

THE ACCREDITATION, CERTIFICATION AND  
QUALITY ASSURANCE INSTITUTE

ACQUIN

AWARDS THE SEAL OF APPROVAL



FOR THE STUDY PROGRAMME

**6B03106 POLITICAL SCIENCE**

**- BACHELOR OF ARTS -**

*AT THE NJC "L.N. GUMILYOV EURASIAN NATIONAL UNIVERSITY"*

**THE ACCREDITATION IS VALID UNTIL 30<sup>TH</sup> OF SEPTEMBER 2032.**

*BAYREUTH, 10 MARCH 2025*

.....  
PROF. DR. SEBASTIAN KEMPGEN  
CHAIRMAN OF THE BOARD

N. 33400501-240300-1

THE ACCREDITATION, CERTIFICATION AND  
QUALITY ASSURANCE INSTITUTE

ACQUIN

AWARDS THE SEAL OF APPROVAL



FOR THE STUDY PROGRAMME

**7M03106 POLITICAL SCIENCE**

**- MASTER OF ARTS -**

*AT THE NJC "L.N. GUMILYOV EURASIAN NATIONAL UNIVERSITY"*

**THE ACCREDITATION IS VALID UNTIL 30<sup>TH</sup> OF SEPTEMBER 2032.**

*BAYREUTH, 10 MARCH 2025*

PROF. DR. SEBASTIAN KEMPGEN  
CHAIRMAN OF THE BOARD

N. 33400501-240301-1

*ACQUIN is a member of the European Quality Assurance Register for Higher Education (EQAR)  
since 2009*

THE ACCREDITATION, CERTIFICATION AND  
QUALITY ASSURANCE INSTITUTE

ACQUIN

AWARDS THE SEAL OF APPROVAL



FOR THE STUDY PROGRAMME

**6B03102 INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS**

**- BACHELOR OF ARTS -**

*AT THE NJC "L.N. GUMILYOV EURASIAN NATIONAL UNIVERSITY"*

**THE ACCREDITATION IS VALID UNTIL 30<sup>TH</sup> OF SEPTEMBER 2032.**

*BAYREUTH, 10 MARCH 2025*

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "S. Kempgen".

PROF. DR. SEBASTIAN KEMPGEN  
CHAIRMAN OF THE BOARD

N. 33400501-240302-1

THE ACCREDITATION, CERTIFICATION AND  
QUALITY ASSURANCE INSTITUTE

ACQUIN

AWARDS THE SEAL OF APPROVAL



FOR THE STUDY PROGRAMME

**7M03107 INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS**

**- MASTER OF ARTS -**

*AT THE NJC "L.N. GUMILYOV EURASIAN NATIONAL UNIVERSITY"*

**THE ACCREDITATION IS VALID UNTIL 30<sup>TH</sup> OF SEPTEMBER 2032.**

*BAYREUTH, 10 MARCH 2025*

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read 'S. Kempgen', is written over a horizontal dotted line.

PROF. DR. SEBASTIAN KEMPGEN  
CHAIRMAN OF THE BOARD

N. 33400501-240303-1

*ACQUIN is a member of the European Quality Assurance Register for Higher Education (EQAR)  
since 2009*

THE ACCREDITATION, CERTIFICATION AND  
QUALITY ASSURANCE INSTITUTE

ACQUIN

AWARDS THE SEAL OF APPROVAL



FOR THE STUDY PROGRAMME

**6B04101 MANAGEMENT**

**- BACHELOR OF ARTS -**

*AT THE NJC "L.N. GUMILYOV EURASIAN NATIONAL UNIVERSITY"*

**THE ACCREDITATION IS VALID UNTIL 30<sup>TH</sup> OF SEPTEMBER 2032.**

*BAYREUTH, 10 MARCH 2025*

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read 'S. Kempgen', is written over a horizontal dotted line.

PROF. DR. SEBASTIAN KEMPGEN  
CHAIRMAN OF THE BOARD

N. 33400501-240304-1

THE ACCREDITATION, CERTIFICATION AND  
QUALITY ASSURANCE INSTITUTE

ACQUIN

AWARDS THE SEAL OF APPROVAL



FOR THE STUDY PROGRAMME

**7M04101 MANAGEMENT**

**- MASTER OF ARTS -**

*AT THE NJC "L.N. GUMILYOV EURASIAN NATIONAL UNIVERSITY"*

**THE ACCREDITATION IS VALID UNTIL 30<sup>TH</sup> OF SEPTEMBER 2032.**

*BAYREUTH, 10 MARCH 2025*

PROF. DR. SEBASTIAN KEMPGEN  
CHAIRMAN OF THE BOARD

N. 33400501-240305-1

*ACQUIN is a member of the European Quality Assurance Register for Higher Education (EQAR)  
since 2009*

THE ACCREDITATION, CERTIFICATION AND  
QUALITY ASSURANCE INSTITUTE

ACQUIN

AWARDS THE SEAL OF APPROVAL



FOR THE STUDY PROGRAMME

**6B04102 ECONOMICS**

**- BACHELOR OF ARTS -**

*AT THE NJC "L.N. GUMILYOV EURASIAN NATIONAL UNIVERSITY"*

**THE ACCREDITATION IS VALID UNTIL 30<sup>TH</sup> OF SEPTEMBER 2032.**

*BAYREUTH, 10 MARCH 2025*

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "S. Kempgen", is positioned above a horizontal dotted line.

PROF. DR. SEBASTIAN KEMPGEN  
CHAIRMAN OF THE BOARD

N. 33400501-240306-1

THE ACCREDITATION, CERTIFICATION AND  
QUALITY ASSURANCE INSTITUTE

ACQUIN

AWARDS THE SEAL OF APPROVAL



FOR THE STUDY PROGRAMME

**7M04102 ECONOMICS**

**- MASTER OF ARTS -**

*AT THE NJC "L.N. GUMILYOV EURASIAN NATIONAL UNIVERSITY"*

**THE ACCREDITATION IS VALID UNTIL 30<sup>TH</sup> OF SEPTEMBER 2032.**

*BAYREUTH, 10 MARCH 2025*

PROF. DR. SEBASTIAN KEMPGEN  
CHAIRMAN OF THE BOARD

N. 33400501-240307-1

*ACQUIN is a member of the European Quality Assurance Register for Higher Education (EQAR)  
since 2009*



THE ACCREDITATION, CERTIFICATION AND  
QUALITY ASSURANCE INSTITUTE

ACQUIN

AWARDS THE SEAL OF APPROVAL



FOR THE STUDY PROGRAMME

**6B04202 INTERNATIONAL LAW**

**- BACHELOR OF ARTS -**

*AT THE NJC "L.N. GUMILYOV EURASIAN NATIONAL UNIVERSITY"*

**THE ACCREDITATION IS VALID UNTIL 30<sup>TH</sup> OF SEPTEMBER 2032.**

*BAYREUTH, 10 MARCH 2025*

PROF. DR. SEBASTIAN KEMPGEN  
CHAIRMAN OF THE BOARD

N. 33400501-240308-1

THE ACCREDITATION, CERTIFICATION AND  
QUALITY ASSURANCE INSTITUTE

ACQUIN

AWARDS THE SEAL OF APPROVAL



FOR THE STUDY PROGRAMME

**7M04202 INTERNATIONAL LAW**

**- MASTER OF ARTS -**

*AT THE NJC "L.N. GUMILYOV EURASIAN NATIONAL UNIVERSITY"*

**THE ACCREDITATION IS VALID UNTIL 30<sup>TH</sup> OF SEPTEMBER 2032.**

*BAYREUTH, 10 MARCH 2025*

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read 'S. Kempgen', is written over a horizontal dotted line.

PROF. DR. SEBASTIAN KEMPGEN  
CHAIRMAN OF THE BOARD

N. 33400501-240309-1

THE ACCREDITATION, CERTIFICATION AND  
QUALITY ASSURANCE INSTITUTE

ACQUIN

AWARDS THE SEAL OF APPROVAL



FOR THE STUDY PROGRAMME

**8D04202 INTERNATIONAL LAW**

**- PHD -**

*AT THE NJC "L.N. GUMILYOV EURASIAN NATIONAL UNIVERSITY"*

**THE ACCREDITATION IS VALID UNTIL 30<sup>TH</sup> OF SEPTEMBER 2031.**

*BAYREUTH, 10 MARCH 2025*

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "S. Kempgen", is written over a horizontal dotted line.

PROF. DR. SEBASTIAN KEMPGEN  
CHAIRMAN OF THE BOARD

N. 33400501-240310-1

ИНСТИТУТ АККРЕДИТАЦИИ, СЕРТИФИКАЦИИ  
И ОБЕСПЕЧЕНИЯ КАЧЕСТВА

ACQUIN

ПРИСУЖДАЕТ СЕРТИФИКАТ КАЧЕСТВА



ПО ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНОЙ ПРОГРАММЕ

**6В03106 Политология**

**- БАКАЛАВР -**

*НАО „ЕВРАЗИЙСКИЙ НАЦИОНАЛЬНЫЙ УНИВЕРСИТЕТ ИМЕНИ Л.Н. ГУМИЛЕВА“*

**АККРЕДИТАЦИЯ ДЕЙСТВИТЕЛЬНА ДО 30 СЕНТЯБРЯ 2032.**

*Байройт, 10 марта 2025*

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "S. Kempgen".

.....  
ПРОФЕССОР, ДР. СЕБАСТЬЯН КЕМПГЕН  
Председатель Аккредитационной Комиссии

N. 33400501-240300-1

*Зарегистрированное общество ACQUIN внесено в Европейский Регистр EQAR (апрель 2009 года) и в Национальный реестр аккредитационных агентств Республики Казахстан (июнь 2012 года)*

ИНСТИТУТ АККРЕДИТАЦИИ, СЕРТИФИКАЦИИ  
И ОБЕСПЕЧЕНИЯ КАЧЕСТВА

ACQUIN

ПРИСУЖДАЕТ СЕРТИФИКАТ КАЧЕСТВА



ПО ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНОЙ ПРОГРАММЕ

**7M03106 Политология**

**- МАГИСТР -**

*НАО „ЕВРАЗИЙСКИЙ НАЦИОНАЛЬНЫЙ УНИВЕРСИТЕТ ИМЕНИ Л.Н. ГУМИЛЕВА“*

**АККРЕДИТАЦИЯ ДЕЙСТВИТЕЛЬНА ДО 30 СЕНТЯБРЯ 2032.**

*БАЙРОЙТ, 10 МАРТА 2025*

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "S. Kempgen".

ПРОФЕССОР, ДР. СЕБАСТЬЯН КЕМПГЕН  
ПРЕДСЕДАТЕЛЬ АККРЕДИТАЦИОННОЙ КОМИССИИ

N. 33400501-240301-1

*Зарегистрированное общество ACQUIN внесено в Европейский Регистр EQAR (апрель 2009 года) и в Национальный реестр аккредитационных агентств Республики Казахстан (июнь 2012 года)*

ИНСТИТУТ АККРЕДИТАЦИИ, СЕРТИФИКАЦИИ  
И ОБЕСПЕЧЕНИЯ КАЧЕСТВА

ACQUIN

ПРИСУЖДАЕТ СЕРТИФИКАТ КАЧЕСТВА



ПО ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНОЙ ПРОГРАММЕ

**6В03102 МЕЖДУНАРОДНЫЕ ОТНОШЕНИЯ**

**- БАКАЛАВР -**

*НАО „ЕВРАЗИЙСКИЙ НАЦИОНАЛЬНЫЙ УНИВЕРСИТЕТ ИМЕНИ Л.Н. ГУМИЛЕВА“*

**АККРЕДИТАЦИЯ ДЕЙСТВИТЕЛЬНА ДО 30 СЕНТЯБРЯ 2032.**

*БАЙРОЙТ, 10 МАРТА 2025*

*S. Kempgen*

ПРОФЕССОР, ДР. СЕБАСТЬЯН КЕМПГЕН  
ПРЕДСЕДАТЕЛЬ АККРЕДИТАЦИОННОЙ КОМИССИИ

N. 33400501-240302-1

*Зарегистрированное общество ACQUIN внесено в Европейский Регистр EQAR (апрель 2009 года) и в Национальный реестр аккредитационных агентств Республики Казахстан (июнь 2012 года)*

ИНСТИТУТ АККРЕДИТАЦИИ, СЕРТИФИКАЦИИ  
И ОБЕСПЕЧЕНИЯ КАЧЕСТВА

ACQUIN

ПРИСУЖДАЕТ СЕРТИФИКАТ КАЧЕСТВА



ПО ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНОЙ ПРОГРАММЕ

**7M03107 МЕЖДУНАРОДНЫЕ ОТНОШЕНИЯ  
(НАУЧНО-ПЕДАГОГИЧЕСКОЕ НАПРАВЛЕНИЕ)  
- МАГИСТР -**

*НАО „ЕВРАЗИЙСКИЙ НАЦИОНАЛЬНЫЙ УНИВЕРСИТЕТ ИМЕНИ Л.Н. ГУМИЛЕВА“*

**АККРЕДИТАЦИЯ ДЕЙСТВИТЕЛЬНА ДО 30 СЕНТЯБРЯ 2032.**

*БАЙРОЙТ, 10 МАРТА 2025*

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "S. Kempgen".

ПРОФЕССОР, ДР. СЕБАСТЬЯН КЕМПГЕН  
ПРЕДСЕДАТЕЛЬ АККРЕДИТАЦИОННОЙ КОМИССИИ

*N. 33400501-240303-1*

*Зарегистрированное общество ACQUIN внесено в Европейский Регистр EQAR (апрель 2009 года) и в Национальный реестр аккредитационных агентств Республики Казахстан (июнь 2012 года)*

ИНСТИТУТ АККРЕДИТАЦИИ, СЕРТИФИКАЦИИ  
И ОБЕСПЕЧЕНИЯ КАЧЕСТВА

ACQUIN

ПРИСУЖДАЕТ СЕРТИФИКАТ КАЧЕСТВА



ПО ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНОЙ ПРОГРАММЕ

**6B04101 МЕНЕДЖМЕНТ**

**- БАКАЛАВР -**

*НАО „ЕВРАЗИЙСКИЙ НАЦИОНАЛЬНЫЙ УНИВЕРСИТЕТ ИМЕНИ Л.Н. ГУМИЛЕВА“*

**АККРЕДИТАЦИЯ ДЕЙСТВИТЕЛЬНА ДО 30 СЕНТЯБРЯ 2032.**

*БАЙРОЙТ, 10 МАРТА 2025*

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read 'S. Kempgen'.

.....  
ПРОФЕССОР, ДР. СЕБАСТЬЯН КЕМПГЕН  
ПРЕДСЕДАТЕЛЬ АККРЕДИТАЦИОННОЙ КОМИССИИ

*N. 33400501-240304-1*

*Зарегистрированное общество ACQUIN внесено в Европейский Регистр EQAR (апрель 2009 года) и в Национальный реестр аккредитационных агентств Республики Казахстан (июнь 2012 года)*



ИНСТИТУТ АККРЕДИТАЦИИ, СЕРТИФИКАЦИИ  
И ОБЕСПЕЧЕНИЯ КАЧЕСТВА

ACQUIN

ПРИСУЖДАЕТ СЕРТИФИКАТ КАЧЕСТВА



ПО ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНОЙ ПРОГРАММЕ

**7М04101 МЕНЕДЖМЕНТ (НАУЧНО-ПЕДАГОГИЧЕСКОЕ НАПРАВЛЕНИЕ)**

**- МАГИСТР -**

*НАО „ЕВРАЗИЙСКИЙ НАЦИОНАЛЬНЫЙ УНИВЕРСИТЕТ ИМЕНИ Л.Н. ГУМИЛЕВА“*

**АККРЕДИТАЦИЯ ДЕЙСТВИТЕЛЬНА ДО 30 СЕНТЯБРЯ 2032.**

*БАЙРОЙТ, 10 МАРТА 2025*

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "S. Kempgen".

.....  
ПРОФЕССОР, ДР. СЕБАСТЬЯН КЕМПГЕН  
ПРЕДСЕДАТЕЛЬ АККРЕДИТАЦИОННОЙ КОМИССИИ

N. 33400501-240305-1

*Зарегистрированное общество ACQUIN внесено в Европейский Регистр EQAR (апрель 2009 года) и в Национальный реестр аккредитационных агентств Республики Казахстан (июнь 2012 года)*

ИНСТИТУТ АККРЕДИТАЦИИ, СЕРТИФИКАЦИИ  
И ОБЕСПЕЧЕНИЯ КАЧЕСТВА

ACQUIN

ПРИСУЖДАЕТ СЕРТИФИКАТ КАЧЕСТВА



ПО ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНОЙ ПРОГРАММЕ

**6B04102 ЭКОНОМИКА**

**БАКАЛАВР -**

*НАО „ЕВРАЗИЙСКИЙ НАЦИОНАЛЬНЫЙ УНИВЕРСИТЕТ ИМЕНИ Л.Н. ГУМИЛЕВА“*

**АККРЕДИТАЦИЯ ДЕЙСТВИТЕЛЬНА ДО 30 СЕНТЯБРЯ 2032.**

*БАЙРОЙТ, 10 МАРТА 2025*

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "S. Kempgen".

