

## **Accreditation Report**

### **Mykolayiv National Agrarian University**

#### **Ukraine**

#### **“Agricultural Management” (Master of Management)**

#### **I Procedure**

**Date of contract:** 19 January 2022

**Date of the submission of self-assessment report:** 2 August 2022

**Date of site visit:** 21 September 2022

**Attendance by ACQUIN office:** Dr. Jasmine Rudolph

**Accreditation decision:** 9 Mai 2023

#### **Peer review experts:**

- **Prof. Dr. Elena Kashtanova**, Anhalt University of Applied Sciences, Professor of International Trade in Agribusiness
- **FH-Prof. MMag. Dr. Michael Schmidthaler**, Upper Austria University of Applied Sciences, Professor and Head of study programme Agricultural Management and Innovations
- **Prof. Dr. Thore Toews**, Technical University Bingen, Professor for applied agricultural business management, agricultural accounting and taxation, taxation theory, agricultural business planning and controlling
- **Farhod Ahrorov**, PhD, Vice-Rector Samarkand branch of Tashkent State University of Economics (Uzbekistan)
- **Dr. Alen Mujcinovic**, Associate Professor, Faculty of Agriculture and Food Sciences University of Sarajevo Sarajevo (Bosnia and Herzegovina)
- **Professor Anargul Belgibayeva**, Sh. Ualikhanov Kokshetau University, Department of Business and Services

- **Marat Onaev**, Zhangir Khan University (Uralsk, Kazakhstan), Director of the Institute of Agrotechnology
- **Rinat Fazylbekov**, Deputy Head, Department of technology innovation Kazakh Research Institute of Plant, Protection and Quarantine
- **Professor Dr. Aleksandra Mandych**, State Biotechnological University, (Kharkiv, Ukraine), Economics and Management of Enterprise
- **Professor Dr. Volodymyr Pysarenko**, Poltava State Agrarian University (Poltava, Ukraine), Head of marketing department
- **Professor Valentina Yakubiv**, Vasyl Stefanyk Precarpathian National University, Vice-Rector for Research, Department of Business Administration
- **Alina Magomedova**, PhD, Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv, Associate Professor, Department of Business Economics
- **Nurgaziev Mairambek**, PhD, Associate Professor, American University of Central Asia, Bishkek, Kyrgyzstan
- **Ulrich Pingel**, CEO, Agralis GmbH
- **Sandra Koop**, University Kiel, Student of Agricultural Sciences (M.Sc.)

The **Assessment Report** of the peer-review experts is **based on** the self-assessment report of the Higher Education Institution (HEI) and extensive discussions with the HEI management, deans and/or heads of the departments, heads of study programme(s), lecturers, staff representatives, students, and alumni.

The basis of the **Assessment Criteria** is part 1 of the “Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area” (ESG) in the current official version. At the same time the national context, particularly the national regulations regarding the establishment of study programmes, are taken into account.

**Content**

<b>I</b>	<b>Procedure</b> .....	1
<b>II</b>	<b>Introduction</b> .....	6
	1 Short profile of HEI .....	6
	2 General information on the study programme .....	15
<b>III</b>	<b>Implementation and assessment of the criteria</b> .....	16
	1 ESG Standard 1.1: Policy for quality assurance .....	16
	1.1 Implementation .....	16
	1.2 Assessment .....	18
	1.3 Conclusion .....	20
	2 ESG Standard 1.2: Design and approval of programmes .....	20
	2.1 Implementation .....	20
	2.2 Assessment .....	21
	2.3 Conclusion .....	23
	3 ESG Standard 1.3: Student-centred learning, teaching, and assessment .....	23
	3.1 Implementation .....	23
	3.2 Assessment .....	26
	3.3 Conclusion .....	27
	4 ESG Standard 1.4: Student admission, progression, recognition, and certification .....	28
	4.1 Implementation .....	28
	4.2 Assessment .....	31
	4.3 Conclusion .....	32
	5 ESG Standard 1.5: Teaching staff .....	32
	5.1 Implementation .....	32
	5.2 Assessment .....	33
	5.3 Conclusion .....	36
	6 ESG Standard 1.6: Learning resources and student support .....	36
	6.1 Implementation .....	36
	6.2 Assessment .....	38
	6.3 Conclusion .....	38
	7 ESG Standard 1.7: Information management .....	39
	7.1 Implementation .....	39
	7.2 Assessment .....	39
	7.3 Conclusion .....	40
	8 ESG Standard 1.8: Public information .....	40
	8.1 Implementation .....	40
	8.2 Assessment .....	42
	8.3 Conclusion .....	43
	9 ESG Standard 1.9: On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes .....	43
	9.1 Implementation .....	43

9.2	Assessment .....	44
9.3	Conclusion .....	46
10	ESG Standard 1.10: Cyclical external quality assurance .....	46
10.1	Implementation .....	46
10.2	Assessment .....	48
10.3	Conclusion .....	49
<b>IV</b>	<b>Recommendation to the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN .....</b>	<b>50</b>
1	Assessment of compliance the Standards and Guidelines in the Higher European Area (ESG) in the actual official version .....	50
2	Accreditation Recommendation .....	52
<b>V</b>	<b>Decisions of the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN .....</b>	<b>55</b>

## **II Introduction**

The experts would like to thank the representatives of the HEI as well as students that they have taken part in the discussions and willingly shared information and their views during the site visit. The discussions are valuable not only for the assessment of the institution, but also for a better understanding of the legal and sociocultural context of the local higher education system.

Evaluation basis for the peer-review experts is the self-assessment report of the HEI as well as intensive discussions during the site visit with the HEI management, deans and/or heads of the departments, head(s) of the study programme(s), study programme(s) coordinators, teachers, lecturers, administrative staff, students, and graduates.

Main objective of the accreditation procedure is to assess the quality of the study programmes and compliance with the "Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area" (ESG). The ESG standards are applied as main assessment criteria in the international accreditation procedure.

In addition, the respective country-specific criteria and standards are taken into account.

A group of experts was set up, which ensured that all areas relevant to the accreditation procedure (e.g. legal, structural, social etc. aspects) as well as the ESG and national criteria were considered. The peer-review experts include professors, representatives of the professional practice and the student representative. A certificate with the ACQUIN seal is awarded upon accreditation of the study programme(s).

### **1 Short profile of HEI**

Mykolayiv National Agrarian University, according to the status of higher education institutions, has a level IV accreditation. Mykolayiv National Agrarian University is an educational and scientific institution with strong material and technical base, a center for innovative design, and is a source of human resources for both the Southern region and for the whole of Ukraine. The key strength of the University is the mutually coordinated activity of all participants in educational, scientific, educational and other processes, united by common goals, ideas, and aspirations. The University prepares students for the educational degrees of junior bachelor's, bachelor's and master's degrees, doctor of philosophy, and doctor of sciences. Today, Mykolayiv National Agrarian University is the leading innovative higher education institution in the south of Ukraine.

The Mykolaiv National Agrarian University is state-owned and subordinated to the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine. The University constantly takes into account and improves indicators of economic efficiency, which include:

- conducting educational activities, improving the quality of training and activities in accordance with the Development Concept of the Mykolaiv National Agrarian University for 2019-2024, bringing the organization's strategy to each employee by formulating specific goals and implementing planned items in accordance with the Program for the Implementation of the Development Concept of the Mykolaiv National Agrarian University for 2019-2024;

- specific tactical actions are determined on the basis of the values of the relevant indicators and are implemented in the form of inclusion of the university in the relevant ratings. According to the Center for International Projects "Euro Education" and the IREG Observatory on Academic Ranking and Excellence (2022): MNAU took 90th place in the academic ranking of higher education institutions of Ukraine "Top-200 Ukraine 2021", 12th place according to the Ranking of Higher Education Institutions of Ukraine according to the Transparency Index of anti-corruption policy; 826th place - UI Green Metric World University Rankings, the university is included in one of the most global rankings of universities in the world U-Multirank.

- reducing costs by optimizing and rationalizing the relevant measures for the preparation of the material and technical base and the work of the Mykolaiv National Agrarian University, in particular, approved, implemented and implemented orders and plans regarding measures for the effective use and conservation of energy carriers at the Mykolaiv National Agrarian University. It is the implementation of such decisions that adapts indicators of financial behavior and attitude to financial issues in accordance with the urgent needs of the university in financial literacy.

The economic efficiency of the University depends on its management, the key tasks of which are the determination of the strengths and weaknesses of the internal environment, the assessment of the contribution of each structural unit to the development of the institution and types of activities (educational, research, innovation, financial and economic), monitoring of service and employer markets, analysis of possible threats from the external environment, forecasting and selection of strategic areas of activity. Mykolaiv National Agrarian University, after receiving the National Standard DSTU ISO 9001:2015 (ISO 9001:2015, IDT), prepared a package of documents and sent them for consideration by the International Certification Body of Management Systems for the purpose of accreditation of the University according to the international standard.

University scientists participated in the development of program documents important for the region, such as: Development Strategy of the Mykolaiv Region for the period up to 2021-2025,

Economic and Social Development Program for 2021, Educational Development Program of the Mykolaiv Region for 2021-2025, etc.

The material and technical base of the University includes 12 educational buildings, 5 dormitories, 6 institutes, 8 faculties, Science Park "Agroprospect", Educational-scientific-practical center, educational-innovative cluster "Agrotechnics", computer classes, 5 scientific and technical libraries, a room for advanced study of foreign languages, 5 sports halls, Hotel "Agroosvita", 4 dining halls, 7 catering establishments, including 3 student buffets in the educational buildings of the University, educational laboratory "Educational Bank" using the automated banking system (ABS) "Scrooge III", educational laboratory of innovative technologies for accounting and taxation, etc.

Mykolayiv National Agrarian University is the co-founder of the scientific park «Agroprospectsyva» unique in the south of Ukraine. Since 2010, the National Innovation Cluster «Soil Fertility» has been successfully operating at the University.

To date, the university has become a co-developer of the strategy for scientific support for the development of rural areas of the Mykolaiv region until 2025 and proposals for the section "Innovative development of the agro-industrial complex of the region" of the Development Strategy of the Mykolaiv region for 2021-2027 and the Action Plan for its implementation.

Mykolaiv National Agrarian University is a co-founder of the only Science Park of Mykolaiv National Agrarian University "Agroperspectiva" in the south of Ukraine, its component is the National Innovation Cluster "Soil Fertility". At the 25th International Agro-Industrial Exhibition, Mykolaiv National Agrarian University was awarded a gold medal in the nomination "Intensification of innovative technologies "education - science - production" with the assistance of the Science Park of Mykolaiv National Agrarian University "Agroprospect".

