

Accreditation Report

The University of Bengkulu, Republic of Indonesia

Bachelor in Law, Bachelor in Accounting, Bachelor in Management, Bachelor in Economics, Magister in Law, Magister in Notarial Law, Magister in Accounting, Magister in Management, Magister in Development Economics, Doctoral in Management, Doctoral in Economics

I Procedure

Date of contract: 31 March 2022

Date of the submission of self-assessment report: 11 November 2022

Date of site visit: 15-17 November 2022

Attendance by ACQUIN office: Dr. Hanna Schösler

Accreditation decision scheduled: 25 September 2023

Peer review experts:

- **Prof. Dr. Surender Munjal**, University of Leeds (UK), Professor of International Business and Management
- **Prof. Dr. Ulrike Stefani**, University of Konstanz, Chair of Accounting
- **Prof. Almas Heshmati**, Jönköping University, Jönköping International Business School (JIBS), Professor of Economics
- **Prof. Dr. Mathias Schmoeckel**, University of Bonn, Executive Director of the Institute of German and Rhenish Legal History and Rhenish Institute of Notarial Law
- **Prof. Dr. Thomas Schomerus**, University of Lueneburg, Professor of Public Law, in particular Energy and Environmental Law
- **Prof. Dr. Mike Geppert**, Friedrich Schiller University Jena, Professor of Strategic and International Management
- **Prof. Dr. Martin Skala**, University of Applied Sciences Osnabrück, Professor of Economics
- **Karl-Peter Abt**, Former manager of the German Chamber of Commerce and Industry
- **Katharina van Kampen**, Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin, Student of Law

The **Assessment Report** of the peer-review experts is **based on** the self-assessment report of the Higher Education Institution (HEI) and extensive discussions with the HEI management, deans and/or heads of the departments, heads of study programme(s), lecturers, staff representatives, students, and alumni.

The basis of the **Assessment Criteria** is part 1 of the “Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area” (ESG) in the current official version. For PhD study programmes the Salzburg Recommendations are considered additionally. At the same time the national context, particularly the national regulations regarding the establishment of study programmes, are taken into account.

Content

I	Procedure	1
II	Introduction	5
1	The Higher Education System in Indonesia	6
1.1	Historical development	6
1.2	Contemporary situation	7
1.3	Accreditation System in Indonesia	9
2	Short profile of HEI	11
2.1	The University of Bengkulu	11
2.2	Faculty of Law	11
2.3	Faculty of Economics and Business	12
3	General information on the study programme(s)	13
III	Implementation and assessment of the criteria	24
1	ESG Standard 1.1: Policy for quality assurance	24
1.1	Status	24
1.2	Assessment	26
1.3	Conclusion	29
2	ESG Standard 1.2: Design and approval of programmes	30
2.1	Status	30
2.2	Assessment	34
2.3	Conclusion	38
3	ESG Standard 1.3: Student-centred learning, teaching, and assessment	39
3.1	Status	39
3.2	Assessment	42
3.3	Conclusion	43
4	ESG Standard 1.4: Student admission, progression, recognition, and certification	43
4.1	Status	43
4.2	Assessment	45
4.3	Conclusion	46
5	ESG Standard 1.5: Teaching staff	47
5.1	Status	47
5.2	Assessment	49
5.3	Conclusion	51
6	ESG Standard 1.6: Learning resources and student support	52
6.1	Status	52
6.2	Assessment	56
6.3	Conclusion	58
7	ESG Standard 1.7: Information management	59
7.1	Status	59
7.2	Assessment	61
7.3	Conclusion	62

8	ESG Standard 1.8: Public information	63
8.1	Status.....	63
8.2	Assessment	63
8.3	Conclusion	64
9	ESG Standard 1.9: On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes	65
9.1	Status.....	65
9.2	Assessment	66
9.3	Conclusion	67
10	ESG Standard 1.10: Cyclical external quality assurance.....	68
10.1	Status.....	68
10.2	Assessment	68
10.3	Conclusion	69
IV	Recommendation to the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN.....	70
1	Assessment of compliance the Standards and Guidelines in the Higher European Area (ESG) in the actual official version.....	70
2	Accreditation Recommendation	71
V	Decisions of the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN.....	75

II Introduction

The experts would like to thank the representatives of the HEI as well as students that they have taken part in the discussions and willingly shared information and their views during the site visit. The discussions are valuable not only for the assessment of the institution, but also for a better understanding of the legal and sociocultural context of the local higher education system.

Evaluation basis for the peer-review experts is the self-assessment report of the HEI as well as intensive discussions during the site visit with the HEI management, deans and/or heads of the departments, head(s) of the study programme(s), study programme(s) coordinators, teachers, lecturers, administrative staff, students, and graduates.

Main objective of the accreditation procedure is to assess the quality of the study programmes and compliance with the "Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area" (ESG). The ESG standards are applied as main assessment criteria in the international accreditation procedure. They are completed with criteria for structured doctoral programmes (Salzburg Recommendations). In addition, the respective country-specific criteria and standards are considered.

A group of experts was set up, which ensured that all areas relevant to the accreditation procedure (e.g. legal, structural, social etc. aspects) as well as the ESG, the Salzburg Recommendations, and national criteria were considered. The peer-review experts include professors, representatives of the professional practice and the student representative. A certificate with the ACQUIN seal is awarded upon accreditation of the study programme(s).

1 The Higher Education System in Indonesia

1.1 Historical development

The modern Indonesian Higher Education System evolved from the colonial education system of the Dutch East Indies. The need for professionally trained personnel who could be used in the administration led to the establishment of a number of higher education institutions (HEIs) in the late 19th century and the first decades of the 20th century, and to the establishment of a number of colleges mainly on the island Java with the largest population. The institutions primarily provided practical vocational education in the fields of Medicine (Medical College in Batavia, 1902), Engineering (Technical College in Bandung, 1920), Agriculture (Bogor Agricultural College) and Law (Jakarta Law College, 1924) and were less research oriented. These education institutions predominantly benefited a small number of European and, to a lesser extent, native indigenous elites – in 1930, only a little over 100 indigenous students were enrolled in the country's universities, where teaching was conducted in Dutch.

After Indonesia's declaration of independence in 1945, the education system underwent a massive expansion, reflecting the increased value of education for the young nation. Numerous foundations of universities like the Universitas Gadjah Mada in Yogyakarta (1949) and the Universitas Indonesia in Jakarta (1950, which emerged from earlier institutions) date from this period. A particularly important role with regard to the diversification of the higher education system was played by the higher education legislation of the early 1960s. The Higher Education Act No. 22 of 1961 stipulated that every province in Indonesia had to have at least one state university, which led to the establishment of 23 new higher education institutions.

In addition, the law established comparable structures at the universities, the “Tri Dharma” (three pillars) of higher education (teaching, research, and service to the community service), which are still valid today. Private universities were recognized as equal to public HEIs, which led to a significant expansion of the private sector.

While particularly the primary and secondary education sector experienced significant growth in the first decades after independence, the development of the tertiary education sector was much slower. Favoured by strong economic growth and – associated with it – an increasing demand for a well-educated labour force as well as an expanding middle class changed this situation from the mid-1970s onwards: While 260,000 students were enrolled at Indonesian universities in 1975, the numbers increased by more than one million each decade. In the mid to late 1970s, the structure of the study programmes was standardised along the lines of the Anglo-American system with bachelor's, master's and PhD degrees, a credit point system, and the division into fully academic and vocational study programmes were introduced.

Today, vocational training in Germany is regarded as a model for the development and expansion of vocational training structures in Indonesia's TVET sector (Technical and Vocational

Education). The new dual study programmes are attracting great interest in Indonesia. Germany enjoys an extremely positive reputation here as a country of engineers, not least due to the popularity of the former President of the Republic of Indonesia, Dr. Bacharuddin Jusuf Habib. Bacharuddin Jusuf Habibie studied aerospace engineering at RWTH Aachen.

1.2 Contemporary situation

With currently 4,593 private and public institutions in tertiary education, Indonesia has one of the largest and most divergent higher education systems in the world (Pendidikan Tinggi 2020 statistics, p. 8, as of December 2020). 633 of these higher education institutions are considered universities (universitas). Since the state-run HEIs cannot meet the demand for primary, secondary, and tertiary education, there is a very broad market for private providers. Of the 4,593 HEIs, 122 are public, state-funded institutions and 3,044 are private. In addition, there are 187 state-owned higher education institutions (e.g. military and administrative colleges) and 1,240 religious colleges. These are not only higher education institutions for the training of religious functionaries, but also – religiously based – institutions with a variety of faculties and a wide range of courses of study and training. Thus, less than 10 per cent of all tertiary education institutions are state-run, more than 90 per cent are private universities. The state universities are generally regarded as particularly qualified and also have most of the country's current 739 doctoral programmes.

Despite the large number of private colleges, “only” about 52 percent of students study there, while 35 percent are enrolled at state colleges. The remaining 17 per cent study at religious colleges or state-owned colleges that are under neither the Ministry of Education nor the Ministry of Religion.

The majority of the state-run higher education institutions are administered and financed by DIKTI (Directorate for Higher Education at the Ministry of Education and Culture). The Ministry of Religion, on the other hand, is responsible for the large number of denominationally oriented higher education institutions. However, there are also higher education institutions that are administered and financed by other ministries, for example the Ministry of Finance and the Ministry of Defence. The private university sector is anchored in DIKTI with regionally organised so-called KOPERTIS networks.

In terms of their legal status, state universities are divided into three categories: autonomous universities (PTN-BH: Perguruan Tinggi Negeri – Badan Hukum); universities with partial financial flexibility (PTN-BLU: Perguruan Tinggi Negeri – Badan Layanan Umum); and universities as full state educational institutions (PTN). Initial efforts to grant universities more autonomy date back to 1999 and were expanded in the following years, gradually first to seven state universities – including the country's top four universities – which were granted the status of autonomous universities (PTN-BH). Currently, twelve state universities out of the 122 belong

to this group. They are all characterised by a higher degree of self-governance and independent financial management, as well as a dual management structure: in all academic as well as development-related matters, decisions are made by a senate composed of members of the faculties. Financial supervision and the election of the rector, on the other hand, are subject to a university council, which includes representatives of the Ministry of Education. (For comparison: in the non-autonomous universities, the rectors are still appointed by the ministry). In financial terms, these universities are allowed to make shifts within their overall budget, generate their own income and build up capital.

Both private and state-supported universities charge tuition fees. The amount of tuition fees varies greatly, depending on the subject studied, the socio-economic situation of the student (there is a subsidy for socially disadvantaged students) and according to the type of university: At a state university, undergraduate studies (bachelor's degree) cost up to Rp. 10,000,000 (approx. 690 euros) per semester for Economic Studies, Social Sciences and Humanities, up to Rp. 15,000,000 (approx. 1,035 euros) for Engineering and up to Rp. 23,000,000 (approx. 1,590 euros) for medical studies. For the master's programme (in Indonesian "Sarjana 2"), the tuition fees per semester range from between 8,000,000 Rp. (approx. 550 euros) and 31,000,000 Rp. (approx. 2,140 euros); the highest tuition fees are charged in the field of management. Doctoral studies at state universities cost between 11,000,000 Rp. (approx. 760 euros) and 45,000,000 Rp. (approx. 3,100 euros).

At private universities, the tuition fees for a particular subject can vary greatly. For an undergraduate/bachelor programme, one has to pay on average between 12,000,000 Rp. (approx. 830,- Euro) and 20.000.000,- Rp. (approx. 1.380,- Euro), for a medical degree up to 54.000.000,- Rp. (approx. 3,725 euros), which does not include the sometimes very high very high enrolment fees for the first semester. In the master's programme, the tuition fees per semester at the private Atma Jaya University in Jakarta, to name just one example, range from 7,000,000 Rp. (approx. 480 euros) and 37,000,000 Rp. (circa 2,550 euros). Again, management is the most expensive field of study. For doctoral studies, which are seldom offered by private universities, one has to pay fees ranging from about 20,000,000 Rp. (approx. 1,380 euros) and 30,000,000 Rp. (approx. 2,070 euros) per semester.

The DIKTI distinguishes between the following types of HEI (in brackets the number of state and private institutions per type): Universitas (646), Institute (132), Sekolah Tinggi (1,361), Akademi (772), Akademi Komunitas (36), Politeknik (219). All these institutions can be state as well as private.

Fully academic education with the degrees S1, S2 and S3 (which are equivalent to a bachelor's, a master's and doctoral degrees respectively) are offered at universities. In addition to the 646 state and private universities, there is also a distance learning university ("Universitas Terbuka"), which was opened in 1984 and offers mainly undergraduate courses. More than

310,000 students are currently enrolled there, with the largest proportion (over 40 per cent) of them at the Faculty of Teacher Education and Pedagogy. The degrees S1, S2, and S3, are also offered at subject-oriented HEIs: at institutes (Institut) and at high schools (Sekolah Tinggi).

Unlike the universities, the so-called Instituts are usually focused in certain areas of specialisation. Courses of study can be completed with a diploma as well as with a bachelor's degree. Some institutes also offer postgraduate courses. Another form of subject-oriented higher education institutions are the Sekolah Tinggi ("High School"), which often consist of only one faculty and for the most part offer courses leading to professional courses of study. They account for almost half of all higher education institutions in Indonesia and are for the most part private. The usual degrees obtained here are D 1 to D 4. These "Diploma" degrees are awarded in application-oriented courses of study; they are not recognised as academic degrees in the European Higher Education Area. The highest D degree, the Diploma 4, concludes a four-year course of study and can be equated to a bachelor's degree (S1) in Indonesia, albeit with the addition of "Bachelor of Applied Science". In addition to the Sekolah Tinggi, the Diploma degree can also be obtained at the 909 so-called academies ("Akademi").

Like the institutes, the Akademi are usually specialised in one field of study such as e.g., accounting, foreign languages, or obstetrics, and are therefore rather small. They too are for the most part private institutions. The courses of study are concluded with a diploma degree. The 304 so-called polytechnics ("Politeknik") offer only three- and four-year programmes with diploma degrees that focus on practical vocational training. To meet the demand for qualified personnel in regions with high industrial or labour market potential, but which do not have HEIs, the establishment of 36 so-called Akademi Komunitas was started in 2012, which offer one-year and two-year courses of study leading to professional qualifications with the degrees D 1 and D 2 respectively.

Most universities still lack university teaching staff with doctoral degrees. Of the 308,600 lecturers statistically recorded, only around 47,625 have a doctorate. About 72 percent of university teachers have a master's degree as their highest qualification; all others teach with Bachelor's, Diploma, or other degrees. The most qualified university teachers, by a wide margin over the other islands, are on Java, where about 26,000 hold doctorates and a good 108,700 have master's degrees. More than 60 per cent of all lecturers with a doctorate are thus employed at higher education institutions on Java.