.....  
ПРОФЕССОР, ДР. СЕБАСТЬЯН КЕМПГЕН  
ПРЕДСЕДАТЕЛЬ АККРЕДИТАЦИОННОЙ КОМИССИИ

N. 33400501-240306-1

*Зарегистрированное общество ACQUIN внесено в Европейский Регистр EQAR (апрель 2009 года) и в Национальный реестр аккредитационных агентств Республики Казахстан (июнь 2012 года)*

ИНСТИТУТ АККРЕДИТАЦИИ, СЕРТИФИКАЦИИ  
И ОБЕСПЕЧЕНИЯ КАЧЕСТВА

ACQUIN

ПРИСУЖДАЕТ СЕРТИФИКАТ КАЧЕСТВА



ПО ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНОЙ ПРОГРАММЕ

**7M04102 Экономика (научно-педагогическое направление)**

**- МАГИСТР -**

*НАО „ЕВРАЗИЙСКИЙ НАЦИОНАЛЬНЫЙ УНИВЕРСИТЕТ ИМЕНИ Л.Н. ГУМИЛЕВА“*

**АККРЕДИТАЦИЯ ДЕЙСТВИТЕЛЬНА ДО 30 СЕНТЯБРЯ 2032.**

*БАЙРОЙТ, 10 МАРТА 2025*

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "S. Kempgen".

.....  
ПРОФЕССОР, ДР. СЕБАСТЬЯН КЕМПГЕН  
ПРЕДСЕДАТЕЛЬ АККРЕДИТАЦИОННОЙ КОМИССИИ

N. 33400501-240307-1

*Зарегистрированное общество ACQUIN внесено в Европейский Регистр EQAR (апрель 2009 года) и в Национальный реестр аккредитационных агентств Республики Казахстан (июнь 2012 года)*

ИНСТИТУТ АККРЕДИТАЦИИ, СЕРТИФИКАЦИИ  
И ОБЕСПЕЧЕНИЯ КАЧЕСТВА

ACQUIN

ПРИСУЖДАЕТ СЕРТИФИКАТ КАЧЕСТВА



ПО ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНОЙ ПРОГРАММЕ

**6B04202 МЕЖДУНАРОДНОЕ ПРАВО**

**- БАКАЛАВР -**

*НАО „ЕВРАЗИЙСКИЙ НАЦИОНАЛЬНЫЙ УНИВЕРСИТЕТ ИМЕНИ Л.Н. ГУМИЛЕВА“*

**АККРЕДИТАЦИЯ ДЕЙСТВИТЕЛЬНА ДО 30 СЕНТЯБРЯ 2032.**

*БАЙРОЙТ, 10 МАРТА 2025*

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "S. Kempgen".

.....  
ПРОФЕССОР, ДР. СЕБАСТЬЯН КЕМПГЕН  
ПРЕДСЕДАТЕЛЬ АККРЕДИТАЦИОННОЙ КОМИССИИ

N. 33400501-240308-1

*Зарегистрированное общество ACQUIN внесено в Европейский Регистр EQAR (апрель 2009 года) и в Национальный реестр аккредитационных агентств Республики Казахстан (июнь 2012 года)*

ИНСТИТУТ АККРЕДИТАЦИИ, СЕРТИФИКАЦИИ  
И ОБЕСПЕЧЕНИЯ КАЧЕСТВА

ACQUIN

ПРИСУЖДАЕТ СЕРТИФИКАТ КАЧЕСТВА



ПО ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНОЙ ПРОГРАММЕ

**7M04202 МЕЖДУНАРОДНОЕ ПРАВО**  
**(НАУЧНО-ПЕДАГОГИЧЕСКОЕ НАПРАВЛЕНИЕ)**  
**- МАГИСТР -**

*НАО „ЕВРАЗИЙСКИЙ НАЦИОНАЛЬНЫЙ УНИВЕРСИТЕТ ИМЕНИ Л.Н. ГУМИЛЕВА“*

**АККРЕДИТАЦИЯ ДЕЙСТВИТЕЛЬНА ДО 30 СЕНТЯБРЯ 2032.**

*Байройт, 10 марта 2025*

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "S. Kegg".

.....  
ПРОФЕССОР, ДР. СЕБАСТЬЯН КЕМПГЕН  
ПРЕДСЕДАТЕЛЬ АККРЕДИТАЦИОННОЙ КОМИССИИ  
N. 33400501-240309-1

*Зарегистрированное общество ACQUIN внесено в Европейский Регистр EQAR (апрель 2009 года) и в Национальный реестр аккредитационных агентств Республики Казахстан (июнь 2012 года)*

ИНСТИТУТ АККРЕДИТАЦИИ, СЕРТИФИКАЦИИ  
И ОБЕСПЕЧЕНИЯ КАЧЕСТВА

ACQUIN

ПРИСУЖДАЕТ СЕРТИФИКАТ КАЧЕСТВА



ПО ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНОЙ ПРОГРАММЕ

**8D04202 МЕЖДУНАРОДНОЕ ПРАВО**

**- ДОКТОРАНТУРА (PHD) -**

*НАО „ЕВРАЗИЙСКИЙ НАЦИОНАЛЬНЫЙ УНИВЕРСИТЕТ ИМЕНИ Л.Н. ГУМИЛЕВА“*

**АККРЕДИТАЦИЯ ДЕЙСТВИТЕЛЬНА ДО 30 СЕНТЯБРЯ 2031.**

*БАЙРОЙТ, 10 МАРТА 2025*

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "S. Kempgen".

.....  
ПРОФЕССОР, ДР. СЕБАСТЬЯН КЕМПГЕН  
ПРЕДСЕДАТЕЛЬ АККРЕДИТАЦИОННОЙ КОМИССИИ

*N. 33400501-240310-1*

*Зарегистрированное общество ACQUIN внесено в Европейский Регистр EQAR (апрель 2009 года) и в Национальный реестр аккредитационных агентств Республики Казахстан (июнь 2012 года)*

## **Accreditation Report**

**L.N. Gumilyov Eurasian National University  
Republic of Kazakhstan**

**“International Law” (Bachelor), “International Law” (Master scientific and pedagogical direction), “International Law” (PhD), “International Relations” (Bachelor), “International Relations” (Master scientific and pedagogical direction)”, “Political Science” (Bachelor), “Political Science” (Master scientific and pedagogical direction), “Economics” (Bachelor), “Economics” (Master scientific and pedagogical direction), “Management” (Bachelor), “Management” (Master scientific and pedagogical direction)**

### **I Procedure**

**Date of contract:** 14 June 2024

**Date of the submission of self-assessment report:** 04 September 2024

**Date of site visit:** 21-23 October 2024

**Attendance by ACQUIN office:** Dr. Lyazzat Nugumanova/Svitlana Kondratova

**Accreditation decision:** 10 March 2025

#### **Peer review experts:**

- **Prof. Dr. Alisher Aldashev**, Kazakh British Technical University, Professor of Economics
- **Prof. Dr. Fabienne Bossuyt**, University of Ghent, Associate Professor at and co-coordinator of the Ghent Institute for International and European Studies
- **Prof. Dr. Richard Frensch**, University of Regensburg, Leibniz Institute for East and Southeast European Studies (Department of Economics), Professor of Economics, esp. Trade and Development of Central and Eastern Europe
- **Prof. Ilya Levine**, PhD, American University in Bulgaria, Assistant Professor, Department of Politics and European Studies
- **Prof. Dr. Roza Nurgozhayeva**, Nazarbayev University, Assistant Professor of Law, Graduate School of Business



- **Prof. Dr. Susanne Schmidt**, Otto-von-Guericke University Magdeburg, Vice Rector for Academic Affairs, Chair of International Management
- **Zhan Myrzagali**, Head of the project on the reconstruction of the public space Mangilik El Astana
- **Marla Bartosch**, Berlin School of Economics and Law, Student of Economics (B.A.)

The **Assessment Report** of the peer-review experts is **based on** the self-assessment report of the Higher Education Institution (HEI) and extensive discussions with the HEI management, deans and/or heads of the departments, heads of study programme(s), lecturers, staff representatives, students, and alumni.

The basis of the **Assessment Criteria** is part 1 of the “Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area” (ESG) in the current official version. For PhD study programmes the Salzburg Recommendations are considered additionally. At the same time the national context, particularly the national regulations regarding the establishment of study programmes, are taken into account.



**Content**

<b>I</b>	<b>Procedure .....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>II</b>	<b>Introduction .....</b>	<b>5</b>
	1 Short profile of HEI .....	5
	2 General information on the study programmes .....	7
	3 Results of the previous accreditation .....	10
<b>III</b>	<b>Implementation and assessment of the criteria .....</b>	<b>11</b>
	1 ESG Standard 1.1: Policy for quality assurance .....	11
	1.1 Implementation .....	11
	1.2 Assessment .....	12
	1.3 Conclusion .....	13
	2 ESG Standard 1.2: Design and approval of programmes .....	13
	2.1 Implementation .....	13
	2.2 Assessment .....	21
	2.3 Conclusion .....	36
	3 ESG Standard 1.3: Student-centred learning, teaching, and assessment .....	37
	3.1 Implementation .....	37
	3.2 Assessment .....	41
	3.3 Conclusion .....	43
	4 ESG Standard 1.4: Student admission, progression, recognition, and certification .....	43
	4.1 Implementation .....	43
	4.2 Assessment .....	44
	4.3 Conclusion .....	45
	5 ESG Standard 1.5: Teaching staff .....	45
	5.1 Implementation .....	46
	5.2 Assessment .....	47
	5.3 Conclusion .....	48
	6 ESG Standard 1.6: Learning resources and student support .....	48
	6.1 Implementation .....	48
	6.2 Assessment .....	50
	6.3 Conclusion .....	52
	7 ESG Standard 1.7: Information management .....	53
	7.1 Implementation .....	53
	7.2 Assessment .....	54
	7.3 Conclusion .....	55
	8 ESG Standard 1.8: Public information .....	55
	8.1 Implementation .....	55
	8.2 Assessment .....	55
	8.3 Conclusion .....	56
	9 ESG Standard 1.9: On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes .....	56

9.1	Implementation .....	56
9.2	Assessment .....	57
9.3	Conclusion .....	58
10	ESG Standard 1.10: Cyclical external quality assurance .....	58
10.1	Implementation .....	58
10.2	Assessment .....	59
10.3	Conclusion .....	59
<b>IV</b>	<b>Recommendation to the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN .....</b>	<b>60</b>
1	Assessment of compliance the Standards and Guidelines in the Higher European Area (ESG) in the actual official version .....	60
2	Accreditation Recommendation .....	63
<b>V</b>	<b>Decisions of the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN .....</b>	<b>68</b>

## **II Introduction**

The experts would like to thank the representatives of the HEI as well as students that they have taken part in the discussions and willingly shared information and their views during the site visit. The discussions are valuable not only for the assessment of the institution, but also for a better understanding of the legal and sociocultural context of the local higher education system.

Evaluation basis for the peer-review experts is the self-assessment report of the HEI as well as intensive discussions during the site visit with the HEI management, deans and/or heads of the departments, heads of the study programmes, study programmes coordinators, teachers, lecturers, administrative staff, students, and graduates.

Main objective of the accreditation procedure is to assess the quality of the study programmes and compliance with the "Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area" (ESG). The ESG standards are applied as main assessment criteria in the international accreditation procedure. They are completed with criteria for structured doctoral programmes (Salzburg Recommendations). In addition, the respective country-specific criteria and standards are taken into account.

A group of experts was set up, which ensured that all areas relevant to the accreditation procedure (e.g. legal, structural, social etc. aspects) as well as the ESG, the Salzburg Recommendations, and national criteria were considered. The peer-review experts include professors, representatives of the professional practice and the student representative. A certificate with the ACQUIN seal is awarded upon accreditation of the study programme(s).

### **1 Short profile of HEI**

L.N. Gumilyov Eurasian National University (ENU) was founded by the Decree of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated May 23, 1996.

Educational activities at ENU are conducted according to a three-level system of training: bachelor's degree – master's degree - doctoral degree (PhD) in Kazakh and Russian languages in full-time education mode.

The Eurasian National University has 13 faculties.

University's full-time teaching staff (2023-2024 academic year) consists of 1,270 people, including 167 doctors of sciences, 468 candidates of sciences, 243 PhD.

The total number of ENU students as of 2024 amounted to 26,074 people, including 22,048 undergraduate students, 3,000 graduate, 1,026 doctoral students.

The university's research activities are developed on the basis of a cluster approach and are aimed at developing fundamental and applied research and innovative activities.

The university implements six priority scientific clusters:

1. Physical sciences and nuclear technologies;
2. Mathematics and information technology;
3. Biology, biomedicine and biotechnology;
4. Engineering;
5. Chemistry and Earth sciences;
6. Social sciences and humanities.

## 2 General information on the study programmes

### Economics (Bachelor)

Date of introduction	1996
Faculty/ department	Department of Economics
Standard period of study (semesters)/ECTS credits	8 semesters / 240 ECTS
Number of students currently enrolled	75
Average number of graduates per year	38
Form of study	full-time

### Economics (Master)

Date of introduction	1996
Faculty/ department	Department of Economics
Standard period of study (semesters)/ECTS credits	4 semesters / 120 ECTS
Number of students currently enrolled	18
Average number of graduates per year	9
Form of study	full-time

### Management (Bachelor)

Date of introduction	1996
Faculty/ department	Department of Management
Standard period of study (semesters)/ECTS credits	8 semesters / 240 ECTS
Number of students currently enrolled	177
Average number of graduates per year	51
Form of study	full-time

### Management (Master)

Date of introduction	1996
----------------------	------

Faculty/ department	Department of Management
Standard period of study (semesters)/ECTS credits	4 semesters / 120 ECTS
Number of students currently enrolled	25
Average number of graduates per year	14
Form of study	full-time

## International Law (Bachelor)

Date of introduction	1999
Faculty/ department	Department of International Law
Standard period of study (semesters)/ECTS credits	8 semesters / 240 ECTS
Number of students currently enrolled	69
Average number of graduates per year	20
Form of study	full-time

## International Law (Master)

Date of introduction	2007
Faculty/ department	Department of International Law
Standard period of study (semesters)/ECTS credits	4 semesters / 120 ECTS
Number of students currently enrolled	32
Average number of graduates per year	6
Form of study	full-time

## International Law (PhD)

Date of introduction	2013
Faculty/ department	Department of International Law
Standard period of study (semesters)/ECTS credits	6 semesters / 180 ECTS
Number of students currently enrolled	5

Average number of graduates per year	2
Form of study	full-time

International Relations (Bachelor)

Date of introduction	Bachelor's degree – 1998 year
Faculty/ department	Department of International Relations
Standard period of study (semesters)/ECTS credits	8 semesters/240 ECTS
Number of students currently enrolled	280
Average number of graduates per year	79
Form of study	full-time

International Relations (Master)

Date of introduction	Master's degree – 2008 year
Faculty/ department	Department of International Relations
Standard period of study (semesters)/ECTS credits	4 semesters / 120 ECTS
Number of students currently enrolled	48
Average number of graduates per year	28
Form of study	full-time

Political Science (Bachelor)

Date of introduction	1999
Faculty/ department	Department of Political Science
Standard period of study (semesters)/ECTS credits	8 semesters / 240 ECTS
Number of students currently enrolled	70
Average number of graduates per year	15
Form of study	full-time

## Political Science (Master)

Date of introduction	2002
Faculty/ department	Department of Political Science
Standard period of study (semesters)/ECTS credits	4 semesters / 120 ECTS
Number of students currently enrolled	57
Average number of graduates per year	20
Form of study	full-time

### 3 Results of the previous accreditation

The study programmes "International Law" (Bachelor), "International Law" (Master scientific and pedagogical direction), "International Law" (PhD), "International Relations" (Bachelor)", "International Relations" (Master scientific and pedagogical direction)", "Political Science" (Bachelor), "Political Science" (Master scientific and pedagogical direction), "Economics" (Bachelor), "Economics" (Master scientific and pedagogical direction), "Management" (Bachelor), "Management" (Master scientific and pedagogical direction) were examined and accredited by the ACQUIN and Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating (IAAR) in 2018 without any conditions.

The accreditation was issued by the 30 September 2024.



### III Implementation and assessment of the criteria

#### 1 ESG Standard 1.1: Policy for quality assurance

**Institutions should have a policy for quality assurance that is made public and forms part of their strategic management. Internal stakeholders should develop and implement this policy through appropriate structures and processes, while involving external stakeholders.**

##### 1.1 Implementation

L.N. Gumilyov ENU has a published Quality Assurance Policy, which is posted on the website of the university in three languages and on information stands of the university departments.

The process of implementing the educational programme (EP) at all stages is accompanied by an internal quality assurance system that complies with the Standards and Recommendations for Quality Assurance in Higher Education in the European Area (ESG).

Monitoring of quality assurance at the external level is implemented through participation in national and international ratings, passing the accreditation and re-accreditation procedures and submitting post-accreditation monitoring reports.

Internal quality assurance is implemented through such a proven tool as online questionnaires/surveys among internal and external stakeholders. Students and employers are also involved in the development of the EP. Employers provide their expert opinions.

One of the channels for external stakeholders to participate in quality assurance is the program ratings of the educational programs.

Annually, the department independently approves a work plan which may include additional activities at the discretion of the department, necessary to improve the quality of educational and scientific activities.