The interweaving of educational, scientific, innovation, and production activity of the Mykolayiv National Agrarian University takes place through a regional university education and research and production complex, which includes the University, colleges of the University: Techno-economic, Voznesensky, Novobuzhsky, Mihijsky; Institute of Postgraduate Education; Training Center for Workers' Professions; Training and Practical Center for Education, and the Training and Production Quail Farm. These last two are used as bases for practical training of graduates.

Mykolayiv National Agrarian University has ensured the unity of agrarian education, agrarian science, and agro-industrial production by introducing into university life the Innovative Investment Projects Program, «Integration of Agrarian Education, Science, and Production», taking into account the Concept of University Development for 2016-2022.

The University provides the educational degrees of associate bachelor, bachelor, and master's degree for 38 specialties, including agronomy, geodesy and land management, technology of production and the processing of livestock products, biotechnology and bioengineering, agroengineering, electric power engineering, electrical engineering and electromechanics, vocational education, management, economics, public administration, accounting and taxation, finance, and banking and insurance.

The quality of the educational process at the Mykolaiv National Agrarian University is ensured by 27 departments, of which 23 graduate, 258 scientific and pedagogical workers, including: 57 professors, 61 doctors of science, 198 associate professors, 201 candidates of science, 7 honored figures of science and technology of Ukraine, 7 honored workers of education, 5 honored workers of agriculture, 7 academicians of industry academies, laureates of the Prize of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine. The university implements opportunities to involve leading Ukrainian and foreign scientists and other industry stakeholders, a large number of whom are university graduates, in the educational process. Also, foreign teachers are constantly involved in the educational process, who conduct lectures and practical classes online.

Following the results of competitions of the IX International Exhibition «Modern Educational Establishments» in 2018, Mykolaiv National Agrarian University was awarded the Grand Prix «Leader of Scientific and Scientific and Technical Activity», a gold medal in the category «Development and use of innovative methods of mixed learning», and a gold medal in the category «Quality of scientific publications», according to the rating of the city international scientific and mathematical database Scopus.

The University has patents for over 200 inventions and utility models. Students are constantly involved in scientific research, and the University of Science and Technology's young scientists are very successful.

By giving students competitive basic and applied knowledge, which they can apply to innovative development of the economy and expand through self-education throughout their lives, the University trains highly skilled professionals for the domestic and foreign labor markets.

The total number of students at the University (educational degrees «Junior Bachelor» «Bachelor», «Master», scientific degree «Doctor of Philosophy») is 3922. The university has post-graduate courses in 18 specialties – economics and management of the national economy, economics and management of enterprises (by types of economic activity, development of productive factors and regional economics, human and animal physiology, genetics (agricultural sciences), general agriculture, agronomy and agrophysics, plant production, livestock production technology, and animal breeding. There are Doctoral programmes in 3 specialties:

economics and management of the national economy, animal breeding, and technology of the production of livestock products.

Masters training at Mykolaiv National Agrarian University is based on a detailed study of masters training systems at universities of developed European countries.

The master's program in the field of «Agrarian Management» focuses on the training of highly skilled managers capable of managing an agrarian business based on the mastery of relevant knowledge, skills, modern computer technologies, industry innovations, and foreign languages.

International training of master's course "Agricultural management" is implemented at the Faculty of Management (Table 1). The faculty consists of 5 departments (Department of Enterprise Economics, Department of Management and Marketing, Department of hotel and restaurant affairs and business organization, Department of Economic Cybernetics and Mathematical Modeling, Department of Public Management and Administration and International Economy), 5 educational and research laboratories, the Training center and the language lab for language learning.

The number of students in full-time as of 01.09.2021 is 568 people, according to the educational degree "Junior Bachelor" - 92, Bachelor - 443, and Master -33, including 11 in the specialty "Agrarian Management".

In 2021 the admission to the master's study was carried out on the places funded from the state budget and on a contractual basis with payment of tuition fees. Competition to budget places was 5 people per a place.

Table 1 – The number of students studying at the master's program "Agrarian Management"

Period (years)	Amount of students	Study on a budget
2018-2019	27	9
2019-2020	20	16
2020-2021	13	1
2021-2022	11	3

The conditions for admission to study in the master's program in the field of «Agrarian Management» are successful graduation from one of the higher education institutions of the III-IV accreditation level and the academic degree of bachelor, specialist or master's.

The uniqueness of this program is that the content of the training is determined by basic education and the future employment location.

The training begins with a semester of theory, due to the fact that all students are enrolled in the program on the first of September.

The master's degree curriculum consists of the following blocks: compulsory study disciplines and elective disciplines.

The main objective of the master program "Agrarian Management" is focused at training of highly qualified managers and specialists in the field of management for enterprises and organizations of various branches of spheres and forms of ownership, bodies of state authorities; is aimed at formation of skills of development of innovative projects and business plans for strategic decision-making in the process of agricultural production management, its processing, storage, transportation and sale to the final consumer.

The strategic goal of the master program "Agrarian Management" is bringing of the educational program at the leading position in the country in education, research and innovation, socio-cultural spheres of activity.

In the field of education the main objectives of the basic master's program "Agrarian Management" are: to promote the formation of a graduate's socially responsible behaviour in society, understanding and acceptance of social and ethical norms, ability to work in a team.

Master's program "Agrarian Management" is aimed at the formation of cultural and professional competences in accordance with the requirements of the State Standard.

The state standard of higher education puts forward mandatory requirements for the training of masters in the direction of "Management": for personnel, material, technical and educational and methodological support of master's programs, financial conditions for the implementation of programs. In particular, the share of scientific-pedagogical workers who have an education by discipline (module) in the total number of scientific-pedagogical workers studying under the master's educational program is at least 70 percent.

The share of research and pedagogical workers from among the executives and workers of organizations whose activity is connected with the area (profile) of the implementing program of master's study (having experience in this professional area not less than 3 years) in the total number of workers, implementing the program of master's study, is at least 25 per cent for the program of applied master's study. The size of the master's program is 90 credit units (table 2).

Table 2 – The structure of the master program "Agrarian Management":

The structure of the master's program		The actual size of the master program in EC	The Hours. (1 EC = 30 hours)	The Structure,%
Block 1	Subjects (modules)	74	2220	82,2
	The base part	44	1320	48,9
	The variable part	30	900	33,3
Block 2	Practice including research work (RW)	8	240	8,9
Block 3	The state final certification	8	240	8,9
The size of the master study		90	2700	100,0

Master's program «Agrarian Management» is implemented as a program of applied master's study. As a result of mastering the educational program the graduate is prepared for the following types of professional activity: basic (organizational management; analytical), additional ( research; teaching).

Great attention is paid to the practical training of students and listeners. In this direction active cooperation with leading agricultural organizations of the Mykolaiv region of which 25 enterprises have the status of basic educational farms of the University is developed.

The University stipulates the use of innovative forms of studies, developing students' skills of teamwork, interpersonal communication, decision making, leadership skills (including, where it is necessary: interactive lectures; group discussions; role-playing games; trainings; case situation analysis and simulation models; teaching of subjects (modules) in the form of courses, based on the results of research conducted by the University, including taking into account regional peculiarities of professional activity of graduates and employers' needs. Every year, more than 100 students undergo internships at agricultural enterprises in Germany, Switzerland, Great Britain, Denmark and Norway.

The University stipulates the use of innovative forms of studies, developing students' skills of teamwork, interpersonal communication, decision making, leadership skills (including, where it is necessary: interactive lectures; group discussions; role-playing games; trainings; case situation analysis and simulation models; teaching of subjects (modules) in the form of courses, based on the results of research conducted by the University, including taking into account regional peculiarities of professional activity of graduates and employers' needs.

The list of elective disciplines for those specializing in «Agrarian Management» of MNAU is similar to the list of these disciplines at UIN Weihenstephan-Trizdorf.

According to Ukrainian legislation, the weekly load of the students in the master's program is 24-26 academic hours. The curriculum at the Mykolaiv National Agrarian University is constructed so that the number of credits, contact hours, and forms of knowledge assessment correspond to German regulations/requirements.



## 2 General information on the study programme

Location	Mykolayiv National Agrarian University: “Agricultural Management” (Master of Management)
Date of introduction	01.09.2018
Faculty/ department	Faculty of Management: Agrarian Management
Standard period of study (semesters)	3 semesters, 1 year 4 months
Number of ECTS credits	90 credits according to ECTS
Number of study places	110 places of full-time
Number of students currently enrolled	11 per semester, 23 per year
Average number of graduates per year	17
Form of study	Full-Time
Tuition fee	6210 UAH per semester, 12420 UAH per year

### **III Implementation and assessment of the criteria**

*The peer-review experts assess the quality of the study programme(s) and compliance with the ESG standards as well as with the national standards. The report must document the assessment of each study programme in the cluster, taking into account each criterion. Depending on the criterion, the assessment of criterion may be appropriate at the study programmes cluster level in order to avoid repetition and better describe general context.*

#### **1 ESG Standard 1.1: Policy for quality assurance**

**Institutions should have a policy for quality assurance that is made public and forms part of their strategic management. Internal stakeholders should develop and implement this policy through appropriate structures and processes, while involving external stakeholders.**

##### **1.1 Implementation**

The basic principles of the quality assurance system of the university are defined in the Constitution and the Concept of the University's educational activities.

The goal of the quality assurance system for educational activities and higher education is to create and maintain conditions for the qualitative training of highly skilled professionals at a level appropriate to undertake professional activity and achieve constant professional growth, through social and professional mobility.

The main tasks of the quality assurance system are:

- 1) the formation of a unified understanding of the criteria for the quality of educational activities and the quality of higher education of the university and ways to assess them,
- 2) developing a system of indicators that allow evaluation and confirmation of the quality of the educational process,
- 3) collecting, analysing and interpreting information on the quality of the educational process,
- 4) forecasting and preventing negative effects on the quality of education.

Ensuring the quality of education is one of the main principles of state policy in the field of education. The creation of a quality assurance system for educational activities and higher education (internal quality assurance system) at the university is regulated by the norms of the Laws of Ukraine «On Education» and «On Higher Education» and the requirements of higher education standards. These laws state that one of the main responsibilities of the head of the educational institution is to ensure the functioning of a quality assurance system. The system should include a policy and quality assurance procedures, the distribution of competences for

quality among all participants in the educational process, a system and mechanisms for ensuring academic integrity, published criteria, rules and procedures for assessing applicants for higher education, published criteria, rules and procedures for assessing the scientific and pedagogical activity of scientific-pedagogical and pedagogical staff, published criteria, rules and procedures for assessing the management activities of the university staff, providing necessary resources to the educational process, ensuring the availability of information systems for the effective management of the university and other procedures and measures determined by special laws and documents of the university.