1.3 Accreditation System in Indonesia

The issue of quality assurance plays a major role in Indonesia with its enormously diverse system of tertiary education institutions. While, for example, in Java and Sumatra 88 and 90

percent of the HEIs are accredited, in the provinces of Papua and West Papua the number is only 40 percent.

The authoritative institution for the accreditation of HEIs and study programmes in Indonesia is the National Accreditation Authority BAN-PT (Badan Akreditasi Nasional Perguruan Tinggi), founded in 1994. In addition, there are also independent accreditation agencies for specific disciplines, e.g. medicine.

The accreditation system is three-tiered and is carried out in a five-year rotation. An “A” accreditation is the best rating. “B” means “very good”, “C” is the lowest classification level and is also used for newly established study programmes. The designations “unggul” (excellent), “baik sekali” (very good) and “baik” (good) were introduced in 2020 and have been used instead of A, B and C since then.

Out of approximately 4,600 higher education institutions in the country, about 62 per cent have been institutionally accredited so far. By the end of 2020, 99 institutions had been accredited with an “excellent” grade (the majority of which were state higher education institutions), 859 with a “very good” grade and 1,755 with a “good” grade. Among the study programmes that have already been accredited, 19.0 per cent received an “excellent” grade (by far the most of these in the subjects of management and accounting), 51.9 per cent a “very good” grade and 29.2 per cent a “good” grade. Clear differences can be seen between state and private higher education institutions: while more than 40 percent of bachelor’s and master’s programmes at state universities are accredited with an “excellent”, this applies to only 7.5 percent of bachelor’s and 12.9 percent of master’s programmes at private universities (Pendidikan Tinggi 2020 statistics, p. 24f).

According to the government’s plans, the accreditation system is to be fundamentally revised. For existing accreditation, the obligation to re-accredit is to be dropped. The previous classification will remain in place but can be reviewed by the accreditation authority in the event of a suspected “decline in performance” of the university, in which case a downgrading is also possible. The HEIs are free to apply for re-accreditation on a voluntary basis, e.g., to move up from the “very good” to the “excellent” level.

2 Short profile of HEI

2.1 The University of Bengkulu

The University of Bengkulu (UNIB) is a state university under the authority of Ministry of Education, Culture, Research, and Technology located in Bengkulu city of Bengkulu province. The University of Bengkulu was established based on the Regulation of the President of Republic Indonesia Number 17 of 1982 on the Establishment of the University of Bengkulu on March 31st, 1982, and it was officially opened on April 24th, 1982.

The strategic plans of the Ministry that are relevant to the university emphasising on

1. Quality and relevance focused on students' development;
2. Developing the students' character;
3. Qualified educational access expansion, especially through equitable and inclusive affirmation;
4. Preserving and advancing not only Indonesian culture, language, and literature but also its main impact on education.

At the end of 2021 the UNIB had 8 faculties with 81 study programmes in all levels of tertiary education. There are 5 study programmes on doctoral level, 21 study programmes with magister degree, 44 study programmes with bachelor's degree, 9 study programmes with vocational or diploma level.

UNIB employs 819 lecturers – consisting of teaching staff (18%), Assistant Professors (38%), Associate Professors (37%) and Professors (7%) – and 308 other staff (librarians, lab assistants, administrators).

The number of active students at the University of Bengkulu in the odd semester 2021/2022 is 21,932 students, consisting of 1,286 vocational students, 18,755 bachelor students, 1,563 magister students, 161 doctoral students, and 167 students in profession programmes.

2.2 Faculty of Law

The Faculty of Law of the University of Bengkulu (henceforth FH UNIB) was established on August 24th, 1982, based on the Decree of the President of the Republic of Indonesia Number 17 of 1982. The FH is the only State FH in Bengkulu Province; it currently serves roughly 2300 active students, the majority of them (1.928) studying at bachelor level and it employs 63 teaching staff.

Following the Decree of the Rector of UNIB Number 881/J30.P/PP/1997 in the Academic Year 1997/1998, the FH UNIB opened three speciality programmes; (1) Civil and Economic Law, (2) State Administration Law and State Administration, and (3) Criminal Justice System and Society Protection (Criminal). Since 2005 the Law Study Programme has been accredited by the National Accreditation Board for Higher Education (henceforth BAN-PT - Badan Akreditasi Nasional Perguruan Tinggi) and gained an A accreditation.

The vision of the Faculty of Law is “becoming a Law study programme that has an excellent process of learning, research and community service to produce professional, cultured, and internationally competitive Law degrees.”

The missions of the Faculty of Law at the University of Bengkulu are to provide legal education with good quality, character, and professionalism by promoting cultural values and scientific development nationally and internationally; to organise innovative, competitive, and comparative research for the improvement of legal science; to organise community service activities as the implementation of legal work in solving legal problems faced by society; to organise productive and long-term collaboration with educational institutions, government, and business at regional, national, and international levels.

2.3 Faculty of Economics and Business

The Faculty of Economics (henceforth FEB UNIB) was established based on Presidential Decree Number 17 of 1982 on March 31st, 1982. The study programmes offered by the FEB UNIB at the beginning consisted of the Department of Economics and Development Studies. Based on the Decree of the Minister of Education and Culture Number 0542/0/1983, the FEB UNIB opened a Management Department, and in 1996, the FEB UNIB opened an Extension Programme and Vocation (Diploma III) Accounting Study Programme. Subsequently, in 2005, the Accounting Department was opened based on the establishment permit Number 1417/D/T/2005 to meet the demands of society and the needs of stakeholders. Furthermore, FEB UNIB opened several postgraduate study programmes; Magister in Management Programme was opened in 1999, Magister in Development Planning Programme was opened in 2006, and Magister in Accounting Programme was opened in 2011. It currently serves roughly 2700 active students, most of them (2.085) studying at bachelor level, and it employs 84 teaching staff.

The development of FEB UNIB and the improvement of services to users from its establishment in 1982 until 2012 align with the vision, missions, and objectives of FEB UNIB. The vision, missions, and objectives of FEB UNIB are formulated realistically and oriented toward the future. A series of workshops to formulate the vision and missions together with various stakeholders and in alignment with the vision and missions of the university was conducted in 2006 and revised in 2010.

3 General information on the study programme(s)

Bachelor in Law

Provider of the study programme	The university of Bengkulu, Faculty of Law
Title of the study programme	Bachelor in Law
Degree	Bachelor in Law (LL. B.)
Date or planned date of introduction	14 July 1982
Subject field	Constitutional/Administrative Law, Civil Law, and Criminal Law
Regular study duration	4 years
Number of ECTS credits	148 equivalents to 223.48 ECTS
Matriculation period	Every year (in September)
Capacity per year	450
Number of students currently enrolled	663
The average number of graduates per year	206,1 (2019 – 2021)
Tuition fees	Rp. 2.500.000 per semesters = \$166 per semesters
Type of studies	Full-time

Bachelor in Accounting

Provider of the study programme	The university of Bengkulu, Faculty of Economics and Business
Title of the study programme	Bachelor in Accounting
Degree	Bachelor in Accounting (B.Acc)
Date or planned date of introduction	12 February 2002
Subject field	Financial, Management, Public Sector, Behavioural Accounting, Auditing, and Taxes
Regular study duration	4 years
Number of ECTS credits	146-160 credits≈220.46-229.52 ECTS
Matriculation period	n.a
Capacity per year	200
Number of students currently enrolled	184 (in 2020)
The average number of graduates per year	78 (2019-2020)
Tuition fees	Rp 220,000 up to Rp 8,500,000 ≈ \$ 14.69 up to 567.50 per semester
Type of studies	Full-time

Bachelor in Management

Provider of the study programme	The university of Bengkulu, Faculty of Economics and Business
Title of the study programme	Bachelor in Management
Degree	Bachelor in Management (B.E)
Date or planned date of introduction	8 December 1983
Subject field	Finance, Marketing, Operations, and Human Resource Management
Regular study duration	4 years
Number of ECTS credits	146 ≈ 220 ECTS
Matriculation period	Every year (in September)
Capacity per year	160-180
Number of students currently enrolled	816
The average number of graduates per year	115
Tuition fees	IDR2.500.000 - IDR3.500.000 ≈ USD167 - USD235 per semester
Type of studies	Full-time

Bachelor in Economics

Provider of the study programme	The university of Bengkulu, Faculty of Economics and Business
Title of the study programme	Bachelor in Economics
Degree	Bachelor in Economics (B.E.)
Date or planned date of introduction	8 December 1983
Subject field	Economics
Regular study duration	4 years
Number of ECTS credits	146 credits equivalent to 220 ECTS
Matriculation period	Every year (in September)
Capacity per year	100
Number of students currently enrolled	426
The average number of graduates per year	40
Tuition fees	Rp. 500.000-4.000.000 per semesters = \$XXX per semesters
Type of studies	Full-time

Magister in Law (LL. M.)

Provider of the study programme	The university of Bengkulu, Faculty of Law
Title of the study programme	Magister in Law
Degree	Magister in Law (LL. M.)
Date or planned date of introduction	6 May 2005
Subject field	Constitutional/Administrative Law, Civil Law, and Criminal Law
Regular study duration	2 years
Number of ECTS credits	46 equivalents to 69.46 ECTS
Matriculation period	Every year (in September)
Capacity per year	50
Number of students currently enrolled	59
The average number of graduates per year	7
Tuition fees	Rp. 4.500.000 per semesters = \$300 per semesters
Type of studies	Full-time

Magister in Notarial Law

Provider of the study programme	The university of Bengkulu, Faculty of Law
Title of the study programme	Magister in Notarial Law
Degree	Magister in Notarial Law (M.N)
Date or planned date of introduction	8 November 2016
Subject field	Law, Private Law, Economic Law, Taxes Law, Agrarian Law
Regular study duration	2 years
Number of ECTS credits	52 equivalentents to 78.52 ECTS
Matriculation period	Every year (in September)
Capacity per year	10
Number of students currently enrolled	35
The average number of graduates per year	10
Tuition fees	Rp. 10.0000.000 per semesters = \$667 per semesters
Type of studies	Full-time

Magister in Accounting

Provider of the study programme	The university of Bengkulu, Faculty of Economics and Busines
Title of the study programme	Magister in Accounting
Degree	Magister in Accounting (M.Acc)
Date or planned date of introduction	30 December 2010
Subject field	Public Sector, Financial, and Management Accounting
Regular study duration	2 years
Number of ECTS credits	44 credits≈66 ECTS
Matriculation period	December and July
Capacity per year	60
Number of students currently enrolled	41 (2020)
The average number of graduates per year	46 (2019-2020)
Tuition fees	Rp 2.500.000 up to Rp 5.000.000 ≈ \$166.91 up to 333.82 per semester
Type of studies	Full-time

Magister in Management (M.M)

Provider of the study programme	The university of Bengkulu, Faculty of Economics and Business
Title of the study programme	Magister in Management
Degree	Magister in Management (M.M.)
Date or planned date of introduction	22 March 1999
Subject field	Marketing Management, Human Resource Management, Public Financial Management, General Management, and Financial Management
Regular study duration	2 years
Number of ECTS credits	44 credits \approx 66 ECTS
Matriculation period	June
Capacity per year	60
Number of students currently enrolled	158
The average number of graduates per year	10-15
Tuition fees	IDR6.500.000 \approx USD450
Type of studies	Full-time

Magister in Applied Economic

Provider of the study programme	The university of Bengkulu, Faculty of Economics and Business
Title of the study programme	Magister in Applied Economics
Degree	Magister in Economics (M.Ec.)
Date or planned date of introduction	3 January 2006
Subject field	Development Planning
Regular study duration	2 years
Number of ECTS credits	42 credits = 65 ECTS
Matriculation period	June
Capacity per year	50
Number of students currently enrolled	78
The average number of graduates per year	8 -15
Tuition fees	Rp. 5.000.000 per semester = \$XXX per semesters
Type of studies	Full-time

Doctoral in Management

Provider of the study programme	The university of Bengkulu, Faculty of Economics and Business
Title of the study programme	Doctoral in Management
Degree	Doctoral in Management (Dr)
Date or planned date of introduction	18 October 2013
Subject field	Financial, Strategic, Human Resource, and Marketing Management
Regular study duration	3 years
Number of ECTS credits	49 credits = 69.46 ECTS
Matriculation period	June
Capacity per year	10
Number of students currently enrolled	46
The average number of graduates per year	20
Tuition fees	IDR15.000.000 ≈ USD1000
Type of studies	Full-time

Doctoral in Economics

Provider of the study programme	The university of Bengkulu, Faculty of Economics and Business
Title of the study programme	Doctoral in Economics
Degree	Doctoral in Economics (Dr)
Date or planned date of introduction	7 October 2014
Subject field	Economics of Development Planning
Regular study duration	7 years
Number of ECTS credits	72 credits equivalent to XX ECTS
Matriculation period	Every year (in June)
Capacity per year	10
Number of students currently enrolled	30
The average number of graduates per year	2
Tuition fees	Rp. 12.500.000 per semesters = \$XXX per semesters
Type of studies	Full-time

III Implementation and assessment of the criteria

The peer-review experts assess the quality of the study programme(s) and compliance with the ESG standards and the Salzburg Recommendations as well as with the national standards. The report must document the assessment of each study programme in the cluster, taking into account each criterion. Depending on the criterion, the assessment of criterion may be appropriate at the study programmes cluster level in order to avoid repetition and better describe general context.

1 ESG Standard 1.1: Policy for quality assurance

Institutions should have a policy for quality assurance that is made public and forms part of their strategic management. Internal stakeholders should develop and implement this policy through appropriate structures and processes, while involving external stakeholders.

1.1 Status

1.1.1 Overall Strategy: Vision, Mission, Values

The Quality Assurance Policy derives from the overall vision, mission, and values of the UNIB. The university's vision is "Becoming a world-class university in 2025". UNIB strives to be excellent, cultured, and globally competitive.

To fulfil this vision, UNIB has formulated the following targets in its mission statement:

1. To develop a world-class education and research.
2. To produce works with Intellectual Properties Rights (IPR).
3. To conduct service in accordance with the needs of local, national, and international society.
4. To develop a good and clean university governance system.
5. Performing the integration of Tri Dharma activities (see below) that have an impact on the development of science, society, and national resilience.

The UNIB aims to implement the equality and diversity of the community in carrying out the educational process at the bachelor, magister, and doctoral levels in science, technology, and arts. The implementation should be in accordance with the main values of UNIB. These are:

1. Culture
2. Innovation
3. Humanity
4. Leadership
5. Integrity
6. Transparency

7. Academic Freedom
8. Divinity

The UNIB formulated these values into several policies implemented at the study programme level. They are:

1. Outlining of UNIB's Long-Term Development Plan (henceforth RPJP – Rencana Pembangunan Jangka Panjang) in the form of strategic stages of medium-term development for 10 years and short-term development for 5 years in the 2020 – 2045 period.
2. The availability of a strategic programme steering target implementation based on priorities.
3. Providing guidance and guidelines in preparing the Strategic Business Plan of UNIB.
4. The achievement and assessment indicators are available to the performance monitoring and evaluation system.
5. Guideline for the academic community and educational staff to collaborate with all stakeholders. Further, to development of the Tri Dharma of higher education at the University of Bengkulu and to improve staff quality by being excellent, cultured and internationally competitive.