In accordance with the job descriptions of the head of the department, the main functions of the head include: development and implementation of a quality assurance policy for the department's educational programs; defining the goals and objectives of the program, monitoring their achievement, as well as monitoring and evaluating the quality of the department's programs; managing risks associated with the implementation of the department's educational program; ensuring that the department's educational program complies with the requirements of regulatory acts; continuous improvement of the educational program.

ENU has approved a Risk Management Policy, which establishes uniform principles and procedures for risk management throughout the university, including educational programs.

The EP take into account the priorities of the Strategic Development Plan of the RK until 2025, in particular the development of functional literacy, the formation of modern skills and competencies in demand by labor markets in the short, medium and long term (in the bachelor's degree, the disciplines «Introduction to the practice of negotiations», «Diversification of international information and communication strategies», «Organization and holding of international events» and others, in the master's degree «Designing research in the field of international relations», «Information security and digital diplomacy» and others).

The quality assurance policy reflects the deep connection and integration between research, teaching and learning, thereby effectively promoting the synergy of all components of the educational process.

The professorial teaching staff freely implements their own research, taking into account modern realities, independently determines the content, forms and methods of teaching in syllabuses in order to achieve the planned learning outcomes.

The policy of the university, faculty and department is aimed at supporting such values as compliance with academic integrity and freedom, prevention of protectionism, corruption, discrimination. These values are reflected in the documents: Policy of Academic Integrity of Faculty, Employees, and Students of the L.N. Gumilyov Eurasian National University, Code of Corporate Culture of Faculty and Employees of the L.N. Gumilyov Eurasian National University.

Thus, the university and the department have a system of internal quality assurance and risk management in order to develop an institutional culture of quality. Internal processes are aligned with the development strategy. The connection between scientific research, teaching and learning is ensured, the national and intra-university context are taken into account. External stakeholders take part in quality assurance.

## **1.2 Assessment**

ENU has a formal policy for quality assurance in place. This policy is publicly available and can be accessed through the university's official website.

The expert panel is convinced that the policy for quality assurance at ENU has not only been implemented very well and is well organized structurally but is also the actual practice of all people involved.

In the interviews with the university administration, it became clear that the university makes high demands on the quality of research and teaching and has implemented a system that covers all areas and is suitable for ensuring these requirements in breadth and depth.

In addition to the understanding of values explicitly conveyed in the classroom, there are also sufficient organisational structures (i.e. code of conduct, collective agreement, information at the beginning of the programmes, reporting systems, etc.) to prevent any form of intolerance and discrimination and to effectively counter corruption.

A positive aspect is that students in particular have the opportunity to provide direct feedback on teaching content and the learning environment through regular evaluations and can thus initiate improvement processes.

In addition to other positive aspects, there is also a compensation system that rewards special efforts in research and teaching with salary bonuses and thus provides specific incentives for teaching staff to contribute to research and teaching and to receive sufficient further training, whereby the university understandably places a clear emphasis on internationality.

The university is committed to promoting gender equality and equal opportunities to all students and staff.

### 1.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

## 2 ESG Standard 1.2: Design and approval of programmes

**Institutions should have processes for the design and approval of their programmes. The programmes should be designed so that they meet the objectives set for them, including the intended learning outcomes. The qualification resulting from a programme should be clearly specified and communicated, and refer to the correct level of the national qualifications framework for higher education and, consequently, to the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.**

### 2.1 Implementation

#### **Economics (Bachelor)**

The purpose of the EP “6B04102 – Economics” is to train bachelors of economics for accounting and economic, planning, analytical, organizational and managerial professional activities in enterprises and organizations.

The study programme contains 240 ECTS, of which 208 ECTS are allocated to theoretical training, 18 ECTS to industrial practice, 6 ECTS to pre-graduate practice and the final certification module – 8 ECTS.

Theoretical training contains disciplines of the general education cycle of the compulsory component (GCD CC), the general education cycle of the elective component (GCD EC), basic

disciplines of the university component (BD UC), specialized disciplines of the university component (PD UC), basic disciplines of the elective component (BD EC), specialized disciplines of the elective component (PD EC).

In the 5th semester there is a compulsory minor module “Industrial Economics” (15 ECTS). The module contains the disciplines “Economics of the Industry” (5 ECTS), “Economics of the Service Sector” (5 ECTS) and “Economics of the Production Sector” (5 ECTS). The minor module can also, at the request of students, be selected from the Minor catalogue of ENU named after L.N. Gumilyov.

The EP includes following modules: General education module; Module of economic and organizational and managerial competencies; Mathematics and its application in economics; Regional and national economics; Enterprise economics and entrepreneurship; Finance and accounting of the enterprise; Economics of enterprises and organizations; Industrial economics; International economics; Final certification module.

The main and mandatory types of professional practice for students are: educational, industrial and pre-diploma internship (2018 admission), industrial and pre-diploma internship (2019-2024 admission).

### **Economics (Master)**

The goal of the EP “7M04102 - Economics” (scientific and pedagogical direction) is to teach master’s graduates with in-depth knowledge in the field of national economics, possessing analytical, organizational and management skills and methods of conducting fundamental and applied scientific research.

The key aspects of the educational process are academic advancement and personal growth of the student. For this purpose, the EP “7M04102 - Economics” included disciplines that promote self-realization, the formation of knowledge, skills and abilities that ensure the development and use of their personal and creative potential - “History and Philosophy of Science”, “Pedagogy of Higher School” and “Psychology of Management” "

The study programme contains 120 ECTS, of which 72 ECTS are allocated to theoretical training, 24 ECTS to undergraduate research work, 12 ECTS to research practice, 4 ECTS to teaching practice and the final certification module - 8 ECTS.

Theoretical training contains basic disciplines of the university component, specialized disciplines of the university component, basic disciplines of the elective component, and specialized disciplines of the elective component.

In general, the EP offers to study three modules of the university component that are mandatory for studying:

- Methodology of master's training (basic disciplines);
- Micro- and macroanalysis (specialized disciplines);
- Theory and practice of scientific research (specialized disciplines).

EP "7M04102 – Economics" contains modules of the component of choice: basic and specialized disciplines.

Modules of basic elective disciplines of the EP "7M04102 – Economics" are Theory and practice of management decisions; Theory and research; Theory and research of industry markets; Economic policy; Theory of sustainable development; Theory of economic growth; Theory and research of teaching; Economic research; Research and analysis.

Modules of specialized elective disciplines of the study programme are Economics of the company; Research of enterprise competitiveness; Economics of enterprises and organizations; World commodity markets; Economics of development of the agricultural sector; City Economy; Economy of urban agglomerations; Smart City Economy; Antimonopoly regulation of the national economy; State regulation of business activities; Theory and research of human capital; Logistics of international transport; International economics; Economic integration; Management of investment projects; Analysis of design solutions; Theory and research of risks in business.

### **Management (Bachelor)**

The purpose of EP «6B04101 - Management» is to prepare bachelors with knowledge in the field of management, capable of making effective management decisions in the activities of enterprises and organizations of various forms of ownership.

The purpose of the educational program is to prepare graduates with basic knowledge in the field of management, organizational and managerial, economic, socio-psychological training, capable of making managerial decisions in the economic activities of the organization and companies of various forms of ownership.

Learning outcomes of EP 6B04101-Management are developed with the following competencies behavioral skills and personality traits (soft skills), professional skills (hard skills) and digital skills.

### **Management (Master)**

The purpose of EP «7B04101 - Management» is to prepare masters with scientific and pedagogical knowledge, capable of carrying out a scientific basis professional activity in the field of management.

Research part of the Master's degree programme includes scientific work conducted in the semester under the guidance of a supervisor in the form of theoretical developments, collection, systematization and analysis of materials for the preparation of reports, scientific articles, presentations at creative seminars, scientific conferences and thesis.

The following types and stages of research work of master's students are envisaged: planning of research work, which includes studying the topics of research work proposed by the relevant department, selecting a research topic, writing a review essay on the selected topic; conducting scientific research; presenting the results of the research at creative seminars and scientific conferences; publishing the results of the conducted research in scientific editions; compiling a report on research work; defense of the scientific report at the seminar.

The educational programme is designed to prepare masters, possessing scientific and pedagogical knowledge, capable of carrying out on a scientific basis professional activity in the field of management.

### **International Law (Bachelor)**

The goal of the educational programme "6B04202 – International Law" is to train competitive specialists with fundamental knowledge and practical skills in the field of international law.

EP "6B04202 - International Law" consists of disciplines of three cycles - general education disciplines (GED), basic disciplines (BD), major disciplines (MD), as well as final certification.

### **International Law (Master)**

The goal of the educational program "7M04202 – International Law" (scientific and pedagogical direction) is to train masters with in-depth scientific and pedagogical knowledge in the field of international, regional and national law, capable of carrying out professional activities on a scientific basis.

The educational trajectory of a master's student includes both classroom studies with teachers and the study of educational materials using services that allow you to generate results and track individual progress during the master's program.

### **International Law (PhD)**

The goal of the educational program "8D04202 - International Law" is to train competitive, in-demand professionals capable of scientific thinking and generating new knowledge in the professional international legal sphere, possessing deep knowledge of the theory, methodology and practice of international law.

The goal of the educational program is to train competitive, in-demand professionals capable of scientific thinking and generating new knowledge in the professional international legal

sphere, possessing deep knowledge of the theory, methodology and practice of international law .

The doctoral program has a scientific and pedagogical focus and involves fundamental educational, methodological and research training and in-depth study of disciplines in international law for the scientific sphere and the system of higher and postgraduate education. The total volume (labor intensity) of the program is 180 credits.

The doctoral program comprises of:

- 1) theoretical training, including the study of a cycle of basic and specialized disciplines;
- 2) practical training of doctoral students: various types of professional practices, scientific internships;
- 3) research work, including the completion of a doctoral dissertation;
- 4) intermediate certification.

The theoretical training of the doctoral program consists of cycles of basic (CB) and major disciplines (MD), which include disciplines of the university component (hereinafter referred to as UC) and the elective component (EC), teaching and research internships.

Teaching internship is carried out with the aim of developing practical skills in teaching and professional activities, where doctoral students are involved in conducting classes in the bachelor's and master's degrees.

The research internship of a doctoral student is carried out with the aim of studying the latest theoretical, methodological and technological achievements of domestic and foreign science, as well as consolidating practical skills, applying modern methods of scientific research, processing and interpreting experimental data in dissertation research.

After admission to doctoral studies, the doctoral student, with the help of domestic and foreign scientific consultants, determines the topic of the dissertation research, which is approved by the university. Approved dissertation topics are published on the official website of the university.

### **International Relations (Bachelor)**

The goal of the bachelor's degree "6B03102 - International Relations" is to prepare competitive bachelors with fundamental professional knowledge and practical skills in the field of international relations and diplomacy, with linguistic training in foreign languages for effective business and intercultural communications, capable of self-development, self-study and adaptation to changing conditions of professional activity.

The content of the program is aimed at acquiring individual-personal (soft skills), professional (hard skills) and digital (digital skills) skills and competencies by students, using modern learning and teaching technologies, including innovative ones.

The study programme contains a volume of 240 ECTS - of which 208 ECTS are theoretical training, 18 ECTS - educational and industrial practice, 6 ECTS - pre-graduation practice and the final certification module - 8 ECTS) involve fundamental educational, methodological and analytical training and in-depth study of disciplines in the relevant areas. Particular attention is paid to industrial practice in the EP.

The individual workload of students consists of the following modules: general education module; Introductory module; The system of international relations; History of international relations; Practical activities of a diplomat; Module of professional languages of communication and office work; Practical activities of a diplomat; International processes; International law; The modern world order: transformation and turbulence; Foreign policy; Module of basic analytical competencies in the specialty; International security; International processes.

In addition, the students' workload includes a module of educational and industrial internships:

- in the second year - educational internship,
- in the third and fourth years - industrial internship,
- in the fourth year - pre-graduation internship.

In the fourth year, a final assessment module is provided, which includes writing and defending a diploma thesis, a diploma project, or preparing and passing a comprehensive exam.

### **International Relations (Master)**

The goal of the master's degree EP "7M03107 - International Relations" (scientific and pedagogical direction (hereinafter-SPD) is to prepare masters with fundamental knowledge and professional competencies in the field of international political and socio-economic relations, capable of implementing research and pedagogical activities.

The content of the Master's program is aimed at acquiring general professional and professional competencies for students.

The study programme contains 120 ECTS out of which 72 ECTS are allocated to theoretical training, 24 ECTS for master's student research work, 12 ECTS for research practice, 4 ECTS for pedagogical practice and 8 ECTS for the final assessment module - 8 ECTS.



The individual workload of students consists of the following modules: Methodology of Master's training; Theoretical and research module; Modern trends in international relations; Methodology of Master's training; Theory and practice of global governance; Negotiating in an international environment, International security; International conflicts in the 21st century.

The students' workload also includes the master's student's research work and the following types of internships:

- in the third semester - teaching internship,
- in the fourth semester - research internship.

In the second year, a final assessment module is provided, which includes the preparation and defense of a master's thesis.

### **Political Science (Bachelor)**

Students of the Political Science (Bachelor) program are required to complete 240 ECTS credits over four years (eight semesters). The program includes both theoretical instruction and practical training: academic practice in the 2nd semester, production practice in the 4th semester, production practice in the 6th semester, and production and pre-diploma practice in the 8th semester.

Students gain technical skills, problem-solving abilities, and interpersonal competencies. In addition to theoretical learning, the program includes practical training components that allow students to develop professional skills. After each year of study, students undergo professional practice, during which they can apply the knowledge gained in specific professional situations.

An important component of the educational process is the development of critical thinking and civic responsibility. The educational program includes such disciplines as Philosophy, Sociology, Anti-Corruption Culture, which contribute to the development of critical thinking skills, understanding of social and political structures, and awareness of one's role and responsibility in society.

The introduction of such disciplines as History of Kazakhstan, Fundamentals of Ecology and Life Safety, Culture of Speech, Political Ethics, etc., contributes to the integration of interdisciplinary knowledge, broadening the horizons of students and promoting the formation of well-rounded individuals.

The development of students' creative potential is facilitated by the introduction of the disciplines «Fundamentals of scientific research», «Fundamentals of academic work», which form students' skills of independent research, the results of which they have the opportunity to present at student conferences and competitions of scientific projects, which are held annually.

In 2021, the following courses were introduced: Political PR, Speechwriting and Public Speaking, Fundraising and Crowdfunding in Politics, Political Parties and Party Systems, Modern Electoral Systems, and Institutions of Civil Society. These changes were linked to the introduction of a modular Minor program across all university educational programs in 2021, consisting of no more than 15 academic credits. The Minor program has two tracks: 1) Modern Promotion Technologies in Politics and 2) Institutional Foundations of a Democratic Society.

In 2023 and 2024, the courses Research Methods and Fundamentals of Academic Work were introduced.

### **Political Science (Master)**

Students of the study program Political Science (Master) are required to complete 120 ECTS credits over 2 years (4 semesters). The program includes theoretical training (68 ECTS), scientific research work (24 ECTS), research internship (12 ECTS), teaching practice (4 ECTS), and final assessment (12 ECTS), including the preparation and defense of the master's thesis.

The goal of the educational program is to prepare qualified masters of social sciences with in-depth theoretical and practical knowledge in contemporary political science, capable of applying acquired competencies in research, practical, and teaching spheres.

Upon completion of the program, graduates acquire both general professional and specialized competencies. These competencies are developed through core university courses and electives, as well as a cycle of profile disciplines chosen by the students.

The master's program includes theoretical training, practical sessions, and a ratio of 2:1 between lectures and practical classes in profile disciplines. Each semester involves scientific research work, with the second year also including a research internship, teaching practice, and research practice.

An important component of the educational process is the development of general professional competencies, which is supported by including courses such as Foreign Language (Professional), History and Philosophy of Science, and Management Psychology in the educational program. The program also includes a course in Higher Education Pedagogy, which helps develop skills in modern pedagogical technologies and their practical application.

To develop skills in selecting and evaluating research methods, independently analyzing complex phenomena and trends in political life, the program includes courses such as Methods of Analyzing Contemporary Political Science, Information and Analytical Support for Scientific Research, Organization of Project Research Work, and Social-Political Statistics and Data Analysis.

## 2.2 Assessment

### Economics (Bachelor/Master)

As one of the leading higher education institutions in Kazakhstan, ENU has been streamlining its educational activities according to a three-level system based on the principles of the Bologna Agreement, awarding Bachelor, Master, and Doctoral degrees. In line with this, the Economics Department of ENU has been implementing consecutive educational programs on Bachelor, Master, and Doctoral (Ph.D.) levels in Economics.

In May 2020, a statewide effort at uniformly naming educational programs (EPs) resulted in the now valid designation of Bachelor and Master programs in Economics at ENU, by renaming the hitherto EP “6B04106 - Economics of Enterprises and Organizations” to EP “6B04102 - Economics”, and EP “7M04106 - National Economics” was renamed as EP “7M04102 – Economics (Scientific and Pedagogical Direction).”

The Department of Economics plans to implement a three-course module "Project Economics", to become part of both the EPs "7M04102 - Economics" and the Department of Management's EP "7M04134 - International Business and Strategic Trade Control". Upon successfully concluding the module, the Department wants to award a (non-degree) certificate.