The main principles of the functioning of the system for ensuring the quality of educational activities and higher education at the university are universality, transparency, objectivity, avoidance of conflicts of interest, minimum necessity (documents, procedures), student-centeredness, systemic and systematic consistency, involvement all of stakeholders and subsidiary (coordination of delegated authority and responsibility).

Policy formulation and the implementation of quality assurance is a priority of the university. The priority directions of ensuring the quality of educational activities and higher education are determined by the University Development Strategy and the Program for the Quality Assurance of Education.

Formation and implementation of a quality assurance policy for education and higher education is coordinated by the rector, Steering Committee, Scientific Council, Scientific and Methodological Council, Training Division, and other structural units and working and advisory bodies. Quality assurance procedures are coordinated at the level of structural units by deans of faculties, directors of institutes, colleges, directors of educational and research centers, heads of institutions, heads of departments, scientist (pedagogical) councils and scientific and methodological (educational, methodological) commissions (councils) of faculties / institutes. At the study program level quality assurance is provided by study program managers, departments and committees of educational programs, research and teaching staff.

Students and their bodies of self-government, employers' councils and graduate associations are required to be involved in the process of formation and implementation of the quality assurance policy for education and higher education.

Responsibilities of authorized entities are determined by the University Charter and relevant provisions.

The university defined minimum required level of scientific and pedagogical qualifications of the teachers by formulating clear requirements regarding the tasks and responsibilities the position, including the ability and willingness of the candidate to develop appropriate and relevant scientific research areas, establish and participate in international cooperation, to establish

transfer of knowledge and technologies, etc., when announcing the competition for the post of academic staff, organizing a periodic assessment of professional competence and quality of teaching (including those with higher education), encouraging professional development of scientific and pedagogical staff, inducing them to scientific and / or innovative activity, promoting (organizational, informational, financial) academic mobility of scientific-pedagogical and pedagogical staff and creating conditions for the improvement of professional qualifications of scientific and pedagogical staff.

The university provides participants in the educational process (including foreign students and students with special needs) access to teaching and methodological support, library resources, a scientific database, professional advisory support, etc., as well as proper technical equipment of the classrooms and dormitories, and provides support for graduates in finding employment.

The university provides for the collection, analysis, and use of information necessary for the effective management of educational programs and other activities (indicators of the effectiveness of teaching and teaching, results of surveys on higher education quality issues for undergraduates and graduates, employment, etc.).

The university publishes and promotes publication (in the state language and in at least one foreign language) on the requirements of the Laws of Ukraine «On education» and «On higher education»: on the master's program «Agricultural Management» and its components (including programs of educational disciplines), data confirming the competence of scientific and pedagogical staff, rules of admission, official documents on the organization of the educational process, and information about the accreditation of educational programs.

## **1.2 Assessment**

Based on the university goals and strategic management, the quality assurance policy has been implemented appropriately in the field of research, teaching and learning. Hence, the quality assurance policy of the University meets the requirements of the Ministry of Education and Science of the country. In addition, the successful results of previous years and promising goals for the future shows the satisfaction of internal and external stakeholders in terms of cooperation.

The analysis of the internal quality assurance of the programme has shown that the procedures for the development, approval, periodic review and monitoring of the Master's programme "Agricultural Management" (Master of Management) are carried out in accordance with the study regulations, which indicates that the initiation, development, approval, monitoring, revision and termination of the Master's programme at the University are carried out transparently and in accordance with the approved procedures, in line with the general objectives of the University's

development strategy, as well as the students of education participate in the design and improvement of the Master's programme, the evaluation of its components and the quality of teaching.

Policy formulation and the implementation of quality assurance is a priority of the University. A wide range of participants at different management levels are involved in the process of implementation quality assurance policy at the University. Students and their bodies of self-government, employers' councils and graduate associations are required to be involved in the process of formation and implementation of the quality assurance policy for education and higher education. Monitoring of educational programs is one of the main steps of quality assurance policy. According to the Regulations on the procedure for development approval monitoring and revision of educational programs one of the crucial components of local and university's monitoring is a survey of internal and external stakeholders. Besides, in self-assessment report is said that students are involved in designing and improving the master's program "Agricultural Management" (Master of Management) evaluating its components and teaching quality. That experience is important for implementation of quality assurance policy at the University. But it's a lack of evidences and details of different stakeholders involvement in providing quality assurance policy. That's why the recommendation is following: to systemize the cases of stakeholders (internal and external) involvement in providing quality assurance policy, designing and improving educational program; to identify the crucial results of that events; to provide the access to the information of stakeholders participation in providing quality assurance policy at the University (for instance, to put information about students', graduates' and employers' surveys on the University's website or on other source).

The quality assurance system for the educational process consists of an internal quality assurance system (administration, department for quality assurance of education, pedagogical and methodological centre for the organisation of the educational process) and external quality assurance.

During the meeting with the representatives of the University it was noted and confirmed that the University has a clear quality culture that ensures systematic development of the educational programme. The University has an Education Quality Assurance Department, whose main purpose is to monitor educational activities and evaluate the data of academic activities in order to effectively manage the quality of the educational process.

During the accreditation process, it was noted that the results of external quality assurance of higher education are presented in detail on the University's website, especially the comments and suggestions made during previous accreditations on the official website of the University.

In the accreditation process, it is clear that employers are constantly involved in the process of periodic revision of the educational programme. The university has consultation and advisory bodies, as well as an expert council of employers and graduates.

### 1.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

## 2 ESG Standard 1.2: Design and approval of programmes

**Institutions should have processes for the design and approval of their programmes. The programmes should be designed so that they meet the objectives set for them, including the intended learning outcomes. The qualification resulting from a programme should be clearly specified and communicated, and refer to the correct level of the national qualifications framework for higher education and, consequently, to the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.**

### 2.1 Implementation

The basis for determining the purpose of the educational program is the Statute of the Ukrainian National Academy of Sciences, the Development Strategy of the National Academy of Sciences of the Russian Academy of Sciences on period 2016-2023 and the Program for the Implementation of the Development Strategy of the Ukrainian National Academy of Sciences for the period 2016-2023.

Two main documents guide the development of study program: Regulations on the procedure for developing and approving work programs for academic disciplines at the National Academy of Sciences of Ukraine and The regulations on the syllabuses of academic disciplines at the Ukrainian National Academy of Sciences.

Study program «Agricultural Management» corresponds to the goals of the university related to the implementation of the integration of science and education in the educational process, practical training and innovative activities that open up opportunities for personal development, as well as creation, accumulation, preservation, distribution and multiplication of professional, scientific, moral and cultural values, in particular, preservation of cultural and historical traditions of Ukraine and provision of patriotic education of youth. A combination of the principles of accessibility of education, a harmonious combination of fundamentality and the practicality of knowledge, the continuity of the process of obtaining higher education, student-centeredness, social responsibility, encouraging initiative, tolerance and readiness for competitiveness contributes to the acquisition of higher education by students education of competencies and programmed learning outcomes. Practical component of specialist training is ensured by partnership with stakeholders.

The initiation, development, approval, monitoring, review and termination of the master's program «Agricultural Management» is carried out transparently and in accordance with the approved procedures, in coordination with the general objectives of the University's Development Strategy.

Students are involved in designing and improving the master's program, evaluating its components and teaching quality.

A 1.5 years master's degree equates to 90 ECTS credits. The curriculum consists of the mandatory academic disciplines and practical training and provides the knowledge and skills necessary for competence in the specialty of the master's degree. Disciplines of specialization and a selective part of the master's degree in management at MNAU are comprised of the academic disciplines of the university's choice and the choice of students. The list of these disciplines is determined depending on the specialty and specialization. Studying for a master's degree ends with the completion of a single qualification exam or defense of the master's thesis.

The credit volume of educational components is determined during the review and update of the master's program in accordance with the Regulation on Procedure development, approval, monitoring and revision of educational programs at the National Academy of Sciences. Actual workload is formed within the curriculum, taking into account the requirements of the Regulation on the Organization of Educational process at MNAU. Elective disciplines make 24% of the total number of ECTS credits. Workload of the students in the master's program according to the curriculum is 24-26 hours per week.

## **2.2 Assessment**

According to the national standard, the curriculum of the Master's program "Agricultural Management" (Master of Management) has been successfully adapted to the national standard since 2009 and approved by the Ministry of Education and Science. Hence, in the specialization component, all 18 subjects of the curriculum are approved by HSWT. Currently, all components of the curriculum have been successfully implemented in the practice in terms of education, research and employment. In addition, the current local and global agricultural production system shows the relevance and necessity of this curriculum, as well as the fact that it corresponds to the goals of the Kyrgyz government and national strategies.

The "Agricultural Management" (Master of Management) is in line with the University's mission and vision, as well as with the goals of the 2020-2024 strategic plan, particularly with the first three objectives of education, research and management.

The content of the educational program has a clear structure; the educational components included in the educational program make up a logical interconnected system and collectively allow the achievement of stated goals and program learning outcomes.

The content of the educational programme corresponds to the subject area of the subject area "Management" of the Master's level of the university. In particular, the ability to solve complex tasks, which fully corresponds to the standard of higher education in the field of knowledge "Management and Administration", is the integral feature of the educational programme. The structure of the educational program provides an opportunity for the formation of an individual educational trajectory, in particular through the individual choice of academic disciplines by students of higher education to the extent provided by legislation.

The educational program and curriculum provide for the practical training of higher education students, which allows them to acquire the competencies necessary for further professional activity.

The scope of the educational program and individual educational components (in credits of the European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System) realistically reflects the actual workload of applicants, is appropriate for achieving the goals and programmatic results of education.

The right to freely choose educational components and form an individual trajectory is provided for by the educational program and regulated by relevant regulatory acts. Students studying in the educational program can individually choose the bases of practice and the topic of the master's thesis. The educational program provides practical training and allows you to acquire the competencies necessary for further professional activity.

Students' English language skills should be improved. Higher entrance requirements should be created with regard to English skills or students should be offered compulsory language courses to improve their English language skills.

Within the framework of the further development of the curriculum, current topics such as big data and digitalisation should be given greater consideration.

The study program "Agricultural Management" (Master of Management) corresponds to the goals of the University related to the implementation of the integration of science and education in the educational process, practical training and innovative activities for students. At the same time, there are some recommendations:

In the program profile to emphasize that students, except academic mobility rights, have the option to get double diploma (two diplomas simultaneously; one diploma is national, the second – is German). The information about double diploma may be presented in the block Features of the program.

