

## Accreditation Report

**S. Seifullin Kazakh Agro Technical University**  
**Republic of Kazakhstan**  
**Agricultural Management (Master of Economics)**

### **I Procedure**

**Date of contract:** 19 January 2022

**Date of the submission of self-assessment report:** 2 August 2022

**Date of site visit:** 21 September 20220

**Attendance by ACQUIN office:** Dr. Jasmine Rudolph

**Accreditation decision:** 9 Mai 2023

#### **Peer review experts:**

- **Prof. Dr. Elena Kashtanova**, Anhalt University of Applied Sciences, Professor of International Trade in Agribusiness
- **FH-Prof. MMag. Dr. Michael Schmidthaler**, Upper Austria University of Applied Sciences, Professor and Head of study programme Agricultural Management and Innovations
- **Prof. Dr. Thore Toews**, Technical University Bingen, Professor for applied agricultural business management, agricultural accounting and taxation, taxation theory, agricultural business planning and controlling
- **Farhod Ahrorov**, PhD, Vice-Rector Samarkand branch of Tashkent State University of Economics (Uzbekistan)
- **Dr. Alen Mujcinovic**, Associate Professor, Faculty of Agriculture and Food Sciences University of Sarajevo Sarajevo (Bosnia and Herzegovina)
- **Professor Anargul Belgibayeva**, Sh. Ualikhanov Kokshetau University, Department of Business and Services

- **Marat Onaev**, Zhangir Khan University (Uralsk, Kazakhstan), Director of the Institute of Agrotechnology
- **Rinat Fazylbekov**, Deputy Head, Department of technology innovation Kazakh Research Institute of Plant, Protection and Quarantine
- **Professor Dr. Aleksandra Mandych**, State Biotechnological University, (Kharkiv, Ukraine), Economics and Management of Enterprise
- **Professor Dr. Volodymyr Pysarenko**, Poltava State Agrarian University (Poltava, Ukraine), Head of marketing department
- **Professor Valentina Yakubiv**, Vasyl Stefanyk Precarpathian National University, Vice-Rector for Research, Department of Business Administration
- **Alina Magomedova**, PhD, Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv, Associate Professor, Department of Business Economics
- **Nurgaziev Mairambek**, PhD, Associate Professor, American University of Central Asia, Bishkek, Kyrgyzstan
- **Ulrich Pingel**, CEO, Agralis GmbH
- **Sandra Koop**, University Kiel, Student of Agricultural Sciences (M.Sc.)

The **Assessment Report** of the peer-review experts is **based on** the self-assessment report of the Higher Education Institution (HEI) and extensive discussions with the HEI management, deans and/or heads of the departments, heads of Study programme(s), lecturers, staff representatives, students, and alumni.

The basis of the **Assessment Criteria** is part 1 of the “Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area” (ESG) in the current official version. At the same time the national context, particularly the national regulations regarding the establishment of Study programmes, are taken into account.

**Content**

<b>I</b>	<b>Procedure</b> .....	1
<b>II</b>	<b>Introduction</b> .....	6
	1 Short profile of HEI .....	6
	2 General information on the Study programme .....	9
	3 Results of the previous accreditation .....	9
<b>III</b>	<b>Implementation and assessment of the criteria</b> .....	11
	1 ESG Standard 1.1: Policy for quality assurance .....	11
	1.1 Implementation .....	11
	1.2 Assessment .....	14
	1.3 Conclusion .....	17
	2 ESG Standard 1.2: Design and approval of programmes .....	18
	2.1 Implementation .....	18
	2.2 Assessment .....	19
	2.3 Conclusion .....	23
	3 ESG Standard 1.3: Student-centred learning, teaching, and assessment .....	23
	3.1 Implementation .....	23
	3.2 Assessment .....	25
	3.3 Conclusion .....	26
	4 ESG Standard 1.4: Student admission, progression, recognition, and certification .....	26
	4.1 Implementation .....	27
	4.2 Assessment .....	28
	4.3 Conclusion .....	29
	5 ESG Standard 1.5: Teaching staff .....	29
	5.1 Implementation .....	29
	5.2 Assessment .....	31
	5.3 Conclusion .....	35
	6 ESG Standard 1.6: Learning resources and student support .....	35
	6.1 Implementation .....	36
	6.2 Assessment .....	37
	6.3 Conclusion .....	38
	7 ESG Standard 1.7: Information management .....	38
	7.1 Implementation .....	39
	7.2 Assessment .....	41
	7.3 Conclusion .....	41
	8 ESG Standard 1.8: Public information .....	42
	8.1 Implementation .....	42
	8.2 Assessment .....	43
	8.3 Conclusion .....	44
	9 ESG Standard 1.9: On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes .....	44

9.1	Implementation .....	44
9.2	Assessment .....	46
9.3	Conclusion .....	48
10	ESG Standard 1.10: Cyclical external quality assurance .....	48
10.1	Implementation .....	48
10.2	Assessment .....	49
10.3	Conclusion .....	49
<b>IV</b>	<b>Recommendation to the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN</b> .....	<b>50</b>
1	Assessment of compliance the Standards and Guidelines in the Higher European Area (ESG) in the actual official version .....	50
2	Accreditation Recommendation .....	52
<b>V</b>	<b>Decisions of the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN</b> .....	<b>53</b>

## **II Introduction**

The experts would like to thank the representatives of the HEI as well as students that they have taken part in the discussions and willingly shared information and their views during the site visit. The discussions are valuable not only for the assessment of the institution, but also for a better understanding of the legal and sociocultural context of the local higher education system.

Evaluation basis for the peer-review experts is the self-assessment report of the HEI as well as intensive discussions during the site visit with the HEI management, deans and/or heads of the departments, heads of the Study programme, Study programme coordinators, teachers, lecturers, administrative staff, students, and graduates.

Main objective of the accreditation procedure is to assess the quality of the Study programmes and compliance with the "Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area" (ESG). The ESG standards are applied as main assessment criteria in the international accreditation procedure.

In addition, the respective country-specific criteria and standards are taken into account.

A group of experts was set up, which ensured that all areas relevant to the accreditation procedure (e.g. legal, structural, social etc. aspects) as well as the ESG and national criteria were considered. The peer-review experts include professors, representatives of the professional practice and the student representative. A certificate with the ACQUIN seal is awarded upon accreditation of the Study programme.

### **1 Short profile of HEI**

NAG "Kazakh Agricultural Technical S. Seifullin University" was founded in 1957. According to the Decree of the Council of Ministers of the USSR N. 1176 dated 3.10.1957, the first agricultural university in this region was established in the city of Akmolinsk. The first admission was organized in 1958 and consisted of 250 students.

In May 2013, the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan N. Nazarbayev proposed to organize on the basis of KATU a world-class research university in the field of agriculture on the model of Nazarbayev University. Features of the new status included an autonomous management model on the model of the world's leading agricultural research universities, combining scientific research, education and implementation of scientific results into real production, aimed at integration into the global scientific and educational space.