The structure of this three-level educational approach is impacted by ENU's aiming at strengthening its status as a research university, which it has been holding since 2022. Accordingly, ENU wants to diminish the number of Bachelor students to the advantage of admitting more Master and Ph.D. students. The new Master-level module "Project Economics" explicitly fits into this development.

At the same time, ENU holds licenses in all areas of the educational programs implemented at the university, which implies that there is no objective to diminish the number of educational programs in place.

The ENU Department of Economics does have a formal policy for the design and approval of programs. The syllabi for Economics programs are discussed at the meetings of the department. Both students and external stakeholders are involved in the design of the study programs, in as much as they take part in the respective meetings. If approved internally, the syllabi and the working curricula go to the educational and methodological committee of the university. After the approval by the educational and methodological committee the syllabi and curricula become active.

The feedback of external stakeholders to the program designs is called for on a regular basis, specifically by surveying and analyzing the satisfaction of employers with educational pro-

grams based on the results of internships, the results of employment of graduates of the department, and scientific and practical forums held at the university with the participation of industry representatives.

The new Master-level module "Project Economics" appears to be projected in response to this feedback.

Expectations and requirements from the professional field as well as the demands on Bachelor *versus* Master level graduates vary enormously in a field of study like economics. While on Bachelor level employability prospects dominate, the expectations on an accomplished Master in Economics would typically also include some preparation to conduct research, so as to be able to successfully enter a Ph.D. program. This is especially so for three-level consecutive programs, such as offered by the Economics Department at ENU.

The objectives of the study programs in Economics at ENU are consequently stated on different levels: while the objectives of the Bachelor program are stated in terms of career opportunities, the objective of the Master program is given in terms of final learning outcomes. The objective of the Bachelor EP "6B04102 – Economics" is stated as "to train bachelors of economics for accounting and economic, planning, analytical, organizational and managerial professional activities in enterprises and organizations." The objective of the Master EP "7M04102 - Economics (Scientific and Pedagogical Direction)" is stated as "to teach masters with in-depth knowledge in the field of national economics, possessing analytical, organizational and management skills and methods of conducting fundamental and applied scientific research."

As made clear in the documentation, but specifically from the discussions with the heads of faculty and departments, the Economics programs at the ENU Economics Department follow a well specified structure: the Bachelor program is to lay some theoretical groundwork, the Master program offers applications to theory, and both with a heavy stress on Enterprise Economics.

The new Master-level module "Project Economics" fits into this approach by entirely neglecting all aspects specific to public investment.

The programs teach only a restricted set of methods, and there is no significant methodological advance from Bachelor to Master level.

Against the broad variation of expectations, requirements, and demands on graduates of economics programs at Bachelor and Master levels, this is one of various viable structures. It in particular highly resembles the traditional program structure of Universities of Applied Sciences (Fachhochschulen) in Germany.

The provided overviews of both programs in Economics already give a broad idea about the distribution of workload (in terms of ECTS credits) between compulsory courses, university courses and elective courses. A puzzling feature of this presentation, however, is some confounding of teaching/learning activity and method: all classroom work and independent study are indiscriminately referred to as “theoretical.”

The syllabi provided for the elective courses sufficiently and transparently list the student workloads in terms of total number of hours, distributed by type of learning, i.e., lectures, seminars, practical exercises, and independent work of the Student (IWS).

The syllabi of the three courses of the new Master-level module "Project Economics" fit into this pattern.

Types of internships are regulated at university level, based on concluded cooperation agreements, e.g. with local private firms, for professional practice.

While both study programs in Economics do reflect the four purposes of higher education of the Council of Europe (“preparation for sustainable employment, personal development, preparing students for active citizenship, and creating a broad advanced knowledge base and stimulating research and innovation), the major stress appears to be given to employability of the graduates.

Accordingly, while the objectives of the Bachelor program are already exclusively stated in terms of career opportunities, the objective of the Master programs also lists a number of marketable skills. The new Master-level module "Project Economics" are meant to broaden these skills.

In fact, the structures of both programs are to a considerable degree defined by labor demand, as in turn voiced by feedback from external stakeholders, specifically by actual and potential employers, mostly from industry. The link between program structure and feedback from industry appears to be mutually reinforcing.

While the conclusion of the expert panel is that criterion 1.2 based on the Standards and recommendations for quality assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) are implemented in the Bachelor and Master programs offered by the ENU Department of Economics, the expert panel nevertheless would want to share a few aspects where we do see some need for optimization, and therefore would want to formulate recommendations.

#### The Bachelor program in Economics

Although the formal procedure of design and approval of the study program appears to be appropriate and all relevant bodies are involved in development and implementation, it seems at least partially that some steps are done *pro forma* or are not entirely accurate. For example,

the syllabus for Mathematical Economics provided as documentation looks more like a syllabus for Econometrics and the Econometrics syllabus resembles more Mathematics. Apart from this, Mathematical Economics taught to economics students is simply higher mathematics without any link to economics. The working curricula are also structured in a more *pro forma* manner. For example, Mathematical Economics and Statistics are both listed as elective disciplines in the working curriculum, whereas Econometrics is a required course. However, it is not specified how students who would not choose these electives can handle a course in Econometrics, which is based on Mathematical Statistics.

#### Recommendations:

- Mathematical Economics to be a required course with a syllabus reflecting topics related to economics.
- Statistics should be a required course in the curriculum.
- Mathematical Economics and Statistics should both be prerequisites for Econometrics.

#### The Master program in Economics

As outlined above, the Bachelor program is to lay theoretical groundwork, the Master program offers applications, both with a heavy stress on Enterprise Economics. Consequently, the programs teach only a restricted set of methods, and there is no significant methodological advance from Bachelor to Master level. As this way of structuring consecutive programs on Bachelor and Master levels resembles the traditional program structure of Universities of Applied Sciences (Fachhochschulen) in Germany, two remarks seem in order:

First, German Universities of Applied Sciences do not have Economics programs – Economics courses are offered as part of Bachelor and Master programs in Management.

Second, German Universities of Applied Sciences so far do not have the right to offer Doctoral programs.

On the first remark: The heavy stress on Enterprise Economics may lead to a loss of product differentiation *vis-à-vis* programs offered in Management. If the Dpt. of Economics would wish to retain their focus on Enterprise Economics, it seems advisable to introduce elements that more sharply distinguish the economics from the management view of the firm. As it stands the current master of Economics program does not really look like a research master program but more of an applied master.

#### Recommendation:

- Introduce – either within the course Enterprise Economics or ideally as a course of its own – content on the Economics of the Firm (transaction cost models, property rights,

behavioral firm models, asset specificity, Melitz models). Alternatively, the Industrial Economics course with the typical topics like Price and product differentiation, mergers and acquisitions, signaling, collusion (with heavy game-theoretic modeling).

On the second remark:

The Master program has a rather eclectic design with various courses like City Economics or Business Diagnostics of Company's Activity. Yet, this is a research Master program within a consecutive structure, to also prepare students for successful participation in and completion of a Ph.D. program with international research publications requirements, as requested by state-wide regulation and in line with the research ambitions of ENU. For that, however, the current structure of the Master program does not equip students with sufficient empirical tools to pursue research. It does have a General Research Methods module but this module is indeed very general and is more of a one-size-fits-all. That is, it discusses general methods for all sciences. However, economics applies rather specific empirical tools and it is not clear whether students are well equipped with them.

Recommendation:

- Introduce a module on Empirical Methods in Economics or Applied Econometrics (models of self-selection, instrumental variables, difference-in-difference, panel data models, non-stationary time series).

**Management (Bachelor/Master)**

The programs' structure aligns with the defined objectives, preparing students to work across various industries, organizational types, departments and hierarchical levels in management. However, the limited availability of modules in English may hinder students' ability to operate effectively in global settings.

The subjects in the second semester cover a variety of topics but do not show a coherent thematic thread or structure, with seemingly no subjects building upon one another. At the Bachelor's level, a significant portion of credit points is allocated to general topics that do not directly address the management field, while key management topics are only available as electives. Although these topics support personal development, the absence of in-depth management content leaves graduates with critical knowledge gaps. The sequence of subjects is unconventional: Management – the core of the subject - is only covered in the third semester, while Entrepreneurship appears in the second semester. Additionally, core management topics such as strategic management, corporate management, innovation management, leadership, HR management, cross-cultural Management are missing in the compulsory modules. It seems like dedicated management subjects are electives, but subjects such as Fundamentals

of Ecology and Life Safety are compulsory modules. Topics that are specifically important for management need to be provided in the basic compulsory curriculum, not just in the electives - for both Bachelor and Master program. The Master's program does not provide sufficient depth of content, which is evident in the literature list, which primarily features textbooks instead of empirical articles from top-tier international journals, including English-language sources, as would be expected at the Master's level.

The formal institutional approval process of the study programs is well-structured.

#### Recommendations:

- Increase in-depth management content in the compulsory modules for both Bachelor's and Master's level.
- Enrich the Master's programme with advanced, deep-level content specific to management
- Include a literature list with English articles from top-rated international journals in the Master's curriculum.

#### **International Law (Bachelor)**

The program combines foundational legal education with international law specialization. It has a trilingual element (Kazakh, Russian, and English) and aligns with the national qualification framework for higher education. The curriculum is structured around 7 key learning outcomes (RT 1-7) that progress from basic academic skills to specialized legal knowledge. Curriculum revisions are undertaken annually, beginning with departmental discussions and culminating in approval by the faculty council and the department of study programs. Assessment methods predominantly involve written examinations and practical assignments, including court case analyses. Student evaluations and Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) are regularly reviewed at the departmental level, with appeals committees providing avenues for addressing grievances. While some students may face repeated academic challenges, institutional policies ensure a balanced response, emphasizing both support and accountability.

Areas for improvement:

1. Curriculum Structure. While curriculum updates align with accreditation requirements, the process is reactive rather than proactively addressing emerging global trends, such as cyber law and data protection, digital currency, intellectual property law, and artificial intelligence in contemporary international law. Having a legal ethics course would be foundational in many programs. Also, the curriculum design has no clear progression path between introductory and advanced courses. It exposes limited attention to clinical legal education components, although the program is designed to educate practitioners. Finally, there is no course on legal



research and writing, yet the university adheres to research-based teaching, and these skills are as important for practitioners as they are for legal scholars (the depth is different, though).

Recommendations:

- Expand contemporary law offerings by including more specific and focused courses, e.g., International Cyber Law and Digital Commerce, Artificial Intelligence and Legal Tech, Legal Ethics in International Practice, etc.
- Implement a clear course progression system.
- Add a clinical education component, simulation-based courses, and legal writing workshops focused on international law.
- Expand professional integration by creating an advisory board and mentorship programs with practicing international lawyers and alumni.

2. Learning Outcomes. The learning outcomes lack specific measurable indicators and could have a better emphasis on practical legal skills development. Since there is no course on legal research and writing, there is no learning outcome dedicated to this skill.

Recommendations:

- Review learning outcomes (RTs) to explore the possibility of including more specific measurable indicators. Add outcomes focused on practical legal skills and legal technology competencies since the legal profession (as many other professions) becomes more acquainted with technologies. Develop specific outcomes for legal research and writing.

3. Strengthening Academic Integrity. Although the program employs supervised written exams and other measures, there is no indication of how the program systematically reinforces academic honesty and critical thinking in daily coursework.

Recommendations:

- Conduct mandatory academic integrity workshops for students in their first year to instill a strong foundation of ethical research and writing practices. Introduce peer-review activities within coursework to encourage collaborative learning and accountability while reducing opportunities for academic dishonesty.

4. Assessment. The program heavily relies on written exams and assignments, which was recommended previously. However, the education industry is evolving, and written assignments might not fully reflect the range of skills needed for a career in international law.

Recommendations:

- Consider diversifying assessment methods by incorporating team projects, oral presentations, and policy analysis papers to build critical skills like collaboration, advocacy, and policy drafting. Evaluate students on experiential learning activities, e.g., role-playing in international tribunals, etc.
- Consider refining plagiarism policies by providing only one chance for resubmission. Allowing rewrites might unintentionally create leniency and encourage risk-taking.

### **International Law (Master)**

The program “7M04202 – International Law” (scientific and pedagogical direction) is a 2-year Master's program (120 credits) that combines advanced theoretical knowledge with research and pedagogical components. It is oriented toward students seeking advanced expertise in international law and related teaching or research careers. The program includes a tailored curriculum that distinguishes it from professional law programs. It has a strong focus on international legal mechanisms, environmental justice, investment law, and human rights protection, structured around 11 learning outcomes (RT1-RT11).

Areas for improvement:

1. Curriculum Structure. The curriculum has a heavy theoretical emphasis, which the program's focus can explain. Research methodology appears frontloaded in the first semester. Course offering seems quite fragmented, which might be explained by the department's current capacity and expertise. There are limited opportunities for interdisciplinary learning and collaboration with other legal and non-legal fields to equip students with a broader skill set.

#### Recommendations:

- Clearly articulate the unique value proposition of the scientific-pedagogical track in terms of its relevance for academia, research, or international legal careers.
- Progress with research methodology components throughout the program. Introduce legal research methodology workshops throughout the program and consider developing research colloquiums for thesis development.
- Introduce dedicated courses across contemporary international law topics.
- Introduce additional practical components such as research workshops, simulated teaching experiences, or internships to balance the theoretical focus.

2. Learning Outcomes. There is some overlap among RTs. Some courses appear to support multiple learning outcomes without clear differentiation. For instance, between RT3, RT4, and RT5 regarding legal analysis, or RT6 and RT7, which makes them less distinguishable. They

also demonstrate a limited focus on technological competencies and linkage with legal research and writing skills.

Recommendations:

- Review learning outcomes (RTs) to consolidate overlapping outcomes for clearer assessment and prioritize their quality over quantity. Strengthen alignment between outcomes and course content.
- Expand learning outcomes (RTs) (professional ethics) coverage across multiple courses; add a research ethics element since the program is scientifically driven.
- Add specific outcomes for digital legal competencies, cross-cultural legal practice, and advanced legal research skills.

3. Professional Development. Teaching internship is present but relatively brief (4 credits). This creates a challenge to justify the scientific-pedagogical track that the program tends to have.

Recommendations:

- Potentially extend teaching internship duration.
- Introduce practitioner-led seminars and research methodology workshops throughout the program.

### **International Law (PhD)**

The doctoral program “8D04202 – International Law” is a 3-year PhD program (180 ECTS credits) that emphasizes research, academic writing, and theoretical foundations of international law. The program combines coursework, teaching practice, research internships, and dissertation work, structured around 10 learning outcomes (RT1-RT10).

Following areas for improvement

1. Program Structure. Although the program places a strong emphasis on research, it offers very limited methodological support as students’ progress, especially in terms of advanced legal research methods. The inclusion of one course in research methods for students without prior exposure may not be sufficient to prepare them for doctoral-level research. The roadmap process and supervision support appear robust but lack emphasis on ensuring baseline research competence before advancing them. Next, the university places a strong emphasis on preparing students for publication in prestigious academic journals. However, the program offers marginal career and publication guidance and research support for future graduates. Also, the university recognizes interdisciplinarity as important but has not implemented it in practice due to student preferences for focusing on international law. The absence of interdisciplinary

expertise in dissertation committees may limit the breadth and impact of research findings. Finally, such an important course of the program as Research Ethics and Integrity is missing.

Recommendations:

- Introduce advanced research methodology courses/seminars, e.g., Advanced Legal Research Methods, Quantitative Methods in Legal Research, Interdisciplinary Research Approaches, etc.; add Research Ethics and Integrity course.
- Explore the development of a bridging module for incoming PhD students without a background in scientific methods to provide additional foundational training.
- Enhance peer-review workshops where PhD students can refine research proposals and gain feedback before advancing to formal dissertation planning; establish an internal peer-review system where faculty and peers provide detailed feedback before journal submission.
- Actively encourage students to explore interdisciplinary topics by providing examples of successful interdisciplinary research and explore policy that would require at least one external or interdisciplinary expert in dissertation committees, especially for topics that overlap with economics, finance, management, political science, or technology.

2. Learning Outcomes. Some outcomes (particularly RT3) have minimal course coverage. RT# relies entirely on practical exposure without offering foundational knowledge in pedagogy and instructional technologies. There is a very limited focus on research methods, as highlighted above, including digital research methods and contemporary legal research tools. There is also insufficient emphasis on interdisciplinary approaches.

Recommendations:

- Review learning outcomes (RTs) to consolidate overlapping outcomes for clearer assessment and prioritize their quality over quantity. Alignment between outcomes and course content should be strengthened.
- Expand learning outcome RT3 (pedagogy) with additional coursework.
- Introduce course design workshops and develop assessment skills training.
- Add specific legal research competencies, including digital competencies, that are increasingly important for successful research.
- Include outcomes for interdisciplinary approaches and research ethics.

3. Publication Support. While academic writing in English is taught externally, the challenges of publishing in top-tier journals indicate room for improving students' academic writing and

understanding of international publishing standards. Emphasis on publication strategy is insufficient.

Recommendations:

- Introduce international journal publication workshops. Research presentation skills and academic English seminars should be offered. Develop publication strategy workshops; expand the academic writing curriculum to include workshops on journal selection and understanding reviewer expectations.

Since all three programs have a trilingual element, ensuring consistency and equal quality across courses taught in different languages is essential. This approach promotes fairness and academic mobility, preparing students for international opportunities while maintaining uniformity in the quality of education across language tracks.