In order to improve language skills of students to include some disciplines in English within the educational program. It means, that some courses which delivered by Ukrainian lecturers, could be taught in English. It helps students to improve the learning outcomes PLO 9 (to be able to communicate in professional and scientific circles in national and foreign languages) and to apply for academic mobility and to defense a final thesis in foreign language. And all these stimulate students to apply for double diploma receiving.

The programme learning outcomes (PLOs) are set according to the national standard so that the educational programme harmonises with the national rules. However, the list of PLOs could be broader than in the national standard and additional PLOs could strengthen and highlight the specific aspects of the Agricultural Management programme.

The list of courses should be revised the Programme learning outcomes (PLO) 8 (“Application of specialised software and information systems to solve organisational management problems”) is one of the most important and modern learning outcomes for students today - according to digitalisation, globalisation and other trends - these are offered by only two components so far (one of them is optional/selective).

Public provision of the course programmes on the university's website should be made. Potential students should have access to additional information about the course and modules, as they do not have access to the Moodle system.

### 2.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

## 3 ESG Standard 1.3: Student-centred learning, teaching, and assessment

<b>Institutions should ensure that the programmes are delivered in a way that encourages students to take an active role in creating the learning process, and that the assessment of students reflects this approach</b>
---

### 3.1 Implementation

The teaching of students is carried out according to individual curricula consisting of a working curriculum and includes all the normative disciplines and a part of the elective academic disciplines selected by the student with the obligatory consideration of the structural and logical scheme of training. Individual curricula are developed for each semester and approved by the dean of the faculty.

Students entering the master's program must have prior agricultural education and experience of agricultural production practices that have been included in the curriculum of bachelor's degree. The first theoretical semester, with which studies begin, is in full compliance with the

requirements of the University of Applied Sciences, Weihenstephan-Triesdorf, and has its own variable part, in accordance with the local requirements of the labor market.

After the first semester, students have 2 weeks of scientific and educational practice in the Methodology of Social Empirical Studies and 2 weeks of work experience internship for Enterprise Analysis and Control, which takes place at agricultural enterprises, where students have to consolidate their knowledge acquired during the semester and deepen their practical experience. The training of specialists of MNAU focuses on close cooperation among the university's educational and research facilities and advanced scientific institutions and agricultural enterprises. The purpose is to form students' professional skills to make independent decisions during specific work in the conditions of production and to systematically replenish their knowledge and apply it creatively to practical activities. The practice involves obtaining a sufficient amount of practical knowledge and skills necessary for future work in agricultural enterprises.

The second theoretical semester has the same compulsory part as Weihenstephan-Triesdorf University of Applied Sciences, while additional subjects provide specialization in the discipline of choice.

After the second semester, students undergo a 2-week practical training in Management Organizations (agricultural enterprises), which aims to consolidate the acquired knowledge and skills in the field of management. At this stage, it is also possible to obtain practical experience abroad.

The third semester is obligatory theoretical courses, as at Weihenstephan-Triesdorf University of Applied Sciences, and courses from the discipline of choice.

The final stage of training is the preparation for the state qualifying exam and, at the student's choice, the presentation and public defense of the master's thesis. For students studying simultaneously at the Weihenstephan-Triesdorf University of Applied Sciences, it is possible to organize their defense via Skype or Cisco WEB Conference and thus to simultaneously present to defense committees from both Ukraine and Germany.

After successful completion of the master's program, graduates receive a state-recognized master's degree with the qualification of «Master in Management, Manager of Enterprises, Institutions, and Organizations», as well as the corresponding Certificate from the Weihenstephan-Triesdorf University of Applied Sciences.

Following types of control are implemented in the study program

1) Input control - a check of the initial level of preparedness of the student and assess its compliance with the requirements of the study subjects. The maximum number of points, which

can recruit students on the input control is not more than 10% of the total number of points of discipline.

2) The current control is a systematic check of the level of formation of students' competencies during classroom hours in the course of the semester. Forms of current control are oral questioning, discussions, testing; written tests, essay writing, settlement and graphic work, laboratory work and others.

3) Landmark control study is carried out at the end of the didactic unit / section discipline at a predetermined time to determine the quality of mastering the material and the level of formation of competence in the discipline. The maximum number of points that a student can score on the basis of landmark control, is 45-50% of the total number of points of discipline. Landmark control can be carried out in writing or in a combined form.

4) Control of independent work of a student (creative rating). Forms of control are writing essays, reports with the right to choose the theme, independent decision of situational problems, selection and study of literature, work with periodicals, preparation for participation in scientific conferences; multimedia design, and others. The maximum number of points as a result of independent work is not more than 15% of the total rating of discipline.

5) Output Control - includes traditional forms of control - test or exam. Only students, who have 40 % of the total number of points on discipline (modules) required by the program are allowed to take the exam apart from output control. The maximum number of points that a student can score on the final (output) control is not more than 30% of the total number of points of discipline.

Schedule of examinations is made for full-time students twice a year, in winter and in summer. Students throughout the academic year have to take no more than 10 exams and 12 credits (tests).

Each teachers determines the forms of control and assessment criteria for their academic discipline. Forms, methods and criteria of assessment of the obtained learning results are proved and explained to the students at the beginning of the semester during the first lecture, during the study and before the exam, as well as during the selection of the practice facility, before attestation. Criteria for evaluating the results of the attestation the exam is presented to the candidates at the course meeting. The criteria for evaluating the results of practices are specified in the work programs, methodical recommendations and are presented to applicants when receiving a task for practical training. Results evaluation criteria of the attestation exam are presented to candidates at the course meetings and summarized in Methodological recommendations with preparation for the final certification of higher education applicants.

Information about the forms of control measures and evaluation criteria is provided to applicants by the dean's office of the faculty management and teachers (schedule of educational process, schedule of current certification).

The mechanism of educational, organizational, informational, advisory and social support for applicants, which implemented at the National Academy of Sciences, carried out through close interaction with curators, teachers, employees of the dean's office, representatives of student self-government, trade union organization, University administration. Educational support of applicants from teachers (both group and individual) is carried out on a permanent basis in accordance with the approved consultation schedule and outside of it. During distance and (or) mixed form of education communication between the participants of the educational process is carried out by using the remote system Moodle training, online meetings on the Zoom, Jitsi meet, Google Meet platforms, informing through social media networks, etc. Organizational support for winners is provided by curators of academic groups and representatives dean's office Course meetings, starostats, curatorial hours and informal events are means of communication between participants of the educational process. Informational support is provided through informative content MNAU website

Consultative support for applicants is provided via Facebook, Instagram, Telegram, Viber, e-mail, website of the University. Participants of the educational process have the opportunity to receive free consultations in the psychological and pedagogical laboratory. Social support for students of higher education is provided by providing academic, personal and social scholarships, material assistance and moral encouragement.

Also, one of the areas of social support is the provision of socially oriented prices in the Public Center nutrition of MNAU. Applicants who need accommodation in dormitories are provided with places. According to Regulations on the survey of participants in the educational process and interested persons at the Ukrainian National Academy of Sciences (<http://surl.li/anigk>) in The university conducts a questionnaire (survey) of the participants of the educational process to study their opinion regarding: the state of educational activity, the quality of providing educational services, etc. The results of surveys of applicants for the OP show that high level of their educational, organizational, informational, advisory and social satisfaction support (<http://surl.li/apzsg>).

### **3.2 Assessment**

Overall, it can be stated that the teaching methods used promote student-centred learning and are sufficiently diverse. The teaching and learning forms are therefore rated as very good by the evaluators. The students provide information about a very good supervision relationship with the teaching staff. The students are very satisfied with the supervision and emphasised

the excellent support and accessibility of the teaching staff. The study advisors advise students on the choice of study programme and the creation of an individual study plan.

Students are continuously supported by the teaching staff in preparing for exams. The examination regulations are also transparent.

All documents relevant to the study programme are available in the university information system.

All information on the study programme is complete and transparent. Interactive teaching methods encourage students to take an active role in the learning process.

Students receive questionnaires to evaluate their courses and the overall learning experience. Discussing the feedback from these surveys with students can be an additional valuable tool in the student-centred quality process. Students can use office hours and the various electronic communication tools to submit complaints or suggestions for improvement.

Students also have various options available for complaints about assessment.

Students are assessed through various methods, e.g. written and oral examinations, presentations and written assignments. The assessment corresponds to the intended learning outcomes. The assessment procedure and regulations are clear to students and are published at the beginning of each course.

Quality control of study preparation takes place throughout the study period and consists of sufficient different control measures:

The University provides equal opportunities for students in all fields of study, regardless of gender, nationality, religion and social status, language and mode of instruction, as well as taking into account special educational needs and individual opportunities to design an individual educational programme aimed at developing the student's professional competence and cognitive activity.

Thus, the documents and materials provided by the university indicate that the university has developed an effective system of knowledge control. It can be concluded that the university applies the principle of student-centred learning, which aims at the personal development of students and ensures equal opportunities for all groups of students.

### **3.3 Conclusion**

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

#### 4 ESG Standard 1.4: Student admission, progression, recognition, and certification

**Institutions should consistently apply pre-defined and published regulations covering all phases of the student “life cycle”, e.g. student admission, progression, recognition and certification.**

##### 4.1 Implementation

The main requirement to apply for a master’s degree is a completed bachelor’s degree, specialist, or master's degree in management, economics or agricultural education. An applicant that obtained bachelor’s degree in another field can be admitted after successfully passing additional entrance examinations.

Citizens of Ukraine have the right to obtain higher education in the university free of charge on a competitive basis in accordance with higher education standards if a certain degree of higher education is acquired by a citizen for the first time funded by the state or local budget.

For the competitive selection of persons during admission to the master's program, professional entrance examinations are conducted in the form of testing according to the volume of bachelor's programs (subject to the successful passing of the additional entrance examination for those who have obtained an educational degree in higher education in another specialty) and a single entrance exam in a foreign language.

Examination commissions are set up for entrance examinations at the State Science and Research Institute. For professional tests, when applying for education on the basis of previously obtained educational degree, professional appraisal commissions are created.

Retaking entrance examinations is not allowed. Appeals against the results of entrance tests conducted at MNAU are considered by the appeal commission, the composition and operations of which are approved by the rector.

An applicant's appeal on test scores received by applicants for entrance tests at MNAU must be submitted personally no later than the day after the announcement of the evaluation. The appeal is considered at a meeting of the appeal commission not later than the next working day after its submission, as a rule in the presence of the applicant.

Rating lists are formed by the admissions committee from the Unified Database and are made public on the website. The decision of the admissions committee regarding the enrolment of an applicant is also reflected in the entrance examiners' electronic office in the Unified Database.

