

## **Accreditation Report**

**Kyrgyz National Agrarian University named K.I. Skryabin  
Republic of Kyrgyzstan**

**Agricultural Management (M.Sc.)**

### **I Procedure**

**Date of contract:** 19 January 2022

**Date of the submission of self-assessment report:** 2 August 2022

**Date of site visit:** 21 September 2022

**Attendance by ACQUIN office:** Dr. Jasmine Rudolph

**Accreditation decision:** 9 Mai 2023

#### **Peer review experts:**

- **Prof. Dr. Elena Kashtanova**, Anhalt University of Applied Sciences, Professor of International Trade in Agribusiness
- **FH-Prof. MMag. Dr. Michael Schmidthaler**, Upper Austria University of Applied Sciences, Professor and Head of study programme Agricultural Management and Innovations
- **Prof. Dr. Thore Toews**, Technical University Bingen, Professor for applied agricultural business management, agricultural accounting and taxation, taxation theory, agricultural business planning and controlling
- **Farhod Ahrorov**, PhD, Vice-Rector Samarkand branch of Tashkent State University of Economics (Uzbekistan)
- **Dr. Alen Mujcinovic**, Associate Professor, Faculty of Agriculture and Food Sciences University of Sarajevo Sarajevo (Bosnia and Herzegovina)
- **Professor Anargul Belgibayeva**, Sh. Ualikhanov Kokshetau University, Department of Business and Services
- **Marat Onaev**, Zhangir Khan University (Uralsk, Kazakhstan), Director of the Institute of Agrotechnology

Date of the publication: 9 June 2023

- **Rinat Fazylbekov**, Deputy Head, Department of technology innovation Kazakh Research Institute of Plant, Protection and Quarantine
- **Professor Dr. Aleksandra Mandych**, State Biotechnological University, (Kharkiv, Ukraine), Economics and Management of Enterprise
- **Professor Dr. Volodymyr Pysarenko**, Poltava State Agrarian University (Poltava, Ukraine), Head of marketing department
- **Professor Valentina Yakubiv**, Vasyl Stefanyk Precarpathian National University, Vice-Rector for Research, Department of Business Administration
- **Alina Magomedova**, PhD, Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv, Associate Professor, Department of Business Economics
- **Nurgaziev Mairambek**, PhD, Associate Professor, American University of Central Asia, Bishkek, Kyrgyzstan
- **Ulrich Pingel**, CEO, Agralis GmbH
- **Sandra Koop**, University Kiel, Student of Agricultural Sciences (M.Sc.)

The **Assessment Report** of the peer-review experts is **based on** the self-assessment report of the Higher Education Institution (HEI) and extensive discussions with the HEI management, deans and/or heads of the departments, heads of study programme(s), lecturers, staff representatives, students, and alumni.

The basis of the **Assessment Criteria** is part 1 of the “Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area” (ESG) in the current official version. At the same time the national context, particularly the national regulations regarding the establishment of study programmes, are taken into account.

**Content**

<b>I</b>	<b>Procedure</b> .....	1
<b>II</b>	<b>Introduction</b> .....	6
	1 Short profile of HEI .....	6
	2 General information on the study programme .....	9
<b>III</b>	<b>Implementation and assessment of the criteria</b> .....	11
	1 ESG Standard 1.1: Policy for quality assurance .....	11
	1.1 Implementation .....	11
	1.2 Assessment .....	12
	1.3 Conclusion .....	13
	2 ESG Standard 1.2: Design and approval of programmes .....	13
	2.1 Implementation .....	13
	2.2 Assessment .....	15
	2.3 Conclusion .....	17
	3 ESG Standard 1.3: Student-centred learning, teaching, and assessment .....	17
	3.1 Implementation .....	17
	3.2 Assessment .....	18
	3.3 Conclusion .....	19
	4 ESG Standard 1.4: Student admission, progression, recognition, and certification .....	20
	4.1 Implementation .....	20
	4.2 Assessment .....	21
	4.3 Conclusion .....	22
	5 ESG Standard 1.5: Teaching staff .....	22
	5.1 Implementation .....	22
	5.2 Assessment .....	23
	5.3 Conclusion .....	25
	6 ESG Standard 1.6: Learning resources and student support .....	25
	6.1 Implementation .....	25
	6.2 Assessment .....	28
	6.3 Conclusion .....	29
	7 ESG Standard 1.7: Information management .....	29
	7.1 Implementation .....	29
	7.2 Assessment .....	30
	7.3 Conclusion .....	31
	8 ESG Standard 1.8: Public information .....	31
	8.1 Implementation .....	31
	8.2 Assessment .....	32
	8.3 Conclusion .....	33
	9 ESG Standard 1.9: On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes .....	33
	9.1 Implementation .....	34

9.2	Assessment .....	35
9.3	Conclusion .....	37
10	ESG Standard 1.10: Cyclical external quality assurance .....	37
10.1	Implementation .....	37
10.2	Assessment .....	38
10.3	Conclusion .....	38
<b>IV</b>	<b>Recommendation to the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN</b> .....	39
1	Assessment of compliance the Standards and Guidelines in the Higher European Area (ESG) in the actual official version .....	39
2	Accreditation Recommendation .....	41
<b>V</b>	<b>Decisions of the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN</b> .....	42

## **II Introduction**

The experts would like to thank the representatives of the HEI as well as students that they have taken part in the discussions and willingly shared information and their views during the site visit. The discussions are valuable not only for the assessment of the institution, but also for a better understanding of the legal and sociocultural context of the local higher education system.

Evaluation basis for the peer-review experts is the self-assessment report of the HEI as well as intensive discussions during the site visit with the HEI management, deans and/or heads of the departments, heads of the study programme, study programme coordinators, teachers, lecturers, administrative staff, students, and graduates.

Main objective of the accreditation procedure is to assess the quality of the study programmes and compliance with the "Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area" (ESG). The ESG standards are applied as main assessment criteria in the international accreditation procedure.

In addition, the respective country-specific criteria and standards are taken into account.

A group of experts was set up, which ensured that all areas relevant to the accreditation procedure (e.g. legal, structural, social etc. aspects) as well as the ESG and national criteria were considered. The peer-review experts include professors, representatives of the professional practice and the student representative. A certificate with the ACQUIN seal is awarded upon accreditation of the study programme.

### **1 Short profile of HEI**

The Kyrgyz National Agrarian University named after K.I. Skryabin (KNAU) is one of the five major universities of the Kyrgyz Republic (KR).

During its 90-year history, the university has achieved many successes and received governmental awards, such as a Diploma of the Presidium of the Supreme Soviet of the Kyrgyz SSR (1973), a Diploma of the Presidium of the Supreme Soviet of the Union of Soviet Socialist Republics and the Order of the Badge of Honour (1983). Since 2009, the university has had the status of the main national university.

Today the university is the largest educational and scientific center of the country. It has trained more than 60,000 highly qualified specialists who work in various areas of the agricultural sector and other sectors of the national economy.

KNAU provides training of the scientific and pedagogical personnel of the highest and middle qualification for the local agrarian sector and at the same time continues to expand its agricultural research.

KNAU offers 23 bachelor's degree programs, 17 master's degree programs and the specialty "Veterinary". Around one thousand graduates graduate from the university every year. The main employers of our graduates are all structures of the Ministry of Agriculture, processing industry, cooperatives, farms and research institutes. During the last year, the employment rate of KNAU graduates averaged over 80%.

Currently, KNAU has 6 faculties (Faculty of Agronomy and Forestry, Engineering and Technical Faculty, Faculty of Hydro Melioration, Ecology and Land Management, Faculty of Veterinary Medicine and Biotechnology, Faculty of Technology and Processing of Agricultural Products, Faculty of Economics and Information Systems), 29 departments, 4 colleges (Technical and Economic College, Agricultural College, Tokmok Agricultural College, Bishkek Agroecological College named after S. Tursunov), school-lyceum, educational and experimental farm.

The university has 6 faculties and 29 departments. 5000 students are currently enrolled in the university. The teaching staff include 262 full-time teachers, including 34 professors, 111 associated professors and 117 lecturers.

KNAU, as the main national university, is the leading institution in the development of national curricula and all agricultural educational programs, as well as in coordinating teaching methodology and research in the agricultural sector.

The mission of KNAU is "Training of highly qualified specialists capable of solving the problems of food and biological security".

KNAU attaches great importance to the development of international cooperation with leading universities and research institutes around the world in the field of agricultural education, scholarships and exchange of students and teachers. Currently, KNAU has 141 active cooperation agreements with universities and research institutes of Commonwealth of Independent States countries (CIS), EU and other regions.