Recommendations:

- Create a dedicated Multilingual Quality Assurance Committee and develop comprehensive language equivalence guidelines.
- Establish cross-language course alignment protocols and standardized learning outcome frameworks.
- Introduce systematic translation and verification processes.
- Establish language proficiency standards for instructors and implement regular linguistic competence assessments. Provide specialized multilingual teaching training and create language-specific pedagogical support resources.
- Conduct regular inter-language course comparisons.

## **International Relations (Bachelor)**

The ENU strategy is matched by the stated goal of the Bachelors programme ‘to prepare competitive bachelors with fundamental professional knowledge and practical skills in the field of international relations and diplomacy, with linguistic training in foreign languages for effective business and intercultural communications, capable of self-development, self-study and adaptation to changing conditions of professional activity.’ The curriculum is in line with this goal. There is an emphasis on applied knowledge and professional skills. This is reflected in the inclusion of courses about business, foreign languages, communication, project management, and various aspects of diplomatic work. The courses about Kazakhstan’s history and foreign policy are appropriate for a Kazakhstani university programme, which aims to train future diplomats for the host country. While the amount of courses about business is unusual for an International Relations programme, the experts understand that these are a product of the local context. That is, both the requirements of the job market and feedback from private sector external stakeholders, as well as Kazakhstan’s need for private and public sector personnel to facilitate a transition from an excessively resource-based economy. The experts do not recommend increasing the programme’s business-related component any further. The options to study in English, Russian, and Kazakh (as well as some electives in German and French) are also conducive to preparing students for careers in international spheres. The inclusion of educational and industrial internships likewise reflects an emphasis on preparing students for their post-graduation careers. In addition, the programme introduces students to important international issues, processes and actors such as the US and China, intergovernmental organizations, security, globalization, and ecology. Regional studies courses are also available, including (appropriately) courses about the Central Asian and post-communist regions that Kazakhstan belongs to. A range of approaches is present, including historical, politico-economic, and geopolitical. The inclusion of courses, such as Psychology, reflects an interdisciplinary element that is well-suited to preparing adaptable graduates for the 21st century job market. Another merit of the programme in IR concerns the opportunities for mobility and internationalization. Overall, the programme is appropriately structured for the preparation of foreign service and other professionals and includes a range of courses about important global actors, regions, issues, and processes that is appropriate for an International Relations degree. The above-mentioned elements of the programme adequately address the Council of Europe’s four purposes of higher education: “preparation for sustainable employment, personal development, preparing students for active citizenship, and creating a broad advanced knowledge base and stimulating research and innovation”. As noted, there is emphasis on preparation for employment, but the programme’s range of subjects (including both the political and non-political) and approaches is also conducive to the other three purposes.

The programme has been designed with consideration of the Kazakhstani state's standards and requirements. Other external stakeholders and students are also involved in the design of the programme. This includes a working group consisting of representatives of the teaching staff, students, and employers. Students' perspectives are also gathered via the use of online surveys. Also, potential employers, representatives of the business community (such as the Chairman of the Board of the Republican public association «Business Council of Youth») are involved in the external examination of the EP.

The expected student workload is sufficiently defined in ECTS credits and is transparent.

Recommendations were made as part of the previous accreditation process. First, due to the close scientific links and parallel approaches of the programmes "Political Science" and "International Relations", it was recommended to unite them within one faculty/department in order to improve the terms of cooperation. The university is in the process of doing this. The experts encourage ENU to complete the process by the time of the next accreditation. Second, it was recommended that the subject "Academic Writing" be included in the Bachelor study programme. The experts likewise recommend the inclusion of "Academic Writing" as a compulsory module at an early point in the program.

Recommendation:

- Academic Writing should be included as a compulsory module at an early point in the program.

**International Relations (Master)**

The Master's programme offers appropriate opportunities for the students' training in the scientific methods of the discipline. This includes and facilitates the students' own graduate research work in the programme. There are also electives about several important international issues and processes. Courses about security are heavily represented among the electives. This is understandable given Kazakhstan's position in an unstable region. However, as this is a Master's in International Relations rather than Security Studies, the experts recommend against further increasing the security component. ENU should instead consider adding more non-security courses. The inclusion of "Management psychology" is unusual but can be understood as another response to job market trends and external stakeholder feedback. The experts recommend against further additions of management and business related courses. The inclusion of internships is conducive to the students' academic and professional development. The same goes for the opportunities for mobility and internationalization. The programme's emphasis on preparing graduates for the local job market, particularly in the public

sector, is also reflected in the participation of external experts in its development. These notably include experts from the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Academy of Public Administration under the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Overall, the programme's structure corresponds to the general strategy of the university.

### **Political Science (Bachelor)**

The ENU strategy is matched by the stated goals of the Bachelor's programme to "provide students with the knowledge and skills in demand in the modern job market" and "to train graduates with social science knowledge who are capable of analysing political processes and phenomena, identifying their general characteristics and specifics, finding the most effective forms of political organization and development, organizing political and electoral campaigns, and developing strategic and programmatic documents for political decision-making."

The curriculum is in line with these goals. There is an emphasis on theoretical knowledge, practical training components, professional skills and interpersonal competencies. This is reflected in the inclusion of courses about political theory, Kazakh history, business and entrepreneurship, foreign languages, fundamentals of scientific research and various internships. The internships allow the students to gain professional practice, during which they can apply the knowledge gained in specific professional situations.

The elective courses allow the students to independently determine a specialization by choosing a number of elective modules in accordance with their own interests and/or the labour market needs of the region. While the range of elective modules seems both broad and relevant enough both to satisfy the interests of students of political science and prepare them for the labour market, the department might want to consider introducing minor tracks for the electives across the cycles, so that students gradually become experts in a specific specialization track, such as 'domestic politics', 'comparative politics' or 'international politics'.

It is commendable that the educational programme pays attention to students' development of critical thinking and civic responsibility by including courses such as «Philosophy», «Sociology», «Anti-Corruption Culture».

It is also worth noting that the educational programme includes courses that go beyond the discipline of political science by offering courses such as «History of Kazakhstan», «Fundamentals of Ecology and Life Safety», «Culture of Speech», «Political Ethics». Students of political science should indeed be exposed to interdisciplinary knowledge, not only to broaden their horizons, but also to better understand the underlying factors of certain processes and phenomena that they study in their core political science subjects. From this perspective, it



seems recommended to also include courses on economy and law in the educational programme, given that legal and economic aspects are closely connected to political issues. These courses could be taught by lecturers from the Economics and Law Faculties at ENU.

It is also commendable that the educational programme allows students to gain research skills by offering courses such as «Fundamentals of scientific research», «Fundamentals of academic work», and « academic writing». Even if the core goal of the programme is to train professionals for the labour market, which in most of the cases does not require research skills, any academic programme in political science should include courses that train students in research skills. In this regard, it should be noted that students felt that there was not enough emphasis in the programme on quantitative research methods, and statistics more generally.

The option to study in English, Russian or Kazakh is conducive to preparing qualified graduates for the 21st century job market.

Another merit of the educational programme is the opportunities for mobility and internationalization.

The above-mentioned elements of the programme adequately address the Council of Europe's four purposes of higher education: "preparation for sustainable employment, personal development, preparing students for active citizenship, and creating a broad advanced knowledge base and stimulating research and innovation". There is emphasis on preparation for employment, but the programme's range of subjects (including both the political and non-political) and approaches is also conducive to the other three purposes.

The programme has been designed with consideration of the Kazakhstani state's standards and requirements. Other external stakeholders (including employers) and students are also involved in the design of the programme. Students' perspectives are also gathered via the use of online surveys.

The expected student workload is sufficiently defined in ECTS credits and is transparent.

Recommendations were made as part of the previous accreditation process. First, due to the close scientific links and parallel approaches of the programmes "Political Science" and "International Relations", it was recommended to unite them within one faculty/department in order to improve the terms of cooperation. The university is in the process of doing this. The experts encourage ENU to complete the process by the time of the next accreditation. Second, it was recommended that the subject "Academic Writing" be included in the Bachelor study programme. The experts positively evaluate the inclusion of "Academic Writing" as a compulsory module at an early point in the programme.

Recommendation:

- Courses on economy and law should be introduced in the educational programme.

### **Political Science (Master)**

The ENU strategy is matched by the stated goal of the Master's programme to "prepare qualified masters of social sciences with in-depth theoretical and practical knowledge in contemporary political science, capable of applying acquired competencies in research, practical, and teaching spheres."

The curriculum is in line with this goal by offering relevant courses in each of these spheres.

It is worth noting that the programme also provides for the development of general professional competencies by including courses such as «Foreign Language», «History and Philosophy of Science», and «Management Psychology». For students interested in becoming teachers in secondary education, it is useful that the programme includes a course in «Higher Education Pedagogy».

At MA level, a programme in political science should devote enough attention to research methodology and research skills, up the point that students are able to independently conduct academic research. The educational programme seems to offer sufficient attention to developing this competence by including courses such as «Methods of Analyzing Contemporary Political Science», «Information and Analytical Support for Scientific Research», «Organization of Project Research Work», and «Social-Political Statistics and Data Analysis».

It is also worth noting that the educational programme includes courses that go beyond the discipline of political science by offering courses such as «political marketing» and «social policy of the RK». However, as noted above for the BA programme, it seems recommended to also include courses on economy and law in the educational programme, given that legal and economic aspects are closely connected to political issues. These could be advanced courses in particular economic and legal aspects, such as political economy, the economics of regional integration, and law of the Eurasian Economic Union. These courses could be taught by lecturers from the Economics and Law Faculties at ENU and/or by international lecturers.

Recommendation:

- Courses on economy and law should be introduced in the educational programme.

### **2.3 Conclusion**

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

### 3 ESG Standard 1.3: Student-centred learning, teaching, and assessment

**Institutions should ensure that the programmes are delivered in a way that encourages students to take an active role in creating the learning process, and that the assessment of students reflects this approach**

#### 3.1 Implementation

Student-centered learning plays an important role in increasing the motivation and involvement of students in the learning process. The implementation of students' needs is reflected in the choice of flexible learning paths, which are formed in the Individual Curriculum (Individual Study Plan). The requirements for the formation of the individual study program (Individual Curriculum) are reflected in the "Regulations on monitoring the academic achievements" of students. The individual study program is formed in the AIS "Platonus" with the help of an advisor, teaching staff, and heads of departments.

Before the start of the academic year, each student registers in the AIS "Platonus" for disciplines and other types of training in accordance with the educational program, thus forming an individual educational program. It contains a list of disciplines that a student or master's student chooses to study in the current academic year, as well as the number of credits corresponding to each discipline.

According to the Methodological Recommendations, conditions are created for individuals with special educational needs. The needs of students in the formation of the educational program are taken into account when developing the syllabus, when drawing up a class schedule for groups in which individuals with special educational needs are studying.

Information on the topics, forms and methods of teaching the disciplines is contained in the syllabi and educational and methodological complex of disciplines.

In general, teachers freely combine the following styles: leadership style (learning through listening and following directions); discussion style (learning through interaction). Deepening research skills through focused discussion and development of scientific mini-projects, using the conference format, for example, in the discipline "Foreign Policy of the Republic of Kazakhstan"; delegation style (learning through empowerment). Moderation of the learning process is transferred to the hands of students when they themselves propose problems for discussion and analysis (for example, choosing problems and an analysis plan), conduct business (role-playing) games on conflicts or negotiation simulations, use the lecturer-understudy format.

Theoretical and practical forms are combined (for example, lectures and practical classes), as well as group, paired and individual assignments.

Interactive and effective teaching methods aimed at actively involving students in the learning process are used: presentation analysis, seminar-discussion, network analysis method, conference form using the expert assessment method, discussion using the "small group" method, "round table", case study, "brainstorming", project form of organizing the lesson, the "six caps" method, "flipped classroom", etc.

Teachers actively use the following digital services for active learning in the online environment: for feedback - Mentimeter.com; Padlet.com; for organizing collaboration - Trello.com; Docs.google.com; miro.com; for creating digital content - Learningapps.org; edpuzzle.com; ru.khanacademy.org.

Feedback in the "teacher-student" tandem plays a key role in the continuous improvement and deepening of the set of methods.

Students and master's students are provided with access to qualified assistance and guidance from teachers in the form of consultations, tutoring sessions, individual guidance on completing projects and writing articles, feedback on the results of completed assignments.

The students' work in class, their level of activity and involvement in the discussion of the problem serve as indicators of the effectiveness of the teaching methods used. The results are discussed at department meetings. Particular attention is paid to the issues of exchanging experience of the department's teaching staff, optimizing the functioning of the mentoring institute. This is especially important in the context of ensuring constructive cooperation between the lecturer and the teacher conducting practical classes. At the end of the lesson, teachers are interested in the opinion of the students. The methods used in the process of teaching a particular discipline can be revised by the teacher during the training, replaced by more productive ones, i.e. this is a constantly evolving component of the educational process.

Curators, undergraduate and graduate advisers, as well as scientific supervisors are in constant contact with students and master's students.

Independent work is implied for each discipline, as well as within the framework of the research and scientific work for the master's degree program of the scientific and pedagogical direction (24 ECTS). The grades for the research and scientific work are posted in the journal in the AIS Platonus along with all disciplines. The effectiveness of independent work on writing a dissertation and articles is checked at department meetings during the discussion of the reports of the research work of master's students.

The relationship between the teacher and the student is built on the basis of the "Code of Corporate Culture of Teachers and Employees of the NJC L.N. Gumilyov Eurasian National University" and the Policy of academic honesty of teachers, employees, and students.

A student-centered approach and student participation in the discussion during the development of the educational program, taking into account their opinions to improve the educational process, involving student representatives in the management of the faculty (IRF Council, IRF Academic Committee) contribute to the formation of trusting relationships between students and teachers.

Of great importance for strengthening mutual respect between the teacher and the student/master's student is their joint scientific work on the implementation of scientific projects, the preparation and publication of articles in publications at both the university and national levels.

In 2022, within the framework of the "listening state" concept, a new format public reception office began operating at ENU, where the university management and staff conduct personal receptions and answer questions from students and staff and etc. The innovation is that students can ask questions of interest to them via a QR code located in all academic buildings, dormitories of the university, as well as through the rector's blog on the ENU website.

The position of Ombudsman was introduced in 2023 . The goal is to comply with the principles of business ethics and regulate social and labor disputes that arise within the team. The Ombudsman holds a reception at the Public Reception Office , holds meetings with curators, first-year students.

There is also an Anti-Corruption Compliance Service, the purpose of which is to ensure that the Company and its employees comply with the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan on combating corruption, the implementation of anti-corruption standards and the international standard ISO 37001:2016, as well as monitoring the implementation of measures to combat corruption and prevent corruption.

Students can send suggestions and recommendations to ENU social networks. Each message (suggestions, complaint) is transferred to the structural unit for the purpose and measures are taken. Consideration of complaints and suggestions from students is ensured at all levels: department, dean's office, registrar's office, vice-rectors, rector.

The contacts of the dean and deputy deans on the faculty page, the head of the chair on the department page.

Group curators and course advisers are in constant contact with students on all issues of interest to students.

The department monitors the quality of teaching in the form of mutual visits, open classes, checking the teaching and methodological documents and examination tickets by members of the department's teaching and methodological council. The results of the visits are discussed

at department meetings. Events within the framework of the School of Pedagogical Excellence, the teaching and Methodological Council and the Scientific and Methodological Council of the department are held.

The department implements procedures aimed at timely informing students about the criteria and procedures for assessing learning outcomes. During the adaptation week, first-year students are required to familiarize themselves with the Guide for First-Year Students, the Academic Policy, the Rules for Conducting Current and Midterm Progress Monitoring, Midterm and Final Assessment.

Teachers regularly discuss assessment criteria with undergraduate and graduate students, provide examples of successful work, and explain the expected standards for completing assignments. This includes organizing consultations where detailed information on assessment criteria is provided. Rubrics and assessment criteria are actively used to ensure the transparency and objectivity of assessment procedures.

Students' achievement of the planned learning outcome is demonstrated in classes, midterm and final assessments, which is reflected in the Current Academic Progress Journal in the AIS "Platonus". If desired, parents of students have the opportunity to monitor their children's academic achievements through the AIS "Platonus".

To demonstrate the level of achievement of planned learning outcomes, various forms of assessment are used. This may include exams, tests, practical assignments, projects, case studies and other types of assessment activities. This approach allows students to demonstrate their knowledge and skills in various situations and contexts.

Students and postgraduates participate in the process of self-assessment and reflection on their level of achievement of planned learning outcomes. They analyze their results, identify the strengths and weaknesses of their learning and develop action plans for further improvement. This approach allows students to actively participate in their education and improve its effectiveness.

The elective courses taught in the educational program make extensive use of the case study method, which refers to given scenarios based on situations in which learners observe, analyze, record, implement, draw conclusions, generalize or recommend. Assessment procedures take into account the individual needs and characteristics of students and create an inclusive environment where each learner has an equal opportunity to learn successfully. Teachers personalize feedback, taking into account the individual needs and characteristics of each learner. This may include providing adaptive measures for learners with students with special needs, taking into account different learning styles and providing additional support and assistance when necessary.