By attracting leading foreign professors and scientists and experienced local specialists, the necessary skills are developed in all key areas of the agro-industrial complex. As a result of its

transformation into an agricultural research university, KATU will serve as the main supplier of competitive innovations for the agro-industrial complex in North and Central Kazakhstan and an attractive workplace for teaching staff and the most attractive place of training for students in the relevant fields of education.

The teaching staff of the university is composed of 814 full-time teachers, including 82 Doctors of Science, 345 candidates of science and 64 PhD. The education is provided by 8 faculties and 44 chairs. In total, 133 educational programs are carried out at S. Seifullin KATU: 47 bachelor's degree programs, 53 master's degree programs and 33 PhD doctoral programs. KATU has 27 centers and laboratories. The total number of students in KATU is 13,077. The total number of master's students and PhD students in S. Seifullin KATU is 1,266. 95% students of KATU are provided with a dormitory.

In recent years, the university has actively improved its position in the world rankings. In 2018, the university ranked 2nd among agricultural universities in the ranking "Kazakhstan-2050 - National Ranking for Innovation and Academic Excellence". 74 Educational programs of KATU are among the top three in the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Basic and applied scientific research are carried out in KATU funded by state and extra-budgetary sources.

On the scientific and experimental campus of the university a gross harvest of wheat was achieved - 155.6 tons, barley - 35.2 tons, oats - 17.7 tons, peas - 8 tons, potatoes - 350 tons, more than 120 tons of hay were harvested.

Variety testing of 52 agricultural crop varieties was carried out (13 - wheat, 10 - potato, 4 - mung bean, 4 - buckwheat, 5 - millet, 6 - rapeseed, 5 - soybean, 4 - pea, 1 - bean).

The university is a participant in 7 Erasmus+ "Capacity Building in Higher Education" projects. In 2018, KATU became a first-time grantee of the EU Erasmus+ project "New and innovative course on Precision Farming" 597985-EPP-1-2018-1-KZ-EPPKA2-CBHE-JPNICoPA (2018-2021).

Since 2003, KATU has been offering the Study program "Agricultural Management" in close cooperation with Weihenstephan University of Applied Sciences (Germany).

The students of this program receive scholarships from HSWT funded by the DAAD program.

The Study program "Agricultural Management" enables the training of specialists with international experience in the management of the business and in new approaches to scientific research.

The curriculum of the “Agricultural Management” study program is developed in cooperation with the Weihenstephan-Triesdorf University of Applied Sciences. Students of this specialization have an opportunity after completing the first year of study to continue their studies at the HSWT. Subject to successful completion and defense of a master's thesis at both universities, the master's student receives a double diploma.

Teaching in the program "Agricultural Management" is carried out by highly qualified staff trained at leading universities in Germany, Russia and Ukraine. In the educational process, teachers use didactic materials developed by Kazakh and German scientists based on the experience of developed countries with a market economy.

Development of international relations of the university with foreign universities creates conditions for annual joint international seminars for students and lecturers of the study program “Agricultural Management”, where the problems of management in the agricultural sector and methods of analysis of investment projects are discussed.

Study program “Agricultural Management” includes mobility in partner universities. During these stays, students have an opportunity to visit research laboratories, agribusinesses specializing in agricultural management, agricultural colleges and collect files for their master's theses. Also, within the framework of academic mobility students have a possibility to study individual subjects at the foreign universities abroad.

## 2 General information on the Study programme

Location	S. Seifullin Kazakh Agro Technical University Republic of Kazakhstan: "Agricultural Management" (Master of Economics)
Date of introduction	01.09.2003
Standard period of study (semesters)	6 Trimester, 2 years
Number of ECTS credits	120
Number of study places	15 per semester
Number of students currently enrolled	10 per semester
Average number of graduates per year	10 per semester
Form of study	Full-Time

## 3 Results of the previous accreditation

The study programme "**Agricultural Management**" (**Master of Economics**) was examined and accredited by the ACQUIN for the first time in 2016 resulting in the following conditions:

- In order to ensure the quality of theses at the master's level, the university must prepare a handbook for students that defines minimum requirements and standards for master's theses.

The conditions were fulfilled. The accreditation was issued by the 30 September 2021.

For further development of the study programme, the following recommendations were formulated:

- Training with regard to methods of scientific research should be intensified).
- Students should be guided more intensely towards independent scientific work. For this purpose, lecture notes should be supplemented with more up-to-date literature and students should be encouraged to conduct their own literature research).
- The module descriptions should be revised. The topicality of the literature references should be checked and competencies should be examined to determine whether they correspond to a master level.
- The university should explore the possibility of offering forms of examination (e.g., portfolio examinations) that assess course-related performance.

A temporary accreditation was issued for the proper implementation of the ACQUIN reaccreditation procedure. The application was approved and the temporary accreditation of the Study programme was issued until 31. September 2023.

### **III Implementation and assessment of the criteria**

*The peer-review experts assess the quality of the Study programme and compliance with the ESG standards as well as with the national standards. The report must document the assessment of each Study programme in the cluster, taking into account each criterion.*

#### **1 ESG Standard 1.1: Policy for quality assurance**

**Institutions should have a policy for quality assurance that is made public and forms part of their strategic management. Internal stakeholders should develop and implement this policy through appropriate structures and processes, while involving external stakeholders.**

##### **1.1 Implementation**

The Quality Policy documents are published on the university website and are publicly accessible. A software "ARTA" is used for internal purposes, through which documents are sent to all stakeholders for review. Currently, "Documentolog" office work software has been introduced for electronic document management.

The management of the program "Agricultural Management" is carried out in accordance with the development program of KATU Seifullin for 2020-2024. The management of the educational program involves representatives of employers. Employers set the direction for the development of educational programs. The effectiveness of the educational program development plan is determined by holding teaching staff accountable for final results, delegating and delineating authority, and posting information on the university's website.

The university carries out the processes of strategic, tactical and operational planning of the educational program and resource allocation in accordance with the Educational Program Development Plan. The expected final results of the implementation of the study program development plan are ensuring effective management of the high-quality implementation of the study program and improving the mechanisms for managing the educational process, ensuring the level of education that meets the conditions of the market and all interested parties, ensuring highly qualified personnel and improving the conditions for developing their creative potential, involving the students of the educational program in the educational process and research activities and developing the resource potential for the implementation of the educational program.

The development plan of educational program is aligned in accordance with the requirements of the market, the needs of the state, stakeholders, the innovative model of S. Seifullin KATU and the training of highly qualified competent specialists in the field of agricultural management

oriented to professional practical, research and scientific and educational activities. The educational program will be considered at a meeting of the Chair of Management. The study program is then recommended to the Faculty Council for consideration. The Faculty of Business Curriculum Committee and the Chair monitor the implementation of the study program development plan to ensure its implementation as planned. The results of the assessment of the effectiveness of the implementation of the study program development plan are used to make adjustments to the plan. This monitoring allows the quality of the study program to be maintained in accordance with the development plan and adjustments to be made in a timely manner.