Procedures for access to training in the master's program “Agricultural Management”, assessment, qualification assignment, recognition of the results of the previous formal and informal

learning, and recognition of the results of training in educational declarations are clearly defined and transparent and ensure the establishment of consistency (or inconsistency) of the results demonstrated by the student as a result of the training requirements of the master's program and additional qualifications (if any).

The procedure for recognizing study results obtained in other institutions of higher education is regulated by the Regulations on Organization of the educational process at MNAU and the Regulation on the procedure for re-enrollment of study results at MNAU. Students of higher education have the right to academic mobility of educational participants the process regulated by the Regulation on the procedure for implementing the right to academic mobility at the National Academy of Sciences. Procedure for recognition of higher education degrees obtained in foreign higher educational institutions or completed periods of study is determined by the Regulation on the commission on the recognition of achievements in educational institutions degrees of higher education and scientific degrees at MNAU. Availability for educational participants of the process is provided by the placement of the specified Regulations on the official website of the University. The procedure for recognizing study results obtained in other institutions of higher education is regulated by the Regulations on Organization of the educational process at MNAU and the Regulation on the procedure for re-enrollment of study results at MNAU. Students of higher education have the right to academic mobility of educational participants the process regulated by the Regulation on the procedure for implementing the right to academic mobility at the National Academy of Sciences.

Procedure for recognition of higher education degrees obtained in foreign higher educational institutions or completed periods of study is determined by the Regulation on the commission on the recognition of achievements in educational institutions degrees of higher education and scientific degrees at MNAU. Availability for educational participants of the process is provided by the placement of the specified Regulations on the official website of the University.

Evaluation of learning outcomes is carried out on the principles of objectivity and a systematic, planned, unity of requirements, on openness, transparency, cost-effectiveness, accessibility and comprehensiveness of the methodology of evaluation, taking into account the individual capabilities of the student.

According to the Educational Programs of Higher Education, when revising the assessments obtained in other educational institutions, the recommendations of the European Credit Transfer System (unless otherwise provided by a bilateral agreement) are used.

Conditions for recognition of successful studies at the University:

credits assigned to individual higher education applicants after completing the learning activities required by the formal curriculum or a separate educational component, and with a successful evaluation of their learning outcomes;

the criteria for successful passing is the assessment of the achievement of the minimum threshold levels for each of the planned learning outcomes of the educational component and the minimum threshold level for the educational component as a whole;

the minimum threshold level for each learning outcome planned for the educational component is determined by the relevant work program (regulations) but can not be less than 50 percent of the maximum possible number of points;;

the minimum threshold level for an educational component is unique in the University, does not depend on the forms and methods of evaluation, and is 60 percent of the maximum possible number of points;

a student may not be allowed to graduate if during the semester he:

- 1) has not reached the minimum threshold level for those learning outcomes that cannot be assessed during the final exam;
- 2) if during the semester he scored insufficiently to obtain a positive assessment, even in the event that he achieves the most possible result at the final control.

The results of the semester control of the master's program are analyzed by the guarantor of the program (working group of the program), reported and discussed at meetings of departments, academics, councils of faculties / institutes and the Academic Council of the University. The results of discussions at councils are grounds for initiating changes in the master's program, in admission, and in the rules of evaluation.

When making a decision on the introduction of any changes to rules of assessment or to the master's program, the timing of the introduction of such changes and distributing them to people who are already enrolled in the program must agree with the student government.

The examiner's objectivity during the acceptance of the defense of the report on production practice is ensured by the commission protection of practice results. Procedures for the prevention and settlement of conflicts of interest are regulated by the Regulation on resolving conflict situations at the Ukrainian National Academy of Sciences. A permanent commission on settlement of conflict situations. The composition of the Commission to resolve a specific conflict situation is being formed the first vice-rector or the vice-rector for scientific-pedagogical and educational work and professional development and consists of at least three members of the Commission approved for the corresponding calendar year.

Conflict of interest resolution procedures include filing and considering a complaint, accepting the appropriate one decision. There was no conflict of interest during the implementation of the master's program "Agrarian Management".

Students who have fulfilled all requirements of curricula and plans in the area of training (specialty) are admitted to state attestation. Admission to the preparation of the graduation thesis project is an order to admit students to state attestation, whose draft is submitted by the dean of the faculty.

The procedure for conducting control measures at the Ukrainian National Academy of Sciences is regulated by regulatory documents that are permanent and freely available on the official website of the University, namely:

- Regulations on the organization of the educational process at MNAU
- Regulations on the procedure for evaluating applicants for higher education at MNAU
- Regulations on the procedure for creating and organizing the work of the examination commission for attestation students of higher education at MNAU
- Regulations on improving the organization of students' independent work at the National Academy of Sciences

#### **4.2 Assessment**

The study requirements are clearly defined and can also be viewed by applicants across parents on the university's website. The website in question is easy to find and very clearly laid out. The university has a suitable procedure for recording relevant information on the course of studies and taking action if necessary. The review panel assesses the admission procedure as transparently described and well thought-out. At the beginning of their studies, students are sufficiently informed about the course of their studies and all opportunities to participate in university life. Upon completion of their studies, graduates therefore receive meaningful and transparent documents showing the qualifications and learning outcomes acquired. In addition, the university has sufficient procedures in place to collect information on students' progress.

Admission requirements are clearly defined. Admission in relation to the need for teachers ensures that there is no oversupply of trained teachers. In addition to the regular admission procedure, the university supports disabled students and students from national minorities.

The university monitors the development of students during their studies. An important element of student success is the sharing of information about the structure of the study programme, prerequisites for course selection, course objectives, course assignments, examinations, workload, etc. In the department, a compulsory introductory course is offered to all students, which

introduces them to all the above-mentioned areas. In addition, students receive information from various counselling services throughout their stay at the university.

The degree certificates issued by the university enable students to either continue their education at institutions outside the country or to pursue a professional career abroad.

Overall, it can be said that the university has transparent enrolment procedures, records and monitors the development of students and issues sufficiently meaningful graduation certificates that demonstrate the qualifications acquired in the program “Agricultural Management” (Master of Management).

### 4.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

## 5 ESG Standard 1.5: Teaching staff

**Institutions should assure themselves of the competence of their teachers. They should apply fair and transparent processes for the recruitment and development of the staff**

### 5.1 Implementation

The university announces competitions for vacant teaching staff positions. Announcement of the competition, deadlines, requirements etc. must be published in the printed mass media, as well as on the official website of the university. Preference is given to candidates who have an academic degrees, academic titles, higher education education in the relevant field of knowledge, research and teaching experience, scientific works, in particular publications in specialized publications from relevant field of science and in publications with a citation index; published educational and methodical works, received documents on intellectual property rights, skills development and professional development in the last 5 years, membership in public professional organizations and other achievements of educational and scientific activity. Discussion of applicants for filling vacant positions takes place at a meeting of the department, the academic council of the faculty and the expert commission of the academic council of the university, before the meeting of the academic council of the university, with the relevant documentary registration of each stage of the specified procedure.

The training of specialists in the international program “Agricultural Management” is carried out by the scientific and pedagogical staff of the departments of the Faculty of Management of MNAU. The educational process of training specialists in the specialty is performed by the scientific and pedagogical staff of 5 departments of MNAU.

Currently 14 teachers teach in the study program “Agricultural Management”. All teachers in this study program have scientific degrees and academic titles. Departments provide the educational process with methodological and informational materials sufficient for normative needs.

In order to promote the professional development of teachers at the university, systematic work has been organized and is being implemented in accordance with the Regulation on professional development and training of pedagogical and research-pedagogical staff employees of the Ukrainian National Academy of Sciences. The university administration constantly organizes advanced courses on development of qualifications, conferences of various levels, seminars, trainings, etc. Teaching staff have an opportunity to attend free foreign language courses at the university led by native speaker. Teaching staff publish their own results of scientific research in specialized university publications

The internationalization of the activities is regulated by the Regulation on the Procedure for the Implementation of the Right to Academic mobility at MNAU. The university has established international relations with many leading higher education institutions countries of the world. MNAU is a member of the Commonwealth of Magna Charta Universities, Membership associations of the Institute of International Education, American Council on International Education. The university cooperates with international organizations, such as the British Council in Ukraine, German Academic Exchange Service (DAAD), International Research and Exchange Council (IREX), Funds named after Senators Fulbright and Humphrey, (Fulbright&Humphrey Foundation), Austrian Academic Exchange Service (OAD), US Peace Corps, Korean society of international cooperation, Federation of Exchanges France-Ukraine, etc. There is an opportunity for teachers and students of higher education to improve knowledge of the professional English language while participating in the work of the English language club. All participants of the educational process have free access to information resources regarding international grants and scholarships programs, to Scopus and Web of Science scientometric databases.

## **5.2 Assessment**

In general, according to the university`s self-assessment report, the positive trends in education, research and training shows the effectiveness of the University`s human resources policy. Also, bilateral and multilateral active cooperation with internal and external partners indicates that the University has been achieving good results in the field of education, research and professional training of teaching staff.

The academic and professional qualifications of the teachers involved in the implementation of the educational program ensure the achievement of the goals and program learning outcomes defined by the respective program.

Procedures for the competitive selection of teachers are transparent and allow to ensure the necessary level of their professionalism for the successful implementation of the educational programme.

The procedure of competitive selection for the positions of scientific and pedagogical workers at the University is regulated by the relevant Regulations and determines the main requirements and procedures of competitive selection.

The announcement of the competition is posted on the University's website in accordance with the legislation. When evaluating candidates during the competitive selection of teachers, academic and professional qualifications are taken into account in accordance with the goals of the educational program and professional activity. The level of proficiency in the state language, foreign languages, the presence of an academic title, a scientific degree in the specialty of teaching disciplines is taken into account; availability of scientific publications, including in Scopus, WoS, textbooks, manuals, methodological developments, participation in international projects, internships, experience of teaching and practical work, participation in grant projects and research topics, etc.

The institution of higher education promotes the professional development of teachers through its own programs or in cooperation with other organizations.

The university, together with its partners, provides various forms of professional development of teachers.

Teachers improve their professional qualifications and teaching skills mostly through participation in projects, internships, trainings, etc.

The institution of higher education attracts practicing professionals, industry experts, and representatives of employers to classroom classes.

All teachers of the program improve their professional qualifications on an ongoing basis in the areas of the disciplines they teach. Teachers undergo internships, courses to improve pedagogical skills. The best practices are the academic mobility of teachers, both international and national, to participate in conferences, forums, and seminars. Active academic and professional activity contributes to the internationalization of the educational program and the University. The competitive selection procedure is transparent, takes into account teachers' professionalism, experience, and pedagogical skills.