The implementation of vision, missions, and values of a university is called the “Tri Dharma” of higher education which includes education, research, and community service:

- The education pillar is implemented in the form of education administration including vocation, academic, and postgraduate programme study.
- The research pillar is implemented to conduct qualified, innovative, and up-to-date research to solve scientific, social, and humanity problems.
- The community service pillar is implemented to introduce and to apply lecturers' and students' ideas and research results in society to contribute to national and regional development.

The Tri Dharma is implemented through the study programmes at UNIB with the coordination of the Office of Research and Community Service.

The arrangement of the vision, mission, objectives, and strategies (VMTS) involved internal and external parties. Internal parties include lecturers and students. While external parties include potential employers and parties who use the services of the Engineering Faculty: government agencies, private companies, business communities, etc. The process was officially accommodated through a workshop.

This overall vision, mission and values are the basis for the faculty's own vision and mission. The Vision of FH UNIB is: “Becoming a leading and pioneer in social applications based on local values.” The vision of FEB UNIB aligns with the vision of UNIB as the main institution.

1.1.2 Quality Assurance Framework

The UNIB has a quality assurance system which consists of different policies of Indonesian Higher Education Quality Assurance:

- With the Internal Quality Assurance System (SPMI), the University of Bengkulu always strives to improve the quality of education in a planned and sustainable manner. The implementation of SPMI at the University of Bengkulu starts from the university level to the study programme level to maintain the educational quality. SPMI of the University of Bengkulu as a sub-system from the education quality assurance system has these functions:
 - Preparation of internal quality assurance standards both academic and non-academic.
 - Carry out monitoring, audits, and internal quality assessments.
 - Coordinate the implementation of improvement and development of academic and non-academic quality.
 - Carry out institutional administration functions from planning, budgeting, implementation, assessment, and reporting.
- The evaluation of the Implementation of Higher Education Standards is carried out through an Internal Quality Audit (AMI). AMI is a systematic, independent, and documented assessment process. AMI ensures that the implementation of activities in the university are following the procedures and that the results are in accordance with the standards to achieve institutional goals.
- To strengthen the content of curricula and respond to changes and existing needs of the labour market, external and internal stakeholders are involved and asked for their input. External stakeholders are for example graduates, graduate employers including the government agencies, private companies, and business communities.

Every faculty of the university has its own quality assurance unit (UPM) that monitors the learning process. It evaluates the process twice a year at the end of each study period. In addition, UPM conducts exit surveys biannually to evaluate implementation of thesis guidance and academic services in laboratories, study programmes, departments, and faculties. The results of the evaluation process conducted by the quality assurance unit are considered for future improvement. UPM also measures the performance of lecturers' teaching activities. This evaluation is divided into four aspects: pedagogic, social, personality and professional. UPM findings are followed up by the Vice Dean of the Academic Division.

1.2 Assessment

Based on the submitted SAR and discussions with various groups at the university, the peer reviewers were able to get a first impression of the Internal Quality Assurance System (SPMI)

that has now been installed. The peers evaluate the fundamentals of Quality Assurance, as far as they relate to the study programmes to be accredited.

The quality assurance system of the university is closely integrated with the Higher Education Quality System of Indonesia and the university has taken the first important steps towards greater internationalization.

In its documents, the university clearly and comprehensibly demonstrates that quality assurance forms a central part of its overall strategy. The five key principles of "Education Excellence": standard setting, standard implementation, standard evaluation, and standard upgrade run like a red line through the entire area of quality assurance. In this context, too, the qualification goal "employability" has a high priority, which is expressly appreciated by the peers. The organizational responsibilities at central and faculty level are also transparently regulated. The diverse instruments used to collect and evaluate data of students, lecturers, teaching staff, graduates and other stakeholders have been described in detail by the university. The same applies to the elements of quality assurance used at the level of the eleven programs. In the university's view, there are two possible methods for programme development: interviews with stakeholders, students and alumni, and tracer studies, which are conducted every five years. The peers had the opportunity to review some evaluation results and reports. Positively, they would like to mention the latest paper "Curriculum Evaluation Results & Tracer Study" of the BA in Accounting. This report details and justifies what content changes were needed and discussed and implemented by the curriculum revision team. In addition, the report contains important information on the requirements of the labour market. In addition to the outstanding importance of the English language (so also the statements in the Faculty of Law's tracer study), new courses (e.g., Accounting Information Systems, Database Management) were introduced and new learning methods were introduced due to the rapid development in information technology.

The peers would also like to mention positively the report of the so-called MONEV team, which evaluated, among others, the study programmes *Accounting* and *Management*. The team's decisions are not binding, but they do provide important recommendations for action by those in responsibility. It is very much appreciated that strengths and weaknesses are openly discussed and documented here. It was not clear from the documents whether and when SPMI was involved at faculty level, respectively how UPM and SPMI interact.

The doctoral programmes are - according to the experts' observation - closely integrated into the QM of the university. The quality assurance instruments and procedures are like those already described.

Based on the submitted documents and the interviews, the experts conclude that the university is on a good way with the development of its quality assurance system. They also have no doubts that the improvements and changes documented by the university have been realized

in terms of content and organization. However, the interaction of the central organ SPMI and faculty-level stakeholders is not sufficiently outlined. There is also a lack of statements on the different process steps that indicate that the quality circle is really closed in the further development of the different programs.

The experts would therefore like to recommend, that in the further development of quality assurance, attention be paid not only to defining responsibilities, but also to establishing measures in a binding and transparent manner and to verifying the effectiveness of the measures in a comprehensible manner. Failure to achieve set goals should also be consistently documented and discussed, as has been done in some documents. To increase the acceptance of the entire QM system, all stakeholders should be involved in a binding manner and in comprehensible and documented process steps.

The promotion of English language skills should be intensively supported by QM throughout the university. The experts also see room for improvement in the participation of students in the further development of study programmes and the necessary, consistent feedback on criticism and suggestions.

The experts were also able to convince themselves that the university has a very good IT infrastructure. The service and administration programmes based on it are impressive.

The UNIB has a clear vision and mission statement as well as core values that formulate the policies for the next decades. These (VMTS) are constantly revised and broken down into five to ten-year development plans that are closely monitored by a strategic business plan. There are still a few hurdles to take on the way to becoming a "World-class University 2025". The experts see all those responsible for QM as having a special responsibility. The road maps and milestones of the faculties are a good guideline.

The most challenging task, however, is to implement a system of key performance indicators that is aligned with the university's strategic goals. This system of key figures would have to consider the mutual interdependencies of the objectives and thus of the key performance indicators to enable management in line with the strategic goals. Currently, various key figures seem to be used whose alignment with the strategic objectives is not clear (e.g., how is the indicator "percentage of bachelor and vocational courses using case study methods or project-based learning" associated with the university's internationalization or visibility in the scientific community?). The integration of the different portals into one single controlling portal, the identification of strategic goals as well as the key performance indicators that correctly measure their achievement, and the breakdown of the selected key performance indicators into several measures that should be considered in the operational decision-making and daily business are key to positioning the university in the long term.

1.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Recommendations:

- The interaction between the central Internal Quality Assurance (SPMI) and faculty-level Quality Assurance Unit (UPM) should be outlined more clearly in the process descriptions of internal quality management.
- It should be outlined more clearly in the process descriptions of internal quality management how the quality circle is closed in the further development of the study programmes.
- Student commitment in the development of study programmes should be enhanced.
- Students should receive consistent feedback on evaluations of all surveys of internal quality assurance.
- The university should implement a system of key performance indicators that is aligned with the university's strategic goals.

2 ESG Standard 1.2: Design and approval of programmes

Institutions should have processes for the design and approval of their programmes. The programmes should be designed so that they meet the objectives set for them, including the intended learning outcomes. The qualification resulting from a programme should be clearly specified and communicated, and refer to the correct level of the national qualifications framework for higher education and, consequently, to the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.

2.1 Status

2.1.1 Bachelor in Law

The Bachelor in Law programme was created in 1982. The objective of the programme is to keep track of and respond to the demands of the advancement of legal science and the expectations of the legal employment market that the graduates will apply to. Since 2005 the Law Study Programme has been accredited by the National Accreditation Board for Higher Education (BAN PT) and gained an A accreditation.

There are three specialisation programmes: State Administrative Law, Civil Law, and Criminal Law. The programme is set at European Qualification Framework 6. On completion the programme awards the equivalent of 223.48 ECTS.

2.1.2 Bachelor in Accounting

The Bachelor in Accounting was created in 2005. The aims of the programme are to educate and improve the quality of professional accountants who can compete in accordance with the needs of stakeholders in ASEAN; to increase the quantity and quality of research and publications; to improve the amount and quality of community service; and to increase the effectiveness, efficiency, and productivity of the study programme. Graduates should provide financial information in the form of financial and tax reports, and audit reports in accordance with applicable standards; and make decisions based on financial statements using reliable information technology and analytical competence in the accounting field, both as accountants (budget financial institutions), novice auditors, and tax accountants, especially in public agencies. The designed curriculum requires students to complete the equivalent of 220.46-229.52 ECTS in four years.

Since its establishment in 2005, the BA programme has been accredited three times; in 2008, 2014 and 2019. The first BA programme gained a B accreditation predicate based on the Decree of the Director of BAN-PT Number 001/BAN-PT/Ak-XI/XI/IV/2008 on April 18th, 2008. The second and third accreditation processes led to an A predicate based on the Decree of BAN PT Number 403/SK/BAN-PT/Akred/S/X/2014 on October 23rd, 2014 and Number 3642/SK/BAN-PT/Ak-PPJ/S/VI/2020.

2.1.3 Bachelor in Management

The bachelor's in management programme was established in 1982. It applies a competency-based curriculum to accommodate the expected learning outcomes. Graduates can master the theoretical concepts in management, and they learn to make strategic decisions based on information and data analysis. In addition, graduates can utilise science and technology in the field of their expertise. The curriculum was reviewed and adjusted after conducting internal evaluations in 2017 based on the Decree of the Rector of the UNIB Number 1455/UN30/HK/2017. Since its establishment, the BM programme has been accredited five times externally by the BAN PT and it gained an A accreditation predicate.

To obtain all the competencies offered through the programme, students must complete the equivalent of 220 ECTS in the programme.

2.1.4 Bachelor in Economics

The bachelor's in Economics programme was established in 1983. It offers 58 courses on basic and intermediate economics science, economics and business fundamentals, Information Technology Science, Non-Economic Skills and Project work. Until 2021, the programme has been reaccredited seven times. Based on BAN-PT Decree Number 425/SK/BAN-PT/AkPP/S/I/2021 on January 12th, 2021, the programme gained an A accreditation with a validity of 5 years. Since 2011, the bachelor's in Economics programme has always received an A+ accreditation from BAN-PT. Students must complete the equivalent of 220.5 ECTS in four years.

2.1.5 Magister in Law

The Magister in Law programme was established in 2005. Its curriculum is designed to deliver employable graduates and it should serve students who are already working to increase their capacities on the job. There are two specialisations offered: Magister in Law (Law and Regional Autonomy, Civil Economic Law, and Criminal Law) and Magister in Development Law. Graduates are enabled to respond to future legal needs and increase their competencies and competitiveness; conducting research that has international qualifications based on local wisdom; organising community service oriented towards legal development based on cultural nobility and social benefits; establishing partnerships with government agencies and community organisations at national and international levels; implementing the development of a programme based on the principles of good governance. During its first accreditation in 2010, the programme received a predicate B based on BAN-PT Decree Number 004/BAN-PT-Ak-VIII/MAGISTER/VI/2010 valid until 2015. Students of the Magister in Law take the equivalent of 69.46 ECTS.

2.1.6 Magister in Notarial Law

The Magister in Notarial Law was established in 2014. The curriculum is designed to follow the standard guidelines for the needs of legal and notarial professions. The mission of the programme is to provide professional legal education in the field of notarial law. The programme stretches over 4 semesters, a thesis is written in the final semester. The curriculum offers 2/3 of compulsory courses (including the thesis), the remaining 1/3 can be filled with various optional courses from the Law faculty. In total, students take the equivalent of 78.52 ECTS within a period of two years.

2.1.7 Magister in Accounting

The Magister in Accounting programme was established in 2011. It has received accreditation ratings of C in 2013, of B in 2015, and of B in 2020 from the national higher education accreditation body (BAN-PT). The programme offers courses at the advanced accounting level. It aims at providing international quality accounting education; improving the ability to master information technology, communication, critical thinking, and interpersonal relationships; and contributing to the development of the accounting profession and providing quality academic services. Students should improve their mastery of information technology, communication, and interpersonal skills, build a strong work ethic; and encourage personal responsibility and integrity. Once employed they should participate in professional development at the local, regional, national, and international levels. Curriculum revision takes place every two years and is carried out through internal discussions and workshops involving all lecturers, coordinators, and the deans of the faculty. In addition, discussions and workshops are held with curriculum experts and stakeholders from business and public sector. In total, students take the equivalent of 66.44 ECTS.

2.1.8 Magister in Management

The Magister in Management was established in 1999 as the first postgraduate programme of the faculty. It has served as a role-model since then. The programme offers a selection of 'Matriculation Courses' (Introductions to Financial, Marketing, Operations and Human Resource Management) that students can take to enter the Magister programme. Then students move on to advanced courses in these areas, and they take courses in Business Law and Ethics, Consumer Behavior, and choose electives from marketing, management, and financial studies. Students write a thesis worth 12 ECTS. The programme gained an A accreditation predicate from BAN-PT in 2014. The curriculum was adjusted after internal evaluation in 2017 based on the Decree of the Rector of UNIB Number 1455/UN30/HK/2017. To complete the degree, students need to obtain the equivalent of 66 ECTS within two years.

2.1.9 Magister in Development Economics

The Magister in Development Economics was established in 2006. The objectives of the MDE are to ensure the availability of highly competent graduates in the field of development planning and regional finance who can compete at local, national, and international level. Graduates work in development planning and regional finance and they can move into the teaching profession. The programme seeks to increase cooperation networks with government, private, and industrial agencies both nationally and internationally. Since its establishment, the programme underwent external accreditation by BAN-PT in 2011 and 2017 and it gained a B predicate twice. The students must complete the equivalent of 63 ECTS within two years.

2.1.10 Doctoral in Management

The Doctoral in Management programme was established in 2013. Learning outcomes include the ability to conduct multidisciplinary research, the ability to develop knowledge in the fields of business and the public sector, and the ability to produce superior quality research by mastering the principles, theories, and measurement methods of research in management. The programme offers courses in six fields of learning: Philosophy of science and research methods, Strategic Management, Multivariate Statistics and Econometrics, Management and Organization Theory, Innovation Management, and Organizational behaviour. The courses add up to the equivalent of 27.18 ECTS. The remaining 42.28 ECTS are reserved for dissertation research and thesis writing.