The main directions of the development plan include: Updating the content of study program based on modern national and international experience in training in this area, internship and market requirements; forming qualitative mechanisms for assessing learning outcomes based on criteria that provide objective information to all interested participants; ensuring the logical coherence of disciplines in the creation of modules for the development of competencies; updating the didactic content of study program taking into account the opinions of potential employers and the satisfaction of graduates, developing didactic materials with multimedia elements on the MOOCS. KZ platform; methodological seminars for the improvement of teaching methods; cooperation agreements with leading domestic production companies to develop practical skills that meet market needs; involvement of domestic and foreign scientists, industry specialists, joint scientific research; continuing education of teachers through doctoral studies, internships at universities, research centers, companies, participation in academic mobility programs, as well as online courses based on the platforms Coursera, EdX, etc., language courses; ensuring continuous career counseling, as well as monitoring the employment and success of graduates; creating conditions for independent research activity of the student at all levels of his education.

In order to elaborate a development plan and objectives of study programs "Business Management" for bachelor, "Agricultural Management" for master students, "Management in Agricultural Complex", an analysis of the preferences of applicants and their parents, the role of the university in the educational services market, survey data of employers, teachers and students, analysis of the contingent and the main characteristics of the student contingent, analysis of student and teacher satisfaction is carried out. In order to meet the needs of the labor market, employers participate in the development of catalogue of elective modules. Employers participate in the meetings with teachers and students. As a result of these meetings, general, professional and additional competencies of graduates are identified, a list of electives and individual course topics relevant to production are discussed.

Monitoring of the study program development plan is carried out by collecting reports on the implementation of the study program development plan, annual reports of the chair, monitoring of the readiness of the chairs for the academic year, quality review of the curriculum, training and method complex of the course, training and method complex of the discipline, didactic support and material procurement of the study program, the readiness of the teaching and educational and laboratory facilities study program, etc., as well as a survey of students and graduates, employers and parents.

Evaluation is carried out in all areas of pedagogical, didactic methodological, informational, scientific activities and material procurement of the educational process. The evaluation of the activities is a continuous process and is carried out in the meetings of the Academic Council, the administration, the faculties and chairs, and is prepared in the form of minutes. Evaluation of study program activities is also carried out by students.

Monitoring the effectiveness of the quality assurance system is carried out through internal audits, review of methodological support, performance evaluation and addressing issues in collegial bodies. The internal audit is carried out by the Quality Service. The control plan includes issues related to the planning, organization, monitoring and development of study program quality. Based on the results of the audit, corrective actions are taken.

Study program management system is transparent, and information is fully available. All activities of the chair, its development, information about the teaching staff, the contingent of students, the research work of students and lecturers and other relevant information is located on the website.

The topics explained in the meetings of the Academic Council are covered on the university's website, and the decisions of the Academic Council are made known to all employees by the heads of the respective departments.

All decisions on the effective functioning of the quality assurance system of the study program are made by collegial bodies, including faculty members of the department, members of pedagogical and methodological, scientific, scientific and technical advisory boards, including the program management, heads of the department.

The study program development plan is in accordance with the documents of the University (Charter of JSC "Kazakh Agrarian Technical S. Seifullin University", Quality Manual, Regulations on the Faculty Council). In addition, the following organizational standards are used: Quality Manual; Regulations on the Academic Council of the University; Regulations on the Informatization Council; Management of quality records; Regulations on the system of indicative planning and monitoring; Management of the processes of educational activity.

The effectiveness of the management of the educational process in the master's program is reflected in the set of regulatory documents: regulations on master's program; regulations on organization of external academic mobility, procedures for organization and implementation of practical training in the master's program", "Organization of progress control during the current and intermediate control of students", "Procedures for the design and preparation of a master's thesis", "Organization of progress control during the final certification of students". In addition, the following QMS standards of KATU: "Structure, content, procedures for development and approval of an electronic didactic complex of the discipline", "Procedures for the organization of research", "Management of the processes of educational activities" and others, the entire list of QMS documents is attached.

Management of processes of scientific activity of students, which specifies the requirements for the processes of management of scientific activity of students, as well as the goals and objectives of involvement of students in research work, determines the general approach and basic principles for the organization of research work of students of KATU. This standard of organization is applied by the chair "Management" and all chairs of KATU and is included in the documents of the quality management system.

The effectiveness of the management of the educational process in bachelor's, master's and doctoral programs is reflected in a number of regulatory documents, such as "Regulations on Master's Programs", "Regulations on the Organization of Scientific Internship in the Master's Program", "The Procedure for the Organization and Implementation of Practical Training in the Master's Program", "Procedures for Registration and Preparation of a Master's Thesis", "Regulations on Doctoral Studies", "Regulations on the Research Activities of Doctoral Students", "Regulations on Academic Mobility in the Master's Program", "Regulations on Doctoral Studies", "Regulations on the Research Work of Doctoral Students".

The effectiveness of study program and its further improvement are influenced by feedback and opportunities to receive it. The level of satisfaction of employees, students, graduates as well as employers with the level of performance of the University and the created working and educational conditions is determined by a survey. A "Regulation on the Procedure for Conducting Sociological Research in JSC KATU" has been developed.

## **1.2 Assessment**

Based on the university goals and strategic management, the quality assurance policy has been implemented appropriately in the field of research, teaching and learning. Hence, the quality assurance policy of the University meets the requirements of the Ministry of Education and Science of the country. In addition, the successful results of previous years and promising

goals for the future shows the satisfaction of internal and external stakeholders in terms of cooperation.

The analysis of the internal quality assurance of the programme has shown that the procedures for the development, approval, periodic review and monitoring of the Master's programme " Agricultural Management (Master of Economics) are carried out in accordance with the study regulations, which indicates that the initiation, development, approval, monitoring, revision and termination of the Master's programme at the University are carried out transparently and in accordance with the approved procedures, in line with the general objectives of the University's development strategy, as well as the students of education participate in the design and improvement of the Master's programme, the evaluation of its components and the quality of teaching.

The quality assurance system for the educational process consists of an internal quality assurance system (administration, department for quality assurance of education, pedagogical and methodological centre for the organisation of the educational process) and external quality assurance.

During the meeting with the representatives of the University it was noted and confirmed that the University has a clear quality culture that ensures systematic development of the educational programme. The University has an Education Quality Assurance Department, whose main purpose is to monitor educational activities and evaluate the data of academic activities in order to effectively manage the quality of the educational process.

During the accreditation process, it was noted that the results of external quality assurance of higher education are presented in detail on the University's website, especially the comments and suggestions made during previous accreditations on the official website of the University.

In the accreditation process, it is clear that employers are constantly involved in the process of periodic revision of the educational programme. The university has consultation and advisory bodies, as well as an expert council of employers and graduates.

Saken Seifullin Kazakh Agrotechnical University has the policy for quality assurance, it has been approved and is publicly available on the university's website and is available to all users: faculty, employees, students, and employers. The main document defining the quality policy and objectives is the Quality Manual.

The quality policy is aimed at implementing the mission, perspective and development strategy of Saken Seifullin Kazakh Agrotechnical University in order to meet the needs of the State, society, sectors of the real economy, potential employers, students and other stakeholders based on the analysis of external and internal factors with the broad involvement of stakeholders.