Professional teaching is assured. Applicant selection and staff development are clearly regulated and meet all standards. There is no doubt about the academic qualifications of the teaching staff. The numerical ratio of teachers to students is very good, which is also appreciated by the students. In the discussions with lecturers and students, the impression was confirmed that the staff is very good, both quantitatively and qualitatively. The students confirmed very good supervision by the lecturers. All lecturers are very well qualified. They describe the situation in class and the contact with the lecturers as extremely pleasant and motivating. Yet, the English language skills of teaching and administrative staff should be improved and corresponding further training courses implemented.

The same standards and uniform application procedures for teaching staff should be prevailed at all partner universities.

Professional practice representatives should be consulted in an institutionalised way in curriculum development.

However, despite the above-mentioned positive trends, the University's human resources policy should continue to increase the transparency of recruitment of the teaching staff and develop new training methods, technologies and their implementation.

The Teaching staff of the program provides by the lecturers who have scientific degrees and academic titles. Competition for the staff position at the University corresponds to the national legal statements and identified as a procedure with a number of logical stages. Additionally, there are several recommendations for the criteria improvement:

In order to improve language (foreign) skills, to provide elements of material incentives for lecturers, delivered lessons in English. It could be bonuses for lecturers, graded depending on number of hours, delivered in English.

There should be a regular survey of the lecturers to identify their professional needs, the relevant methods of the motivational system, the psychological environment in distance work and the educational process. The results of the survey should be analysed by the heads of the different management levels.

Apart from the requirements to apply for a career position at the university and the possibility to publish a scientific paper in the Electronic Scientific Edition on Economics "Modern Economics" and the Agronomic Journal of the Ukrainian Black Sea Region, financial and non-financial incentives should be provided to encourage the publication activity of lecturers, including publications in foreign editions incorporated in Scopus or Web of Science. Financial incentives could be a bonus salary or partial funding of scientific papers published in Scopus

or Web of Science; non-financial incentives could be dean's or rector's certificates for publication activities.

### 5.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

## 6 ESG Standard 1.6: Learning resources and student support

**Institutions should have appropriate funding for learning and teaching activities and ensure that adequate and readily accessible learning resources and student support are provided.**

### 6.1 Implementation

Material and technical support of MNAU allows the qualitative training of specialists in the specialty «Agrarian Management». The university has sufficient classrooms equipped with modern technology, educational laboratories, a library of science and technology with ample book stock, and sufficient accommodation in student dormitories.

The university is the owner of the premises, which has the entire training and support base. Education is conducted in 12 academic buildings with a total area of 116,727.0 square meters, including 93,381.0 square meters of educational and laboratory premises.

Four academic buildings with total area of 26,472.7 square meters are available for students of the educational and professional program «Agrarian Management».

The main base for the formation of theoretical knowledge of students and of obtaining scientific information by postgraduate students and academic staff is a library, the total area of which is 1594 square meters, of which the area of the stacks is 694 square meters. The library has 8 reading rooms, where the total number of seats is 520. In addition, the dormitories have a library with 91 seats. The university, according to license requirements, has the necessary stock of educational literature. The general information fund of the library contains 263638 titles.

The university has an efficient electronic library reading room equipped with 90 internet-connected workspaces. The electronic catalog has more than 42 000 titles.

The material and technical base for students of the educational and professional program includes:

- multimedia equipment rooms, where professional disciplines are taught,
- high level of technical support in using modern equipment, which allows a visual display of the theoretical material and reveals the practical aspects of subjects,

- specialized laboratories containing all the necessary equipment and software,
- educational and scientific laboratory «Teaching Bank» which allows teachers to integrate aspects of practical training into the educational process and provide students with higher education skills in fiscal institutions;
- educational and scientific laboratory «Innovative technologies of accounting and taxation» is used to improve the quality of training and the acquisition of practical skills related to financial accounting, organization, and methods of auditing reports;
- educational and scientific laboratory «Automated workplace of the manager of business planning and forecasting» which allows teachers to improve the quality of training and acquisition of relevant competencies,
- Teaching and Research Laboratory, Department of Economics of Enterprises enables teachers to provide students with skills related to economic departments of enterprises and institutions,
- a centre for business training and business games.

The available multimedia equipment in the study rooms and laboratories, with access to the Internet, provides visual representation of information with access to current normative documents and financial reporting, and provides an opportunity for the simulation of real cases, allowing for the attachment of educational material and the formation of analytical abilities and the professional competencies of students.

The University has 900 PCs and additional organizational and peripheral equipment.

The university has an educational and information portal, which stores the lecture materials (texts and presentations) and materials for laboratory and workshops. Through this portal, students take modular and final testing. E-learning courses are developed on the Moodle distance learning platform.

The university has an agricultural open encyclopaedia, which contains the materials for remote learning, annotation (supplemented by expert commentary and links to internal and external resources), and standards.

The university introduced a website «Agrarian sector of Ukraine», which is the basis of a nationwide remote informational and advisory system in the fields of agricultural production and of agrarian science and education.

## 6.2 Assessment

The ratio between the number of students and the teaching materials and spaces is appropriate. Libraries and classrooms are well digitised and it should be mentioned which has a positive effect on the development process of student-centred learning. Therefore, the premises and equipment are adequate to support the effective implementation of the programme objectives and learning success in all respects.

From the meeting with the student council and the self-evaluation report, it can be concluded that the information provided to the students about the service facilities of the university is very good.

The resource facilities of the study programme can be described as very good. The modern and excellent equipment, which corresponds to the subject standards, is suitable for providing students with a sound education. In the opinion of the review panel, the overall resource endowment is thus very well suited for the implementation of the degree programme. Buildings, rooms and technical equipment can be described as exemplary. The library offers students extensive support in searching for information and using the available technology. The university is also well equipped for digital teaching.

The needs of a heterogeneous student body are also adequately addressed. Internal quality assurance takes material resources into account in its evaluation culture and regularly solicits feedback from students. The evaluation team assesses all material, financial and human resources as fully sufficient to achieve the qualification goals of the study programme. The needs of a heterogeneous student body are taken into account in every respect.

For the administrative staff, there is the possibility of individual further development. The scope and qualifications of the non-academic administrative staff can be described as very good. Sufficient opportunities for further training are available.

It can be stated that the degree programme has a high degree of studyability. Yet, the University of Applied Science Weihenstephan-Triesdorf should establish a good administrative infrastructure for all partner universities and create even more support services in general and during student mobility phases with a view to even better studyability.

In order to guarantee the implementation of the study programme, the staff should also grow with the increasing number of students.

## 6.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

## 7 ESG Standard 1.7: Information management

**Institutions should ensure that they collect, analyse and use relevant information for the effective management of their programmes and other activities.**

### 7.1 Implementation

The Master's "Agricultural Management" (Master of Management) main documents such as curriculum, Regulations on the organization of the educational process at MNAU, Regulations on the procedure for evaluating applicants for higher education at MNAU, syllabuses, methodical recommendations for practical classes and independent assignments, assessment criteria and requirements in the Moodle distance learning system are freely available.

The goals, content, expected learning outcomes, as well as the procedure and evaluation criteria within the disciplines of the master's program "Agrarian Management" are contained in working programs of educational disciplines and syllabi, which are presented in the Moodle distance learning system and are published on the website of the Ukrainian National Academy of Sciences. The specified information within the disciplines of the master's program "Agricultural Management" is provided to applicants throughout period of study. During the year, teachers conduct individual advisory work according to the schedule. All necessary information is provided to students at the beginning of studying the discipline (first lesson), in particular, regarding the content and meaning of the discipline, program learning outcomes, teaching and learning methods, the order and evaluation criteria, control measures, topics for individual works, a list of informal measures, information sources, etc. In addition, the above information is provided to applicants during the presentation of optional disciplines. Information on the educational process under the master's program "Agricultural Management" (Master of Management) (schedule of the educational process, list elective subjects, schedule of classes and semester control, teacher consultation schedules, schedules classes in production conditions, schedules for the protection of practice results are presented on the official website University, faculty page and relevant departments. The evaluation criteria of the final attestation are indicated to the applicants the beginning of its passage.

### 7.2 Assessment

The university has a well-functioning information management system. The administration has thorough data collection systems. The current and complete data structure is used very well for the internal quality management system. The evaluation of the data is accompanied by quality assurance measures and planning of follow-up activities.

The programme uses the existing infrastructure of the university to collect student feedback on individual courses and lectures as well as on the environment at the university in general.

Students report that they feel encouraged to give feedback to lecturers and that their feedback is well received by lecturers. A survey of student satisfaction with the quality and conditions of the study programme is conducted annually to investigate student opinion on the quality of the University's educational and administrative services.

For the programme that is in the process of being accredited, there is sufficient information to attract applicants.

The university has the necessary procedures for collecting and analysing information about the programme, including key performance indicators, information about the student body, the level of academic achievement, student performance and examinations. Students are provided with educational resources and student support services.

The expert group therefore notes that the university regularly collects and analyses information on the study programme, students, graduates and other activities as part of the quality management system and makes it available to the internal quality assurance system.

Both students and teachers are involved in the processes through a procedure and existing structures at the university. In addition, graduates and employers are also involved in the process.

Thus, as part of the university's quality management, data on students is collected and their assessment is carried out. Also based on the self-evaluation report of the university and the discussions during the online evaluation, the expert group was able to confirm that the institution implements the necessary measures to assess the quality of teaching.

Information management includes the use of various methods to provide information. Confidentiality of information is also guaranteed.

### 7.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

## 8 ESG Standard 1.8: Public information

<b>Institutions should publish information about their activities, including programmes, which is clear, accurate, objective, up-to date and readily accessible.</b>
--

### 8.1 Implementation

The main source of information about MNAU is the official website of the university, which provides up-to-date information about study programs. Curriculum, work programs of disciplines (modules), teaching materials, and background abstracts of lectures are available in electronic form available on the university's website. In addition, on the website of the Faculty

of Management, where the master's program "Agricultural Management" (Master of Management) is implemented, information about the organizational structure with the names of contact persons and their phone numbers and email addresses, along with the curriculum schedule is provided.

A booklet that covers the main issues of the international master's program "Agricultural Management" (Master of Management) is publicly available. Once a month the university organizes an Open Day, where potential applicants can ask questions and learn about the study program. Each semester the Faculty of Management offers lectures that cover main aspects of applying and studying at the Weihenstephan-Triesdorf University of Applied Sciences and on opportunity of obtaining a double degree diploma.