The doctoral programme is open to practitioners with job experience and to regular students. Students with a practitioner background tend to do more research with a qualitative approach, and students with an academic background are more likely to write a dissertation using a quantitative approach.

The programme strives to support economic development activities, forming collaborative relationships with stakeholders, and improving the competitiveness of UNIB graduates. The programme has been accredited two times. The first accreditation in 2016 led to a B predicate based on Number 2136/SK/BAN-PT/Akred/D/IX/2016. The second accreditation gained an “Excellent” accreditation predicate from BAN-PT. To complete the programme, students must gather the equivalent of 69.46 ECTS, in total.

2.1.11 Doctoral in Economics

The Doctoral in Economics programme was established in 2014 and it is aligned to the vision of UNIB. The programme aims to provide independent education through a structured learning process and positive academic culture by carrying out quality research activities in the field of economics and disseminate them both at the national and international levels;

and to participate in solving problems faced by government, business, and communities through consultation, training, workshops, and guidance in the field of economics. The curriculum contains courses in basic economic skills and non-economic skills, and it reserves time for project work including dissertation proposal, research and dissertation writing, seminar, international research activity, and examination. The lecture activities are taken in one semester, and the dissertation is written in three to eight semesters. Thus, the study length is between three years or six semesters and five years or ten semesters. The programme curriculum is constantly reviewed and updated. In 2020, the programme gained a B predicate from BAN-PT with Decree Number BAN-PT Number 644/SK/BAN-PT/Akred/D/X/2020. To complete the programme students must acquire the equivalent to 108.12 ECTS.

2.2 Assessment

2.2.1 General points

The university has a strong bouquet of taught bachelor and magister programmes. Inclusion of business ethics and research project/dissertation in each programme is appreciable. Regular evaluations and adjustments of curricula with the involvement of internal and external stakeholders is highly commendable.

The module documentation provided includes information for credits for each module and European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System (ECTS). It should be complemented with information on workload, i.e., study time, in terms of number of hours (as listed above). This can help staff, students, and any external stakeholders, such as accrediting bodies understand the amount of work involved in each module. In addition, details regarding number of hours reserved for lectures and for tutorials can be provided.

On comparison, all magister programmes as well as all bachelor programmes don't seem to be equal in terms of ECTS credits. The number of credits should be brought in line with other (international) programmes to foster (international) student mobility and mobility between programmes at UNIB.

Community service is an important aspect of all programmes at UNIB. During the visit of the university, it was mentioned that students can substitute course work with community service. To what extent this community service relates to the learning objectives of each programme and what number of credits can be substituted, remains unclear. Students mentioned that community service spans 45 days per semester, which is a substantial amount of semester time. Whether and how students receive credits for this work and to what extent community service relates to the learning objectives of their study programmes or prepares students for future employment did not become clear.

The targets for different activities of the university are related to international exchanges, research and publication, and dissemination of research, and to achieve world-class university ranking. The targets might be higher than the actual capacity to fulfil them in the coming years. The university seems to have allocated the necessary resources to achieve the goals. Performance evaluation of achievement on a yearly basis and an overview of resources and incentives are necessary. To join the rank of world-class universities, Bengkulu University must develop and standardize its research, education, degree programs, and organization in line with international standards. Improved teaching quality, coverage, and level, as well as student and faculty exchange programmes, are crucial to achieve its goals. Significant improvement in English skills is required for networking and international exchange engagements.

At least for magister programmes, it seems suitable to offer two to three specializations within each programme. The university could also further improve its programmes by including more international as well as company-related, practical, and interdisciplinary (cross-faculty) modules and projects.

2.2.2 Bachelor in Law

The curriculum is characterised by a variety of subjects, some of which are prescribed by the University and others by the faculty. The courses prescribed by the Law Faculty consist of a general part and specific courses for Criminal Law, Administrative and Constitutional Law, and alternative courses. The study structure follows a clear concept, starting with general and basic subjects and then going further. A total of 148 credits are awarded for 8 semesters. The system of credit points could possibly be simplified. Even though many subjects are offered, the distribution over the semesters seems appropriate and it is studyable.

The range of subjects includes some core elements such as civil, criminal, and public law, and some more advanced subjects such as philosophy of law, environmental law or alternative dispute resolution. The combination of subjects seems appropriate.

2.2.3 Bachelor in Accounting

Although the Bachelor in Accounting programme has been established only in 2005, it has already achieved considerable successes. In particular, the programme has attracted many students from the region, and graduates seem to have very good opportunities at the job market. They mainly work as financial accountants, auditors, or tax accountants, both for private sector companies and government agencies. Moreover, the results of the internal accreditations of the BA programme show continuous improvement.

The programme is in line with the purposes of higher education of the Council of Europe, especially with the goals “personal development” and “preparing students for active citizenship”.

The fact that the ratio of applicants for this programme to admitted students is well over 5 as well as the alumni survey result that most graduates take less than 6 months to obtain qualified employment are good indications that the goal “preparation for sustainable employment” is also being met.

The learning objectives of the programme reflect adequately the requirements from the professional field in the areas of accounting, tax accounting, auditing, and public accounting. Moreover, the learning content of the programme is structured in a reasonable way. The university offers a good mix of learning formats (e.g., group discussions, simulations, case studies, project- and problem-based learning). The internship planned in the seventh semester, for which the university has established a monitoring system, seems to be a useful supplement to the academic education. Overall, the goal of “creating a broad advanced knowledge base” is also met.

2.2.6 Magister in Law

The curriculum of the four-semester Magister in Law provides in part for similar subjects as the Bachelor's programme, but the programme is more focused on fewer subjects. This is appropriate for a magister programme. Here, too, there is a gradation in the semesters, in that more general and basic subjects such as legal theory and legal policy are offered first, and then more specialised subjects such as agricultural law or tax law are provided for. The third semester then provides for specialisations in "Law And Autonomy Area", "Law Civil And Economy" or "Law Criminal And Protection Public". The four-semester "Master Law Development" has a wider range of subjects. Overall, however, the magister programme can be expanded even more to include "modern" subjects such as environmental law, technology law or human rights.

2.2.7 Magister in Notarial Law

The programme is mainly run by local practitioners, and it is functional and provides for public notaries in Indonesia. Notaries use the faculty as local teachers from practice to produce the next generation of public notaries, who can fulfil their offices as seen in the tradition of the “Latin” notarial, to which Indonesia since its Code of 1840 belongs.

2.2.8 Magister in Accounting

The Magister in Accounting programme is practice-oriented and contains both classical elements (e.g., Financial Reporting, Auditing, Corporate Governance, Capital Market Theory, Statistics, etc.) and modern content (e.g., Behavioral Accounting, Corporate Social Responsibility

Reporting, Accounting and Tax Fraud Investigation, Financial Criminology and Money Laundering). The contents of the BA programme and the MA programme are linked, which facilitates the transition for students. There are additional preparatory courses for those students who do not meet the admission requirements.

2.2.12 General evaluation of PhD programmes

An effective doctoral programme is quintessential for a university having ambition to become a world-class higher educational institution. On the face, the doctoral programme of the University of Bengkulu seems to be good although the number of courses is low. There are clear provisions for quality of teaching, student-centered learning, feedback, guidance on academic writing, and international publication. However, the university needs to elevate its standard of research. There are two interrelated elements through which this can be obtained: a) research resources; and b) research environment.

Resources provide a backbone for doctoral programs. There are provisions for secondary databases and access to journal articles, but the availability needs to be increased. Resources are needed to help PhD students attend mainstream international conferences (rather than regional conferences in home continent), such as the Academy of International Business (AIB) and Academy of Management (AoM) conferences, which mostly take place in Europe and North America. In addition, some budget can be made available to provide incentives to doctoral students/staff for publishing in top tier journals.

The university also needs a system to judge the quality of publications. Just publishing in Scopus listed journal is not enough. There are at least two indicative lists that can be followed a) Australian Business Deans Council (ABDC) and Chartered Association of Business School (CABS).

[ABDC Journal Quality List - Australian Business Deans Council](#)

[Academic Journal Guide 2021 - Chartered Association of Business Schools \(charteredabs.org\)](#)

Besides resources for doing research, research environment is equally important. In fact, resources inform the research environment. Participation in international conferences, such as the AIB and AOM, can help scholars not only present their research and obtain feedback from experts but it can also form the basis of collaboration and networking with subject experts. The university should take active initiatives to invite subject experts for delivering research workshops on key topics such as how to publish and research methods. There is some evidence that industry experts are invited by the university but adding subject experts to the list will provide a significant strength for doctoral research.

There are provisions for governing doctoral programs, but the process of supervision should also be formally structured. For each supervision meeting, there should be a formal procedure

to record 1) Pre-meeting agenda, and 2) post-meeting minutes providing details of a) key discussion points, and b) action points for the doctoral student with clearly defined time scales. The university should make a short-term and medium-term strategy to implement these changes, including statistics on publication profile and research activities of doctoral students and staff to demonstrate how progress has been made following the accreditation assessment.

Recommendations:

- The number of courses in the PhD programmes is low and might need to be increased.
- The university needs to elevate its standard of research. There are two interrelated elements through which this can be obtained:
 - a) research resources:
 - The availability of access to secondary databases and journal articles should be increased,
 - Appropriate funding to help PhD students attend mainstream international conferences should be made available,
 - Incentives should be created for doctoral students/staff to publish in top tier journals,
 - International standards for measuring journal quality, e.g., Australian Business Deans Council (ABDC) and Chartered Association of Business School (CABS) should be adopted instead of the listing in Scopus.
 - b) research environment:
 - Faculty should seek collaboration and networking with renowned experts in the field,
 - Faculty should invite experts in the field to deliver research workshops on key topics such as research methods and how to publish.
- Provisions for governing doctoral programs should be increased, e.g., by formally structuring and rewarding the process of supervision.
- The university should make a short-term and medium-term strategy to implement these changes, including statistics on publication profile and research activities of doctoral students and staff to demonstrate how progress has been made following the accreditation assessment.

2.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **not fulfilled**.

3 ESG Standard 1.3: Student-centred learning, teaching, and assessment

Institutions should ensure that the programmes are delivered in a way that encourages students to take an active role in creating the learning process, and that the assessment of students reflects this approach

3.1 Status

3.1.1 Student-centred learning and teaching

The character of learning at UNIB is – according to the self-evaluation report – “interactive, holistic, integrative, scientific, contextual, thematic, and collaborative”. The interactive character has been applied in the learning process where lecturers and students actively communicate with each other. Holistically, the learning process at UNIB is directed at efforts to develop student potential, especially academic potential, and open new thinking insights that are different from the insights when they were still in high school. Learning is also carried out integrative between the theory presented in class with practical experience in the field in the form of lectures and practical work in the field.

The UNIB prioritizes a scientific approach so that students can develop concepts, formulate problems, and propose hypotheses, collect information to answer hypotheses, and make conclusions. Contextual learning is applied by linking learning materials with the context of their daily lives and with the latest scientific developments, including by incorporating the results of lecturers’ research into learning materials. The thematic learning process is applied in the higher semesters, where the courses taught in this semester summarize the various disciplines that have been taught in the previous semester. In certain cases, students are grouped for collaborative activities such as completing structured assignments so that the learning activities are student-centred.

Learning methods feature lectures, tutorials, seminars, practicum, studio practice, workshop practice, practice fieldwork, research, and community services. Face-to-face learning in the classroom is combined with online learning. Lecturers vary learning methods according to the characteristics of the material and student learning styles. Learning is conducted in an integrative way between lectures in class and practical learning activities.

There are group discussions, simulations, case studies, collaborative learning, cooperative learning, project-based learning, problem-based learning, or other learning methods that can effectively facilitate the fulfilment of the learning outcomes. In addition to class discussions, the teaching methods used are problem-based, discovery-inquiry, and project-based learning which involve students actively participating in learning. To smoothen the learning process, empirical data and examples are widely used for easier understanding the academic subject and the application of methods.

The university offers students the possibility of the so-called “Independent learning - independent campus” (MBKM). This curriculum allows students to take courses outside their study programmes according to the needs and abilities they want to explore, both across study programmes and universities.

UNIB has a Learning Management System (LMS) in the form of e-learning to support online classes and student learning management. During the Covid-19 pandemic, the learning process was switched to online mode. Besides being supported by LMS, online learning includes various online meeting platforms or online chat applications. In classes there are blended learning tools used, both face-to-face and virtual either synchronously or asynchronously. UNIB implements MOOCs (Massive Online Open Courses) so that learning is no longer limited by place and time. Thus, the wider community, both at home and abroad, can study at UNIB. Lecturers are provided with university teaching training and active learning methods. They are encouraged to use interactive teaching methods and make use of the available facilities and infrastructure. Lecturers also ensure that teaching methods, assessment, and classroom resources reflect sensitivity to diversity and incorporate positive role portrayal, relevant issues, and themes such as ethics, inclusion, respect, and acceptance, including diversity in family composition, gender identity, and sexual orientation. The respect for diversity in learning systems is based on the principle that the differences are recognised and utilised positively to benefit the quality of learning and the workspace.

Each semester, students receive a different credit load depending on the GPA obtained in the previous semester, with a maximum of 24 credits.

Doctoral courses

The cornerstones of teaching and learning methods for PhD students include offering facilities, close guidance, and assessment of learning achievements. Students do not only participate in courses, research and publications are also included to support the learning stages. Students and lecturers have online and offline interactions: academic guidance, guidance in the thesis writing process, public lecture, dissertation writing workshops and international journal publications, cooperation with other institutions in conducting colloquia for proposal writing and dissertation results.

3.1.2 Assessment of learning

The assessment principles applied by the University of Bengkulu are educative, authentic, objective, accountable and transparent:

- The educative principle motivates students to improve the planning and learning methods, and to achieve the graduate learning outcomes;

- The authenticity principle orientates towards a continuous learning process and learning outcomes that reflect students' abilities during the learning process;
- The objectivity principle describes that the standard is agreed by the lecturers and students and is free from the influence of the subjectivity of the assessor and the one being assessed;
- The accountability principle describes clear procedures and criteria and is agreed upon at the beginning of the lecture, and understood by students;
- The transparency principle guarantees that procedures and results can be accessed by all stakeholders.

All assessment principles are applied and adjusted to each study programme based on its characteristics and related to the competencies and degrees to be achieved by the graduates. Each course has a description called “Semester Course Details” (RPS) that consists of the targets of learning outcomes, materials, methods, time and stages. To maintain the quality of learning, the implementation of lectures, both compulsory and elective courses, refers to the “Semester Course Detail” (Rencana Pembelajaran Semester – RPS) that has been prepared for each course. This RPS becomes a reference for both lecturers and students when conducting lectures.