The Master's degree programme "Agricultural Management" was developed on the basis of cooperation between KNAU and the Weihenstephan-Triesdorf University of Applied Sciences (HSWT) with the support of the TEMPUS-TASIS JEP 25067 (2006-2009) project "Education and Training for the Agricultural Sector in Central Asia". Within the framework of this project, training seminars were held for KNAU lecturers and staff, some of these trained lecturers are now teaching in the master's study programme "Agricultural Management". In 2017-2019 within the framework of Erasmus+ project additionally 8 lecturers from KNAU have been able to improve their teaching modules.

The “Agricultural Management (M.Sc.)” is unique in its structure and practical orientation. Graduates receive Kyrgyz Master's Diploma as well as certificate of the HSWT.

From 2006 to 2021, the International Master Center of KNAU was engaged in the organization of the master's programme “Agricultural Management” and coordination of master's programmes. At present, the training of undergraduates in the direction 580200 “Management” is implemented at the Department of Management and Agro-Marketing of the Faculty of Economics and Management named after E.I.Arabayev, which has 13 employees: 1 PhD, 8 candidates of sciences and 3 senior lecturers.



## 2 General information on the study programme

Location	Kyrgyz National Agrarian University named K.I. Skryabin, Republic of Kyrgyzstan: "Agricultural Management" (M.Sc.)
Date of introduction	01.09.2007
Standard period of study (semesters)	4 semester, 2 years
Number of ECTS credits	120
Number of study places	10
Number of students currently enrolled	5 per semester, 10 per year
Average number of graduates per year	7
Form of study	Full-Time
Tuition fee	17500 Kyrgyz som per semester, 37 000 Kyrgyz som per year

The study programme "Agricultural Management" (M.Sc.) was examined and accredited by the ACQUIN for the first time in 2016 resulting in the following conditions:

- In order to ensure the standard of theses at Master's level, the university must draw up a handbook for students in which minimum requirements and standards for Master's theses are defined.

The conditions were fulfilled. The accreditation was issued by the 30. September 2021.

For further development of the study programme, the following recommendations were formulated:

- Training in the methods of scientific work should be strengthened.
- Students should be guided more strongly towards independent scientific work.
- To this end, lecture notes should be supplemented with more up-to-date literature and students should be encouraged to and students should be encouraged to conduct independent literature research.
- The module descriptions should be revised. The topicality of the literature references should be and competences should be checked to see whether they correspond to a master's level.
- The university should examine the possibility of offering forms of examination (e.g. portfolio examinations), which assess performance during the course of study.

- It is recommended that more use be made of the variety of possible forms of examination and that forms of examination be with regard to the qualification goals of the individual modules.
- The expert group recommends the expansion of personnel resources for the coordination of the study programme.

A temporary accreditation was issued for the proper implementation of the ACQUIN reaccreditation procedure. The application was approved and the temporary accreditation of the study programme was issued until 30. September 2023.

### III Implementation and assessment of the criteria

*The peer-review experts assess the quality of the study programme(s) and compliance with the ESG standards as well as with the national standards. The report must document the assessment of each study programme in the cluster, taking into account each criterion. Depending on the criterion, the assessment of criterion may be appropriate at the study programmes cluster level in order to avoid repetition and better describe general context.*

#### 1 ESG Standard 1.1: Policy for quality assurance

**Institutions should have a policy for quality assurance that is made public and forms part of their strategic management. Internal stakeholders should develop and implement this policy through appropriate structures and processes, while involving external stakeholders.**

##### 1.1 Implementation

The quality assurance policy of KNAU is based on the mission and vision of the university and is part of the strategic management of the university. It is implemented at all levels of the university. The Government of Kyrgyzstan has set an important national task for the university to ensure food and biological security, to develop and implement appropriate regulatory documentation, to create a specialized and technically complete infrastructure for the implementation of control functions.

The orientation of the mission and vision of the university development in the main areas of activity is consistent with the national priorities in terms of the transition of educational institutions to the University 4.0 model, as well as improving the system of training for the sectoral economy of the country. In order to meet these objectives, the university has adopted local regulations focused on the formation of the innovation belt of the university, increasing the number of start-up teams and projects in all areas of training. The task of working in such teams is formulated by the university's industrial partners, and the activities are coordinated by mentors from among employers and university employees. These activities are aimed at forming entrepreneurial competencies of students, which also correspond to the needs of the labour market and the objectives of building up farms and companies operating in various areas of the agro-industrial complex of Kyrgyzstan. The development strategy of KNAU is aimed at solving the main tasks of improving the quality of training profile specialists for various branches of agriculture and agribusiness.

In 2020, KNAU revised the main provisions of the KNAU Strategic Development Plan until 2025, which outlines the key areas of action to improve the education system, including a focus

on the development of distance learning: creating open online distance learning courses, including its own, for internal use and promotion of the KNAU brand, expanding the use of distance learning technologies in the implementation of educational programmes.

The documents defining the quality assurance policy are Regulations on the internal system of education quality assessment at KNAU, Regulations of KNAU Education Quality Council, Regulations on Education Quality Department, Regulations on the rating assessment of KNAU teaching staff activities, Regulations on questioning students and teaching staff, Regulations on the use of anti-plagiarism internet system, Regulations on KNAU GAC, Regulations on point-rating system of student knowledge assessment and Methodological guidelines on the development of teaching materials.

The Quality Assurance Policy aims at the active involvement of external stakeholders in quality assurance and at ensuring the link between research, teaching and learning, which is established through incorporating the results of research work of teachers and students in the educational process and involvement in the implementation of educational programmes of employees from other universities and specialized organisations.

Quality assurance of educational services at the university is realized through monitoring, reporting, analysis of results and taking measures to improve the efficiency of the university and is regulated by the documented procedure "Guidelines for monitoring and evaluating the quality of the educational process of the KNAU named after K.I. Skryabin".

The quality management system of education is coordinated by the Department of Education Quality, which in its activities is guided by normative-legal acts in the field of quality assurance, manages, and monitors the state of development, implementation and continuous improvement of the quality management system of the university.

## **1.2 Assessment**

Based on the university goals and strategic management, the quality assurance policy has been implemented appropriately in the field of research, teaching and learning. Hence, the quality assurance policy of Kyrgyz National Agrarian University named K.I. Skryabin meets the requirements of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Kyrgyz Republic. In addition, the successful results of previous years and promising goals for the future shows the satisfaction of internal and external stakeholders in terms of cooperation.

The analysis of the internal quality assurance of the programme has shown that the procedures for the development, approval, periodic review and monitoring of the Master's programme "Agricultural Management" (M.Sc.) are carried out in accordance with the study regulations, which indicates that the initiation, development, approval, monitoring, revision and termination of the Master's programme at the University are carried out transparently and in accordance with the

approved procedures, in line with the general objectives of the University's development strategy, as well as the students of education participate in the design and improvement of the Master's programme, the evaluation of its components and the quality of teaching.

The quality assurance system for the educational process consists of an internal quality assurance system (administration, department for quality assurance of education, pedagogical and methodological centre for the organisation of the educational process) and external quality assurance.

During the meeting with the representatives of the University it was noted and confirmed that the University has a clear quality culture that ensures systematic development of the educational programme. The University has an Education Quality Assurance Department, whose main purpose is to monitor educational activities and evaluate the data of academic activities in order to effectively manage the quality of the educational process.

During the accreditation process, it was noted that the results of external quality assurance of higher education are presented in detail on the University's website, especially the comments and suggestions made during previous accreditations on the official website of the University.

In the accreditation process, it is clear that employers are constantly involved in the process of periodic revision of the educational programme. The university has consultation and advisory bodies, as well as an expert council of employers and graduates.

### 1.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

## 2 ESG Standard 1.2: Design and approval of programmes

**Institutions should have processes for the design and approval of their programmes. The programmes should be designed so that they meet the objectives set for them, including the intended learning outcomes. The qualification resulting from a programme should be clearly specified and communicated, and refer to the correct level of the national qualifications framework for higher education and, consequently, to the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.**

### 2.1 Implementation

The curriculum of the master's programme "Agricultural Management" was developed in 2009 on the basis of the curriculum of the international master's programme "Agricultural Management" offered by HSWT, which was adapted to the national standards of Kyrgyzstan and approved by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Kyrgyz Republic.