Teachers use a variety of forms of feedback to ensure that it is effective and useful for students. This can be oral feedback during lectures and practical classes, as well as written comments on the work of students and postgraduates, electronic messages or individual consultations, comments in the Platonus system and via messengers.

As part of feedback, teachers provide students with advice on the learning process aimed at their academic and personal growth. This can be either specific guidance on improving results or recommendations on optimizing teaching methods, developing self-organization skills and increasing motivation.

The final assessment for the discipline is assessed according to the assessment criteria. The final assessment for the discipline is mandatory conducted jointly with an independent examiner. According to the "Regulations on monitoring the academic achievements of students" an electronic list of independent examiners is generated by the head of the department in the personal account "Platonus". This list is approved by the dean two weeks before the start of the session. The results of the final assessment are also published in the AIS "Platonus".

The appeal procedure is regulated by point 5.8 of the Academic Policy and point 4.9 of the Rules for conducting current and midterm monitoring of academic performance, midterm and final assessment. A student who disagrees with the result of the final assessment for a discipline has the right to submit an appeal to the dean of the faculty no later than the next working day after the exam.

The department guarantees students the right to appeal in accordance with established procedures and regulations. This includes providing information on appeal rules and procedures, access to relevant forms and documents required to file an appeal and advisory support for students wishing to exercise this right.

Before each examination session, the department forms an Appeals Committee. This ensures that each appeal is considered fairly and impartially.

### **3.2 Assessment**

The university employs diverse teaching methods, including discussions, role-playing, flipped classrooms, and case studies, combined with digital tools like Mentimeter and Trello. This variety ensures students engage actively and learning styles are accommodated. Continuous improvement is supported through student feedback, peer reviews, and professional development programs for faculty. Students can share complaints or suggestions through QR codes, social media, or direct contact with faculty and university management. A public reception office and the rector's blog provide platforms for open communication, demonstrating the university's commitment to listening and improving.

Assessment is transparent, with clear criteria shared in syllabi and rubrics. Exams, projects, and case studies align with learning goals. Independent examiners oversee final exams, and results are shared in the "Platonus" system. Students receive personalized feedback, ensuring fair and constructive evaluations.

Students can appeal assessments through a structured process handled by an Appeals Committee, ensuring fairness. Clear policies guide this process, giving students confidence in the system.

PhD students receive strong support through regular consultations and tailored guidance from supervisors. Collaborative mentoring and professional development for supervisors help ensure students meet their academic goals. A shared culture of supervision is actively being developed.

The diverse teaching methods, student-centered approach, and transparent assessment processes stand out as strengths. Further development of the appeals process and additional training for supervisors could enhance these systems further.

The university has implemented more innovative teaching methods, improved assessment transparency, and expanded feedback channels.

The recruitment processes are clear and transparent. ENU provides support to the teaching staff for their professional development. Staff participate in internships and training programmes. They are also offered opportunities to follow trainings at foreign universities, including in EU member countries. Moral and material rewards are used to encourage professional development. Staff have also received external grants for research projects. Nonetheless, more could be done to improve the scholarly output of staff. The previous accreditation report recommended for ENU to consider adjusting the curriculum of the teaching staff to provide more time for research. The experts concur with this recommendation. Students highlighted that some teaching staff seem to be overburdened, which in part has to do with the fact that student numbers have continued to grow. This makes it more challenging to give feedback to students on individual assignments. The experts also recommend that ENU consider devoting a portion of the ENU budget to a research fund for staff research expenses. More publications in respected international journals will aid ENU in its transition into a research university.

The experts commend the staff winners of the "Best University Teacher" award. More broadly, the programme shows a good variety of innovative teaching methods. It is also a positive development that the percentage of faculty members with a higher degree has continued to rise since the previous accreditation period. Overall, students tended to perceive the teaching staff as competent and appreciated diversity of teaching formats, including the interactive teaching.



However, there seemed to be variation between the staff in terms of their perceived competences and flexibility, with some staff being perceived by students as more competent than others. Students particularly noted a gap between the older and younger generation of teaching staff. Although this does not apply generally, students remarked that some of the older staff were less flexible in terms of adapting and diversifying teaching methods and specifically struggled with embedding IT and software into their teaching and communication practices. Similarly, students highlighted that not all staff who teach in English sufficiently master the language, which has a strong negative effect on the quality of the teaching. Consequently, it is recommended for the programme to introduce stricter requirements for teaching staff, both with respect to knowledge of applied IT and software and fluency in English as a language of instruction.

With respect to assessment methods, the self-assessment form indicated that there are three forms of possible final assessment, namely oral exams, written exams and test assignments. Students confirmed that the assessment methods varied in the MA programme. However, they mentioned that the overall majority of courses in the BA study programme were assessed via written exams. Some students deplored this, as they had hoped for more diversity in the assessment methods. While this might be a matter of feasibility given the large number of students, it seems recommended to encourage teaching staff of courses in the BA programme to re-evaluate their assessment methods and if possible to introduce a different assessment method for their courses.

It is commendable that the programme includes opportunities to be exposed to foreign teaching staff and to engage in mobility at foreign universities.

### 3.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

## 4 ESG Standard 1.4: Student admission, progression, recognition, and certification

**Institutions should consistently apply pre-defined and published regulations covering all phases of the student “life cycle”, e.g. student admission, progression, recognition and certification.**

### 4.1 Implementation

Admission of the students is carried out on the basis of the Rules for admission to study in educational programs which is approved by the decision of the Board of Directors at the end of each academic year for the upcoming year.

The University ensures the availability of information about the rules and conditions of admission. Information on the rules and conditions of admission is posted on the University website in the section (Applicants).

All stages of student's life cycle are reflected in Regulations on monitoring the academic achievements of students and in Academic policy of the university.

Traditionally, at the beginning of the academic year, meetings are held for first-year students as part of the adaptation week, which cover the rules of the educational process, living in student houses, participation in student organizations (online format on the Zoom, YouTube platforms). Students are provided with ENU Student Guide.

On August 29, 2023, ENU Ombudsman took part in a meeting with first-year students. During the meeting, the Ombudsman introduced the first-year students to the Ombudsman Regulations, informed them about the tasks and functions of the Ombudsman, provided legal education to students on their rights, legal interests and responsibilities at the university, on issues of monitoring compliance with the rights and interests of students, and provided her contact information so that students could file a complaint if any controversial situations arise.

During the adaptation week, student groups are organized, curators, advisers and leaders of the group from active students are appointed. Each curator of the 1st year group held the first curator hour to get acquainted with the students.

Kazakhstan is a signatory to the Lisbon Convention on the Recognition of Qualifications. In accordance with it, ENU provides for the transfer of disciplines in the corresponding/related EP.

Upon completion of the educational programs, a diploma and transcript are issued in three languages - Kazakh, Russian and English. Graduates also receive diploma supplement.

## **4.2 Assessment**

The admission process is clearly defined and transparent, with rules and conditions published on the university website in the "Applicants" section. Admission for international students includes an interview process, ensuring inclusivity and alignment with academic goals. During the adaptation week, students receive comprehensive information about university life and academic regulations through meetings, guides, and direct contact with curators and advisers. This ensures clarity and support for incoming students.

Student progression is monitored through the "Regulations on Monitoring the Academic Achievements of Students" and the university's academic policies. The institution emphasizes student support by appointing curators and advisors for each group and actively engaging first-year students during orientation. The ENU Ombudsman provides an additional channel for

addressing issues related to students' rights and progression, ensuring a fair and supportive environment.

As a signatory to the Lisbon Recognition Convention, the university has robust recognition procedures for qualifications and credits. For instance, credits earned during academic mobility programs are transferred seamlessly to related educational programs. The procedures align with international standards, demonstrating the institution's commitment to academic mobility and transparency.

Graduates receive diplomas and transcripts in three languages (Kazakh, Russian, and English), which detail the qualification earned, learning outcomes, and program specifics. This ensures that students have clear and portable documentation of their achievements.

The recruitment process for doctoral programs is linked to explicit outcomes, focusing on admitting candidates who align with the program's objectives. Students can select supervisors, enhancing flexibility in pursuing specific research interests. The public admission criteria are clear and accessible, promoting transparency.

Doctoral candidates are recognized as early-stage researchers and receive the necessary support to develop their academic and professional skills.

The structured and transparent admission process, particularly for international students, ensures inclusivity. Clear recognition procedures for qualifications and credits reflect international best practices.

Graduation documents in multiple languages enhance global portability for students.

The emphasis on student support, including the Ombudsman and curators, creates a welcoming environment for progression. Strengthening digital tools to provide real-time updates on progression and recognition processes could enhance accessibility.

Expanding flexibility in supervisor selection for PhD students may better align research goals with student interests.

#### **4.3 Conclusion**

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

### **5 ESG Standard 1.5: Teaching staff**

<b>Institutions should assure themselves of the competence of their teachers. They should apply fair and transparent processes for the recruitment and development of the staff</b>
---

## 5.1 Implementation

Hiring and professional development procedures for employees are carried out based on national legislation and the university's internal documentation.

The University has established an HR department responsible for staffing the university's structural divisions, developing HR policies for competitive staff selection, and managing the adaptation and onboarding processes for new employees.

Faculty recruitment is organized by the university on a competitive basis. Announcements for vacant faculty and research positions are published through mass media and on the University's website.

The main document regulating personnel management at the university is the ENU Personnel Policy for 2021-2025. This document is focused on developing human potential, attracting top employees, fostering their development, showing respect to everyone, creating a favorable work environment, and improving the quality and effectiveness of the team's activities.

Transparency in personnel procedures is ensured by publishing relevant information on the university's website and disseminating it through dean's offices and departments, using various sources (university website, hh.kz, enbek.kz, recruitment agencies, etc.). Information about the recruitment process for vacant positions is available on the website.

For professional development and the realization of creative needs of each category of employees at the University are implemented mechanisms of moral and material incentives: commendations, awarding diplomas, payment of bonuses, presentation for the title «Honorary Worker of Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan», recommendation for participation in the competition «The best teacher of the university», professional development.

Professional development is carried out through seminars, online seminars, Coursera courses and internships at leading universities and enterprises in Kazakhstan and abroad.

To support the professional development and creative needs of each category of staff, ENU implements mechanisms for moral and material encouragement: commendations, awards, bonuses, nominations for the title of «Honorary Worker of Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan», recommendations for participation in the «Best University Teacher» competition, and opportunities for further training.

Incentives for faculty include KPI-based rewards (KPI Regulations), rewards for publishing articles in high-impact foreign journals and additional payments to faculty teaching in English.

## 5.2 Assessment

Currently, the academic teaching staff in the Department of Economics comprises some two dozen people, all of whom (except one) hold a Ph.D. degree. More than 80 per cent of the teaching staff is female.

Personnel management in the Department of Economics follows the rules of the university, as laid down in the documented and publicly available "Personnel Policy of ENU." Qualification requirements for teaching positions are defined statewide. Transparency in staffing procedures is ensured by publishing relevant information on the university's website and disseminating it through deans' offices and departments.

As all (except one) of the academic teaching staff in the Department of Economics hold a Ph.D. degree, they are thus eligible to teach both in the Bachelor and in the Master programs. With a minimum teaching load of 30 credits per year, the staff size appears appropriate to carry out the study programs (including the Ph.D. program).

The department also employs international research advisors for supervising Ph.D. students.

ENU contracts for teaching staff are typically permanent, except for part-time practitioners. Contracts require at least two publications per year. In 2023, the teachers of the Economics Department shared 16 impact factor journal publications among them. Over the past six years, teachers of the Economics Department completed two international projects within the National Technical Center and three projects funded by the Ministry of Education.

Again, at university level, open to all departments, teachers can go to professional development courses on developing their methodological skills with international partner universities, supported by 500 licenses for the skill development platform *Coursera*. These possibilities are used to considerable degrees within the Department of Economics. The department also offers opportunities for research internships abroad for both staff and Ph.D. students.

A useful feature for securing the teaching staff's keeping up-to-date with teaching methods and technologies is the ENU-wide implemented student feedback in form of end-of semester student surveys. The surveys are anonymous and online, and processed by an independent department. Processed and anonymized data are sent to the department and to the faculties. Issues based on students' negative answers can then be dealt with at the department level.

The recruitment processes are clear and transparent. ENU provides support to the teaching staff for their professional development. Staff participate in internships and training programmes. They are also offered opportunities to follow trainings at foreign universities, including in EU member countries. Moral and material rewards are used to encourage professional development. Staff have also received external grants for research projects. Nonetheless, more could be done to improve the scholarly output of staff. The previous accreditation report

recommended for ENU to consider adjusting the curriculum of the teaching staff to provide more time for research. The experts concur with this recommendation. Students highlighted that some teaching staff seem to be overburdened, which in part has to do with the fact that student numbers have continued to grow. This makes it more challenging to give feedback to students on individual assignments. The experts also recommend that ENU consider devoting a portion of the ENU budget to a research fund for staff research expenses. More publications in respected international journals will aid ENU in its transition into a research university.

The experts commend the staff winners of the “Best University Teacher” award. More broadly, the programme shows a good variety of innovative teaching methods. It is also a positive development that the percentage of faculty members with a higher degree has continued to rise since the previous accreditation period. Overall, students tended to perceive the teaching staff as competent. It is, however, unusual that a large portion of the teaching staff were trained as historians in their graduate studies. On the other hand, these staff do show a commitment to developing their expertise in and producing research about International Relations. Also, there are staff, particularly among the newer members, who do have higher degrees in the field. Consequently, it is recommended for the programme to prioritize candidates with higher degrees in International Relations when it recruits new staff.

The programme has given its students some opportunities to be exposed to foreign teaching staff. While it is commendable that students in the BA and MA programmes in IR are offered opportunities for mobility, not all students of these programmes go abroad and hence it would be beneficial to have more exposure to foreign teaching staff. Therefore, the experts recommend for ENU to make greater efforts to attract foreign teaching staff, particularly on a longer term or even permanent basis. The previous accreditation report had likewise expressed concerns about “a decrease in the rate of attraction of foreign and domestic teachers to conduct joint research in the implementation of educational programs.”

### 5.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

## 6 ESG Standard 1.6: Learning resources and student support

**Institutions should have appropriate funding for learning and teaching activities and ensure that adequate and readily accessible learning resources and student support are provided.**

### 6.1 Implementation

The scientific library is located in two buildings. The main building houses subscriptions to textbooks and literature in foreign languages. The library offers students and faculty access to

2 electronic halls with 150 computers, internet access, and subscription databases; 12 reading rooms with a total of 830 seats for users; and coworking zones for independent work on all floors. On the third floor, the Information Resource Center «American Corner and Maker Space» is available, providing access to high-quality English language learning materials, conversation clubs, the E-library USA research database, and collections of printed books. The Maker Space area offers various courses on modeling, 3D printing, robotics, etc. To support research activities, a reference and advisory service operates, providing consultations and training on working with electronic resources. To create favorable conditions for students with special educational needs, an Inclusive Information Resource Center operates. This center is equipped with computers with internet access and subscription databases. Some of the available databases have special services for inclusive education. Computers are equipped with software allowing visually impaired and blind students to listen to and type texts.

The library's fund is reflected in the electronic library and provides various services to users for accessing information, searching, viewing, ordering necessary literature, and obtaining various analytical and statistical information.

The electronic catalogue database includes 205,067 bibliographic records reflecting printed documents, electronic documents from the library's collection, as well as networked, local, and installed documents, providing access to digitized full texts – 68,539 units of textbooks, teaching aids, monographs, conference materials, etc.

To support graduate employment, the university has a Career and Business Partnership Department, which attracts employers to conduct various events at the university to inform students and graduates of ENU about job opportunities and professional internships.

The following types of social support are provided: Provision of benefits for tuition fees, Benefits for accommodation in Student Houses, Medical care at Astana Clinic, Social support for students from among orphans, orphans left without guardianship and under guardianship.

For students with disabilities (those with visual and hearing disabilities - until the deadline specified in the disability certificate and Medical Advisory Committee) 75% supplement to the scholarship based on the results of the examination session with excellent or good academic performance.

The University has various Support Services which includes psychological support services for students, faculty and staff, Inclusive Support Center, Center “Oner ortalygy”, Directorate of Student Houses (Regulations on the Directorate of Student Houses Eurasian National University named after L.N. Gumilyov).

The Inclusive Information and Resource Center operates on the premises of the scientific library. It is equipped with a PC and a scanner and speaking programs that facilitate access to

information for students with visual impairments. A coworking area has been opened on the first floor of the library, allowing students with special educational needs to study within the library walls, take part in events, work together with teachers and fellow students, and engage in self-education. The Center's resource fund is replenished with audio publications. The adaptive capabilities of the available electronic library systems "Lan", "IPR Books" and "Student Consultant" are used in servicing students with special educational needs. Information and library services in the context of distance learning are provided via the WhatsApp messenger, e-mail, and home delivery of textbooks from the library fund.

## 6.2 Assessment

Student information on available resources and support, the organization of the university, educational programs, etc., is assembled in a student guidebook (seperately edited for freshmen), available online at the university portal, at <https://www.enu.kz/en/page/for-students/students-guide>. Portal access is provided via internet or the internal network of the university. The automated information system PLATONUS provides for each student a personal account, allowing access to study-relevant information.