Periodically, the learning process at UNIB is monitored and evaluated (see for more details, chapter III.9):

1. Every year the Internal Quality Audit (AMI) is conducted to evaluate the learning system.
2. The Quality Control Taskforce of each faculty is tasked with evaluating the syllabus and RPS based on learning outcomes for each of the study programmes at the end of each semester. This evaluation is conducted by the lecturers of the courses and students separately. Documents are monitored and the implementation of learning is reported upon, at least evaluating the material suitability and the accuracy of the assessment method.
3. At the end of the semester, the results of the monitoring and evaluation, and the results of student evaluations based on the implementation of the lectures are discussed through lecturer meetings to obtain input for improvement in the next lecture period.

In addition, UPM also conducts exit surveys to assess the implementation of thesis guidance and academic services in laboratories, study programmes, departments, and faculties. The results of these surveys are integrated in the improvement process of the study programmes. The results of the learning evaluation are analysed and followed up at least two times each semester. The method of assessing student learning outcomes is stated by each lecturer in the RPS and compiled by a team of supporting lecturers and approved by the Department. The points assessed include assignments/quizzes, midterm and final exams, and practicum scores. Assignments can be in the form of answering questions, group discussions, writing papers, presentations, etc. The weights of assessments differ from course to course. In the

first meeting, the lecturer should explain the assessment procedure. At the end of each semester, the lecturer gives a final score. The lecturer inputs the final score on the academic portal at the end of the semester. Usually, the time limit for uploading the scores is within two weeks after the final test.

Students can complain if the learning process, assessment, or other services are considered not appropriate. Students can submit complaints against the lecturers or other services to the department. The complaint is then resolved at the department level, submitted to the faculty level, or, if necessary, to the university level. Clarifications on grades are resolved by the relevant lecturer. If it is not resolved, students can escalate to the department level. The department then conducts a direct follow-up or coordinates with the Academic Division of the faculty when necessary. The complaint mechanism is described in the Standard Operating Procedure.

Doctoral

Learning assessment standards for Doctoral programmes must include external assessment teams from different universities. The main advisor and promoter at the doctoral degree have scientific qualifications relevant to the student's specialisation.

3.2 Assessment

From the documentation and the discussions with lecturers and students it can be concluded that all programmes put a strong emphasis on teacher-student interaction, proper student supervision and responding to students' talents and abilities as well as any special needs they might have.

The administrative and technical support for teaching at bachelor, magister, and doctoral levels at UNIB looks adequate and effective. However, discussions with the university and documents provided by the UNIB do not indicate properly, whether and how new teaching methods are informing teaching and learning. For example, it is not clear whether and how social media and digital technologies inform teaching and learning.

The discussions with students indicated that some improvements can still be made with regards to the practical experience that students can gain during their studies. Economics students felt that the theory component of their curriculum prepared them well for the (international) labour market, but they would like to engage more in project work and case studies.

Finally, it seems the university has made some efforts to include transferable 'skills' in programme documentation. However, this needs some more work. Magister programme in Applied Economics provides more details than other programs. There should be consistency in recording skills, and a focus should be laid on 'student employability' while identifying skills. There should be evidence of team building, leadership, persuasion, effective oral presentation, and report writing.

The assessment procedure is clearly described for the students and the examination process promotes reliable assessment. At the beginning of each semester, the weighting of the examinations and the submission requirements for the course are communicated to the students.

3.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Recommendations:

- The university should describe transferable skills for all programmes consistently with a focus on student employability.
- Transferable skills such as team building, leadership, persuasion, effective oral presentation, and report writing should be reflected in all curricula and be a regular part of the evaluation process.
- Project work and case studies should be enhanced in all curricula.

4 ESG Standard 1.4: Student admission, progression, recognition, and certification

Institutions should consistently apply pre-defined and published regulations covering all phases of the student “life cycle”, e.g. student admission, progression, recognition and certification.

4.1 Status

4.1.1 Admission

The student recruitment system for accepted students is regulated by the Minister of Research, Technology and Higher Education of the Republic of Indonesia (Regulation no. 60 of 2018 concerning the acceptance of new undergraduate students at State Universities (PTN)). According to the ministry’s regulation there are three options for applying at the UNIB:

- State University National Admission Selection (Seleksi Nasional Masuk Perguruan Tinggi Negeri – SNMPTN) is a national selection system based on screening of the applicants’ academic achievements in Senior High School or Vocational High School or Vocational Islamic High School. The government bears the selection fee so that student applicants are not charged a selection fee.
- State University Independent Admission Selection – Western Region (Seleksi Mandiri Masuk Perguruan Tinggi Negeri Indonesia Bagian Barat – SMMPTN) is an independent admission selection held jointly by 15 state universities in Western Indonesia. This selection is based on a written exam with a registration fee and an additional Institutional

Development Fee. SMMPTN is intended for high school graduates from the last two years ago.

- State University Joint Admission Selection (Seleksi Bersama Masuk Perguruan Tinggi Negeri – SBMPTN) is a joint selection carried out by all state universities under the coordination of a Central Committee, with selection based on the results of a paper-based written test or a computer-based test. The test materials include:
 - A Scholastic Potential Test (Tes Potensi Skolastik – TPS) to measure cognitive abilities such as quantitative knowledge, which consists of the knowledge and mastery of basic mathematics.
 - English Language Proficiency Test and Academic Ability Test (Tes Kemampuan Akademik – TKA), which measures cognitive abilities directly related to the content of subjects studied in school. The test emphasises Higher Order Thinking Skills.

The decision whom to accept as students follows the new student admission standard of the UNIB based on the SBMPTN scores of applicants.

At the postgraduate level, admission is carried out by each study programme. The policy of the recruitment and selection system for student candidates carried out by the coordinator of the magister study programme is guided by the rector's regulation. The study programme coordinator carries out the recruitment process. He or she forms a selection committee that decides upon the registration time and the requirements that candidates must meet. These decisions are made public, and the candidates who meet the requirements are invited to take tests. The committee then determines final admission upon the test results. The numbers of applicants are much higher than the numbers of accepted students for all programmes (ie., Bachelor in Management 2019 had 1.467 applicants and accepted 180 students).

Admission to the doctoral programmes is granted to students with a minimum Grade Point Average (GPA) of 3.00 and no C scores; a minimum score of 500 on the TOEFL test or an equivalent test from a recognised international institution; a TPA certificate from the Autonomous Business Unit for Test Organisation with a minimum score of 500.

4.1.2 Progression

In general, the requirements for bachelor degree students for progression are:

- be registered as an active student in the current semester,
- passed all the courses and achieved the learning outcomes of the study programmes,
- have a cumulative grade point average (CGPA) of at least 2.5 with maximum two D grades,
- have no D grade in the nationally compulsory general courses, and
- fulfil all other requirements set by the study programmes.

Students wanting to enter the Magister of Accounting programme without a background in Economics must take a matriculation programme with a load of 15 credits or five courses (e.g., Management and Cost Accounting, Auditing, Financial Accounting, Accounting Information Systems, and Government Accounting).

The average study period for Bachelor in Management was 4.8 years (target 4 years), Bachelor in Economics: 4.5 years (target 3.5 years), Magister in Management: 3.5 years (target 3 years), Magister in Applied Economics: 2.9 years (target 3.3 years), Doctoral in Management: 4.5 years (target 3.4 years), Doctoral in Economics: 4.5 years (target 4.5 years). These figures are based on 2019 and especially for the doctoral programmes they are derived from a small number of students.

4.1.3 Recognition

With the application of standards, all lecture activities in the UNIB can be recognised throughout Indonesia and even internationally. Based on the Regulation of the Rector of the University of Bengkulu Number 25 of 2020 Article 20:

- Students can apply for credit transfers for courses obtained from study programmes within the university and other state universities that are accredited with at least B predicate (“Very Good”),
- Courses that can be transferred for credit are:
 - Student exchange program, Sandwich and Double Degree;
 - Educational programs that have been followed before, study programmes in universities and other tertiary institutions that are accredited at least with a B predicate (good);
 - Other activities carried out in non-university institutions;
 - Vocational level transfer programs and fast track programs.

4.1.4 Certification

In order to obtain a bachelor degree of the FH and FEB UNIB, students must finish the equivalent of 220-229 ECTS points. Upon completion graduates receive a certificate with the grade, a transcript of records and a diploma supplement of their studies, describing the learning outcomes of the study programme.

To obtain a doctoral degree, students need to fulfil all requirements set by the study programme with the minimum grade B (Good). Students receive a predicate with honours on completion of a maximum of four years of study.

4.2 Assessment

The admission into programmes on the bachelor, magister and doctoral level is regulated through a transparent process that is clearly defined beforehand and publicly accessible in

Indonesian. The recruitment centers around students' academic achievement, field proficiency, and language skills.

The process of monitoring and tracking student progression is mainly done through an online platform, providing a comprehensive overview to students and lecturers. This information is used by teachers and counsellors to support students in improving their progress. There is a student support office at the university, providing guidance to the students and informing them about their rights. Students achieving exceptionally well academically get awarded special honours.

The university regulations on recognition of courses allow for good student mobility throughout the country between HEI's. However, the university should improve the standards of its documentation and availability of English language information to also allow for international student mobility.

Upon graduation the students receive sufficient documentation of their academic achievements. The documentation of certification could be improved, if it was given to the students in Indonesian and English, making international application by students easier.

To realise and implement the goal of "Becoming a world-class university in 2025", the international collaboration with universities and companies in the ASEAN-region should be expanded. The possibilities for a student exchange should be enhanced and the number of intakes and outgoings should grow to better integrate the FH and FEB UNIB in the international scientific community.

4.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Recommendations:

- The documentation of recognition and certification of student achievements should be improved by providing all documents in Indonesian and English language version, to ease international student mobility.
- The international collaboration with universities and companies in the ASEAN-region should be increased. Possibilities for a student exchange should be enhanced and the number of intakes and outgoings increased.

5 ESG Standard 1.5: Teaching staff

Institutions should assure themselves of the competence of their teachers. They should apply fair and transparent processes for the recruitment and development of the staff

5.1 Status

The quality assurance process for teaching staff at UNIB covers the entire cycle from recruitment to termination. The lecturers have duties in the field of education, research, and community service, known as the Tri Dharma of higher education.

The Faculty of Law currently employs 63 teaching staff (3 professors, 33 associate professors). The Faculty of Economics and Business employs 84 teaching staff (3 professors, 53 associate professors).

5.1.1 Process of recruiting staff

The UNIB establishes and follows a clear, transparent, and fair process for the recruitment of teaching staff. This is explained in a guideline for planning and recruiting lecturers and education personnel. The selection/recruitment process of civil servants and non-civil servants are guided by the Regulation of the Minister of Administrative and Bureaucratic Reform, the National CPNS Selection Guidebook issued by the State Civil Service Administration Agency, and the Regulation of the Government of the Republic of Indonesia concerning the Authority to Appoint, Transfer, and Discharge the Civil Servants.

The recruitment process for civil-servant lecturers (Pegawai Negeri Sipil – PNS) at the UNIB applies the following steps:

1. Proposing the faculty's needs based on each study program's needs analysis.
2. Staffing technical meetings at the university level to stipulate the formation.
3. Announcing the selection process of civil servants' candidates according to the formation and requirements online and written information on the Staffing Office at the University of Bengkulu. The conditions are:
 - 3.1. Indonesian citizen,
 - 3.2. at least 18 years old, maximum 35 years old,
 - 3.3. physically and mentally healthy and free from drugs,
 - 3.4. good behaviour as proven by the Statement of Police Report (henceforth SKCK – Surat Keterangan Catatan Kepolisian),
 - 3.5. have never been dishonourably discharged as a civil servant/member of the Indonesian National Military (henceforth TNI – Tentara Nasional Indonesia) / Indonesian National Police (henceforth POLRI – Kepolisian Negara Republik Indonesia),
 - 3.6. not currently working as PNS/CPNS and
 - 3.7. do not have contractual agreement/service ties with other agencies,

- 3.8. having minimum GPA 3.0 for bachelor's degree (S-1) holder, and 3.25 for master's degree (S-2) holder with a linear field of study from an accredited Study Programmes at least B.
4. Accepting the online registration.
5. The CPNS test includes a Basic Competency Test (TKD) through a computer-assisted test (CAT), and the participants who pass the section may proceed to Field Competency Test (TKB), microteaching and interviews.
6. The announcement will be published online.

The differences between the civil-servant lecturers and the non-civil-servant lecturers are basically that the (nationally standardized) CPNS test is substituted by a procedure of the UNIB that include Basic Competency Test, Field Competency Test, micro-teaching and interviews. The Lecturer workload describes the credit load for implementing teaching, research, and community service each semester. In general, the workload should be in the interval of 12 to 16 credits.

The faculty of Law has 69 permanent lecturers with 17 lecturers holding doctoral degrees (25%) and 47 lecturers holding magister degrees (68%). The number of lecturers continuing their doctoral studies is 5 lecturers (7%).

The management of the faculty is supported by 10 civil servants' personnel (%) and 19 non-PNS personnel (%). 23 of the educational personnel of the faculty have a bachelor and magister degree, the other 6 has a junior high school or senior high school degree.

The faculty of Economics and Business has 91 permanent lecturers with 39 lecturers holding doctoral degrees (43%) and 45 lecturers holding magister degrees (50%). The number of lecturers continuing their doctoral studies is 7 lecturers (7%).

The management of the faculty is supported by 17 civil servants' personnel (%) and 33 non-PNS personnel (%). 42 of the educational personnel of the faculty have a bachelor and magister degree, the other 8 has a junior high school or senior high school degree.

UNIB has 819 permanent lecturers and 29 non-permanent lecturers. In 2021, the number of UNIB lecturers was 819 lecturers with qualifications: 503 lecturers (65%), 279 doctoral level (34%), and 49 professors (6%) spread over eight faculties. Based on the number of lecturers and students, the ratio of lecturers to students is 1:27.

The programme Magister in Notarial Law is run by practitioners.

5.1.2 Opportunities for personal development

Lecturers' positions are offered at four levels:

1. Instructor
2. Assistant Professor,
3. Associate Professor,

4. Professor.

Each level has terms, rights and obligations described by the UNIB that are accessible for every teacher. UNIB focuses on implementing possibilities to accelerate the career level of lecturers through special research grants. In addition, there is also a mentoring programme where a senior lecturer guides junior lecturers to accomplish the university's Tri Dharma obligations.

In addition to the career path development, the UNIB offers professional trainings to enhance the teaching abilities of the lecturers. The opportunities include study assignments, internships, seminars, workshops, e-learning training, e-book training, e-journal training, teaching materials training, applied approach training, and training on RPS preparation based on OBE (Outcome Based Education).