According to the Kyrgyz national standard, curricula should consist of three components, namely: state, university and specialised components. All 18 subjects in the curriculum are

approved by the HSWT. The state component includes 9 subjects (history and methodology of management science, organisation of research activities, information resources and technologies in management, pedagogy and psychology in higher education, research methods in management, managerial economics, project management, organisation theory and organisational behavior, strategic analysis). The university and specialised component include 9 subjects (organisation of livestock production, organisation of crop production, professional foreign language, enterprise analysis and control, economics of production, agricultural policy, business management, enterprise planning, international agro-marketing strategies).

Procedures and stages of the development of the EP, including its approval and consistent implementation during the educational process strictly follow the requirements of the State Standard of HPE in the field of 580200 Management, approved by the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the KR in 2021.

The qualifications awarded as a result of the study programme correspond to the National Qualifications Framework and the Qualifications Framework of the European Higher Education Area. The qualifications and specialities to be awarded are compiled in accordance with the Resolution of the KR Government dated 23 August 2011 "On Establishing a Two-Tiered Structure of HPE in the KR".

The main educational programme is developed by the relevant department, considered at the meeting of the Academic Council of KNAU and approved by the Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs, taking into account current updates and changes and is annually updated in terms of disciplines (modules) established in the curriculum.

During the discussion of the EP the relevance and demand for this programme by employers as well as representatives of the academic community was determined. The content of each section of the programme strictly corresponds to the requirements of the State Educational Standard and defines the main directions of educational activities for master's degree training. The curriculum includes a general scientific cycle and a professional cycle and offers basic and elective parts. The content of the EP allows student to choose his/her individual educational trajectory by developing a list of elective disciplines.

Disciplines of the elective part are developed by the department with the participation of employers, taking into account modern requirements for the profile of "Agricultural Management". For each discipline approved by the department teaching materials with the definition of competence of a model graduate, working programs of disciplines, programs of practice and research work of students, the state final certification, as well as staff involved in the implementation are developed.

The main document for monitoring educational program is the "Methodology for Monitoring the Employment of Graduates of educational organisations of higher education of the KR", approved by the Ministry of Education and Science (MES) of the KR, dated 20 September 2016.

The educational program is approved by the Educational and Methodical Council of KNAU, is constantly monitored and periodically evaluated by the respective department, Educational and Methodical Commission of the Faculty and Quality Department, taking into account the recommendations and suggestions of students, teaching staff, employers, graduates and other interested parties.

The Department of Educational Quality conducts surveys, questionnaires among students, graduates, teaching staff, employers and other stakeholders.

Teaching in the study programme "Agricultural Management" is conducted as a full-time evening course from 17.00 to 20.00 and also alternatively on Saturdays from 9.00 to 17.00.

The main aim of the master's study programme "Agricultural Management" is to prepare students for work in the field of applied agricultural management. Students are required to have basic education in agricultural sciences or economics (bachelor's degree or similar) to be admitted to this program. Students learn practical methods of operational, organizational and economic analysis and management, and use this knowledge in professional practice in agricultural or agriculturally related organizations, particularly in production planning, human resources management, agro-marketing and logistics. In addition to working in agricultural management and agricultural enterprises, graduates of this profession can find work in scientific and applied research, in international projects and teaching at universities. Graduates of "Agricultural Management" work in key positions at GIZ, at the Ministry of Agriculture, consulting organizations "TES - Center", AGROLEAD, NGO "CAMP Ala-Too", Public Association "Agency of Development Initiatives", in some international projects of FAO, UNDP, JICA and in foreign companies and enterprises in the field of agribusiness.

## **2.2 Assessment**

According to the Kyrgyz national standard, the curriculum of the Master's program "Agricultural Management" (M.Sc.) has been successfully adapted to the national standard of Kyrgyzstan since 2009 and approved by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Kyrgyz Republic. Hence, in the specialization component, all 18 subjects of the curriculum are approved by HSWT. Currently, all components of the curriculum have been successfully implemented in the practice in terms of education, research and employment. In addition, the current local and global agricultural production system shows the relevance and necessity of this curriculum, as well as the fact that it corresponds to the goals of the Kyrgyz government and national strategies.

The study programme is in line with the University's mission and vision, as well as with the goals of the 2020-2024 strategic plan, particularly with the first 3 objectives of education, research and management.

The content of the educational program has a clear structure; the educational components included in the educational program make up a logical interconnected system and collectively allow the achievement of stated goals and program learning outcomes.

The content of the educational programme corresponds to the subject area of the subject area "Management" of the Master's level of the university. In particular, the ability to solve complex tasks, which fully corresponds to the standard of higher education in the field of knowledge "Management and Administration", is the integral feature of the educational programme. The structure of the educational program provides an opportunity for the formation of an individual educational trajectory, in particular through the individual choice of academic disciplines by students of higher education to the extent provided by legislation.

The educational program and curriculum provide for the practical training of higher education students, which allows them to acquire the competencies necessary for further professional activity.

The scope of the educational program and individual educational components (in credits of the European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System) realistically reflects the actual workload of applicants, is appropriate for achieving the goals and programmatic results of education.

The right to freely choose educational components and form an individual trajectory is provided for by the educational program and regulated by relevant regulatory acts. Students studying in the educational program can individually choose the bases of practice and the topic of the master's thesis. The educational program provides practical training and allows you to acquire the competencies necessary for further professional activity.

Students' English language skills should be improved. Higher entrance requirements should be created with regard to English skills or students should be offered compulsory language courses to improve their English language skills.

Within the framework of the further development of the curriculum, current topics such as big data and digitalisation should be given greater consideration.

The university should improve recruitment processes by referring to the advantages of the program curriculum and employment opportunities. More over the university should improve the quality of teaching based on the independent and anonymous evaluations of the students and stakeholders. Even so the university should collaborate and work closely with alumni and stakeholders to continuously improve the program.



## 2.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

## 3 ESG Standard 1.3: Student-centred learning, teaching, and assessment

**Institutions should ensure that the programmes are delivered in a way that encourages students to take an active role in creating the learning process, and that the assessment of students reflects this approach**

### 3.1 Implementation

The educational activity of the university is aimed at the implementation of student-centred learning and to take into account needs of various students including persons with disabilities, orphans, students left without parental care, students whose parents have participated in military conflicts etc.. Such students have an opportunity to receive benefits for admission and discounts on payment of the fees. In this context, flexible learning pathways are provided for students, opportunities for learning in different forms, opportunities to use different learning methods, and the availability of feedback used to assess learning environment.

In the structure of the basic educational programme an educational and methodological guide has been developed, which informs about the list of questions, evaluation system, distribution of points in assessment of students' knowledge. In the approved schedule of the educational process 2 modules are planned, at the end of which a boundary control is carried out (in the form of computer testing, calculations, written answers, etc.). The results of the boundary control by each teacher are entered in the electronic sheet through a personal account on the educational portal of the university.

The information system "AVN" systematizes the detailed information about the educational activity of the university, including the information about the possibilities of forming individual educational trajectories for the students. The flexibility of the educational trajectory is ensured by the presence of several profiles within the educational areas and the students' freedom of choice of elective disciplines, visiting language courses (English, German), driving courses, circles, sports sections.

Teachers use interactive teaching methods such as role-playing games, case studies, presentation and video materials of training courses using multimedia projectors and electronic textbooks. Teachers widely use practice-oriented classes where master's students go on practical exercises to the production bases, with which the faculty has agreements on cooperation, as well as to the educational and experimental farm of the university.

To encourage independent work of the students, the 50% of the total number of credits of each discipline is allocated for an independent work. Types of students' independent work, their

workload in hours, forms and terms of control are regulated in the relevant sections of the syllabus for each discipline. KNAU uses a point system of assessment, which allows the teacher to be more flexible in determining the level of students' achievements, for example, a student can gain extra points for an independent work, participation in project and group work. The criteria and mechanism for assessing the learners' knowledge are publicly available on the university website. The procedure and forms of competence assessment are regulated by the Regulation on Grading and Rating System (GRS) of Student Learning.

General monitoring of the academic achievements of students is carried out by means of knowledge control. According to the approved schedules in one semester two current controls and midterm (session) are carried out. The results of current and midterm are discussed and approved by the department. To monitor academic progress the information system AVN is applied, which allows structural divisions of university and students themselves to carry out their own analysis of achievements by results of the current, midterm attestations and examination sessions at the end of each semester. Each teacher and student have his/her own personal account, which has all the necessary data for obtaining information on the study of the discipline and other information related to the educational process.