In order to implement the university's obligations to develop a quality culture as well as to implement a strategy for continuous quality improvement, the regulation "On the procedure for developing an educational program development plan and monitoring its implementation" has been developed and is in force at the University.

The Development Plan of the educational program "Agrarian Management" reflects the policy of quality assurance of the educational program, including the relationship between scientific research, teaching and training. Also, the Development Plan of the educational program "Agrarian Management" provides for interaction between the real sectors of the economy, the business community, the scientific community, the teaching staff and students.

The quality policy is a part of the general policy and strategy of Saken Seifullin Kazakh Agro-technical University and includes recognition of the responsibility of management and its obligations in quality issues.

To work out a development plan and goals of the educational program "Agrarian Management", the preferences of applicants and their parents are analyzed, the contingent and the main characteristics of the contingent of students are analyzed, the satisfaction of students and teaching staff are analyzed, also the data from the survey of employers, teaching staff and students are used.

The labor market needs involve employers into the development of a catalogue of elective disciplines and as a result of such meetings with which general, professional and additional competencies of graduates are determined, a list of elective disciplines relevant to production is discussed.

The quality policy is implemented through processes and standards of internal quality assurance which involve the participation of all departments of the university.

The quality assurance strategy is developed and implemented by representatives of internal stakeholders through appropriate structures and processes with the involvement of external stakeholders.

The university staff is involved in the development, discussion and adoption of a quality assurance policy which is formed and periodically reviewed on the basis of legislative and regulatory acts in the field of education, the current results of the analysis of satisfaction of consumers of educational services and other stakeholders.

Top management assumes a leading role in the implementation of the quality policy and commitments to ensure the unity of goals, continuity of management traditions, maintenance and

continuous improvement of the quality management system which provides a process approach to all types of activities and decision-making based on an objective analysis of evidence.

The aim of the educational program is closely interrelated with the University's Quality Policy which ensures the effectiveness of its implementation.

The quality policy is updated systematically at the university. The quality policy is analyzed once every 2 years at the meetings of the Quality Coordination Council for adequacy and suitability.

Educational programs at Saken Seifullin Kazakh Agrotechnical University are updated annually by 30% taking into account the interests of the labor market. The educational program "Agrarian Management" was developed in accordance with the Classifier of training areas with higher and postgraduate education and the State Compulsory Educational Standard (SCES) of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The Educational Program Development Plan for 2019-2023 has been developed on the basis of the strategic development plan of the university and is the main document for determining and solving the problems of the educational program. The document is posted on the university's website. The implementation period of the development plan is 5 years.

To monitor the implementation of the educational program plan and the fulfilment of corrective actions there used the reports of heads of structural divisions, questionnaires, audits and surveys.

The assessment is carried out in all areas of educational, methodical, informational, scientific, educational activities and material and technical support of the educational process. Evaluation of activities is a continuous process and is carried out at meetings of the Academic Council, the Rector's Office, faculties and departments, is issued in the form of protocols. Evaluation of educational activities is also carried out by students as the main consumers of educational services.

Control of the effectiveness of the quality assurance system is carried out through internal audits, examination of methodological support, evaluation of activities and consideration of issues by collegial bodies. Internal audit is conducted by the quality service. The audit plan includes issues related to the planning, organization, monitoring and development of the educational program quality. Corrective actions are carried out based on the results of the audit.

### **1.3 Conclusion**

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

## 2 ESG Standard 1.2: Design and approval of programmes

**Institutions should have processes for the design and approval of their programmes. The programmes should be designed so that they meet the objectives set for them, including the intended learning outcomes. The qualification resulting from a programme should be clearly specified and communicated, and refer to the correct level of the national qualifications framework for higher education and, consequently, to the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.**

### 2.1 Implementation

The educational program "Agricultural Management" was developed on the basis of the orders of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education" of the State Compulsory Standard for Higher Education, Framework Regulations for the Activities of Educational Organizations, as well as other regulatory legal documents of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, and complies with the National Qualifications Framework and Occupational Standards agreed with the Dublin Descriptor and the European Qualifications Framework.

In the process of study program development, a committee for study program development is formed. The committee consists of the employers, faculty and staff. The study program is discussed at a meeting of the responsible Chair. Afterwards, the study program is deliberated in the Education and Methods Council of the Faculty and approved by the Academic Council of the university. The quality of the program is verified by an internal audit of the Academic Council of the university. The external audit of the study program is conducted by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Finally, a study program is registered in the Register of Educational Programs for Higher Postgraduate Studies.

Educational programs are coordinated with the Dean of the Faculty, representatives of the business community, the Academic Affairs Department, and approved at a meeting of the University Academic Council.

Leading faculty, interested persons, and employers participated in the content discussion of the basic and major disciplines included in the study program. Representatives of organizations noted that the content of individual disciplines meets the needs of the labor market for training highly skilled professionals, provides the opportunity to acquire practical business skills and analyze production situations to develop optimal solutions.

Educational programs are updated by 30% annually, taking into account the interests of the labor market. Educational programs of bachelor's, master's and doctoral degree programs "Business management", "Agricultural Management" and "Management in agrarian complex" were developed in accordance with the Classifier of directions for training of specialists with higher and postgraduate education and the State general education standard of the Republic

of Kazakhstan. The Development Plan of Educational Programs for 2019 - 2023 was developed on the basis of the Strategic Development Plan of the university and is the key document for identifying and solving the problems of the educational program.

The model of the graduate of the study program is developed on the basis of the "Regulation on the procedure for developing a plan for the development of an educational program and monitoring its implementation", which is published on the website of the university. The competence model of the graduate "Agricultural management" has a structure, which includes several main components of competence blocks and elements: "Professional activity areas", "Professional activity types", "General education competences", basic and professional competences.

As a part of the study program "Agricultural Management" students need to take an internship. The university has a number of agreements with companies and organizations that provide internship places. The internship is entered into the student's individual study plan when the student has mastered the set minimum of basic theoretical courses required to complete the internship.

The results of the internship are evaluated according to the point system and are taken into account when calculating GPA for the student's transition from one academic year to the next.

## **2.2 Assessment**

According to the national standard, the curriculum of the Master's program "Agricultural Management" (Master of Economics) has been successfully adapted to the national standard since 2009 and approved by the Ministry of Education and Science. Hence, in the specialization component, all 18 subjects of the curriculum are approved by HSWT. Currently, all components of the curriculum have been successfully implemented in the practice in terms of education, research and employment. In addition, the current local and global agricultural production system shows the relevance and necessity of this curriculum, as well as the fact that it corresponds to the goals of the Kyrgyz government and national strategies.

The study programme is in line with the University's mission and vision, as well as with the goals of the 2020-2024 strategic plan, particularly with the first three objectives of education, research and management.

The content of the educational program has a clear structure; the educational components included in the educational program make up a logical interconnected system and collectively allow the achievement of stated goals and program learning outcomes.