Graduates and entrants may receive individual consultations at the Dean's Office either personally or by telephone or e-mail. On the personal sites of the teachers providing courses in the master's program of "Agricultural Management" there is information on the structure of the training modules and contact information, which allows students and applicants to ask questions about the master's course.

Information about the international master's course is also posted on the bulletin boards at all of faculties of the university.

The university has created a graduates employment center at MNAU, which actively cooperates with large employers in the agrarian sector. The purpose in forming the employment center was to provide high quality professional training of specialists through integrated cooperation of the University with interested companies and organizations – leading employers – by combining intellectual capacity, material and financial resources, and corporate partners.

The main tasks of the Center are:

- Improving the image of the University in the educational services market of Ukraine;
- forecasting the needs of the labor market for specialists of the corresponding specialty;
- providing proposals for the improvement of professional requirements for specialists
- assessing the quality of the curricula and training programs. Participation in the development of content, informational and methodological and logistical support of the selected components of curricula and training programs;
- implementation of production and pre-diploma practice of students;
- involve students in actual production and research activity of enterprises and organizations-partners of the University;

- attract staff agencies of institutions, enterprises, and organizations to the educational process (lectures, workshops, production management practices, course and degree design);
  - conducting joint conferences, school-seminars for students, post-graduate students and young scientists, etc.;
  - creation of a database of leading Ukrainian enterprises that can provide students with high-level practical training;
  - ensuring the employment of graduates of the University (preliminary provision of employment for future graduates);
- constant monitoring of the quality of training of specialists among graduates and leading employers;
- organization, with an eye to future employment, of the advanced training and internships of scientific and pedagogical workers and employees of the University.

All regulatory documents are freely accessible on the official website of the Ukrainian National Academy of Sciences, which ensures transparency and accessibility for all participants of the educational process. Participants of the educational process have information about their rights and obligations. Applicants who have enrolled in training contain detailed and structured information about the availability, placement and content of regulatory documents during course collections, curatorial hours. Applicants are provided with information on all types of activities of MNAU, their rights, duties and directions communication. During the hiring process, teachers must familiarize themselves with the normative documents of the Ukrainian National Academy of Sciences.

In accordance with the Law of Ukraine "On Access to Public Information", MNAU places it on the official website and its results of providing in response to an information request in an electronic or other convenient form.

Each of the stakeholders has the opportunity to express their vision, opinions, recommendations, wishes with use questionnaires, by letter to the e-mail address of the guarantor, the faculty of management, the department of management and marketing, by phone, in social networks, trust box.

## **8.2 Assessment**

The main source of public information about the study program "Agricultural Management" (Master of Management) is the official website of the university, the website of the Faculty of Agricultural Economics, the website of the Faculty of Agrobusiness and Management, and website of the Master's Center which is the graduation department for this study program.

All persons interested in receiving information about events at the university and, in particular, information updates on program have informational support through close communication using various social networks: Facebook, Instagram. The Master's Preparing Center additionally highlights all information related to the program on its official Facebook page. Considerable attention is paid to the coverage of all events related to the organization of the educational process, the life of students and graduates. The university has its own YouTube channel, where all scientific and educational events of the university are covered and students upload videos. Students can find here the information about the history of successful partnership, advantages of studying the master's program etc.

### 8.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

## 9 ESG Standard 1.9: On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes

**Institutions should monitor and periodically review their programmes to ensure that they achieve the objectives set for them and respond to the needs of students and society. These reviews should lead to continuous improvement of the programme. Any action planned or taken as a result should be communicated to all those concerned.**

### 9.1 Implementation

The procedure for developing, approving, monitoring and periodic revision of the master's program of «Agricultural Management» is being implemented at the MNAU in accordance with the Regulation on the procedure for the development, approval, monitoring and revision of educational programs in MNAU, Regulations on the organization of the educational process at MNAU, Regulations on working (project) groups and groups for providing educational programs at MNAU. All the specified normative documents are published on the official website of the Ukrainian National Academy of Sciences and are freely available for all participants in the educational process.

The revision of the master's program of "Agricultural Management" takes place in accordance with the Regulation on the procedure for development, approval, monitoring and review of educational programs at MNAU. Responsibility for the organization and conduct of local monitoring is carried out by the Guarantor. The results of local monitoring are brought to the attention of the participants of the educational process. Based on the results of the review of the master's program of "Agricultural Management" in 2021, the following proposals were made to the master's program of "Agricultural Management":

- according to the results of the survey, proposals were received from master's program of «Agricultural Management» applicants regarding the need to increase the number practical

classes and (or) informal events with the participation of stakeholders, in particular on their basis (was implemented in the first semester of 2021-2022 taking into account quarantine restrictions), as well as a proposal regarding the necessity increasing the number of professional and practical disciplines (the proposal will be taken into account during formation master's program of "Agricultural Management" 2022 project).

Students are involved in the process of reviewing and improving the master's program of "Agricultural Management" through participation in meetings of the master's program working group, meetings of the academic council of the faculty of management and the academic council of the university.

After studying the discipline, passing practice, the teachers conduct a survey (questionnaire) of the applicants of the master's program of "Agricultural Management" concerning in particularly transparent assessment, discussion of learning outcomes, free access to information, compliance with academic integrity, etc., as well as expressing one's own vision of educational quality process and wishes. Thus, according to the results of the questionnaire conducted by the master's program of "Agricultural Management" (Master of Management) guarantor, proposals were received from master's program of "Agricultural Management" (Master of Management) applicants regarding the need to increase the number of practical classes and (or) informal events with the participation of stakeholders, in particular, on their basis (it was implemented in the first semester of 2021-2022, taking into account quarantine restrictions), and also a proposal regarding the need to increase the number of professional and practical disciplines (the proposal will be taken into account when forming the master's program of «Agrarian Management» 2022 project).

## **9.2 Assessment**

The Examination of the regulatory documents in the Academic Policy section of the University's website, the self-evaluation report, the results of the faculty and student survey, and the results of the online survey confirmed that monitoring and regular evaluation of the study program "Agricultural Management" (Master of Management) is carried out at the University.

The schedule of activities for monitoring the quality of education was approved, according to which the University monitors and regularly evaluates the study programmes in order to achieve the objectives and meet the needs of students and society. In order to determine the level of satisfaction of internal needs, the University organises and conducts a survey among students, faculty and University staff every academic session.

The survey is conducted to determine the level of satisfaction with the students' educational needs, their attitude towards the educational process, the socio-cultural environment, etc.

The results of the survey are statistically analysed, discussed in the administrative meetings and taken into account in the further planning of educational activities. According to the monitoring statistics, the programme management analyses and compiles the survey results in order to initiate the necessary measures to achieve the desired results.

The existing quality management seems to function according to a hierarchical principle. However, the goal is a functioning control circle between the participants in order to improve the quality of research and teaching (Circle of Quality). This Circle of Quality functions according to the bottom up - top down principle.

The university regularly reviews the strategy and policy in the area of quality and monitors its implementation.

Overall, it should be noted that responsibilities are clearly and comprehensibly regulated, not least because the core processes of quality assurance are documented in the university's regulations.

Feedback between students and teachers is a prerequisite for improving teaching and should be introduced. The evaluation results of the anonymous course evaluations will be presented to the students after the surveys and discussed with them in order to derive concrete measures for improving teaching.

It became clear in the discussions that there is definitely close contact with the graduates and that they are surveyed very soon after graduation.

The course evaluations thus serve the continuous development and improvement of quality and studyability. The student workload is continuously surveyed in the course evaluations; corresponding questions are included in the questionnaires. An evaluation of the workload through a module should take place at regular intervals.

Students are made aware of the student workload and examination requirements by the lecturers at the beginning of the course. In the degree programme, the measure of how many hours one ECTS point corresponds to the student workload is anchored in the regulatory documents.

With regard to the quality of teaching, it should be noted that measures to ensure it begin with the recruitment of teaching staff. In addition, the university offers teaching staff various further training opportunities, both on technical and didactic topics.

It can be stated that there is a combination of internal and external quality management in order to offer its own study programmes in a generally ESG-compliant manner.

The "Agricultural Management" (Master of Management) is regularly evaluated to ensure quality and to check compliance with the high quality standards. Ongoing monitoring of the study

programme is carried out in accordance with the quality assurance policy. The programme is reviewed regularly and if changes are required, they are made. This process is exemplary. The study programmes thus have suitable and different procedures for internal quality assurance.

The University has a systematic procedure of analysis, development, monitoring and periodic revision of the educational program. Employers who confirmed this process as transparent, understandable and accessible are involved in the improvement of the educational program. A culture of quality has been formed in the academic community of the University, which contributes to the continuous development of the educational program and educational activities under this program.

The process of collecting proposals from various groups of stakeholders is insufficiently organized. It is recommended to strengthen work on the organization of the process of collecting proposals from various groups of stakeholders.

Standardised evaluation procedures should be introduced, in order to advance the quality assurance of the study programme and, if necessary, to be able to derive recommendations for action

### **9.3 Conclusion**

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

## **10 ESG Standard 1.10: Cyclical external quality assurance**

<b>Institutions should undergo external quality assurance in line with the ESG on a cyclical basis</b>
--

### **10.1 Implementation**

In accordance with the Regulation on student self-government of the Mykolaiv National Agrarian University student self-government is directly involved in internal procedures of the master's program of «Agricultural Management» quality assurance. Representatives of student self-government are members of academic councils of the university and Faculty of Management. Students who are part of these bodies can submit proposals to the academic council of the faculty and the university on improving the strategy of the university regarding educational, pedagogical and scientific control process and participate in resolving conflict situations that may arise between students and representatives administration/teachers. They can be members of working groups or groups for the provision of educational programs.

At MNAU, employers are involved in reviewing of the study program “Agricultural Management” (Master of Management) curricula, holding lectures and practical classes, to educational and scientific events.

The practice of MNAU in collecting and taking into account information on the career path and employment trajectories of the graduates includes regular communication and invitations to educational and scientific events (open lectures, conferences, etc.). The experience and suggestions are considered, in particular for updating and provisioning qualities of the master's program.

The university operates the Center for Employment of Graduates of MNAU , which carries out its activities with the aim of providing assistance to applicants and graduates of the university in planning professional career and promotion of their employment, as well as adaptation to practical activities. MNAU conducts the Open Days of the Ukrainian National Academy of Sciences and the "PROFISTAR" program

Members of the academic community of MNAU are involved in the procedures of internal quality assurance of the master's program at all stages. During the meetings of the working group and the support group, at the meetings of the department, scientific and methodical commission faculty, academic council of the faculty and university, meetings of the rectorate and dean's office, meetings of bodies of student self-government, issues of the quality of the master's program are considered.