The assessment is carried out by several examiners: a lecturer and an assistant on a 100-point scale, and justifying circumstances (difficult life situations, illness, etc.) are taken into account.

If a student does not agree with the assessment procedure or the assessment received, the local regulations of the university provide for a formal appeal procedure.

After the end of each examination sessions, the university conducts an anonymous survey of students "Teacher in the eyes of students". Based on the results of questionnaires and appeals, the university administration determines the topics and conducts necessary training and information courses for teachers.

The Department of Quality at the university periodically conducts an anonymous survey of students on the satisfaction of educational activities and the presence of corruption. The university has a so called "Trust Box". Students can directly address the Rector with their suggestions and comments for improving the educational process, social issues, relations with the teaching staff, etc. on the website of the university.

### **3.2 Assessment**

Overall, it can be stated that the teaching methods used promote student-centred learning and are sufficiently diverse. The teaching and learning forms are therefore rated as very good by the evaluators. The students provide information about a very good supervision relationship with the teaching staff. The students are very satisfied with the supervision and emphasised

the excellent support and accessibility of the teaching staff. The study advisors advise students on the choice of study programme and the creation of an individual study plan.

Students are continuously supported by the teaching staff in preparing for exams. The examination regulations are also transparent.

All documents relevant to the study programme are available in the university information system.

All information on the study programme is complete and transparent. Interactive teaching methods encourage students to take an active role in the learning process.

Students receive questionnaires to evaluate their courses and the overall learning experience. Discussing the feedback from these surveys with students can be an additional valuable tool in the student-centred quality process. Students can use office hours and the various electronic communication tools to submit complaints or suggestions for improvement.

Students also have various options available for complaints about assessment.

Students are assessed through various methods, e.g. written and oral examinations, presentations and written assignments. The assessment corresponds to the intended learning outcomes. The assessment procedure and regulations are clear to students and are published at the beginning of each course.

Quality control of study preparation takes place throughout the study period and consists of sufficient different control measures:

The University provides equal opportunities for students in all fields of study, regardless of gender, nationality, religion and social status, language and mode of instruction, as well as taking into account special educational needs and individual opportunities to design an individual educational programme aimed at developing the student's professional competence and cognitive activity.

Thus, the documents and materials provided by the university indicate that the university has developed an effective system of knowledge control. It can be concluded that the university applies the principle of student-centred learning, which aims at the personal development of students and ensures equal opportunities for all groups of students.

### **3.3 Conclusion**

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

#### 4 ESG Standard 1.4: Student admission, progression, recognition, and certification

**Institutions should consistently apply pre-defined and published regulations covering all phases of the student “life cycle”, e.g. student admission, progression, recognition and certification.**

##### 4.1 Implementation

Admission to KNAU undergraduate and graduate programmes is carried out in accordance with the Law of Kyrgyzstan "On Education", "Admission Regulations at the KNAU named after K.I. Skryabin", approved by the order of the rector, agreed with the MES KR, as well as the requirements of the State Education Standard, regulations on tests and examinations and regulations on appeals. The composition of the Admissions Committee is approved by the order of the Rector. The responsible secretary of the Admission Commission of the university is approved by the Ministry of Education and Science of Kyrgyzstan.

Student recruitment measures are carried out systematically throughout the academic year according to the plan through the media (participation of teaching staff in various TV programmes), periodicals, organisation of excursions to the university, open classes and master classes, guest lectures of teaching staff of the university.

Admissions information material is available on the university's website. Admission to the master's programme is based on the results of computer testing and examination. After the enrolment students receive student ID, record book and authorized access (login and password) to the educational platform of the university.

The study process at the university is based on credit system. To graduate students must reach 120 ECTS points. The workload of the study program is split into general science cycle (24 ECTS points), professional cycle (46 ECTS points), practice and research work (30 ECTS points) and final state attestation (20 ECTS points).

A student who has fully complied with the requirements of the curriculum of the respective course, collected the required number of credits and if applicable, paid the fees is transferred to the next course. Transfer from one course to another is regulated by the decision of the commission on the transfer and expulsion of undergraduates in accordance with the Regulations on the order of transfer, expulsion and reinstatement of students of KNAU.

Regarding its compliance with the Lisbon Recognition Convention, the university does not tolerate any discrimination on any grounds, ensures openness, consistency and reliability of procedures and criteria used in the assessment and recognition of qualifications, provides all required information, consultation, etc. upon request.

The university has developed a mechanism for the recognition of academic mobility of students, the internal documents of the university allow recognition of previous learning outcomes

and qualifications. The main documents are Regulations on the recognition of learning outcomes at KNAU for students studying at foreign universities, Regulations on academic mobility of students, lecturers, postgraduate students and researchers and Regulation on the Procedure for the Production, Storage, Issue and Record-Keeping of National and European Education Documents (Diploma Supplement)

In accordance with the main educational program a student who has fully mastered all disciplines of the curriculum "Agricultural Management", passed all necessary practices and received positive evaluations, is allowed to the final state certification by the order of the rector. The university is responsible for state examinations and defense of master's thesis. The rector issues an order on successful completion of studies and a state is issued. Upon request a transcript of the European Diploma Supplement can be obtained.

Students can additionally attend courses for drivers, tractor drivers, foreign languages (English and German), computer programming, 1C accounting and receive certificates, etc.

The progress of students is determined by the results of a comparative analysis of examination sessions, assessments of the practices, final certification of students, which reflects the level of performance (%) and the average scores in disciplines and courses. The results of the progress of students in the disciplines are reflected in the examination reports, graduates - in the transcript, which shows a list of courses taken, the number of credits received, hours of classes, grades in the disciplines.

#### **4.2 Assessment**

The study requirements are clearly defined and can also be viewed by applicants across parents on the university's website. The website in question is easy to find and very clearly laid out. The university has a suitable procedure for recording relevant information on the course of studies and taking action if necessary. The review panel assesses the admission procedure as transparently described and well thought-out. At the beginning of their studies, students are sufficiently informed about the course of their studies and all opportunities to participate in university life. Upon completion of their studies, graduates therefore receive meaningful and transparent documents showing the qualifications and learning outcomes acquired. In addition, the university has sufficient procedures in place to collect information on students' progress.

Admission requirements are clearly defined. Admission in relation to the need for teachers ensures that there is no oversupply of trained teachers. In addition to the regular admission procedure, the university supports disabled students and students from national minorities.

The university monitors the development of students during their studies. An important element of student success is the sharing of information about the structure of the study programme,

prerequisites for course selection, course objectives, course assignments, examinations, workload, etc. In the department, a compulsory introductory course is offered to all students, which introduces them to all the above-mentioned areas. In addition, students receive information from various counselling services throughout their stay at the university.

The degree certificates issued by the university enable students to either continue their education at institutions outside the country or to pursue a professional career abroad.

Overall, it can be said that the university has transparent enrolment procedures, records and monitors the development of students and issues sufficiently meaningful graduation certificates that demonstrate the qualifications acquired in the programme.

### 4.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

## 5 ESG Standard 1.5: Teaching staff

**Institutions should assure themselves of the competence of their teachers. They should apply fair and transparent processes for the recruitment and development of the staff**

### 5.1 Implementation

KNAU's human resources policy aims to ensure appropriate quality of the educational process. Recruitment, promotion, dismissal and acquaintance of personnel with the rights and duties is carried out by the "Personnel Services" department. The department is guided by the Regulation on the order of substitution of positions of the teaching staff of KNAU named after K.I. Skryabin.

Main criteria when recruiting teachers is the applicant's basic education and practical work experience.

All teachers carry out scientific and applied research on issues of agribusiness, agricultural science, actively participate in international scientific conferences and educational projects, such as Erasmus +, PAWER, DERECA, AgroDev, LOGO, DAAD, FAO, JICA, in TI-CA project (Turkey), projects of MOI KR, etc.

The university operates a system of rating of departments and point-rating system for evaluating the performance of teaching staff. The rating takes into account teaching, teaching-methodical, organizational-methodical, research and educational aspects with their ranking on the importance and labor intensity of implementation. Taking these aspects as well as the results of a survey of colleagues and students into account, teachers receive honorary awards of the university, ministries and departments.

All teachers at KNAU, including those of the “Agricultural Management” programme, regularly develop their professional competencies and research skills. During the period 2017-2021 within the framework of Erasmus+ project, eight teachers have developed further their qualifications in the main training modules of the “Agricultural Management” programme. Within the framework of JICA project two teachers were trained in Japan on the topic "Strengthening the role and functions of farmers' organizations in Central Asian countries". Through DAAD program three teachers of KNAU passed a 3-month research fellowship at the University of Applied Sciences Rhein Waal (Germany). Within the framework of the World Bank project, FAO teachers and master students of the programme “Agricultural Management” participated in thematic and applied research on food security and development of agribusiness and green economy.