5.1.3 Research opportunities

The UNIB encourages scientific activities to strengthen the link between education and research. In the research guide, there are additional outputs in the form of books or teaching materials that lecturers and students can use in class. In addition, related to the "Independent Learning - Independent Campus" programme, students are also entitled to do independent research, do internships in research centres or be involved in research conducted by lecturers. Thus, UNIB strongly supports student participation in local, national, and international scientific writing competitions.

5.1.4 Innovation in teaching methods and the use of new technologies

To encourage innovation in teaching methods and the use of new technologies, UNIB has undertaken:

1. Provision of a Moodle platform as a learning management system that lecturers and students can use during lectures.
2. Teaching grants finance the development of teaching materials which include books, videos, websites and others.
3. Online lectures using Zoom, G-meet and other similar services.

5.2 Assessment

5.2.1 Process of recruiting staff

The UNIB's two recruiting processes for staff – for civil servants and for non-civil servants – are regulated by public records and clearly defined. Also, promotions are handled according to Indonesian regulations. The processes are fair and transparent.

The UNIB has recruited highly competent teaching staff for the subjects taught. Most of the staff at the faculty's assessed programmes at bachelor, magister and doctoral levels is permanently employed. Teaching faculty is required to have the relevant professional qualifications and certifications to be employed at UNIB.

According to the information presented in the discussions, just some percent of the teaching load is done by external lecturers that offer a deeper insight in special fields of studying or include for example a business perspective into their teachings. UNIB should consider raising the direct involvement of external experts in the teaching of the students. On the same grounds, international incoming teaching mobility should be increased. This represents an asset to the students' chances of employment, but the selection mechanisms and methods for securing the quality of these practitioners should be described in the recruitment process guidelines.

5.2.2 Opportunities for personal development

Teaching and learning at UNIB is provided adequately for all programs, based on enough lecturers with suitable levels of professional qualification. The university has also clearly defined further education and development goals in place for its teaching staff. A five-year planning process is in place for recruitment and further education of teaching staff. Recruitment plans are supposed to be submitted to the responsible governmental bodies for approval. However, discussions with the university revealed that English language skills of lecturers are still deficient. To increase the quality of teaching and learning and to meet the overall internationalization aims laid out by the university, English language skills should be improved on all levels of the university (management, administration, and teaching staff). This move will not just promote English language course development and teaching at UNIB but also trigger joint cross-border research activities.

The university can also focus on strengthening its bouquet of training and workshops in relation to doctoral studies, both for students and supervisors.

5.2.3 Research opportunities

The expert panel was told that the UNIB offers funds for research to the lecturers. However, specific details were not presented. Thus, the expert panel had no insight, whether or how much teaching load can be substituted for by research activities of the lecturers. The number of lecturers that could obtain funds and grants for research or the amount of third-party financial means could also not be detected. As a practice-oriented university, UNIB's main focus is directed to teaching. Research activities are of secondary importance.

Still, the expert panel recommends that lecturers be encouraged to become more research active because this will not only improve quality of teaching but also enables the active involvement of students in research activities, which might also inspire novel ways of teaching and learning.

5.2.4 Innovation in teaching methods and the use of new technologies

The UNIB offers the teachers a diverse array of possibilities to enhance the learning techniques. The Covid-pandemic in general has had a tremendous impact on advances in blended learning activities at the university and faculty level. These new methods require the provision and renewal of hard- and software. The university should continuously monitor the use of innovative teaching methods by the teaching faculty.

5.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Recommendations:

- The selection mechanisms and methods for securing the quality of practitioners with teaching obligations should be described in the recruitment process guidelines.
- English language proficiency among teaching as well as support staff should be enhanced to develop further international teaching competencies, and international (incoming and outgoing) student, faculty, and staff mobility.

6 ESG Standard 1.6: Learning resources and student support

Institutions should have appropriate funding for learning and teaching activities and ensure that adequate and readily accessible learning resources and student support are provided.

6.1 Status

6.1.1 General information about the campus

The UNIB occupies a land area of 24.9 ha located in Bengkulu Province. This location is easy to access by people from outside of the Bengkulu province since it is only around 30 minutes from Fatmawati airport. The UNIB has public facilities that may be used by all students of the Law and Economics Faculty including Integrated Service Building, UNIB library, clinic, sports facilities, banking facilities, and prayer facilities (mosques).

The students can benefit from 14 main buildings consisting of office buildings, a lecture building, three laboratory buildings, a library building, a student activity centre building, a health building, canteens, student association secretariats, entrepreneurship hangars, and others. There is a Dean's room, three Vice Dean's rooms, a section head's room, a large meeting room, a small meeting room, one classroom, a faculty senate room, and a quality assurance unit room. All classrooms have air conditioners, good quality furniture, and smooth and robust internet access. A shared administration room is provided with sufficient capacity for faculty education personnel who serve students in each study programme.

There are 26 classrooms in the teaching and learning facility, with a total seating capacity of 1,660 pupils. For a total of 8,300 students, five sessions can be held in the classrooms in a single day. All classrooms have air conditioners, smart TVs, and LCD. The teaching and learning process for postgraduate programmes is not only carried out in the collaborative teaching and learning building but also in the postgraduate building. The final project courtroom and seminar room for each study programme are in the building of each study programme.

The buildings of the FEB and FH are centres for academic and financial administration services. In these buildings, there is a dean's room, three vice dean's rooms, a section head's room, a large meeting room, a small meeting room, one classroom, a faculty senate room, and a quality assurance unit room. All classrooms have air conditioners, good-quality furniture, and smooth and robust internet access. A shared administration room is provided with sufficient capacity for faculty education personnel who serve students in each study programme. Every lecturer of FEB and FH has a comfortable workspace with smooth internet access. Students can consult with lecturers in the workspace. The lecturer's workspace has tables, chairs, and bookcases to meet standard requirements.

The Faculty of Law has a law laboratory for students consisting of a Civil Practice Judicial Studio, a Criminal Practice Judicial Studio, a State Administrative Practice Judicial Studio, and a Constitutional Court Judicial Study. The physical facilities of the FH use six buildings: Building D (Notarial Law building), building (Law Laboratory building), building F (Magister in Law building), and moot court building. The FH also provides documentation and legislation units, which the Law Laboratory administratively manages to increase facility support by providing easily accessible reference sources for law faculty students.

The building of the FEB has an area of 1.728 m² and it has three floors. The 1st floor contains a conference room, academic services, student affairs, finance and personnel, internal affairs and equipment, the UPM faculty room, two toilets with four cubicles, a computer laboratory, and an investment gallery. The 2nd floor has some rooms such as the Faculty Senate room, Dean's room, Vice Dean for Academic Affairs room, resources and finance room, student affairs hall, leadership meeting room, classrooms, prayer room, pantry, and eight toilet cubicles. The 3rd floor consists of a hall and two classrooms.

6.1.2 Administrative student support

The Faculty of Law (FH) has an administrative section that assists the FH in running its study programmes (Bachelor and Magister in Law, Magister in Notarial Law). The administration Section is led by a section head responsible to the Dean of the Law faculty. The head of the administrative section has the task of carrying out academic affairs, student affairs, planning, finance, staffing, management, administration, internal general affairs, and state property within the faculty. The Quality Assurance Unit (UPM) of the FH aims to ensure that the education process, research process, and community service carried out by both lecturers and students can follow service quality standards.

During the study period, the students are supported by the SIAKAD system. SIAKAD includes the KRS, LHS, transcripts, class schedules, academic guidance, and e-learning that can be accessed by students and lecturers. Students can easily consult with the best possible lecturers directly in the workspace or through the internet and SIAKAD facilities provided. Students can consult in planning their studies with their academic advisor at the beginning of the semester before the lecture starts. Lecturers as academic advisors provide advice and input regarding the student's study plans and study results of each semester.

New students are encouraged to join the student organisations or associations to develop their interests and talents in academic and non-academic fields. These activities can help students develop their potential to balance their learning activities. The division which oversees this activity is the division of student affairs of the faculty.

Students are also encouraged to seek information about career and work goals through the skill, insight, and career development. These activities may be conducted through workshops and training on entrepreneurship, seminars on career development, public lectures with practitioners according to their fields, and collaboration with the industry by involving the students

6.1.3 Library

The UNIB library's mission is to provide access to information, to support the Tri Dharma of Higher Education, and to improve the quality of library resources to become relevant and professional. The library facilities can be accessed freely by registered users with a library membership card.

The library of UNIB has an area of 6,000 m². It continues to develop as the institution's commitment to improving the quality of providing facilities and learning resources so that they can contribute to the improvement of education quality. The library of UNIB collection currently includes more than 75,000 copies of textbooks, 11 national journals accredited by Dikti/LIPI, 1 international journal, 3 proceedings, 339 theses and 1,117 copies, 2 dissertations, and 11,000 undergraduate theses and 15,251 copies. In addition to the collection of books in the library, the library of UNIB is also equipped with the digital collections for students to access the learning resources for free. The FEB and FH division have their own reading rooms and the faculties possess 605 textbooks, 37 magazines, 986 journals, and thousands of theses. Many journals can be accessed without a subscription. In addition, UNIB has a collaboration with the national library so that library users can access various resources held there. UNIB has also innovated in developing an integrated online digital library with all Faculty Reading Rooms within UNIB the website Senayan Library Information System (<https://slims.unib.ac.id/index.php>) or through the SlimS application and. Through this application and website, the academic community can connect to the National Library and access all books and journal collections including: the books, references, magazines, national and international journals. In addition to supporting facilities, the library of UNIB is also managed by professional librarians. They all have sufficient qualifications to properly help the academic community and employees within UNIB. The work of librarians is also assisted by the administrative staff (civil servants and honorary staff) who are placed by the university at the library of UNIB.

6.1.4 IT Service

The information system of UNIB is connected using the Local Area Network (LAN) and Wide Area Network (WAN). This system has a big data capacity and adequate accessibility with a speed of 800 Mbps. The area of UNIB has been connected using optical fibre and WiFi for LAN connection to access the internet. Therefore, these facilities will help the academic community and education personnels to access various UNIB internal information and the internet.

The Office of Development of Information, Technology and Communication (LPTIK) is an institution responsible for the utilisation and development of information systems for the benefit of learning and programme management which can be accessed at <https://lptik.Unib.ac.id>. The services offered by LPTIK include New Student Registration System, Academic Portal System, Lecture Attendance System, Graduation Registration System, UNIB Academic Information System, Online Community Service System, Personnel System, Remuneration System, Planning System for UNIB PPK Bureau, Lecturer and Employee Absence System, Registration SIM, UNIB Portal PIN Making System, e-Learning System, Library System, Correspondence System, e-Journal System, Book Search System, UNIB Repository System, Learning Evaluation Information System, Database Information System, and UNIB Graduates Tracer Study application.

UNIB already has an LMS-based e-learning application (<https://elearning.Unib.ac.id/>) which has been used intensively to support blended learning. The system can be used to provide lecture materials and modules that the lecturers and students can use to support synchronous and asynchronous learning. The online learning is conducted through video conference applications.

The management of the information system of the faculties Law and Economics is integrated with the one developed by UNIB. The existing information systems include SIAKAD (Academic Information System), SIRENBA (Business Plan Information System), Academic Portal, SIREMUN (Remuneration Information System), Employee Attendance Information System, SIMPEG (Employment Information System), FH and FEB UNIB Websites (<https://fh.unib.ac.id/> and <https://feb.unib.ac.id/>), Informatics Study Programme Website, Web Civil Engineering Study Programme Website, Mechanical Engineering Study Programme Web, Electrical Engineering Study Programme Website, Architecture Study Programme Web, and Information Systems Study Programme Web.

The information system of UNIB is used to improve the effectiveness in archiving, decision-making, efficient learning, and improving the quality of academic programmes. The development of the information system is a part of the internal quality assurance in learning activities. To improve the quality of academic programme implementation, each study programme can use various applications: the Academic Portal, Lecture Attendance, UNIB Academic Information, Online KKN, e-Learning, Library, Correspondence, e-learning Journal, Book Search, UNIB Repository, and Learning Evaluation Information System.

6.1.5 Training events and support services

UNIB conducts various approaches of training for the management, lecturers, and students to support the improvement of the learning standards, research and community service, and institutional management. Students can participate in training to increase their competences

through soft skills training, student creativity programmes, entrepreneurship, and organisational management. These training programmes support the main competencies of students in their respective fields. They are conducted by the division of the student affairs of the university and faculty.

UNIB has a Career Development Centre to implement programmes to align education and professional work. In the future, this unit is expected to be able to prepare UNIB graduates to compete in the job market to increase their employability. The career and entrepreneurship guidance is also conducted by the Technology Business Incubator, which aims to grow young creative entrepreneurs at UNIB with several activities including technical business guidance, Business Competitions, and Business Training.

6.1.6 Student research

Already during their studies, students are guided to apply for research funds. The most competitive funds are provided by the Ministry of Education, Culture, Research, and Technology. These funds were received through the “Student Creativity Programmes” (PKM) and “Student Creativity Competition Scheme”. The emphasis of student's research is to follow the research roadmap of each study programme.

6.2 Assessment

6.2.1 Physical facilities

The UNIB has a library to which students have free access. In the library, there is ample opportunity to access various forms of literature in both physical and online form and there are reading rooms where students can study without being disturbed.

The various teaching rooms at the faculty are of suitable sizes and well equipped with various IT technical equipment which enables a modern and pedagogically up-to-date form of teaching. In all classrooms there is wi-fi which enables access to the internet and the information system used at the university.

It is pleasing that the UNIB also has various offers for the practice of sports activities, such as basketball, volleyball, and football. These sports facilities enable the students to exercise and thus ensure good conditions for a mental and physical surplus that will benefit them during busy periods of study.

Students criticise the absence of a lift in (some) buildings of the university and especially students of the Law faculty experience problems with overcharged facilities such as reading rooms and other resources.

6.2.2 Student Support

There are several options for the students to get help and support during their studies. With regards to academic counselling and support of the career centre, there is plenty of advice and guidance for students during their studies. This help is especially important when the students must contact companies in connection with choosing an internship and later in connection with the preparation of a graduation project. In addition, several of the study programmes have a well-functioning student association where events are regularly held with visits from former students and companies who give presentations about working in business and law. These events give the students insights into the working life after their studies and opportunities to establish a network with the industry.

Based on interviews with the students, it seems that various support opportunities work well, and they also confirm that the administrative staff are good at helping when problems arise during the period of study. In addition, tutors are assigned to help new students get off to a good start in their studies. Discussions with students revealed, however, that this support system is geared mainly towards study issues. Support for students in special life situations (e.g., pregnancy or child-care) is not institutionalized. Students argue that there exists a cultural sensitivity towards personal issues that are not openly addressed.

The expert panel also misses support for international exchange as a key to becoming a globally (visible) university. Students aiming at a student exchange should be more supported financially, conditions for an exchange should be enhanced by supporting English language skills either on a voluntary, informal base, e.g., an English café, or by setting certain requirements like some courses in English.