The teachers of the department took part in seminars and webinars on accreditation issues and ensuring the quality of the master's program. A permanent staff has been organized at MNAU interfaculty seminar on quality assurance of the master's program and exchange of experience regarding the completion of the process accreditation of the master's program. Feedback between the participants of the academic community regarding the internal quality assurance of the master's program is ensured by questionnaires, proposals, recommendations, which, by the decision of the working group, are considered when updating the study program. Close cooperation and interaction between all structural subdivisions has been established at MNAU, which allows to coordinate main directions of providing educational services and ensuring their quality in a combination of education, science, and production.

At MNAU a quality management system was implemented and a Quality Council was created to successfully implement the policy in the field of quality. The activities of the Quality Council are aimed directly at improving the education quality system. Issues of development, implementation, improvement of the master's program, improvement of educational and methodological and information support, use of traditional and innovative methods to ensure the quality of teaching within the limits of the master's program and a specific discipline,

conducting questionnaires, processing results, their implementation, updating the master's program are within the scope of responsibility security group and OP Guarantor. Publicity of information is ensured in view of the principles of openness and transparency. Structural divisions of the Ukrainian National Academy of Sciences are involved in the implementation of the master's program, ensuring its quality. The level of internal quality of development, implementation, updating and monitoring the quality of the master's program is provided by the Guarantor, the assurance group. This is the distribution of the main ones tasks, responsibilities and initiatives between the structural divisions of the Ukrainian National Academy of Sciences is due to consideration interests of all participants in the educational process to ensure the quality of education and its effectiveness partnerships.

## **10.2 Assessment**

As far as the legal framework of quality assurance is concerned, the study programme is conducted in accordance with the regulations and guidelines. For this purpose, the university has a combination of internal and external quality management to offer the study programme in accordance with the ESG. The University has undergone institutional accreditation. The accreditation results are incorporated into the structuring of the University's business processes. Of particular importance is the cooperation with external stakeholders such as partner universities, graduates, industry and employers in order to gain impetus for continuous internal quality development.

Quality management ensures very well that the general quality assurance measures and instruments are constantly up-to-date and transparent. The University fulfils all obligatory aspects of external quality assurance: the different organisational units and levels are adequately in place and were explained in detail in the interviews with the HEI. Both internal and external quality assurance of the University's measures take into account all legal requirements and benefit from each other to advance the quality development of the study programme. External quality assurance extends to all necessary organisational levels such as financial operations and educational provision. The internal and external quality assurance mechanisms for the continuous development of the programme is well developed and the cyclical functioning of the programme's quality assessment is effective. The quality of the surveys and the processing of the results can be rated as very good. No specific problems in the cyclical external quality assurance were reported for the study programme.

The follow-up activities of the university's external quality assurance in preparing the next procedure are generally well thought out. The results of the external assessment and recognition of the quality of the study program (reports, expert opinions, etc.) are published on the university's website.

In conclusion, the coherence between external and internal quality assurances is well structured.

### **10.3 Conclusion**

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

#### IV Recommendation to the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN

##### 1 **Assessment of compliance the Standards and Guidelines in the Higher European Area (ESG) in the actual official version**

The study programme “**Agricultural Management**” (**Master of Management**) was assessed on the basis of the "Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area" (ESG) and the national or other relevant regulations.

The expert group concludes that the **ESG standards** 1.1 (Policy for quality assurance), 1.2 (Design and approval of programmes), 1.3 (Student-centred learning, teaching and assessment), 1.4 (Student admission, progression, recognition and certification), 1.5 (Teaching staff), 1.6 (Learning resources and student support), 1.7 (Information management), 1.8 (Public information), 1.9 (On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes) and 1.10 (Cyclical external quality assurance) are fulfilled.

The assessment criteria are as follows:

**Standard 1.1 Policy for quality assurance:** Universities have a publicly accessible quality assurance strategy, which is part of their strategic management. This strategy is developed and implemented by internal stakeholder representatives through appropriate structures and processes, involving external stakeholders.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.2 Design and approval of programmes:** Universities have procedures for the design and approval of their courses. The courses are designed in such a way that their objectives, including the desired learning outcomes, can be achieved. The qualification obtained during a degree program is clearly defined and communicated; it refers to the corresponding level of the national qualifications framework for higher education and, consequently, the qualifications framework for the European Higher Education Area.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.3 Student-centred learning, teaching and assessment:** Universities ensure that the courses offered are carried out in such a way as to encourage students to play an active role in the design of the learning process and that this approach is also taken into account when assessing students / examinations.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.4 Student admission, progression, recognition and certification:** Universities ensure that the courses offered are carried out in such a way as to encourage students to play an active role in the design of the learning process and that this approach is also taken into account when assessing students / examinations.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.5 Teaching staff:** Universities ensure the competence of their teachers. They use fair and transparent procedures for the recruitment and further training of their employees.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.6 Learning resources and student support:** The university has adequate funding to finance study and teaching and ensure that there is always a sufficient and readily available range of learning and support available for their studies.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.7 Information management:** Universities ensure that they collect, analyze and use the relevant data relevant to the successful conduct of studies and other activities.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.8 Public information:** Universities publish easily understandable, correct, objective, up-to-date and well-accessible information about their activities and courses of study.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.9 On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes:** Universities are constantly monitoring their courses and regularly reviewing them to ensure that they achieve the goals set and meet the needs of students and society. The tests lead to a continuous improvement of the courses. All affected parties will be informed about any measures planned or resulting from this.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.10 Cyclical external quality assurance:** Universities regularly undergo external quality assurance procedures in accordance with the ESG.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

The peer-review experts note that the recommendations from the previous accreditation procedure have been adequately taken into account.

## 2 Accreditation Recommendation

The peer-review experts recommend an unconditional accreditation of the study programme **“Agricultural Management” (Master of Management)** with the following **recommendations**:

1. Students' English language skills should be improved. Higher entrance requirements should be created with regard to English skills or students should be offered compulsory language courses to improve their English language skills.
2. Within the framework of the further development of the curriculum, current topics such as big data and digitalisation should be given greater consideration.
3. The same standards and uniform application procedures for teaching staff should prevail at all partner universities.
4. The English language skills of teaching and administrative staff should be improved and corresponding further training courses implemented.
5. Professional practice representatives should be consulted in an institutionalised way in curriculum development.
6. The HSWT should establish a good administrative infrastructure for all partner universities and create even more support services in general and during student mobility phases with a view to even better studyability.
7. In order to guarantee the implementation of the study programmes, the staff should also grow with the increasing number of students.
8. Better strategic communication activities should be developed to publicise the study offer in order to arouse the interest of potential applicants in the long term.
9. Standardised evaluation procedures should be introduced, in order to advance the quality assurance of the study programme and, if necessary, to be able to derive recommendations for action.
10. The University should systemize the cases of stakeholders (internal and external) involvement in providing quality assurance policy, in designing and improving educational program.
11. The university should provide the access to the information of stake-holders participation in providing quality assurance policy at the University (for instance, to put information

- about students', graduates' and employers' surveys on the University's website or on other source).
12. In the program profile to emphasize that students, except academic mobility rights, have the option to get double diploma (two diplomas simultaneously; one diploma is national, the second – is German). The information about double diploma may be presented in the block Features of the program.
  13. In order to improve language skills of the students the university include some disciplines in English within the study program. It means, that some courses which delivered by Ukrainian lecturers, could be taught in English. It helps students to improve the learning outcomes PLO 9 (to be able to communicate in professional and scientific circles in national and foreign languages) and to apply for academic mobility and to defense a final thesis in foreign language.
  14. The programme learning outcomes (PLOs) are set according to the national standard so that the study program harmonises with the national rules. However, the list of PLOs could be broader than in the national standard and additional PLOs could strengthen and highlight the specific aspects of the Agricultural Management programme.
  15. The list of courses should be revised the Programme learning outcomes (PLO) 8 ("Application of specialised software and information systems to solve organisational management problems).
  16. The public provision of the course programmes on the university's website should be made transparently. Potential students should have access to additional information about the course and modules, as they do not have access to the Moodle system.
  17. In order to improve language (foreign) skills, to provide elements of material incentives for lecturers, delivered lessons in English. It could be bonuses for lecturers, graded depending on number of hours, delivered in English.
  18. There should be a regular survey of the lecturers to identify their professional needs, the relevant methods of the motivational system, the psychological environment in distance work and the educational process. The results of the survey should be analysed by the heads of the different management levels.
  19. Apart from the requirements to apply for a career position at the university and the possibility to publish a scientific paper in the Electronic Scientific Edition on Economics "Modern Economics" and the Agronomic Journal of the Ukrainian Black Sea Region, financial and non-financial incentives should be provided to encourage the publication activity of

lecturers, including publications in foreign editions incorporated in Scopus or Web of Science. Financial incentives could be a bonus salary or partial funding of scientific papers published in Scopus or Web of Science; non-financial incentives could be dean's or rector's certificates for publication activities.

## V Decisions of the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN

Based on the evaluation report of the expert group and the statements of the Higher Education Institutions the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN makes on the 09 May 2023 the following decisions unanimously:

**The study programme “Agricultural Management” (Master of Management) at the Mykolajiv National Agrarian University is accredited without any conditions. The accreditation is valid until 30. September 2029.**

The following recommendations are given for the further development of the study programme:

- Students' English language skills should be improved. Higher entrance requirements should be created with regard to English skills or students should be offered compulsory language courses to improve their English language skills.
- Within the framework of the further development of the curriculum, current topics such as big data and digitalisation should be given greater consideration.
- The same standards and uniform application procedures for teaching staff should be prevailed at all partner universities.
- The English language skills of teaching and administrative staff should be improved and corresponding further training courses implemented.
- Professional practice representatives should be consulted in an institutionalised way in curriculum development.
- The HSWT should establish a good administrative infrastructure for all partner universities and create even more support services in general and during student mobility phases with a view to even better studyability.
- In order to guarantee the implementation of the study programmes, the staff should also grow with the increasing number of students.
- Better strategic communication activities should be developed to publicise the study offer in order to arouse the interest of potential applicants in the long term.
- Standardised evaluation procedures should be introduced, in order to advance the quality assurance of the study programme and, if necessary, to be able to derive recommendations for action.
- It is recommended to carry out further development of the internal quality assurance system by timely response to legislative changes, and by improving the coordination of measures to monitor the quality of the educational programme and educational activities at the University level.
- The expert group recommends involving students more in the work of the department in order to take their wishes and suggestions more into account when planning and implementing the educational process, selecting, reviewing and updating the educational programme.
- It is recommended to ensure the teaching of professional disciplines by a specialist with appropriate qualifications.