In the educational process teachers widely use innovative teaching methods and advanced learning technologies including information technologies: online lectures are conducted on the ZOOM platform, presentations in MS Office PowerPoint are developed for training sessions, interactive surveys in Google-forms are used. In order to improve the quality of the educational process, educational and methodological materials (course-ware, assignments, methodological guidelines, etc.) are placed in the personal accounts of students, WhatsApp chats are used.

In addition to participation in educational and scientific work (publication of educational and scientific literature, publication of articles, seminars, trainings, etc.), teachers of the programme participated in vocational guidance work, in various sports and cultural events.

The university has high academic level of the teaching staff (about 76.9% of teachers have doctoral and PhD degrees). Since 2008, the DAAD long-term lecturers have been teaching in the study program “Agricultural Management” in order to further develop the quality of teaching of the master's programme. Currently, 13 full-time employees are teaching in the master's programme “Agricultural Management”, including 10 PhDs and 3 senior lecturers.

## **5.2 Assessment**

In general, according to the KNAU's self-assessment report, the positive trends in education, research and training shows the effectiveness of KNAU's human resources policy. Also, bilateral and multilateral active cooperation with internal and external partners indicates that KNAU has been achieving good results in the field of education, research and professional training of teaching staff.

However, despite the above-mentioned positive trends, the KNAU's human resources policy should continue to increase the transparency of recruitment of the teaching staff and develop new training methods, technologies and their implementation.

The academic and professional qualifications of the teachers involved in the implementation of the educational program ensure the achievement of the goals and program learning outcomes defined by the respective program.

Procedures for the competitive selection of teachers are transparent and allow to ensure the necessary level of their professionalism for the successful implementation of the educational program.

The procedure of competitive selection for the positions of scientific and pedagogical workers at the University is regulated by the relevant Regulations and determines the main requirements and procedures of competitive selection.

The announcement of the competition is posted on the University's website in accordance with the legislation. When evaluating candidates during the competitive selection of teachers, academic and professional qualifications are taken into account in accordance with the goals of the educational program and professional activity. The level of proficiency in the state language, foreign languages, the presence of an academic title, a scientific degree in the specialty of teaching disciplines is taken into account; availability of scientific publications, including in Scopus, WoS, textbooks, manuals, methodological developments, participation in international projects, internships, experience of teaching and practical work, participation in grant projects and research topics, etc.

The institution of higher education promotes the professional development of teachers through its own programs or in cooperation with other organizations.

The university, together with its partners, provides various forms of professional development of teachers.

Teachers improve their professional qualifications and teaching skills mostly through participation in projects, internships, trainings, etc.

The institution of higher education attracts practicing professionals, industry experts, and representatives of employers to classroom classes.

All teachers of the program improve their professional qualifications on an ongoing basis in the areas of the disciplines they teach. Teachers undergo internships, courses to improve pedagogical skills. The best practices are the academic mobility of teachers, both international and national, to participate in conferences, forums, and seminars. Active academic and professional activity contributes to the internationalization of the educational program and the University. The competitive selection procedure is transparent, takes into account teachers' professionalism, experience, and pedagogical skills.



Professional teaching is assured. Applicant selection and staff development are clearly regulated and meet all standards. There is no doubt about the academic qualifications of the teaching staff. The numerical ratio of teachers to students is very good, which is also appreciated by the students. In the discussions with lecturers and students, the impression was confirmed that the staff is very good, both quantitatively and qualitatively. The students confirmed very good supervision by the lecturers. All lecturers are very well qualified. They describe the situation in class and the contact with the lecturers as extremely pleasant and motivating. Yet, the English language skills of teaching and administrative staff should be improved and corresponding further training courses implemented.

The same standards and uniform application procedures for teaching staff should be prevailed at all partner universities.

Professional practice representatives should be consulted in an institutionalised way in curriculum development.

However, despite the above-mentioned positive trends, the KNAU's human resources policy should continue to increase the transparency of recruitment of the teaching staff and develop new training methods, technologies and their implementation.

### 5.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

## 6 ESG Standard 1.6: Learning resources and student support

**Institutions should have appropriate funding for learning and teaching activities and ensure that adequate and readily accessible learning resources and student support are provided.**

### 6.1 Implementation

The university has sufficient modern material and technical, library and information base, corresponding to the mission, goals and objectives of the Plan of strategic development of KNAU, as well as the requirements of sanitary norms and fire safety, state compulsory standards of the specialties and provides student-centred approach to learning.

The accessibility of educational resources and support systems for students at the university is ensured by the appropriate infrastructure and material-technical base.

Supporting and counselling of students is offered by the programme manager and supervisors. Teachers provide individual consultations.

On the territory of the university there is access to the Internet at the speed of 100 Mbit/s, 80 Mbit/s, 60 Mbit/s with unlimited volume of traffic. The university dormitories are provided with

a local area network, there are Wi-Fi zones on the territory. At the moment there are about 80 wireless Wi-Fi access points in the academic buildings and student dormitories

All written research papers are checked for "Anti-plagiarism" by StrikePlagiarism.com before publication, which increases the performance of master theses, and raises the perception of academic integrity of the teaching staff and students;

KNAU has teaching and experimental facilities including 20 specialised laboratories.

The university scientific library is a modern educational and research centre, with a book fund of 633782 copies, the educational - 400500, scientific literature and methodical aids - 221082, medical - 1200, literature in English and German on agricultural science - 1000. Library subscribes to 5 newspapers ("Kutbilim", "Kyrgyz Tuusu", "Erkin Too", "Vecherniy Bishkek", "Slovo in Kyrgyzstan") and 4 magazines ("Normative acts of KR", "Veterinary", "Dairy and meat cattle", "Land management and cadastre"). The electronic library collection includes 3984 copies. The digital library maintains cooperation with such electronic library systems as Lan, Elibrary, Virtual Scientific Library. The library has book exchanges with educational institutions and scientific organizations of the CIS countries.

The Department of Scientometrics analysis and editing has been established at KNAU in order to improve the quality of articles in accordance with international requirements.

Educational buildings are provided with material and technical conditions that provide the possibility of unhindered access of persons with disabilities: the porch is equipped with a ramp; the doorways of academic buildings provide access to the premises for people with low mobility, the provision of volunteer students or university staff as assistants (assistants) to provide technical assistance to students with disabilities and persons with disabilities. The system of social support for students at KNAU provides for the provision of benefits on contract fees for orphans and disabled people of group 1-2.

Two classrooms assigned to the study programme "Agricultural Management" are equipped with modern computers and equipment with access to the Internet, multimedia projectors, air conditioning, blackboard, pin board and flip-chart. These classrooms are also available for master students on weekdays in their spare time.

The university guarantees non-discrimination based on gender, nationality, language and religion through equal access to educational resources. The university respects ethnic and religious diversity of students and provides them with free time on the occasion of important national or religious holidays of the country of origin. The management of the KNAU enables students to report or make claims to the management on any cases of violation of their rights through all available means of communication.

Coordination of the international master's program "Agricultural Management" is the responsibility of the Center for International Educational Programs (CIEP) KNAU. CIEP provides methodological and organizational assistance to potential candidates for admission to the practical semester of a master's programme "Agricultural Management" in HSWT. The Center provides informational and consultative support to teachers of KNAU for participation in training seminars in Germany, organizes such seminars and participates in the training of students.

As a responsible for other joint educational programs, the Centre coordinates the development of joint curricula, teaching and assessment methods of students, mutual recognition of learning outcomes at partner universities, the existence of common management structures for joint programmes, as well as the issuing of a double diploma or certificate.

The university has 141 agreements with universities of near and far abroad countries on programmes of academic mobility of teaching staff and students. Information about external and internal academic mobility programmes is posted on the website of KNAU, in official groups in social networks, particularly Instagram page of the International Relations Department. The International Relations Department presents information on academic mobility programmes and organizes meetings with representatives of LOGO e.V., Erasmus+, Bixter Training, etc..

Academic mobility of students is regulated by the Regulations of KNAU on academic mobility. The decision on the re-crediting of mastered disciplines studied on mobility is taken by the heads of the study program and is recorded on the transcript. The main documents for credit transfer are: transcript, point-rating system of learning and collection of normative documents on the application of ECTS.