ENU is a successful, and therefore fast growing entity, with its student body approaching 30,000. Consequently, the university is outgrowing its campus: finding space for offices, classrooms and dormitories has developed into a development barrier. This, however, is to change with opening a new campus projected outside of the city, which will be able to host some 20,000 students, mainly from natural sciences. The rest, including the social sciences, will be able to spread on the "old" campus. While the existing campus is in principle technically functioning and appropriate, in discussions with students, however, we noted that in some classrooms, there appears to be a lack of technical equipment, such as projectors.

On campus, ENU also provides for student recreation, sports grounds, public catering facilities for students, faculty and staff, and a a medical center. Specifically for mental health, the university provides counseling sessions: seven psychologists can be called any time. Since 2022, ENU has institutionalized a service of individualized inclusion support for students with disabilities.

The heart of the infrastructure equipment is ENU's university library, hosting some 1.5 million books. However, at least as important for today's world of learning are the digital resources provided by the library services to personalize learning. The library's digital resources can be accessed remotely through the website <https://lib.enu.kz>. The library actively uses social networks (Facebook, Instagram, YouTube) to inform about its resources. For Bachelor students, remote access to electronic textbooks provided by the library is the most important resource of learning. For Master and Ph.D. Students in the social science area, access to journals and



databases be-comes more important. In terms of journal access, ENU library gives access to open access arti-cles and to scientific journal content included in the national subscriptions of the Ministry of Science and Higher Education. This does include remote access to a number of social science journals from leading publishers. In terms of databases, the library bundles access to many sec-ondary open access data relevant for social science students. Primary data access with relevance to social sciences includes companies' financial statements and court decisions. The library regu-larly collects data requests from departments, deciding upon affordability and priority.

Apart from for what is offered by the library, other primary (research) databases result from individual teachers' efforts, e.g. on the basis of research project funding, and appear not to be systematically catalogued beyond department levels. A similar situation appears to hold in terms of software: there is—except for an educational Microsoft Office license allocated to each student—no centralized access for downloading software that would enable predomi-nantly Master and Ph.D. level students to use, e.g., relevant quantitative empirical methods of social sciences. From the Department of Economics documentation we know from one such individualized effort, in which “Computer class No.102 was equipped with software for statisti-cal calculations PSPP and R for conducting the course "Statistical analysis in economics and business" by foreign professor, for 2nd-year master's students of the Economics programme.” In our judgement, this so far prevalent absence of a systematic approach to establishing a software catalogue (for students and staff alike) does not result from a lack of funding. Rather, at least in part it appears to be a consequence of choice in terms of EP structures that have so far not stressed teaching quantitative empirical methods of social sciences (see section II.2 above).

At ENU, internationalization and student mobility are core concerns. 10 per cent of students are degree seeking foreign students; in addition, ENU hosts a number of exchange students. Foreign students are integrated by preparative courses.

ENU participates in all academic mobility programs supported by the Ministry of Higher Educa-tion and Science, including ErasmusPlus and intergovernmental agreements. Beyond that, ENU offers selected international double-degree programs, and both students and staff profit from a considerable number of bilateral exchange agreements with international universities. Individual (conference or research) travel support varies by program level, reaching 3 months internship for Ph.D. students at partner/supervisor university.

Also in part reflecting its internationalization efforts, ENU follows a policy of trilingualism. Spe-cifically in multilingual groups at Bachelor level, all three languages (Kazakh, Russian and English.) are used. On Master level, some courses may be offered in English only.

ENU student learning is dominated by traditional types of learning, in lectures, seminars, practical exercises, and independent work of the student. In our meeting with students, some comments concerned a lack of using new technology in teaching, and, on individual basis, some teachers' lack of quantitative skills as well as English language skills in classes to be taught in English.

There are various channels for student feedback on this and other issues—social networks, the rector's blog on the website, and specifically the ENU-wide implemented student feedback in form of anonymous online end-of semester student surveys. Beyond this, students are involved in academic council meetings, department meetings, and in in the ENU budget committee.

Overall, the material and technical base and information resources of the university are sufficient and correspond to the requirements of the programs being implemented.

In general, the experts have the impression that the study programmes are endowed with the necessary teaching materials, material equipment and computer technology for an effective and meaningful learning process. Together, the material and technical base and resources of the university enable offering high-quality training and preparation of specialists within the BA and MA programmes.

Generally, students seem satisfied with the educational material and technical base and resources, as well as with the accessibility and range of the resources of the library. However, some students complained about the limited capacity of the faculty infrastructure to host all the students. The experts are aware that the university has seen its student numbers grow exponentially. The new campus that is being built might partly solve this problem, but students of political science will remain in the old campus, where the material infrastructure is not always sufficiently modernized.

With respect to learning materials and syllabi, students seemed generally satisfied with the diversity and quality of the material. However, some students remarked that a number of courses work with outdated readings and study materials. Therefore, it seems recommended to use stricter requirements for teaching staff with respect to annual updates of the substance and readings of the courses and to closely follow up if such complaints about the learning material emerge from the student surveys.

### **6.3 Conclusion**

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

## 7 ESG Standard 1.7: Information management

**Institutions should ensure that they collect, analyse and use relevant information for the effective management of their programmes and other activities.**

### 7.1 Implementation

Collection of information through the AIS "Platonus", reviews in social networks and accounts, stakeholder surveys are carried out in order to provide feedback and make appropriate decisions.

Seven types of surveys are conducted at ENU:

- online survey of first-year students on the reasons for choosing L.N. Gumilyov ENU;
- Assessment of student satisfaction with the quality of teaching disciplines at L.N. Gumilyov ENU for the 1st semester, Assessment of student satisfaction with the quality of teaching disciplines at L.N. Gumilyov ENU for the 2nd semester;
- Student satisfaction with the organization and implementation of professional practice (educational, pedagogical, research, industrial, pre-graduation) at L.N. Gumilyov ENU;
- Assessment of student satisfaction with the quality of educational services provided, learning conditions at L.N. Gumilyov ENU;
- Assessment of satisfaction with the working conditions of L.N. Gumilyov ENU" (among the teaching staff and employees);
- Satisfaction of graduates with the quality of educational services provided by L.N. Gumilyov ENU.
- Assessment of the quality of training of graduates of the L.N. Gumilyov ENU (among employers).

The Registrar's Office should be highlighted operates in real time and maintains a consultation page on key issues related to the movement of the contingent. Students also have the opportunity to apply for services through the SSC module in their personal account in the AIS "Platonus". There is a system for independently submitting an application for the summer and additional semester. Students can take additional training by submitting an application through the Institute of Continuous Education.

The Council of Employers of ENU is functioning, which includes various enterprises and organizations, including the State Institution "Employment Center" of the Akimat of Astana.

The Department of Career and Business Partnership operates, the purpose of which is to develop a system of interaction between employers and the university in order to form the necessary professional and social-personal competencies of graduates. Every year, graduates who studied on a grant are distributed among three levels.

The Alumni Office monitors the employment and career expectations of the graduates. The main tasks are to identify the main factors that influenced the employment of graduates and the problems they faced, organize the work of the Call-centre Telsurvey, and track the career trajectory of the ENU graduates.

Since 2008, the public association "Association "Tulek" of the L.N. Gumilyov ENU" has been operating. Its mission is to unite the efforts of the intellectual, creative and business potential of graduates to solve the socio-economic problems of the Republic of Kazakhstan, as well as to find effective solutions to the problems that graduates face in their practical activities and life, in assisting the university in strategic development.

Based on the ENU Development Strategy, Operational Plans are developed annually, reports on achieving target indicators and development indicators are defended.

Achieving development indicators is implemented in the KPIs of deans and heads of departments.

Thus, information management and reporting are aimed at improving the quality of the educational process, involving all stakeholders.

## **7.2 Assessment**

ENU presented information on the Information management system in the context of the study programmes undergoing accreditation. The university has a comprehensive system for collecting and analysing information. The university collects data on admissions, profile of student body, student progression, drop-out rates, student satisfaction. The information on graduates and their employment is systematically collected. The university maintains a permanent statistical record of the progress of students in the offered study programmes.

ENU conducts surveys of different stakeholders such as students, faculty, potential employers.

Information about study programmes is carried out based on collection, analysis, and use of relevant information. The collected data are used to summarise the results and the effectiveness of the study programmes. During the conversation with students, it was noted that students actively use the Platonus platform in their educational activities on a regular basis. The positive highlight is that the university uses a system that allows to collect data, monitor, and manage information about the achievements of students, among other applications.

### 7.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

## 8 ESG Standard 1.8: Public information

**Institutions should publish information about their activities, including programmes, which is clear, accurate, objective, up-to date and readily accessible.**

### 8.1 Implementation

One of the main sources of information for applicants, students and other interested parties is the ENU website, faculty page on the website and social networks.

For applicants, the “Applicants” tab provides all the necessary information: admission rules, announcements, information about creative exams, regulatory legal acts, information about the special exam in pedagogical sciences, a list of documents, etc.

There is a page on the website of the ENU with information for students.

The website regularly publishes news and announcements.

The University has a YouTube channel with 6.5 thousand subscribers where various video materials, open classes, interviews with guests, etc. are presented.

Each Faculty regularly publishes information about various events and news of departments.

Information on the department's educational program is posted on the website on the official Instagram page of the departments, Telegram channel, TikTok.

The university annually organizes "Open Days" for senior school students in Astana.

The teachers of the department provide consultations on the EP for applicants during the work of the Admissions Committee.

Interaction with employers is carried out through meetings within the walls of the university with representatives of organizations, as well as explanatory work in the organizations themselves.

A traditional "Job Fair" is held for graduates.

### 8.2 Assessment

The official website of ENU serves as the main source of the basic information about the history of creation and study process relevant details of the university. The university website has a designated section for applicants with the details outlining the functions of the admissions committee with working hours and contact details which is available on the landing page of the website. The rules for admission to ENU are reflected on the Applicant tab, where a list of

educational programmes is listed. The dissemination of information about the university is also carried out through its social media pages and accounts on the following platforms: Facebook, Instagram, VKontakte, and YouTube.

### 8.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

## 9 ESG Standard 1.9: On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes

**Institutions should monitor and periodically review their programmes to ensure that they achieve the objectives set for them and respond to the needs of students and society. These reviews should lead to continuous improvement of the programme. Any action planned or taken as a result should be communicated to all those concerned.**

### 9.1 Implementation

The quality of the EP implementation is one of the primary tasks of ENU, which is consistent with the mission and vision.

ENU has developed fundamental documents and internal regulatory documentation, according to which comprehensive activities are carried out aimed at ensuring the quality of the implemented EP.

The university annually conducts internal monitoring on the basis of the Order of the Chairman of the Board - Rector of the University and in accordance with the "Regulations on monitoring and examination of the quality of the implementation of educational programs" (approved by the Decision of the Board of the NJSC L.N. Gumilyov ENU, minutes No. 15, dated October 22, 2022).

Monitoring of the implementation of the EP is carried out by the Quality Assessment Center. Assessment of the quality of the implementation of the EP is carried out within the framework of surveys of students in terms of levels of training, employers and other stakeholders. The procedure is regulated by the Survey Guidelines.

The results of monitoring, surveys and other issues on the quality of the implementation of the EP are considered at meetings of the collegial bodies of the university (Educational and Methodological Council, Academic Council).

There is a regular monitoring of the content of similar EPs of foreign universities, requests and proposals of stakeholders (employers, students and trends in the development of international relations as an academic professional environment) for the purpose of further improvement.

In order to ensure effective implementation and create a favourable learning environment, the department reviews the content and structure of the EP, taking into account changes in the

labor market, employers' requirements and the demands of society. An extended meeting of the department is held annually to review the EP for relevance with the participation of all stakeholders. The participation of students and graduates makes it possible to determine the needs of students, who can suggest the inclusion of new learning outcomes/competencies. The participation of employers at the meeting makes it possible to determine new competencies, expectations of the professional community, and also update the content of existing courses/modules.

The distribution of academic hours for lectures, seminars and Individual Work of Students is carried out in accordance with regulatory acts and is organized in such a way as to provide students with the opportunity to gain solid knowledge of the discipline, with a special emphasis on individual creative work. The departments analyze the academic performance of students, assess the adequacy of the workload of disciplines, based on the results of which changes are introduced into the workload of disciplines. The analysis of academic performance also provides the level of effectiveness of student assessment procedures, and the department also analyzes the compliance of student assessment forms with the learning outcomes of the discipline.

The department maintains contact with practice bases, as a result of which the practice bases provide their feedback. It also maintains contact with graduates. Feedback from foreign scientists and practitioners is collected.

## **9.2 Assessment**

The university demonstrates a strong commitment to continuous monitoring and improvement of its educational programs (EPs), ensuring alignment with its mission and vision. Annual reviews are conducted based on internal regulations and feedback from stakeholders, including students, employers, and academic staff. These reviews are discussed in university councils and department meetings, creating a closed loop for continuous enhancement. The systematic incorporation of feedback, particularly from students and employers, ensures programs are updated to reflect changing societal needs and labor market demands. Key instruments for program development include regular benchmarking with similar programs at foreign universities, integrating the latest research trends, and addressing the evolving expectations of society. The workload distribution for students is carefully managed, with a cap of six hours of classes per day, and academic performance is regularly analyzed to optimize workloads and ensure alignment with learning outcomes. Assessment procedures are periodically reviewed to ensure they effectively measure intended learning outcomes and meet the needs of students and stakeholders.

The participation of stakeholders, including students, employers, and alumni, is a central element of program development. Annual departmental meetings provide a platform for stakeholders to propose updates to competencies and course content. Feedback mechanisms, including surveys and meetings, inform program adjustments, ensuring relevance and quality. The results of these processes are communicated transparently through self-assessment reports and public forums, reinforcing trust and engagement. The learning environment and support services are tailored to meet the needs of students, with departments maintaining close contact with internship providers and graduates. Feedback from international experts and foreign practitioners further enhances program relevance and quality.

Particularly positive aspects include the systematic and inclusive approach to program monitoring, the alignment of content with the latest research and labor market needs, and the transparency of communication with stakeholders. Areas for optimization include expanding digital tools for real-time feedback and enhancing support for aligning student workload with individual needs.

### 9.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

## 10 ESG Standard 1.10: Cyclical external quality assurance

**Institutions should undergo external quality assurance in line with the ESG on a cyclical basis**

### 10.1 Implementation

The following external quality assurance tools can be distinguished:

1. Ratings of the EP IAAR and "Atameken" National Chamber of Entrepreneurs
2. Subject ranking of the International agency Times Higher Education Ranking–2022
3. External examinations of the EP by employers
4. The external accreditation procedure (in accordance with the terms of issuance of the certificate). Based on the results of monitoring and evaluation of the EP, corrective work is carried out aimed at continuous improvement.

All study programmes are accredited by national and international agencies. The university has successfully passed institutional accreditation.



During the 2017 accreditation, experts from the ACQUIN Institute for Accreditation, Certification and Quality Assurance made a number of recommendations, following which several actions were taken to improve the quality of educational program. All recommendations have been considered and implemented.

### **10.2 Assessment**

ENU has successfully undergone several reputable national and international accreditations. External accreditation procedures are held regularly. At the same time, preparation and improvements at the university are a continuous commitment as many of them can be done prior to or in-between the accreditation initiations, as there are specific recommendations and opportunities for constant improvements available; both in the medium and long term, the associated 58 endeavours at the department levels can be planned and implemented in a way that goes beyond the specified baselines.

### **10.3 Conclusion**

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

#### IV Recommendation to the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN

##### 1 **Assessment of compliance the Standards and Guidelines in the Higher European Area (ESG) in the actual official version**

The study programmes “**International Law**” (Bachelor), “**International Law**” (Master scientific and pedagogical direction), “**International Law**” (PhD), “**International Relations**” (Bachelor), “**International Relations**” (Master scientific and pedagogical direction) , “**Political Science**” (Bachelor), “**Political Science**” (Master scientific and pedagogical direction), “**Economics**” (Bachelor), “**Economics**” (Master scientific and pedagogical direction), “**Management**” (Bachelor), “**Management**” (Master scientific and pedagogical direction) were assessed on the basis of the "Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area" (ESG), the Salzburg Recommendations (applicable for doctorate programmes), and the national or other relevant regulations.

The expert group concludes that the **ESG standards** 1.1 (Policy for quality assurance), 1.2 (Design and approval of programmes), 1.3 (Student-centred learning, teaching and assessment), 1.4 (Student admission, progression, recognition and certification), 1.5 (Teaching staff), 1.6 (Learning resources and student support), 1.7 (Information management), 1.8 (Public information), 1.9 (On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes) and 1.10 (Cyclical external quality assurance) are fulfilled.

[The expert group concludes that the **Salzburg Recommendations** 1 (Research as the basis and the difference), 2 (Critical mass and critical diversity), 3 (Recruitment, admission and status), 4 (Supervision), 5 (Outcomes), 6 (Career development), 7 (Credits), 8 (Quality and accountability), 9 (Internationalisation), 10 (Funding) 11 (Autonomy), 12 (Legal framework) and 13 (Intersectoral collaboration) are fulfilled.]

##### *Comprehensive evaluation of the expert group*

It must be shown from the previous evaluation criteria that / how criteria are fulfilled and / or which deficiencies exist, if any.

The assessment criteria are as follows:

**Standard 1.1 Policy for quality assurance:** Universities have a publicly accessible quality assurance strategy, which is part of their strategic management. This strategy is developed and implemented by internal stakeholder representatives through appropriate structures and processes, involving external stakeholders.