A newly opened student centre at the campus will contribute to a productive learning and studying environment for all students.

6.2.3 IT-infrastructure and LMS systems

It generally seems that the university has an IT infrastructure that supports the work of all groups of employees and that ensures a quick and efficient handling of everything related to teaching and research.

The university's information system PAK and their Learning Management System (LMS) ensure students' safe and quick access to various relevant information such as grades, schedules, homework, teaching material and material from various lectures, which makes it easier for students to have a continuous overview of their studies. Based on interviews with the students, it seems that the IT technical systems support their everyday life at the university, and they say that the various lecturers are good at using them.

6.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

General recommendations:

- Financial support offers to students willing to go abroad should be improved. Opportunities to practice English language skills should be improved in formal (some courses in English) and informal ways (English café).
- Student support systems should also consider special needs and special life situations of students such as pregnancy, childcare, or care work in general.

Study-specific recommendations for BA, MA Law and Notarial Law:

- Opening hours of study spaces and library buildings should be extended to alleviate problems with overcharged facilities.

7 ESG Standard 1.7: Information management

Institutions should ensure that they collect, analyse and use relevant information for the effective management of their programmes and other activities.

7.1 Status

The UNIB has effective management to collect and evaluate data of students, lecturers, teaching staff, graduates, and other stakeholders which are evaluated against Key and Additional Performance Indicators. Data gathering starts with an Entry survey. This survey is conducted on new students at orientation time. The purpose of the survey is to obtain background information on students for instance area/ethnic/province origin, economic background, school origin, etc. The results of this survey can be one of the foundations for the implementation of learning methods in each study programme.

Monitoring and evaluation of teaching and learning process is a routine activity, which is held at least once a year. Data collection activities are carried out by distributing questionnaires to several lecturers who teach. This questionnaire is filled out by the students and recapitulated based on the number of lecturers who teach in the study programme. The recovered data is analysed and evaluated in the teaching and learning process to find out the deficiencies in the quality of teaching carried out by each lecturer. This can be seen from the high and low scores given by students to the questions in the questionnaire. A high score indicates that the quality is good, and vice versa. The lecturers are always present at each class and are very enthusiastic about delivering material. Furthermore, the monitoring and evaluation method was carried out with two methods consisting of offline and online questionnaire distribution methods. For the offline method, the lecturer distributes the questionnaire to each student according to the subject, then the questionnaire is tabulated and evaluated. For the online method, the results of monitoring and evaluation can be obtained directly from the data.

The student academic progress information system can be monitored through the academic portal system (<https://pak.unib.ac.id>). Moreover, academic supervisors can monitor the academic progress based on student GPA in each semester, while academic progress is monitored through the Academic Information System (SIKAD). Students with academic problems, including those who must drop out, will also be addressed through the study program. The data includes student profiles, study development and progress, the record of study results (grades), student successes and failures, courses and lecturers, class schedules, academic supervisors, number of students, the status of active and inactive students, student graduation, file sharing references and guides. Students can access a list of courses, room and class schedules, lecturers, KRS, academic supervisors, reports of the semester and cumulative study results (grade), student status, and student profiles. They also can evaluate courses and the learning process. SIKAD can be accessed by relevant units to input, process, update,

monitor and evaluate the progress of students' studies. SIAKAD is also connected with bank partners for students to carry out tuition fee payments.

Furthermore, the information management related to student satisfaction with the learning process for each lecturer can be accessed through (<https://siepel.unib.ac.id/>). The institution of Learning Development and Quality Assurance (LPMPP) is a unit that works to compile and report the evaluation result to the university leaders which will be submitted to the faculty, which later will be forwarded to the study programmes. This evaluation is conducted every semester on all courses offered at UNIB. The Quality Assurance Team at the faculty level and the Quality Assurance Team in each study programme will analyse and closely consider any recommendations made as a result of the learning evaluation's findings for potential future improvements. The results of the learning evaluation are also followed up by the dean, the head of study programmes, and supporting lecturers to find solutions and raise the standard of learning. The learning outcomes report will be used as the basis for UNIB leaders to improve the quality of learning, including improving the infrastructure.

The University of Bengkulu established a graduate career information centre (CDC) that connects with stakeholders outside the university. The centre conducts stakeholder satisfaction surveys of employers of graduates. This survey can be conducted directly in person, online using a Google form, or using other methods. It includes questions about graduate performance in integrity, professionalism, communication, teamwork, foreign language mastery skill, management, and IT skills.

The Class Attendance System is created to record the attendance of lecturers in the class that they teach in that semester. It is also created as a course journal for quality assurance of the conformity of lecture materials with RPS and Lesson Plan designed by the lecturers. In addition, it is also created to monitor student attendance as a basis for eligibility to take exams.

The Online community service system monitors students' participation in community service activities by tracking their location real-time. Students can document their activities and share them with their supervisors.

The Human Resources System (SISTER) collects data on lecturers and manages their portfolios for career development purposes. The data in the portfolio can be claimed in the credit score assessment process and lecturer certification. Assessors or reviewers can evaluate lecturer activities and products that have been claimed.

The Remuneration Information System assists the remuneration team in handling employee incentive calculations and provides reports of direct incentives, indirect incentives, incentives received by employees, and the percentage of incentives divided for the needs of the manager. An Attendance system using fingerprint mechanism records attendance of lecturers and educational staff once they are within the area of UNIB.

The Inter-semester class registration system is an additional system to facilitate inter-semester classes whose duration is shorter than the regular one. Registration for inter-semester classes is intended to record students who will take part in these activities.

The Library Management Information System (e-library) is the developed information system to help the services and library staff in managing the library. The library staff can always monitor the availability of books, the list of new books, borrowed books, and returned books. The library system at UNIB simplifies the inventory of the available books and other related information at the library.

7.2 Assessment

Overall, the university collects a large amount of valuable (and in some cases highly sensitive) data, both from students and lecturers. This data can make a valuable contribution to the further development of the programmes and to the identification of possible problems. However, there are also points for improvement about the data that is collected, the analysis of this information, and data security.

For example, the Class Attendance System collects live data on the teachers' presence and the time that students spend in class, mainly because participation is a prerequisite for students' eligibility to take exams. The students' presence on the premises of the university as well as their participation in community service activities is also monitored by tracking their location in real-time. While students and teachers at UNIB do not object to this practice, the university should be aware that international incoming students and teaching staff might consider this to be a severe breach of their privacy. It is recommendable that the university develops a policy regarding the storage and use of personal data that explains and justifies the collection of this information. The policy should be publicly available to all students and employees.

The performance of the lecturers, lecture plans, and materials used is also monitored closely, for example by higher-level staff according to the regulations of the Indonesian government. According to international academic standards, lecturers should have (some) freedom in selecting the topics they want to present in class and the methods they want to use. International incoming staff might not be ready to accept these mechanisms of control and the limitations on academic freedom and the university should strive to extend the sovereignty and independence of their teaching staff within the limits of governmental regulations.

The teaching, research, and administrative language in collecting, reporting, and analysing the relevant information is not in English. This is a problem for evaluating and an effective obstacle for exchanges and internationalization.

7.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Recommendations:

- To address the needs of international incoming students, faculty, and staff the university should develop a privacy policy regarding the storage and use of personal data (including live tracking of persons' location) that is publicly available.
- Data collection should be conducted in a uniform manner for all programmes to enhance comparability and comprehensibility of the documentation.

8 ESG Standard 1.8: Public information

Institutions should publish information about their activities, including programmes, which is clear, accurate, objective, up-to date and readily accessible.

8.1 Status

Most information of the UNIB is accessible on the university's official website (www.unib.ac.id). The website provides access to the latest data of information related to the university profile, offices, academics, scholarships, general information, and reports, admission system for the new students and the academic regulations. The website contains external links to connect UNIB with information of – for example – the Ministry of Education, governmental agencies, and professional associations. The website of the UNIB is bilingual; information is presented both in Indonesian and English.

The website is periodically updated by the “Public Relation Division” (Hubungan Masyarakat – HUMAS) that is coordinated by the “Information and Documentation Officers” (Pejabat Pengolah Informasi dan Dokumentasi – PPID).

In addition to the website, the public can access information about the UNIB through social media accounts such as Facebook, Instagram, Twitter, and YouTube.

8.2 Assessment

Most members of the expert panel have no language competencies in Indonesian. Therefore, the assessment concentrates on the English version of UNIB's website.

The UNIB has made a SWOT-analysis of their website and concluded that despite the strength of a continuous updating the “design of the website is outdated [and the] layout (...) is unorganized”. The immediate plans for improvement, however, concentrate on elimination of user complaint and on technical issues like stability of the website's performance in case of massive increases of users at a given time.

The expert panel strongly suggests that a relaunch of the website with a more attractive and user-friendly design and layout should be a priority. Students, employers, and other stakeholders should find their most relevant information immediately.

How informative the website is in Indonesian, the expert panel cannot assess (see above). However, the information in English is certainly not a mirrored version of the Indonesian one. In general, informations about the study programmes in English are inadequate, difficult to find, or not current or dummy data from when the website was created. For an international recognition, the website of the UNIB should be enhanced both in structure and in content, especially in English.

Furthermore, public information should not be reduced to websites or social media. The students should be given all relevant information about the study programmes they want to attend. A website may be a good introduction of key information. For an in-depth information, additional documents should be provided, e.g., syllabi of the study programmes, students guides, RPS etc. This documentation should be included on the study programmes' website. Alternatively, an information package could be presented via e-mail to interested people that at least the applicants for a study programme are thoroughly informed.

8.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Recommendations:

- For an international recognition, the internet presence of the university should be enhanced both in structure and in content and English.
- The student should be given a module handbook based on the course description for the national accreditation at the beginning of their studies, that should also be publicly available on the website.

9 ESG Standard 1.9: On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes

Institutions should monitor and periodically review their programmes to ensure that they achieve the objectives set for them and respond to the needs of students and society. These reviews should lead to continuous improvement of the programme. Any action planned or taken as a result should be communicated to all those concerned.

9.1 Status

The UNIB conducts regular monitoring and review of study programs to ensure the learning outcomes are set and adapted to the needs of students and the community. Systematic monitoring is a part of the Internal Quality Assurance System (SPMI) of UNIB through the Internal Quality Audit (AMI) that is conducted by the “Institute of Learning Development and Quality Assurance” (LPMPP). AMI is an objective evaluation process to ensure that the activities at UNIB are in accordance with the procedures set and that the results of these activities are in accordance with the standards set by UNIB. If the implementation of a study programme is not in accordance with the standards, corrective actions are applied. In its implementation, the LPMPP has full, independent and unlimited access to all the documents prepared by the study programmes. The auditor checks the completeness of all forms of documents and to obtain the necessary data and information according to the scope of the audit. AMI collects documents on the three levels of university, faculty, and of study programmes. Exemplary documents gathered from the three levels are:

- University level: Program Implementation Policy, Quality Policy/ SPMI, University Business Strategic Plan, Quality Documents (Standards, Manuals, Procedures), Academic and Non-Academic Regulations, Rector’s Decree and Circular Letter;
- Faculty level: Academic Policy, Dean Decree, Standard Operating Procedure of Programme Implementation and Evaluation;
- Study programme level: Academic Manuscripts/ Curriculum Documents, Lesson Plan Document, Manual/ Work Instruction, Learning Modules, Learning Implementation Document, Learning Evaluation Document.

AMI has been introduced in 2019, so that by 2022 it has run four cycles. In 2021 AMI has been conducted on 78 undergraduate and postgraduate study programmes. AMI auditors were appointed by Rector's Decree. Based on the Assignment Letter, there were 61 certified auditors appointed. The evaluation was carried out in two stages. They are Desk Evaluation (adequacy audit) and Field Assessment (compliance audit). The overall evaluation results show that the average criterion score is above 3 on a scale of 0-4.

The results gathered are presented to the university’s leadership first, then submitted to the faculty and at last to the directors of the study programmes. The AMI results of each study program are discussed in the Management Review Meeting (Rapat Tinjauan Manajemen –

RTM) at the faculty level. The Quality Assurance Team at the faculty level and the Quality Assurance Team in each study programme analyse the data in RTMs and propose recommendations for potential future improvements. The results of the learning evaluation are also followed up by the dean, the head of study programmes, and supporting lecturers to find solutions and raise the standard of learning. The RTM results, the learning outcomes report, will be used as the basis for UNIB leaders to improve the quality of learning, including improving the infrastructure. Corrective actions are determined based on the RTM and they are implemented by means of the Business and Budget Plan (Rencana Bisnis dan Anggaran – RBA) of the faculty in accordance with the improvement targets to be achieved. In addition, the results of the RTM are used as the basis for standard revisions so that sustainable quality improvement is achieved.

Based on the results of the internal and external evaluation, UNIB revised its standard by adding 24 additional standards in 2020. Likewise, as a follow-up to the results of the AMI at the university level, additional facilities like the Integrated Service Building and Clinic were added.

9.2 Assessment

The Self-Assessment Report and the discussions with the University's relevant status groups show that a continuous monitoring and readjustment of the study programmes exist. There also seems to be a close monitoring of teachers and students. The existing instruments for ongoing monitoring and review of programmes can be evaluated positive. The reflection and communication of evaluation results to other stakeholders seem well established. In particular, the relevant persons in charge at Bengkulu University show good will to continuously monitor and review the programmes; they are very willing to address deficits and to improve their programmes to keep them up to date.

During the discussion rounds teaching staff and university representatives illustrated their sensitivity towards the needs of potential future employers and the local and national community. The great importance of community service in the strategic goals of the university (the so-called Tri Dharma) also attests to this. This service to the community could be organized in a way that it benefits future career opportunities of students, honing their soft skills and reflecting at the same time the needs of Indonesian society and the district of Bengkulu.

Many experts criticise that the content of study programmes is not yet connected to international standards (e.g., Accounting and Notarial Law, see chapters 2.2.7 and 2.2.8) and could be updated to include more "modern" topics (e.g., environmental law, technology law, human rights, see chapter 2.2.6). A focus on improving these connections to international standards can open new chances of employment for students and benefits the overall goal of internationalization. The university should consider including more international stakeholders in their regular evaluation of programmes, beyond the international accreditation that it undergoes now.

Administrative staff, teaching staff, and students are aware of the monitoring and readjustment processes, the engagement of the stakeholders in the monitoring and readjustment processes, and the strategic goals of the UNIB and their implications for the department and the study programmes. Students are aware of the potential and impact of their engagement in the processes, yet they are not informed about the results. Student progress regulations comply with regulations of the Indonesian government.

According to the self-report of the faculties, students do not take part in the Management Review Meeting (RTM). Given that they are the ones most prominently affected by any changes of the study programme, their voice should be heard in a broader way than just filling in the course evaluation questionnaires about the lecturers' performances.

9.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Recommendations:

- The results of course evaluations should be made available in a suitable form to the students of the respective courses.
- Students should be represented in the Management Review Meeting (RTM).