The strategy of S. Seifullin Kazakh Agrotechnical University until 2025 is to build a system of advanced training of specialists and scientific and pedagogical personnel in accordance with

international standards by providing wide opportunities to choose the level, content, form and duration of training based on unique curricula and academic mobility.

One of the tasks by which the strategic goals of the university will be achieved is the modernization of the educational process through the introduction of unique educational curricula developed on the basis of their own scientific results with the participation of employers, leading domestic and foreign professors and scientists as well as integration into the world scientific and educational space.

The study program “Agricultural Management” (Master of Economics) is aimed at training qualified, competitive specialists and managers which contributes to the development of efficient and sustainable production systems in the agricultural sector as well as the development of agricultural regions. Thus, this Study programme which allows to train specialists with foreign experience in economic management and new approaches in conducting scientific research, is integrated into the overall strategy of the university.

When designing the Study programme "Agrarian Management", the University ensured:

- the compliance with the purpose of the Study programme with the university's development strategy;
- the availability of clearly defined expected learning outcomes;
- the participation of students and other stakeholders in the development of the educational program;
- the external expertise and the availability of reference and information resources;
- the constant unhindered advancement of a student in the process of mastering the program;
- the determination of the expected workload of students;
- the opportunities for internships;
- the process of official approval of the program.

Students, teachers and external stakeholders take part in the development of the study program "Agricultural Management (Master of Economics)". The content of the Study programme is updated annually taking into account the expectations of employers and the individual interests of students.

Recommendations and suggestions for improving the Study programme are offered by stakeholders during round tables. Surveys of employers, meetings and communications with them are regularly conducted where comments and suggestions are made to improve further work. The questions of the questionnaire are discussed at the meetings of the department as a result

of which new elective courses are developed taking into account the wishes and suggestions of interested parties.

The teaching staff, as interested persons, immediately participate in the design of modular Study programmes through the design of specialty disciplines included in the Study programme.

The University has defined procedures for the design and approval of the Study programmes. The Study programme "Agrarian Management" corresponds to the set objective including the expected learning outcomes formed on the basis of Dublin descriptors taking into account the requirements of internal and external stakeholders.

The study program "Agricultural Management" (Master of Economics) was designed in accordance with the 7th level of the National Qualification Framework coordinated with the Dublin descriptors and the European Qualification Framework. The results of the training of the study program are determined on the basis of the Dublin descriptors of the second level in the form of competencies.

Thus, the qualification obtained during a degree program is clearly defined and communicated; it refers to the corresponding level of the national qualifications framework for higher education and, consequently, the qualifications framework for the European Higher Education Area.

The objective of the study program Agricultural Management (Master of Economics) is to train highly qualified competent specialists in the field of management of the agro-industrial complex focused on professional practical, research and scientific and pedagogical activities.

The program is characterized by practical orientation and a high level of independent work of undergraduates. It was designed jointly with experienced teachers, agricultural production workers and is focused on the strengths of agricultural education in Germany and Kazakhstan. In the course of training, the main focus is on the interactive forms (seminars, presentations, practices) and practical content (real research) in order to eventually get versatile qualified graduates who meet modern professional requirements. Independent specialized training of students provides a wide range of subjects to choose from.

The university has procedures for designing and approving its courses. The courses are designed in such a way that their objectives, including the desired learning outcomes, can be achieved.

The study program "Agricultural Management" (Master of Economics) presents the expected learning outcomes at the level of the entire program: Each module is focused on achieving a certain learning outcome, that is, competence. The learning outcomes are formulated according to the program as a whole, for each module and a separate discipline.

The following career opportunities have been defined for graduates: management of organizations, divisions, groups (teams) of employees, projects; design of strategies for the development of organizations and their individual divisions; analytical, research and teaching activities.

The structure of the Master's degree program "Agricultural Management" (Master of Economics) is formed from various types of educational and scientific work that determine the content of education, reflects their relationship, measurement and accounting. The labor intensity of all types of work is taken into account by the volume of the mastered material and is measured in Credits. Thus, there is a cumulative credit system that takes into account credits mastered at previous levels of education.

The main criterion for the completion of the educational process in the master's degree in scientific and pedagogical training is workload of at least 120 credits.

As part of Master's Student Scientific Research (MSSR) the individual work plan of a master's student provides for the mandatory scientific internship. Internships in universities of the near and far abroad are held once for the entire period of study. The duration of the internship is up to 10 days.

Undergraduates from the university receive comprehensive support in the process of organizing an internship. Scientific internships are implemented according to memoranda, agreements, contracts concluded by the university with universities of the near and far abroad.

The study program "Agricultural Management" (Master of Economics) reflects the four purposes of higher education of the Council of Europe. It allows undergraduates to receive a high-quality education not only for further work but also for life as active citizens in a democratic society, to ensure personal development and create and maintain a broad base of advanced knowledge.

All four purposes are equally important and compatible, and also reinforce each other. Many of the competencies that undergraduates will receive in order to be an active citizen will also help them find a job and will contribute to their personal development.

The formal institutional approval process of study program at the university is clearly structured.

In the process of designing study program, a committee is created to develop study program. Further, the study program is approved at a meeting of a department, then at the educational and methodological council of the faculty. Then it is approved by the Academic Council of the University.

The quality of the "Agricultural Management" (Master of Economics) is checked by an internal audit, the Academic Council of the University. External examination of Study programme is

carried out by the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan. After passing this process, Study programme is entered into the Register of study programmes.

Students' English language skills should be improved. Higher entrance requirements should be created with regard to English skills or students should be offered compulsory language courses to improve their English language skills.

Within the framework of the further development of the curriculum, current topics such as big data and digitalisation should be given greater consideration.

### **2.3 Conclusion**

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

## **3 ESG Standard 1.3: Student-centred learning, teaching, and assessment**

**Institutions should ensure that the programmes are delivered in a way that encourages students to take an active role in creating the learning process, and that the assessment of students reflects this approach**

### **3.1 Implementation**

The implementation of the goals of the study program “Agricultural Management” (Master of Economics) takes into account the needs of different groups of students, which corresponds to the mission of the university, faculty and chair.

The beginning of the student-centered studies is the preparation of a socio-psychological portrait of the newly admitted students based on an individual questionnaire survey of the 1st year students. The university sociologist is involved in developing the questionnaire and analyzing the survey results. The socio-psychological portrait of a first-year student allows to determine demographic characteristics, social status, leisure time, value orientations, attitudes to political events, religion, satisfaction with the educational process of students and their plans for the future.

In accordance with the rules of credit system, each student forms an individual study plan, which determines his individual educational path. Student advisor, a teacher, advises the student on choice of modules. The advisor monitors that all components and elements of the educational program in the student's individual curriculum is covered. Each chair discusses the subjects at the sessions of pedagogical and methodological seminars, and then proposes these subjects to the students. Afterwards, according to the accepted form, the student creates his individual curriculum, based on which the relevant department of the university creates a timetable.

All students have an opportunity to write scientific articles and abstracts, conduct scientific research during the preparation of theses, within the framework of annual participation in scientific and practical conferences. Collections of students' scientific publications are published annually.