During the period from 2017 to 2021 a total of 229 students of KNAU trained and completed internships in foreign universities and organizations. 23 students have completed pre-master's internship at HSWT and ten of them were admitted to the study.

Within the framework of academic mobility under the ERASMUS+ project - 3 Master students studied in the second theoretical semester at HSWT in 2018 - 2019, their learning outcomes were recognised by grades in transcripts, and they successfully completed their studies at KNAU.

Within the framework of the DAAD academic mobility of teachers for the "Agricultural Management" Master's students several professors from Germany conducted lectures and seminars at KNAU.

Within the framework of academic mobility offered by the LOGO e.V. programme, KNAU students with a good level of German can undertake agricultural internship in Germany, acquire practical skills, and advanced knowledge of the German language. In the 4th year, they can be admitted to a practical semester at HSWT.

Within the framework of regional academic mobility offered by Kazakh National Agrarian University every year Master students of “Agricultural Management” program participate in summer, winter schools on "Green Economy", receive certificates and publish their articles.

## 6.2 Assessment

The ratio between the number of students and the teaching materials and spaces is appropriate. Libraries and classrooms are well digitised and it should be mentioned which has a positive effect on the development process of student-centred learning. Therefore, the premises and equipment are adequate to support the effective implementation of the programme objectives and learning success in all respects.

From the meeting with the student council and the self-evaluation report, it can be concluded that the information provided to the students about the service facilities of the university is very good.

The resource facilities of the study programme can be described as very good. The modern and excellent equipment, which corresponds to the subject standards, is suitable for providing students with a sound education. In the opinion of the review panel, the overall resource endowment is thus very well suited for the implementation of the degree programme. Buildings, rooms and technical equipment can be described as exemplary. The library offers students extensive support in searching for information and using the available technology. The university is also well equipped for digital teaching.

The needs of a heterogeneous student body are also adequately addressed. Internal quality assurance takes material resources into account in its evaluation culture and regularly solicits feedback from students. The evaluation team assesses all material, financial and human resources as fully sufficient to achieve the qualification goals of the study programme. The needs of a heterogeneous student body are taken into account in every respect.

For the administrative staff, there is the possibility of individual further development. The scope and qualifications of the non-academic administrative staff can be described as very good. Sufficient opportunities for further training are available.

It can be stated that the degree programme has a high degree of studyability. Yet, the University of Applied Science Weihenstephan-Triesdorf should establish a good administrative infrastructure for all partner universities and create even more support services in general and during student mobility phases with a view to even better studyability.

In order to guarantee the implementation of the study programme, the staff should also grow with the increasing number of students.

### 6.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

## 7 ESG Standard 1.7: Information management

**Institutions should ensure that they collect, analyse and use relevant information for the effective management of their programmes and other activities.**

### 7.1 Implementation

KNAU effectively applies modern information and communication technologies and software tools in the process of collecting, analysing and managing information. The university systematises and analyses all information related to the implementation of the main educational programme. For example, the data on the student population, level of progress, student achievements and drop-out rates are analysed annually.

All students and staff are involved in the process of information management. Student satisfaction with the implementation of the basic educational programme and the quality of education is determined by conducting a survey among students and graduates. The management of the HEI analyses the results of the survey and takes into consideration the suggestions of students. Meetings with teachers are held regularly to inform about the development plans of the university and other important management issues. The results and suggestions are analysed, reported to the management and corrective actions are taken.

For comprehensive automation of educational processes the information system "AVN", educational portal, electronic document management system "AiDoc", electronic library with electronic library systems "Lan", "Elibrary", "Virtual scientific library", accounting software 1C Accounting and Polaris are used.

The following programmes are used to organise video conferences and online training: Zoom, Google Meet, BigBlueButton.

Information on the learning portal is available to teaching staff and students only after entering an individual login and password. Personal account is used by the students to get acquainted with the individual study plan, view the schedule of training sessions, access training materials, etc. Teachers can control the attendance and progress of students using the software. Through the use of AVN IS, the automatic rating of academic achievements of each student is displayed. All educational-methodical (syllabus) materials are handed over for personal use to the student.

The analysis of the level of graduates' employment in "Agricultural Management" showed that KNAU graduates are in high demand on the labour market and for the last 5 years (2016-2021) average employment rate of the graduates was 85.4%.

The university in order to support students and graduates in finding a job, annually organizes round tables, job fairs with the invitation of potential employers and invites successful graduates, who share the experience of career development. Annually, students are surveyed at the beginning and end of their studies regarding their expectations and the achievement of their learning objectives.

All general sections of the university's official website are freely accessible, and information is available in Kyrgyz, Russian and English languages. There is a version of the website for visually impaired. Information on the activities of the university during the academic year is highlighted in the section "News"; on the home page there are Sections: "Applicants", "Students", "Graduates", where everyone can find the information they are interested in; also in the "Educational Units" section there is a link to the individual pages of the faculties, institutes and colleges. The website has a separate feedback platform for complaints, appeals and further information. Information is also collected through social media and messengers.

## **7.2 Assessment**

The university has a well-functioning information management system. The administration has thorough data collection systems. The current and complete data structure is used very well for the internal quality management system. The evaluation of the data is accompanied by quality assurance measures and planning of follow-up activities.

The programme uses the existing infrastructure of the university to collect student feedback on individual courses and lectures as well as on the environment at the university in general. Students report that they feel encouraged to give feedback to lecturers and that their feedback is well received by lecturers. A survey of student satisfaction with the quality and conditions of the study programme is conducted annually to investigate student opinion on the quality of the University's educational and administrative services.

For the programme that is in the process of being accredited, there is sufficient information to attract applicants.

The university has the necessary procedures for collecting and analysing information about the programme, including key performance indicators, information about the student body, the level of academic achievement, student performance and examinations. Students are provided with educational resources and student support services.

The expert group therefore notes that the university regularly collects and analyses information on the study programme, students, graduates and other activities as part of the quality management system and makes it available to the internal quality assurance system.

Both students and teachers are involved in the processes through a procedure and existing structures at the university. In addition, graduates and employers are also involved in the process.

Thus, as part of the university's quality management, data on students is collected and their assessment is carried out. Also based on the self-evaluation report of the university and the discussions during the online evaluation, the expert group was able to confirm that the institution implements the necessary measures to assess the quality of teaching.

Information management includes the use of various methods to provide information. Confidentiality of information is also guaranteed.

### 7.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

## 8 ESG Standard 1.8: Public information

<b>Institutions should publish information about their activities, including programmes, which is clear, accurate, objective, up-to date and readily accessible.</b>
--

### 8.1 Implementation

KNAU systematically informs the public and all interested parties about the programmes implemented and the expected learning outcomes of these programmes, the qualifications awarded, forms of study, teaching, learning and assessment procedures etc..

Informing the public about the activities of the university is carried out through the official website of the university, as well as through the website of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Kyrgyz Republic. In addition, the university has its official accounts in almost all popular social networks: Facebook /, telegram-, Instagram-, YouTube -, where necessary information is published. The website of KNAU contains information on licenses and accreditation, where there is information on program accreditations and information on positions in the national ranking by year.

The university regularly publishes quantitative and qualitative information on the implementation of the university's mission, achievements and plans for university development, programmes being implemented, activities of student support services, participation in international programmes and projects, achievements of graduates, as well as on foreign and international scientific societies and associations, using mass media, covering through newspapers

such as "Kut Bilim", "Erkin-Too", "Kyrgyz Tuusu", "Vecherniy Bishkek", "Slovo Kyrgyzstana", "Fabula", "De-Fak". The University publishes its own scientific journal "Vestnik KNAU" to provide information about the results of research activities of scientists, undergraduates, students and teachers. KNAU holds international and scientific-practical conferences, seminars, trainings of the teaching staff and students, annual meetings with graduates.

To spread the objective and reliable information about the educational programmes of the university the promotional booklets, posters, presentation videos and brochures about the programmes and educational opportunities available at KNAU, the Open Doors Day, career guidance and meetings with the managers of industrial enterprises and rural education departments are held, and the WhatsApp groups of principals, class masters and students from all the regions are actively used.

Public information on cooperation and interaction with partners within the study program including academic/consulting organisations, business partners, social partners and educational organisations is described on the university website. The university cooperates closely with local universities, research institutes, the National Academy of Sciences of the KR, the Ministry of Agricultural and Mineral Resources of the KR, Kumtor, etc. KNAU educational programs annually participate in the national ranking of HEIs conducted by NAAR (Kazakhstan).