10 ESG Standard 1.10: Cyclical external quality assurance

Institutions should undergo external quality assurance in line with the ESG on a cyclical basis

10.1 Status

The Ministry of Education, Culture, Research and Technology implements a Higher Education Quality Assurance System (SN Dikti) to ensure the quality of the study programmes and the higher education institution. The assessment is planned, implemented, documented and evaluated by the National Accreditation Board for Indonesian Higher Education (BAN-PT) or the Independent Accreditation Board (LAM) through the accreditation process based on their authority.

The External Quality Assurance System (SPME) implements an assessment every five years. The goals of SPME are to:

- determine the quality of the study programme and Higher Education based on the criteria of SN Dikti and
- ensure the quality of the study programme externally in both academic and non-academic fields.

HEIs submits a request for re-accreditation of the study programme to LAM or BAN-PT for maintaining and enhancing the accreditation status and accreditation rank.

The process of accreditation is conducted at the level of study programmes, faculty, and university. The office of “Education and Teaching Quality Assurance” (LPMP) prepares the documents of the policy of quality management, quality management manual, quality management report, and others.

Based on the latest data of the accreditation of study programmes at the University of Bengkulu until June 2022, 20 study programmes gained “excellent” rank, 51 study programmes gained “B” rank, 10 study programmes gained “C” rank. In conclusion, 25% of the study programmes at the University of Bengkulu have gained the top rank in the last accreditation.

10.2 Assessment

UNIB’s external quality assurance is performed by national regulation through the National Accreditation Board of Higher Education. Other forms of quality assurance have not been considered so far on a regular basis. As the UNIB is highly regulated by national legislation, the internal quality assurance system has been developed in accordance with the external standards by BAN-PT and LAM. The results of the accreditation are published, and the rating of study programmes, faculty and UNIB as a whole influence students in their decision where to start studying.

However, it seems to the expert panel that the criteria of the external quality assurance does not include an assessment of the research activities. This could be undertaken on a regular basis by an international expert panel to strengthen the commitment to the vision of “Becoming a world-class university” and could provide essential recommendations for action.

10.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

IV Recommendation to the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN

1 **Assessment of compliance the Standards and Guidelines in the Higher European Area (ESG) in the actual official version**

The study programmes “**Bachelor in Law**”, “**Bachelor in Accounting**”, “**Bachelor in Management**”, “**Bachelor in Economics**”, “**Magister in Law**”, “**Magister in Notarial Law**”, “**Magister in Accounting**”, “**Magister in Management**”, “**Magister in Applied Economics**”, “**Doctoral in Management**”, and “**Doctoral in Economics**” were assessed on the basis of the "Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area" (ESG), the Salzburg Recommendations for doctoral programmes, and the national relevant regulations.

The expert group concludes that the **ESG standards** 1.1 (Policy for quality assurance), 1.4 (Student admission, progression, recognition and certification), 1.5 (Teaching staff), 1.6 (Learning resources and student support), 1.7 (Information management), 1.8 (Public information), 1.9 (On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes) and 1.10 (Cyclical external quality assurance) are **fulfilled**. The **ESG standards** 1.2 (Design and approval of programmes) and 1.3 (Student-centred learning, teaching and assessment) are **fulfilled**.

2 Accreditation Recommendation

The peer-review experts recommend **accreditation with recommendations**:

General recommendations

1. The interaction between the central Internal Quality Assurance (SPMI) and faculty-level Quality Assurance Unit (UPM) should be outlined more clearly in the process descriptions of internal quality management.
2. It should be outlined more clearly in the process descriptions of internal quality management how the quality circle is closed in the further development of the study programmes.
3. Student commitment in the development of study programmes should be enhanced.
4. Students should receive consistent feedback on evaluations of all surveys of internal quality assurance.
5. The university should implement a system of key performance indicators that is aligned with the university's strategic goals.
6. Module descriptions, together with total credits, entry requirements, credits required for passing the program, teaching form, any programme specification, year wise list of modules, methods of assessment (exam, assignment, group presentation etc.) should be provided.
7. The documentation should be the same for each programme and the number of ECTS credits for each module and each programme should be clarified.
8. For the sake of student mobility between programmes as well as international mobility, the lengths of bachelor, magister, and doctoral programmes should be aligned with international standards.
9. The university should foster the development of more interdisciplinary modules and projects across faculties.
10. The university should describe transferable skills for all programmes consistently with a focus on student employability.
11. Transferable skills such as team building, leadership, persuasion, effective oral presentation, and report writing should be reflected in all curricula and be a regular part of the evaluation process.
12. Project work and case studies should be enhanced in all curricula.
13. The documentation of recognition and certification of student achievements should be improved by providing all documents in Indonesian and English language version, to ease international student mobility.
14. The international collaboration with universities and companies in the ASEAN-region should be increased. Possibilities for a student exchange should be enhanced and the number of intakes and outgoings increased.

15. The selection mechanisms and methods for securing the quality of practitioners with teaching obligations should be described in the recruitment process guidelines.
16. English language proficiency among teaching as well as support staff should be enhanced to develop further international teaching competencies, and international (incoming and outgoing) student, faculty, and staff mobility.
17. Financial support offers to students willing to go abroad should be improved. Opportunities to practice English language skills should be improved in formal (some courses in English) and informal ways (English café).
18. Student support systems should also consider special needs and special life situations of students such as pregnancy, childcare, or care work in general.
19. To address the needs of international incoming students, faculty, and staff the university should develop a privacy policy regarding the storage and use of personal data (including live tracking of persons' location) that is publicly available.
20. Data collection should be conducted in a uniform manner for all programmes to enhance comparability and comprehensibility of the documentation.
21. For an international recognition, the internet presence of the university should be enhanced both in structure and in content and English.
22. The student should be given a module handbook based on the course description for the national accreditation at the beginning of their studies, that should also be publicly available on the website.
23. The results of course evaluations should be made available in a suitable form to the students of the respective courses.
24. Students should be represented in the Management Review Meeting (RTM).

General recommendations on PhD programmes:

1. The number of courses in the PhD programmes is low and might need to be increased.
2. The university needs to elevate its standard of research. There are two interrelated elements through which this can be obtained:
 - a) research resources:
 - i) The availability of access to secondary databases and journal articles should be increased,
 - ii) Appropriate funding to help PhD students attend mainstream international conferences should be made available,
 - iii) Incentives should be created for doctoral students/staff to publish in top tier journals,

- iv) International standards for measuring journal quality, e.g., Australian Business Deans Council (ABDC) and Chartered Association of Business School (CABS) should be adopted instead of the listing in Scopus.
- b) research environment:
 - i) Faculty should seek collaboration and networking with renowned experts in the field,
 - ii) Faculty should invite experts in the field to deliver research workshops on key topics such as research methods and how to publish.
- 3. Provisions for governing doctoral programs should be increased, e.g., by formally structuring and rewarding the process of supervision.
- 4. The university should make a short-term and medium-term strategy to implement these changes, including statistics on publication profile and research activities of doctoral students and staff to demonstrate how progress has been made following the accreditation assessment.

Recommendations for study programme “Bachelor in Law“, “Master in Law”, and “Notarial Law”:

1. Opening hours of study spaces and library buildings should be extended to alleviate problems with overcharged facilities.

Recommendations for the study programme “Doctoral in Management”:

1. More elective courses and more courses in English language should be provided to level with international programmes.
2. International mobility of PhD students and faculty should be expanded to increase exchanges with international academic community and publications in international journals.
3. Regular monthly meetings between supervisors and PhD students with discussions, research presentations and feedback should be institutionalized.
4. Programme length should be adjusted to the international average of 3 - 4 years. Currently, the programme is both narrow in coverage, and short in period length.

Recommendations for the study programme “Doctoral in Economics”:

1. The number of courses, their diversity and advanced level, and the number of courses taught in English should be increased.
2. International mobility of PhD students and faculty should be facilitated more to increase exchanges with international academic community and publications in international journals.

3. Regular monthly meetings between supervisors and PhD students with discussions, research presentations and feedback should be institutionalized.
4. Experts recommend introducing a journal publication requirement to qualify for PhD defense to secure high research quality and learning of publication procedure.

V Decisions of the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN

Based on the evaluation report of the expert group and the statement of the Higher Education Institution, the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN has made its decision on 25 September 2023.

General recommendations for all study programmes:

- The interaction between the central Internal Quality Assurance (SPMI) and faculty-level Quality Assurance Unit (UPM) should be outlined more clearly in the process descriptions of internal quality management.
- It should be outlined more clearly in the process descriptions of internal quality management how the quality circle is closed in the further development of the study programmes.
- Student commitment in the development of study programmes should be enhanced.
- Students should receive consistent feedback on evaluations of all surveys of internal quality assurance.
- The university should implement a system of key performance indicators that is aligned with the university's strategic goals.
- Module descriptions, together with total credits, entry requirements, credits required for passing the program, teaching form, any programme specification, year wise list of modules, methods of assessment (exam, assignment, group presentation etc.) should be provided.
- The documentation should be the same for each programme and the number of ECTS credits for each module and each programme should be clarified.
- For the sake of student mobility between programmes as well as international mobility, the lengths of bachelor, magister, and doctoral programmes should be aligned with international standards.
- The university should foster the development of more interdisciplinary modules and projects across faculties.
- The university should describe transferable skills for all programmes consistently with a focus on student employability.
- Transferable skills such as team building, leadership, persuasion, effective oral presentation, and report writing should be reflected in all curricula and be a regular part of the evaluation process.
- Project work and case studies should be enhanced in all curricula.
- The documentation of recognition and certification of student achievements should be improved by providing all documents in Indonesian and English language version, to ease international student mobility.
- The international collaboration with universities and companies in the ASEAN-region should be increased. Possibilities for a student exchange should be enhanced and the number of intakes and outgoings increased.
- The selection mechanisms and methods for securing the quality of practitioners with teaching obligations should be described in the recruitment process guidelines.
- English language proficiency among teaching as well as support staff should be enhanced to develop further international teaching competencies, and international (incoming and outgoing) student, faculty, and staff mobility.

- Financial support offers to students willing to go abroad should be improved. Opportunities to practice English language skills should be improved in formal (some courses in English) and informal ways (English café).
- Student support systems should also consider special needs and special life situations of students such as pregnancy, childcare, or care work in general.
- To address the needs of international incoming students, faculty, and staff the university should develop a privacy policy regarding the storage and use of personal data (including live tracking of persons' location) that is publicly available.
- Data collection should be conducted in a uniform manner for all programmes to enhance comparability and comprehensibility of the documentation.
- For an international recognition, the internet presence of the university should be enhanced both in structure and in content and English.
- The student should be given a module handbook based on the course description for the national accreditation at the beginning of their studies, that should also be publicly available on the website.
- The results of course evaluations should be made available in a suitable form to the students of the respective courses.
- Students should be represented in the Management Review Meeting (RTM).

General recommendations on PhD programmes:

- The number of courses in the PhD programmes is low and might need to be increased.
- The university needs to elevate its standard of research. There are two interrelated elements through which this can be obtained:
 - research resources:
 - The availability of access to secondary databases and journal articles should be increased,
 - Appropriate funding to help PhD students attend mainstream international conferences should be made available,
 - Incentives should be created for doctoral students/staff to publish in top tier journals,
 - International standards for measuring journal quality, e.g., Australian Business Deans Council (ABDC) and Chartered Association of Business School (CABS) should be adopted instead of the listing in Scopus.
 - research environment:
 - Faculty should seek collaboration and networking with renowned experts in the field,
 - Faculty should invite experts in the field to deliver research workshops on key topics such as research methods and how to publish.
- Provisions for governing doctoral programs should be increased, e.g., by formally structuring and rewarding the process of supervision.

- The university should make a short-term and medium-term strategy to implement these changes, including statistics on publication profile and research activities of doctoral students and staff to demonstrate how progress has been made following the accreditation assessment.

Bachelor in Law:

The study programme “Bachelor in Law” at the University of Bengkulu is accredited without any conditions.

The accreditation is valid until 30. September 2029.

The following recommendations are given for the further development of the study programme:

- Opening hours of study spaces and library buildings should be extended to alleviate problems with overcharged facilities.

Bachelor in Accounting:

The study programme “Bachelor in Accounting” at the University of Bengkulu is accredited without any conditions.

The accreditation is valid until 30. September 2029.

Bachelor in Management:

The study programme “Bachelor in Management” at the University of Bengkulu is accredited without any conditions.

The accreditation is valid until 30. September 2029.

Bachelor in Economics:

The study programme “Bachelor in Economics” at the University of Bengkulu is accredited without any conditions.

The accreditation is valid until 30. September 2029.

Magister in Law:

The study programme “Magister in Law” at the University of Bengkulu is accredited without any conditions.

The accreditation is valid until 30. September 2029.

The following recommendations are given for the further development of the study programme:

- Opening hours of study spaces and library buildings should be extended to alleviate problems with overcharged facilities.

Magister in Notarial Law:

The study programme “Magister in Notarial Law” at the University of Bengkulu is accredited without any conditions.

The accreditation is valid until 30. September 2029.

The following recommendations are given for the further development of the study programme:

- Opening hours of study spaces and library buildings should be extended to alleviate problems with overcharged facilities.

Magister in Accounting:

The study programme “Magister in Accounting” at the University of Bengkulu is accredited without any conditions.

The accreditation is valid until 30. September 2029.

Magister in Management:

The study programme “Magister in Management” at the University of Bengkulu is accredited without any conditions.

The accreditation is valid until 30. September 2029.

Magister in Applied Economics:

The study programme “Magister in Applied Economics” at the University of Bengkulu is accredited without any conditions.

The accreditation is valid until 30. September 2029.

Doctoral in Management:

The study programme “Doctoral in Management” at the University of Bengkulu is accredited without any conditions.

The accreditation is valid until 30. September 2029.

The following recommendations are given for the further development of the study programme:

- More elective courses and more courses in English language should be provided to level with international programmes.
- International mobility of PhD students and faculty should be expanded to increase exchanges with international academic community and publications in international journals.
- Regular monthly meetings between supervisors and PhD students with discussions, research presentations and feedback should be institutionalized.
- Programme length should be adjusted to the international average of 3 - 4 years. Currently, the programme is both narrow in coverage, and short in period length.

Doctoral in Economics:

The study programme “Doctoral in Economics” at the University of Bengkulu is accredited without any conditions.

The accreditation is valid until 30. September 2029.

The following recommendations are given for the further development of the study programme:

- The number of courses, their diversity and advanced level, and the number of courses taught in English should be increased.
- International mobility of PhD students and faculty should be facilitated more to increase exchanges with international academic community and publications in international journals.
- Regular monthly meetings between supervisors and PhD students with discussions, research presentations and feedback should be institutionalized.
- Experts recommend introducing a journal publication requirement to qualify for PhD defense to secure high research quality and learning of publication procedure.