To support student entrepreneurial initiatives, the chair of management organized the international movement "Enactus".

At the faculty there is a scientific club for the students. Students in the club prepare and participate in competitions for scientific works, international, republican scientific and practical conferences and Olympiads.

In the course of studies at the university, various teaching and learning methods such as studies, presentations, preparation of reports workshops of leading experts, face-to-face courses, round tables, competitions, business and role plays, analysis of concrete situations, case studies are used.

A lecturer can create courses in the Moodle and upload texts, files, presentations, questionnaires, etc.

The main tool for monitoring and analysing the effectiveness of study program at the Department of Management is the work of the Methodology Council, which coordinates all methodological issues of the learning process.

Different methods of ongoing control of knowledge such oral, written control, combined control, defense and presentation of self-study, discussion, training, round tables, group discussion on problematic issues, tests, project, other interactive methods are used in the study program.

The university has established a system for monitoring the quality of students' knowledge. The main forms of intermediate control are tests, written work and oral examination.

Examination materials are provided to students before the examination. The database of test materials is developed and reviewed by the instructor and approved at a department meeting. Review of exam materials verifies that the scoring criteria are consistent with the intended learning outcomes. Exam questions are evaluated in two phases: review and approval of the didactic aspects and approval of exam questions.

A student who disagrees with the result of the examination may appeal the examination no later than the next day. The appeal is made personally to the relevant appeal committee. Only contested questions (wrong question, two or more correct answers, no correct answer, etc.) are appealed. In individual cases (illness, family circumstances etc.), the Dean of the Faculty may allow the student to participate in a single examination period (early examination or extension of the examination period).

The final stage of the students' education is the final state examination. The final state examination serves to check the knowledge, skills, abilities and competences that student has acquired in the course of the study. A state attestation commission responsible for final state examination is established for each study program. The chairmen of the state attestation commission are scientists from other universities of the country and leading specialists of enterprises.

The electronic educational system "Platonus" is used for the feedback system and for providing information on the results of the assessment of students' knowledge.

Every student receives a "personal profile" through the educational platform "Platonus", where they can find necessary information, study modules and control their knowledge, it is also possible to communicate directly with lecturers live.

A number of student organizations such as the student council and the union of students are active at the university, through these organizations students interact with the management of the university and the faculty. Student leaders are elected in each faculty.

According to the regulation "On the organization of the educational process according to the credit system of education" at KATU, every student has a right to file a complaint.

All educational buildings and dormitories are installed with surveillance cameras, boxes for complaints and suggestions. The university homepage has a blog of the rector, where any student of the university can write suggestions or complaints. The administration of the university does everything to prevent conflicts of all kinds, abuses and to create a strong social and legal protection of students.

Monitoring the quality of teaching includes the evaluation of the methodological level of a particular lecturer within the framework of control visits of teaching by internal experts particularly lecturers and professors. Monitoring of student and employer satisfaction includes evaluation of the quality of education and training of professionals by means of a questionnaire.

Monitoring of professional progress of teachers includes evaluation of professional development of teachers and the degree of their compliance with the positions.

### **3.2 Assessment**

Overall, it can be stated that the teaching methods used promote student-centred learning and are sufficiently diverse. The teaching and learning forms are therefore rated as very good by the evaluators. The students provide information about a very good supervision relationship with the teaching staff. The students are very satisfied with the supervision and emphasised the excellent support and accessibility of the teaching staff. The study advisors advise students on the choice of study programme and the creation of an individual study plan.

Students are continuously supported by the teaching staff in preparing for exams. The examination regulations are also transparent.

All documents relevant to the study programme are available in the university information system.

All information on the study programme is complete and transparent. Interactive teaching methods encourage students to take an active role in the learning process.

Students receive questionnaires to evaluate their courses and the overall learning experience. Discussing the feedback from these surveys with students can be an additional valuable tool in the student-centred quality process. Students can use office hours and the various electronic communication tools to submit complaints or suggestions for improvement.

Students also have various options available for complaints about assessment.

Students are assessed through various methods, e.g. written and oral examinations, presentations and written assignments. The assessment corresponds to the intended learning outcomes. The assessment procedure and regulations are clear to students and are published at the beginning of each course.

Quality control of study preparation takes place throughout the study period and consists of sufficient different control measures:

The University provides equal opportunities for students in all fields of study, regardless of gender, nationality, religion and social status, language and mode of instruction, as well as taking into account special educational needs and individual opportunities to design an individual educational programme aimed at developing the student's professional competence and cognitive activity.

Thus, the documents and materials provided by the university indicate that the university has developed an effective system of knowledge control. It can be concluded that the university applies the principle of student-centred learning, which aims at the personal development of students and ensures equal opportunities for all groups of students.

### **3.3 Conclusion**

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

## **4 ESG Standard 1.4: Student admission, progression, recognition, and certification**

<b>Institutions should consistently apply pre-defined and published regulations covering all phases of the student "life cycle", e.g. student admission, progression, recognition and certification.</b>
--

#### 4.1 Implementation

The university develops admission plans, according to which number of lecturers and professors as well as availability of the necessary base for the educational process is determined.

Admission to the master's program is carried out in accordance with the Model Rules of Admission to Education in Educational Institutions Conducting Professional Programs for Postgraduate Education, approved by the Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018. KATU accepts citizens of the Republic of Kazakhstan, foreign citizens and stateless persons with higher education and bachelor's degree. (ANNEX 20) Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan of October 31, 2018.

Applicants and students are informed about the requirements of the educational program and the specifics of its implementation through the university's website, an annual "Open Day", information sheets and brochures, career counselling among students, invitations to open events, conferences of the university, etc.

Students are provided with the following documents: an academic calendar, programs of operational and pedagogical practices, regulations for writing theses, curriculum for all disciplines studied, catalogs of electives of the modules, an individual curriculum.

The prerequisite for a student to transfer from program to program is grade point average (GPA) not lower than the transfer grade established at a university and a full completion of the first academic stage according to the individual curriculum.

Students are transferred to the next academic year according to examination results, taking into account the results of the additional semester and the achieved transfer grade. The transfer of the student is carried out by the order of the university management. The student with educational scholarship who has achieved the specified transfer score and is transferred to the next academic year in the presence of academic debt shall eliminate the academic debt on a paid basis but shall retain the educational scholarship.

The transfer of a student from one discipline and mode of study to another within an institution of higher education on a paid basis is accompanied by the introduction of appropriate contract changes and is formalized by order of the university administration.

The university takes measures among students in order to prevent possible difficulties in the studies. According to the Quality Management System, the following information is gathered and analysed: class attendance data (by subject), information on current monthly performance in the semester and examination results. At the faculty and academic affairs department level,

summary information is gathered and analysed per group and per faculty: Final student attendance reports; current monthly progress reports; mid-term review results by exam scores. Based on the incoming information, problems in the educational process are identified and their causes are analysed.

The university helps first-year students in adaption to the university. A guide was developed, which contains necessary information about the university, library teaching, the functions of advisors and curators.