## **8.2 Assessment**

The main source of public information about the study program "Agricultural Management" (M.Sc.) is the official website of the university, the website of the Faculty of Agricultural Economics, the website of the Faculty of Agrobusiness and Management, and website of the Master's Center which is the graduation department for this study program.

All persons interested in receiving information about events at the university and, in particular, information updates on program have informational support through close communication using various social networks: Facebook, Instagram. The Master's Preparing Center additionally highlights all information related to the program on its official Facebook page. Considerable attention is paid to the coverage of all events related to the organization of the educational process, the life of students and graduates. The university has its own YouTube channel, where all scientific and educational events of the university are covered and students upload videos. Students can find here the information about the history of successful partnership, advantages of studying the master's program etc.

The university offers detailed information on studying and teaching as well as on the university's main research areas. Organisational documents and relevant regulations are made available on the website. Contact persons and contact points for the degree programme and student life are clearly and transparently named.



The information provided to the public about the degree programme is satisfactory overall. There are many opportunities for prospective students to find out about the university and student life.

Information about study programmes is publicly available (admission criteria, learning outcomes, qualifications awarded, information about employment of graduates, etc.). Information about the study programme that is in line with the university's mission is secured. High school graduates, students, graduates and other interested groups can find out about the university's activities and offers on its homepage. In addition, contact persons are named for further information and questions. Yet there should be better strategic communication activities developed to publicise the study offer in order to arouse the interest of potential applicants in the long term.

The university provides information about its activities, such as the degree programme and the selection criteria for admission, the intended learning outcomes of the degree programmes, the teaching, learning and examination methods, the student success rates and the qualifications of the teaching staff.

In addition, the university provides information on its homepage about its academic achievements, such as publications, external and internal conferences and events, as well as non-academic achievements, such as cultural and social projects and activities.

The study-related documents and information are to be accessible to both students and prospective students. In addition, contact persons are named for further information and questions.

The university provides information about its activities. The University conducts its activities based on the principles of transparency, openness, involvement and awareness-raising of all stakeholders in educational activities: One of the main means of providing information is through the use of information technology and media. In addition to the information on the University's website, the public and applicants are provided with information on the specifics of the study programme under accreditation through events such as the Open Day.

### **8.3 Conclusion**

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

## **9 ESG Standard 1.9: On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes**

**Institutions should monitor and periodically review their programmes to ensure that they achieve the objectives set for them and respond to the needs of students and society. These reviews should lead to continuous improvement of the programme. Any action planned or taken as a result should be communicated to all those concerned.**

## 9.1 Implementation

The university conducts monitoring and periodic assessment of the basic educational programmes (BEP) in order to guarantee the achievement of its objectives, the full formation of the planned learning outcomes and to meet the needs of students and society. Continuous internal monitoring is carried out annually by the graduating department, academic department and department of education quality. The procedure of monitoring and periodic assessment of the BEP is carried out on the basis of the following internal regulatory documents: Guidelines for monitoring and assessment of the quality of the BEP at KNAU, Regulations on the internal system of education quality assessment, Regulations on practice, Methodological Recommendations on the development of teaching and methodological complex of disciplines.

Assessment of the quality of the implementation of the study program is carried out within the framework of the general monitoring system, which provides: assessment of EP management (professional level of teaching staff, organisation of educational process, assessment of the level of achievement of programme objectives, demand for graduates), implementation of EP (curriculum, curricula, methodological and information support, material and technical base, modern educational technologies, research and development) and EP results (intermediate attestation, final attestation).

HEI management is interested in the participation of students, employers and other stakeholders in the revision of HEIs. In particular, employers participate in departmental meetings when all issues and concerns related to external changes on the revision of the study programme are considered. In order to increase the degree of professional training of graduates, the annual survey of employers is conducted.

The mechanisms for monitoring and evaluation of the study program are surveys of the participants of the educational process, feedback from the supervisors of internships, class visits, opinions of the chairs of the State accreditation State Attestation Commission (SAC), discussion of the results at the meetings of the relevant structural units and the Study-Methodological Council (SMC) of the university. The results of monitoring of students' and society's fulfilment of needs are given in the reports of the department of quality of education. The results of monitoring and periodic assessment of the study program, comments and suggestions are taken into account in the development and revision of documents of the MEP for the next academic year. Faculty members, students, as well as employers participate in the discussion of this issue.

Teachers of disciplines carry out assessment of the level of formation of universal and professional competences during the current and midterm assessments. Coordinators of internships and curators of study groups track performance of students according to their observations

and a database of individual plans and personal achievements of students. The results of the analysis are discussed at the meetings of the departments, the Academic Council of the faculties and the university.

The analysis of the relevance of the title and content of the disciplines to the current trends of scientific development is conducted through the review of the study program by employers. Innovative suggestions from stakeholders to improve the activities of the study program can be submitted both through communicative means of communication at (official website of the university, feedback section, e-mail). Also, all changes made to the EP are published on the official university website, so that all stakeholders are informed of any actions planned or taken in relation to the EP.

In order to ensure the quality of preparation of competitive graduates, the curriculum for the next academic year is discussed and revised annually. The meeting is attended by the teaching staff of the department and employers. The content of the curriculum is revised annually depending on the changes in the labour market, relevance, expediency of the changes made, etc. Proposals for changes in the content of the educational programmes are eventually updated and formulated by the chairs and approved at the meeting of the SMC of the university.

The head of the study program, academic department and department of education quality systematically monitor the information provision of students, the material and technical base and the level of competence of the teaching staff. At the end of academic year the qualitative composition of the teaching staff in terms of compliance with the profile of training including their academic degrees, dynamics of professional development and academic mobility, as well as the degree of participation of specialists of enterprises in the educational process is analysed. Based on the results of monitoring and periodic assessment the head of the study program prepares a report.

## **9.2 Assessment**

The Examination of the regulatory documents in the Academic Policy section of the University's website, the self-evaluation report, the results of the faculty and student survey, and the results of the online survey confirmed that monitoring and regular evaluation of the study programme "Agricultural Management"(M.Sc.) is carried out at the University.

The schedule of activities for monitoring the quality of education was approved, according to which the University monitors and regularly evaluates the study programmes in order to achieve the objectives and meet the needs of students and society. In order to determine the level of satisfaction of internal needs, the University organises and conducts a survey among students, faculty and University staff every academic session.

The survey is conducted to determine the level of satisfaction with the students' educational needs, their attitude towards the educational process, the socio-cultural environment, etc.

The results of the survey are statistically analysed, discussed in the administrative meetings and taken into account in the further planning of educational activities. According to the monitoring statistics, the programme management analyses and compiles the survey results in order to initiate the necessary measures to achieve the desired results.

The existing quality management seems to function according to a hierarchical principle. However, the goal is a functioning control circle between the participants in order to improve the quality of research and teaching (Circle of Quality). This Circle of Quality functions according to the bottom up - top down principle.

The university regularly reviews the strategy and policy in the area of quality and monitors its implementation.

Overall, it should be noted that responsibilities are clearly and comprehensibly regulated, not least because the core processes of quality assurance are documented in the university's regulations.

Feedback between students and teachers is a prerequisite for improving teaching and should be introduced. The evaluation results of the anonymous course evaluations will be presented to the students after the surveys and discussed with them in order to derive concrete measures for improving teaching.

It became clear in the discussions that there is definitely close contact with the graduates and that they are surveyed very soon after graduation.

The course evaluations thus serve the continuous development and improvement of quality and studyability. The student workload is continuously surveyed in the course evaluations; corresponding questions are included in the questionnaires. An evaluation of the workload through a module should take place at regular intervals.

Students are made aware of the student workload and examination requirements by the lecturers at the beginning of the course. In the degree programme, the measure of how many hours one ECTS point corresponds to the student workload is anchored in the regulatory documents.

With regard to the quality of teaching, it should be noted that measures to ensure it begin with the recruitment of teaching staff. In addition, the university offers teaching staff various further training opportunities, both on technical and didactic topics.

It can be stated that there is a combination of internal and external quality management in order to offer its own study programmes in a generally ESG-compliant manner.

The study programme “Agricultural Management”(M.Sc.) is regularly evaluated to ensure quality and to check compliance with the high quality standards. Ongoing monitoring of the study programme is carried out in accordance with the quality assurance policy. The programme is reviewed regularly and if changes are required, they are made. This process is exemplary. The study programme thus has suitable and different procedures for internal quality assurance.