For PhD programmes additionally apply

- Salzburg Recommendation 8: Quality and accountability
- Salzburg Recommendation 12: Legal framework
- Salzburg Recommendation 13: Intersectoral collaboration

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.2 Design and approval of programmes:** Universities have procedures for the design and approval of their courses. The courses are designed in such a way that their objectives, including the desired learning outcomes, can be achieved. The qualification obtained during a degree program is clearly defined and communicated; it refers to the corresponding level of the national qualifications framework for higher education and, consequently, the qualifications framework for the European Higher Education Area.

For PhD programmes additionally apply

- Salzburg Recommendation 11: Autonomy
- Salzburg Recommendation 1: Research as the basis and the difference
- Salzburg Recommendation 2: Critical mass and critical diversity
- Salzburg Recommendation 5: Outcomes
- Salzburg Recommendation 7: Credits
- Salzburg Recommendation 9: Internationalisation
- Salzburg Recommendation 6: Career development

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.3 Student-centred learning, teaching and assessment:** Universities ensure that the courses offered are carried out in such a way as to encourage students to play an active role in the design of the learning process and that this approach is also taken into account when assessing students / examinations.

For PhD programmes additionally apply

- Salzburg Recommendation 4: Supervision

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.4 Student admission, progression, recognition and certification:** Universities ensure that the courses offered are carried out in such a way as to encourage students to play an active role in the design of the learning process and that this approach is also taken into account when assessing students / examinations.

For PhD programmes additionally apply

- Salzburg Recommendation 3: Recruitment, recognition, and certification

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.5 Teaching staff:** Universities ensure the competence of their teachers. They use fair and transparent procedures for the recruitment and further training of their employees.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.6 Learning resources and student support:** The university has adequate funding to finance study and teaching and ensure that there is always a sufficient and readily available range of learning and support available for their studies.

For PhD programmes additionally apply

- Salzburg Recommendation 10: Funding

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.7 Information management:** Universities ensure that they collect, analyze and use the relevant data relevant to the successful conduct of studies and other activities.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.8 Public information:** Universities publish easily understandable, correct, objective, up-to-date and well-accessible information about their activities and courses of study.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.9 On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes:** Universities are constantly monitoring their courses and regularly reviewing them to ensure that they achieve the goals set and meet the needs of students and society. The tests lead to a continuous improvement of the courses. All affected parties will be informed about any measures planned or resulting from this.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.10 Cyclical external quality assurance:** Universities regularly undergo external quality assurance procedures in accordance with the ESG.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**National criteria:** if applicable, national criteria are integrated in the ESG standards or listed separately.

The peer-review experts note that the recommendations from the previous accreditation procedure have been adequately taken into account.

## **2 Accreditation Recommendation**

The peer-review experts recommend unconditional accreditation of study programmes “International Law” (Bachelor), “International Law” (Master scientific and pedagogical direction), “International Law” (PhD), “International Relations” (Bachelor), “International Relations” (Master scientific and pedagogical direction)”, “Political Science” (Bachelor), “Political Science” (Master scientific and pedagogical direction), “Economics” (Bachelor), “Economics” (Master scientific and pedagogical direction), “Management” (Bachelor), “Management” (Master scientific and pedagogical direction).

### **Unconditional accreditation: Compliance with the standards**

The institutional structures and performance fulfil all criteria. In case of substantial compliance, the experts may express recommendations for further improvement. These recommendations may be taken into account by the HEI with regard to the further improvement of quality.

### **Accreditation with conditions: Partial compliance with the standards**

The institutional structures and performance do not completely fulfil at least one criterion. Certain aspects must be revised to ensure compliance with the standards. Unfulfilled criteria are likely to be met and must be fulfilled within the specified time period. As soon as condition(s) are fulfilled, the accreditation is granted for the complete accreditation period.

### **Refusal of accreditation: Non-compliance regarding one or more standards**

The institutional structures and performance do not fulfil one or more standards. Major deficiencies and weaknesses are so significant that they are unlikely to be rectifiable within a reasonable period of time. In this case, the Accreditation Commission refuses the accreditation.

The HEI can suspend the procedure in order to extend the timeframe for rectifying the major deficiencies.

The peer group **proposes the following accreditation:**

- Accreditation without conditions

The peer-review experts recommend the following **recommendations**:

**Recommendations for study programme „Management“ (Bachelor)**

- Increase in-depth management content in the compulsory modules for both Bachelor's and Master's level.

**Recommendations for study programme „Management“ (Master scientific and pedagogical direction)**

- Increase in-depth management content in the compulsory modules for both Bachelor's and Master's level.
- Enrich the Master's programme with advanced, deep-level content specific to management
- Include a literature list with English articles from top-rated international journals in the Master's curriculum.

**Recommendations for study programme „Economics“ (Bachelor)**

- Mathematical Economics to be a required course with a syllabus reflecting topics related to economics.
- Statistics should be a required course in the curriculum.
- Mathematical Economics and Statistics should both be prerequisites for Econometrics.

**Recommendations for study programme „Economics“ (Master scientific and pedagogical direction)**

- Introduce – either within the course Enterprise Economics or ideally as a course of its own – content on the Economics of the Firm (transaction cost models, property rights, behavioral firm models, asset specificity, Melitz models). Alternatively, the Industrial Economics course with the typical topics like Price and product differentiation, mergers and acquisitions, signaling, collusion (with heavy game-theoretic modeling).
- Introduce a module on Empirical Methods in Economics or Applied Econometrics (models of self-selection, instrumental variables, difference-in-difference, panel data models, non-stationary time series).

**Recommendations for study programme „International Law “ (Bachelor)**

- Expand contemporary law offerings by including more specific and focused courses, e.g., International Cyber Law and Digital Commerce, Artificial Intelligence and Legal Tech, Legal Ethics in International Practice, etc.

- Implement a clear course progression system.
- Add a clinical education component, simulation-based courses, and legal writing workshops focused on international law.
- Expand professional integration by creating an advisory board and mentorship programs with practicing international lawyers and alumni.
- Review learning outcomes (RTs) to explore the possibility of including more specific measurable indicators. Add outcomes focused on practical legal skills and legal technology competencies since the legal profession (as many other professions) becomes more acquainted with technologies. Develop specific outcomes for legal research and writing.
- Conduct mandatory academic integrity workshops for students in their first year to instill a strong foundation of ethical research and writing practices. Introduce peer-review activities within coursework to encourage collaborative learning and accountability while reducing opportunities for academic dishonesty.
- Consider diversifying assessment methods by incorporating team projects, oral presentations, and policy analysis papers to build critical skills like collaboration, advocacy, and policy drafting. Evaluate students on experiential learning activities, e.g., role-playing in international tribunals, etc.
- Consider refining plagiarism policies by providing only one chance for resubmission. Allowing rewrites might unintentionally create leniency and encourage risk-taking.

**Recommendations for study programme „International Law “ (Master scientific and pedagogical direction)**

- Clearly articulate the unique value proposition of the scientific-pedagogical track in terms of its relevance for academia, research, or international legal careers.
- Progress with research methodology components throughout the program. Introduce legal research methodology workshops throughout the program and consider developing research colloquiums for thesis development.
- Introduce dedicated courses across contemporary international law topics.
- Introduce additional practical components such as research workshops, simulated teaching experiences, or internships to balance the theoretical focus.
- Review learning outcomes (RTs) to consolidate overlapping outcomes for clearer assessment and prioritize their quality over quantity. Strengthen alignment between outcomes and course content.

- Expand learning outcomes (RTs) (professional ethics) coverage across multiple courses; add a research ethics element since the program is scientifically driven.
- Add specific outcomes for digital legal competencies, cross-cultural legal practice, and advanced legal research skills.
- Potentially extend teaching internship duration.
- Introduce practitioner-led seminars and research methodology workshops throughout the program.

### **Recommendations for study programme „International Law “ (PhD)**

- Introduce advanced research methodology courses/seminars, e.g., Advanced Legal Research Methods, Quantitative Methods in Legal Research, Interdisciplinary Research Approaches, etc.; add Research Ethics and Integrity course.
- Explore the development of a bridging module for incoming PhD students without a background in scientific methods to provide additional foundational training.
- Enhance peer-review workshops where PhD students can refine research proposals and gain feedback before advancing to formal dissertation planning; establish an internal peer-review system where faculty and peers provide detailed feedback before journal submission.
- Actively encourage students to explore interdisciplinary topics by providing examples of successful interdisciplinary research and explore policy that would require at least one external or interdisciplinary expert in dissertation committees, especially for topics that overlap with economics, finance, management, political science, or technology.
- Review learning outcomes (RTs) to consolidate overlapping outcomes for clearer assessment and prioritize their quality over quantity. Strengthen alignment between outcomes and course content.
- Expand learning outcome RT3 (pedagogy) with additional coursework.
- Introduce course design workshops and develop assessment skills training.
- Add specific legal research competencies, including digital competencies, that are increasingly important for successful research.
- Include outcomes for interdisciplinary approaches and research ethics.
- Introduce international journal publication workshops. Add research presentation skills and academic English seminars. Develop publication strategy workshops; expand the academic writing curriculum to include workshops on journal selection and understanding reviewer expectations.



- Create a dedicated Multilingual Quality Assurance Committee and develop comprehensive language equivalence guidelines.
- Establish cross-language course alignment protocols and standardized learning outcome frameworks.
- Introduce systematic translation and verification processes.
- Establish language proficiency standards for instructors and implement regular linguistic competence assessments. Provide specialized multilingual teaching training and create language-specific pedagogical support resources.
- Conduct regular inter-language course comparisons.

**Recommendation for study programme „International Relations “ (Bachelor)**

- Academic Writing should be included as a compulsory module at an early point in the program.

**Recommendation for study programmes „Political Science “ (Bachelor/Master scientific and pedagogical direction)**

- Courses on economy and law should be introduced in the educational programme.

## **V Decisions of the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN**

Based on the evaluation report of the expert group and the statement of the Higher Education Institution, the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN has made its decision on the 10 March 2025:

### **International Relations (Bachelor)**

**The study programme "International Relations" (Bachelor) is accredited without any conditions.**

**The accreditation is valid until 30. September 2032.**

The following recommendations are given for the further development of the study programme:

- Academic Writing should be included as a compulsory module at an early point in the program.

### **International Relations (Master scientific and pedagogical direction)**

**The study programme " International Relations" (Master scientific and pedagogical direction) is accredited without any conditions.**

**The accreditation is valid until 30. September 2032.**

### **Political Science (Bachelor)**

**The study programme " Political Science" (Bachelor) is accredited without any conditions.**

**The accreditation is valid until 30. September 2032.**

The following recommendations are given for the further development of the study programme:

- Courses on economy and law should be introduced in the educational programme

### **Political Science (Master scientific and pedagogical direction)**

**The study programme " Political Science" (Master scientific and pedagogical direction) is accredited without any conditions.**

**The accreditation is valid until 30. September 2032.**

The following recommendations are given for the further development of the study programme:

- Courses on economy and law should be introduced in the educational programme

### **Economics (Bachelor)**

**The study programme " Economics" (Bachelor) is accredited without any conditions.**  
**The accreditation is valid until 30. September 2032.**

The following recommendations are given for the further development of the study programme:

- Mathematical Economics to be a required course with a syllabus reflecting topics related to economics.
- Statistics should be a required course in the curriculum.
- Mathematical Economics and Statistics should both be prerequisites for Econometrics.

**Economics (Master scientific and pedagogical direction)**

**The study programme " Economics" (Master scientific and pedagogical direction) is accredited without any conditions.**

**The accreditation is valid until 30. September 2032.**

The following recommendations are given for the further development of the study programme:

- Introduce – either within the course Enterprise Economics or ideally as a course of its own – content on the Economics of the Firm (transaction cost models, property rights, behavioral firm models, asset specificity, Melitz models). Alternatively, the Industrial Economics course with the typical topics like Price and product differentiation, mergers and acquisitions, signaling, collusion (with heavy game-theoretic modeling).
- Introduce a module on Empirical Methods in Economics or Applied Econometrics (models of self-selection, instrumental variables, difference-in-difference, panel data models, non-stationary time series).

**Management (Bachelor)**

**The study programme " Management" (Bachelor) is accredited without any conditions.**

**The accreditation is valid until 30. September 2032.**

The following recommendations are given for the further development of the study programme:

- Increase in-depth management content in the compulsory modules for both Bachelor's and Master's level.

**Management (Master scientific and pedagogical direction)**

**The study programme " Management" (Master scientific and pedagogical direction) is accredited without any conditions.**

**The accreditation is valid until 30. September 2032.**

The following recommendations are given for the further development of the study programme:

- Increase in-depth management content in the compulsory modules for both Bachelor's and Master's level.
- Enrich the Master's programme with advanced, deep-level content specific to management
- Include a literature list with English articles from top-rated international journals in the Master's curriculum.

**International Law (Bachelor)**

**The study programme " International Law" (Bachelor) is accredited without any conditions.**

**The accreditation is valid until 30. September 2032.**

The following recommendations are given for the further development of the study programme:

- Expand contemporary law offerings by including more specific and focused courses, e.g., International Cyber Law and Digital Commerce, Artificial Intelligence and Legal Tech, Legal Ethics in International Practice, etc.
- Implement a clear course progression system.
- Add a clinical education component, simulation-based courses, and legal writing workshops focused on international law.
- Expand professional integration by creating an advisory board and mentorship programs with practicing international lawyers and alumni.
- Review learning outcomes (RTs) to explore the possibility of including more specific measurable indicators. Add outcomes focused on practical legal skills and legal technology competencies since the legal profession (as many other professions) becomes more acquainted with technologies. Develop specific outcomes for legal research and writing.
- Conduct mandatory academic integrity workshops for students in their first year to instill a strong foundation of ethical research and writing practices. Introduce peer-review activities within coursework to encourage collaborative learning and accountability while reducing opportunities for academic dishonesty.
- Consider diversifying assessment methods by incorporating team projects, oral presentations, and policy analysis papers to build critical skills like collaboration, advocacy, and policy drafting. Evaluate students on experiential learning activities, e.g., role-playing in international tribunals, etc.
- Consider refining plagiarism policies by providing only one chance for resubmission. Allowing rewrites might unintentionally create leniency and encourage risk-taking.

**International Law (Master scientific and pedagogical direction)**

**The study programme " International Law" (Master scientific and pedagogical direction) is accredited without any conditions.**

**The accreditation is valid until 30. September 2032.**

The following recommendations are given for the further development of the study programme:

- Clearly articulate the unique value proposition of the scientific-pedagogical track in terms of its relevance for academia, research, or international legal careers.
- Progress with research methodology components throughout the program. Introduce legal research methodology workshops throughout the program and consider developing research colloquiums for thesis development.

- Introduce dedicated courses across contemporary international law topics.
- Introduce additional practical components such as research workshops, simulated teaching experiences, or internships to balance the theoretical focus.
- Review learning outcomes (RTs) to consolidate overlapping outcomes for clearer assessment and prioritize their quality over quantity. Strengthen alignment between outcomes and course content.
- Expand learning outcomes (RTs) (professional ethics) coverage across multiple courses; add a research ethics element since the program is scientifically driven.
- Add specific outcomes for digital legal competencies, cross-cultural legal practice, and advanced legal research skills.
- Potentially extend teaching internship duration.
- Introduce practitioner-led seminars and research methodology workshops throughout the program.

### **International Law (PhD)**

**The study programme " International Law" (PhD) is accredited without any conditions. The accreditation is valid until 30. September 2031.**

The following recommendations are given for the further development of the study programme:

- Introduce advanced research methodology courses/seminars, e.g., Advanced Legal Research Methods, Quantitative Methods in Legal Research, Interdisciplinary Research Approaches, etc.; add Research Ethics and Integrity course.
- Explore the development of a bridging module for incoming PhD students without a background in scientific methods to provide additional foundational training.
- Enhance peer-review workshops where PhD students can refine research proposals and gain feedback before advancing to formal dissertation planning; establish an internal peer-review system where faculty and peers provide detailed feedback before journal submission.
- Actively encourage students to explore interdisciplinary topics by providing examples of successful interdisciplinary research and explore policy that would require at least one external or interdisciplinary expert in dissertation committees, especially for topics that overlap with economics, finance, management, political science, or technology.
- Review learning outcomes (RTs) to consolidate overlapping outcomes for clearer assessment and prioritize their quality over quantity. Strengthen alignment between outcomes and course content.
- Expand learning outcome RT3 (pedagogy) with additional coursework.
- Introduce course design workshops and develop assessment skills training.
- Add specific legal research competencies, including digital competencies, that are increasingly important for successful research.
- Include outcomes for interdisciplinary approaches and research ethics.

- Introduce international journal publication workshops. Add research presentation skills and academic English seminars. Develop publication strategy workshops; expand the academic writing curriculum to include workshops on journal selection and understanding reviewer expectations.
- Create a dedicated Multilingual Quality Assurance Committee and develop comprehensive language equivalence guidelines.
- Establish cross-language course alignment protocols and standardized learning outcome frameworks.
- Introduce systematic translation and verification processes.
- Establish language proficiency standards for instructors and implement regular linguistic competence assessments. Provide specialized multilingual teaching training and create language-specific pedagogical support resources.
- Conduct regular inter-language course comparisons.