The study program "Agricultural Management" (Master of Economics) actively encourages students to self-educate and develop outside the main program. The system of self-education includes: 1) Youth Committee, which implements the youth policy at the university and participates in the organization and improvement of the educational process at the university. 2) Student Parliament - an organization that unites all public associations of KATU, forms the right moral and psychological environment among young people. 3) Youth organization "Zhas Otan" under the party "Amanat" is a voluntary association of students of KATU, representing the interests of young people of different social groups. 4) Alliance of Students of Kazakhstan - an organization that embodies the intellectual, creative, spiritual and innovative state of students of KATU, promotes student activity and healthy lifestyle. 5) The Student Council of Residence Halls coordinates the activities of student self-government at the university.

In order to ensure the representation of students in the highest governing bodies of KATU, the Academic Council includes 1 student per faculty and two students at the Faculty Council.

"Alumni" is an alumni association with a public self-government established in accordance with the applicable law. Persons who are not alumni but work at the university can also voluntarily join the club. The Alumni Club has its own website. The purpose of the club is social legal protection, financial strengthening and improvement of welfare of students, faculty and graduates of Kazakh Agricultural Technical S. Seifullin University.

The university has modern educational programs, attractive extracurricular activities, including the development of sports and creative skills; actively develops the policy of student mobility, support for talented students. But among other things, there are minor problems, for example, the organization of internships abroad, the creation of electronic manuals are better to develop.

After successful graduation a student is issued a transcript and a Diploma Supplement.

## **4.2 Assessment**

The study requirements are clearly defined and can also be viewed by applicants across parents on the university's website. The website in question is easy to find and very clearly laid out. The university has a suitable procedure for recording relevant information on the course

of studies and taking action if necessary. The review panel assesses the admission procedure as transparently described and well thought-out. At the beginning of their studies, students are sufficiently informed about the course of their studies and all opportunities to participate in university life. Upon completion of their studies, graduates therefore receive meaningful and transparent documents showing the qualifications and learning outcomes acquired. In addition, the university has sufficient procedures in place to collect information on students' progress.

Admission requirements are clearly defined. Admission in relation to the need for teachers ensures that there is no oversupply of trained teachers. In addition to the regular admission procedure, the university supports disabled students and students from national minorities.

The university monitors the development of students during their studies. An important element of student success is the sharing of information about the structure of the study programme, prerequisites for course selection, course objectives, course assignments, examinations, workload, etc. In the department, a compulsory introductory course is offered to all students, which introduces them to all the above-mentioned areas. In addition, students receive information from various counselling services throughout their stay at the university.

The degree certificates issued by the university enable students to either continue their education at institutions outside the country or to pursue a professional career abroad.

Overall, it can be said that the university has transparent enrolment procedures, records and monitors the development of students and issues sufficiently meaningful graduation certificates that demonstrate the qualifications acquired in the "Agricultural Management" (Master of Economics) program.

### 4.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

## 5 ESG Standard 1.5: Teaching staff

<b>Institutions should assure themselves of the competence of their teachers. They should apply fair and transparent processes for the recruitment and development of the staff</b>
---

### 5.1 Implementation

KATU is recognized as a research university and its development program has been approved in accordance with the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated September 1, 2020 No. 545 "On Assigning the Status of a Research University to NAG Kazakh Agricultural Technical S. Seifullin University" and confirmation of its development program for 2020 - 2024.

Human resources policy of KATU was developed in accordance with the development strategy of KATU and represents the main directions and approaches of human resource management to implement the mission and strategic goals of KATU. Kazakh Agricultural Technical S. Seifullin University annually organizes a vacancy announcement. The vacancy announcement is carried out on the basis of the regulations. The terms and conditions are available on the website.

The regulations and standards of the QMS describe the main provisions on the organizational and functional structure of the teaching staff management and its development, including the selection of personnel.

The study program need in terms of human resources is determined by the number of students enrolled and the teaching load of the chair. Qualification characteristics are intended to promote the proper selection and recruitment of personnel, improve their entrepreneurial skills, rationalize the division of labor, provide an effective mechanism for delineating functions, authorities, and responsibilities among employees, and establish uniform procedures for determining their professional duties and establish qualification requirements for them. Qualification characteristics are used as normative documents and serve as the basis for developing job descriptions that include a specific list of job responsibilities for different categories of teachers. Currently, the educational program is run by 20 full-time lecturers and 3 part-time lecturers. 70% of the lecturers have a PhD.

The university offers many opportunities for professional development of the teaching staff including internships, seminars, an internal training system, English courses, cooperation with renowned foreign professors, the opportunity to engage in creative activities etc.. In addition, the university has developed a system of social support - sports infrastructure, a pharmacy and a store which offers special discounts, an active trade union and others. For non-resident faculty or those who do not have their own apartment in Nur-Sultan, the university can provide a university housing.

The ethical behaviour and corporate culture of the faculty members of the Department of Management and the university as a whole is regulated by the Regulation "On Business Ethics, Conflict of Interest and Relationship Resolution Policy and Procedures of Decision Making".

The system of remuneration at KATU is flexible and depends on the quality of results and participation in other activities of KATU. The difference in salary depending on the performance can reach four times for the same position. A wide modern infrastructure has been provided for scientific, educational and innovative activities.

The university has developed and implemented a regulation for setting salary supplements of teaching staff. KATU applies the following types of supplements to the official salary of staff

members: for teaching English/German, for internship or study abroad, for the quality of scientific results, to perform administrative tasks, according to the evaluation results.

Targeted promotion of young scientists is provided by the Young Scientists Council of the University. Council of Young Scientists of Kazakh Agricultural Technical S. Seifullin University is a permanent collegial advisory body on honorary basis. The activities of the Council are aimed at improving the efficiency and effectiveness of scientific, pedagogical and methodological work of faculty members who are younger 40 years.

## **5.2 Assessment**

In general, according to the university's self-assessment report, the positive trends in education, research and training shows the effectiveness of the University's human resources policy. Also, bilateral and multilateral active cooperation with internal and external partners indicates that the University has been achieving good results in the field of education, research and professional training of teaching staff.

The academic and professional qualifications of the teachers involved in the implementation of the educational program ensure the achievement of the goals and program learning outcomes defined by the respective program.

Procedures for the competitive selection of teachers are transparent and allow to ensure the necessary level of their professionalism for the successful implementation of the educational programme.

The procedure of competitive selection for the positions of scientific and pedagogical workers at the University is regulated by the relevant regulations and determines the main requirements and procedures of competitive selection.

The announcement of the competition is posted on the University's website in accordance with the legislation. When evaluating candidates during the competitive selection of teachers, academic and professional qualifications are taken into account in accordance with the goals of the educational program and professional activity. The level of proficiency in the state language, foreign languages, the presence of an academic title, a scientific degree in the specialty of teaching disciplines is taken into account; availability of scientific publications, including in Scopus, WoS, textbooks, manuals, methodological developments, participation in international projects, internships, experience of teaching and practical work, participation in grant projects and research topics, etc.