The University has a systematic procedure of analysis, development, monitoring and periodic revision of the educational program. Employers who confirmed this process as transparent, understandable and accessible are involved in the improvement of the educational program. A culture of quality has been formed in the academic community of the University, which contributes to the continuous development of the educational program and educational activities under this program.

The process of collecting proposals from various groups of stakeholders is insufficiently organized. It is recommended to strengthen work on the organization of the process of collecting proposals from various groups of stakeholders.

Standardised evaluation procedures should be introduced, in order to advance the quality assurance of the study program and, if necessary, to be able to derive recommendations for action.

### 9.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

## 10 ESG Standard 1.10: Cyclical external quality assurance

**Institutions should undergo external quality assurance in line with the ESG on a cyclical basis**

### 10.1 Implementation

In 2022 KANU passed an international institutional accreditation conducted by the Independent Accreditation and Rating Agency (Kazakhstan). The accreditation was issued for five years.

The master’s Programme “Agricultural Management” was accredited by the Accreditation, Certification and Quality Assurance Institute ACQUIN, Germany on 27 September 2016. In 2018 the master’s programme in the direction 580200 Management successfully passed an independent accreditation by the Agency for Accreditation of Educational Programmes and Organisations. Accreditation was issued for five years.

## 10.2 Assessment

As far as the legal framework of quality assurance is concerned, the study program is conducted in accordance with the regulations and guidelines. For this purpose, the university has a combination of internal and external quality management to offer the study programme in accordance with the ESG. The University has undergone institutional accreditation. The accreditation results are incorporated into the structuring of the University's business processes. Of particular importance is the cooperation with external stakeholders such as partner universities, graduates, industry and employers in order to gain impetus for continuous internal quality development.

Quality management ensures very well that the general quality assurance measures and instruments are constantly up-to-date and transparent. The University fulfils all obligatory aspects of external quality assurance: the different organisational units and levels are adequately in place and were explained in detail in the interviews with the HEI. Both internal and external quality assurance of the University's measures take into account all legal requirements and benefit from each other to advance the quality development of the study programme. External quality assurance extends to all necessary organisational levels such as financial operations and educational provision. The internal and external quality assurance mechanisms for the continuous development of the programme is well developed and the cyclical functioning of the programme's quality assessment is effective. The quality of the surveys and the processing of the results can be rated as very good. No specific problems in the cyclical external quality assurance were reported for the study programme.

The follow-up activities of the university's external quality assurance in preparing the next procedure are generally well thought out. The results of the external assessment and recognition of the quality of the study program (reports, expert opinions, etc.) are published on the university's website.

In conclusion, the coherence between external and internal quality assurances is well structured.

## 10.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

#### IV Recommendation to the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN

##### 1 **Assessment of compliance the Standards and Guidelines in the Higher European Area (ESG) in the actual official version**

The study programme „„**Agricultural Management**”(M.Sc.) was assessed on the basis of the "Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area" (ESG) and the national or other relevant regulations.

The expert group concludes that the **ESG standards** 1.1 (Policy for quality assurance), 1.2 (Design and approval of programmes), 1.3 (Student-centred learning, teaching and assessment), 1.4 (Student admission, progression, recognition and certification), 1.5 (Teaching staff), 1.6 (Learning resources and student support), 1.7 (Information management), 1.8 (Public information), 1.9 (On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes) and 1.10 (Cyclical external quality assurance) are fulfilled.

The assessment criteria are as follows:

**Standard 1.1 Policy for quality assurance:** Universities have a publicly accessible quality assurance strategy, which is part of their strategic management. This strategy is developed and implemented by internal stakeholder representatives through appropriate structures and processes, involving external stakeholders.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.2 Design and approval of programmes:** Universities have procedures for the design and approval of their courses. The courses are designed in such a way that their objectives, including the desired learning outcomes, can be achieved. The qualification obtained during a degree program is clearly defined and communicated; it refers to the corresponding level of the national qualifications framework for higher education and, consequently, the qualifications framework for the European Higher Education Area.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.3 Student-centred learning, teaching and assessment:** Universities ensure that the courses offered are carried out in such a way as to encourage students to play an active role in the design of the learning process and that this approach is also taken into account when assessing students / examinations.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.4 Student admission, progression, recognition and certification:** Universities ensure that the courses offered are carried out in such a way as to encourage students to play an active role in the design of the learning process and that this approach is also taken into account when assessing students / examinations.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.5 Teaching staff:** Universities ensure the competence of their teachers. They use fair and transparent procedures for the recruitment and further training of their employees.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.6 Learning resources and student support:** The university has adequate funding to finance study and teaching and ensure that there is always a sufficient and readily available range of learning and support available for their studies.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.7 Information management:** Universities ensure that they collect, analyze and use the relevant data relevant to the successful conduct of studies and other activities.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.8 Public information:** Universities publish easily understandable, correct, objective, up-to-date and well-accessible information about their activities and courses of study.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.9 On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes:** Universities are constantly monitoring their courses and regularly reviewing them to ensure that they achieve the goals set and meet the needs of students and society. The tests lead to a continuous improvement of the courses. All affected parties will be informed about any measures planned or resulting from this.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.10 Cyclical external quality assurance:** Universities regularly undergo external quality assurance procedures in accordance with the ESG.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.



The peer-review experts note that the recommendations from the previous accreditation procedure have been adequately taken into account.

## 2 Accreditation Recommendation

The peer-review experts recommend an unconditional accreditation of the study programme „**Agricultural Management**” (M.Sc.) with the following **recommendations**:

1. Students' English language skills should be improved. Higher entrance requirements should be created with regard to English skills or students should be offered compulsory language courses to improve their English language skills.
2. Within the framework of the further development of the curriculum, current topics such as big data and digitalisation should be given greater consideration.
3. The same standards and uniform application procedures for teaching staff should prevail at all partner universities.
4. The English language skills of teaching and administrative staff should be improved and corresponding further training courses implemented.
5. Professional practice representatives should be consulted in an institutionalised way in curriculum development.
6. The HSWT should establish a good administrative infrastructure for all partner universities and create even more support services in general and during student mobility phases with a view to even better studyability.
7. In order to guarantee the implementation of the study programmes, the staff should also grow with the increasing number of students.
8. Better strategic communication activities should be developed to publicise the study offer in order to arouse the interest of potential applicants in the long term.
9. Standardised evaluation procedures should be introduced, in order to advance the quality assurance of the study programme and, if necessary, to be able to derive recommendations for action.
10. The University should improve recruitment processes by referring to the advantages of the programme curriculum and employment opportunities;
11. The University should improve the quality of teaching based on the independent and anonymous evaluations of the students and stakeholders;
12. The University should collaborate and work closely with alumni and stakeholders to continuously improve the programme.

## V Decisions of the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN

Based on the evaluation report of the expert group and the statements of the Higher Education Institutions the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN makes on the 09 May 2023 the following decisions unanimously:

**The study programme “Agricultural Management” (M.Sc.) at the Kyrgyz National Agrarian University named K.I. Skryabin is accredited without any conditions.  
The accreditation is valid until 30. September 2029.**

The following recommendations are given for the further development of the study programme:

- Students' English language skills should be improved. Higher entrance requirements should be created with regard to English skills or students should be offered compulsory language courses to improve their English language skills.
- Within the framework of the further development of the curriculum, current topics such as big data and digitalisation should be given greater consideration.
- The same standards and uniform application procedures for teaching staff should be prevailed at all partner universities.
- The English language skills of teaching and administrative staff should be improved and corresponding further training courses implemented.
- Professional practice representatives should be consulted in an institutionalised way in curriculum development.
- The HSWT should establish a good administrative infrastructure for all partner universities and create even more support services in general and during student mobility phases with a view to even better studyability.
- In order to guarantee the implementation of the study programmes, the staff should also grow with the increasing number of students.
- Better strategic communication activities should be developed to publicise the study offer in order to arouse the interest of potential applicants in the long term.
- Standardised evaluation procedures should be introduced, in order to advance the quality assurance of the study programme and, if necessary, to be able to derive recommendations for action.
- It is recommended to carry out further development of the internal quality assurance system by timely response to legislative changes, and by improving the coordination of measures to monitor the quality of the educational programme and educational activities at the University level.
- The expert group recommends involving students more in the work of the department in order to take their wishes and suggestions more into account when planning and implementing the educational process, selecting, reviewing and updating the educational programme.
- It is recommended to ensure the teaching of professional disciplines by a specialist with appropriate qualifications.