The institution of higher education promotes the professional development of teachers through its own programs or in cooperation with other organizations.

The university, together with its partners, provides various forms of professional development of teachers.

Teachers improve their professional qualifications and teaching skills mostly through participation in projects, internships, trainings, etc.

The institution of higher education attracts practicing professionals, industry experts, and representatives of employers to classroom classes.

All teachers of the program improve their professional qualifications on an ongoing basis in the areas of the disciplines they teach. Teachers undergo internships, courses to improve pedagogical skills. The best practices are the academic mobility of teachers, both international and national, to participate in conferences, forums, and seminars. Active academic and professional activity contributes to the internationalization of the educational program and the University. The competitive selection procedure is transparent, takes into account teachers' professionalism, experience, and pedagogical skills.

Professional teaching is assured. Applicant selection and staff development are clearly regulated and meet all standards. There is no doubt about the academic qualifications of the teaching staff. The numerical ratio of teachers to students is very good, which is also appreciated by the students. In the discussions with lecturers and students, the impression was confirmed that the staff is very good, both quantitatively and qualitatively. The students confirmed very good supervision by the lecturers. All lecturers are very well qualified. They describe the situation in class and the contact with the lecturers as extremely pleasant and motivating. Yet, the English language skills of teaching and administrative staff should be improved and corresponding further training courses implemented.

The same standards and uniform application procedures for teaching staff should be prevailed at all partner universities.

Professional practice representatives should be consulted in an institutionalised way in curriculum development.

However, despite the above-mentioned positive trends, the University's human resources policy should continue to increase the transparency of recruitment of the teaching staff and develop new training methods, technologies and their implementation.

Depending on the need for personnel, the Saken Seifullin Kazakh Agrotechnical University annually announces a competitive selection for an academic teaching position.

The announcement of the Competition for filling vacant positions of the teaching staff is posted on the university website, other Internet resources, or in periodicals distributed throughout the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The procedure for the competitive replacement of vacant positions of the teaching staff of the university is carried out in accordance with the Regulations on the rules for the competitive replacement of vacant positions of the teaching staff of JSC "Saken Seifullin Kazakh Agrotechnical University".

To provide the transparency of the screening process of applicants for filling vacant positions of the teaching staff, two competition commissions are created at the university: the competition commission of the university and the competition commission of the faculty. At the same time, the basic goal of the work of the competition commissions are to provide everyone with equal opportunities to participate in the competition, ensure fair competition among the participants in the competition, monitor the observance of objectivity, publicity of the competition, etc.

The conclusion of the department for each candidate is adopted by open or secret ballot by a simple majority of votes. The participants of the competition have the right to attend the meeting of the department and familiarize themselves with its conclusion at their request.

The Faculty Competition Committee decides to include the candidate in the ballot for secret ballot for competitive selection for the vacant position of Associate Professor (Associate Professor), Senior Lecturer, Assistant. leading teachers of partner universities, employers, members of the board of trustees, etc. This circumstance also ensures the transparency and objectivity of the selection procedure at the university.

The personnel policy of the Saken Seifullin Kazakh Agrotechnical University was developed in accordance with the University Development Strategy and represents the main directions and approaches of personnel management for the implementation of the mission and declared strategic goals of the Saken Seifullin Kazakh Agrotechnical University.

The following principles underlie the formation and implementation of personnel policy: a democratic approach to management, respect for parity, the creation of conditions and an atmosphere of initiative and creativity, stimulation of the teaching staff, personal improvement. This approach meets modern trends in the field of work with human resources and is based on the formation and strengthening of "human capital" in the context of the transition to a knowledge society.

For the teaching staff, conditions have been created and maintained for the development of the personality of the regulation of socio-cultural processes that contribute to the strengthening of moral, civic and general cultural qualities, for the formation of general cultural (social-personal) competencies.

For the teaching staff of the educational program "Agrarian Management" there are ample opportunities for professional development - internships, seminars, an internal system of advanced training, English courses, work with famous foreign professors, the opportunity to engage in creativity and much more.

The University has developed and implemented the Regulations on the system of material incentives for the teaching staff, departments and faculties in nominations based on the results of the year. In order to motivate to achieve high production results, exemplary performance of official duties, the Regulation provides for a one-time material incentive for individual achievements of the teaching staff - in the form of a bonus.

So, in order to encourage the individual achievements of the teaching staff in scientific activities, the nominations "Productive Scientist", "Author of the Best Article" were established. In order to stimulate high individual achievements in educational activities, the nominations "Best Teacher", "Effective Teachers", "Author of a Textbook / Study Guide", "Best Language Training" were established.

As part of enhanced training, mastering innovative teaching methods, teachers annually take advanced training courses and participate in seminars. In the educational process, teachers use innovative educational technologies and modern teaching methods.

In order to implement student-centered learning, teachers use various teaching methods and technologies that take into account the variety of forms and assimilation of information. The university implements the principles of academic honesty.

The university offers sufficient support to teachers regarding the acquisition of new teaching methods and technologies and their implementation. To do this, in accordance with the Regulations on the establishment and allowances for the teaching staff, by order of the Chairman of the Board of the Company to the official salaries of the teaching staff, allowances are established for the official salary of employees for teaching in English, for internships or studying abroad, for the quality of scientific results, for performing administrative functions, as well as an allowance based on the results of the rating.

These allowances are personal bonuses of a stimulating nature for the results of the teaching staff's own achievements and are included in the basic salary. The main requirements

for the establishment of allowances are set out in the Regulation on the establishment of allowances for the teaching staff.

The remuneration system at the Saken Seifullin Kazakh Agrotechnical University is flexible - depending on the quality of the results and involvement in other activities of the Saken Seifullin Kazakh Agrotechnical University, the difference in wages for the same position can reach 4 times. A wide modern infrastructure has been provided for scientific, educational and innovative activities.

The purposeful development of young teachers is provided by the Council of Young Scientists of the Saken Seifullin Kazakh Agrotechnical University, which is a permanent collegial advisory body on a voluntary basis. The activities of the council are aimed at improving the efficiency and effectiveness of scientific, educational and methodological work of teachers up to 40 years old.

Currently, the educational program is being implemented by 20 full-time teachers and 3 part-time teachers, including doctors of science - 2, candidates of science - 8, doctors of PhD - 2 and masters in the profile of the Educational program - 8. Thus, the degree of the department is 60%, and the degree OP is 70%, which meets the requirements. All teachers serving the EP in major disciplines have advanced training and sufficient work experience. The quantitative and qualitative composition of the teaching staff of the graduating department is stable.

Classes in the direction of "Agricultural Management" (Master of Economics) are taught by highly qualified teachers who have been trained in leading universities in Germany, Russia and Ukraine. In the educational process, teachers use educational and methodological literature developed by Kazakh and German scientists based on the experience of developed countries with a market economy.

### **5.3 Conclusion**

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

## **6 ESG Standard 1.6: Learning resources and student support**

<b>Institutions should have appropriate funding for learning and teaching activities and ensure that adequate and readily accessible learning resources and student support are provided.</b>
---

## 6.1 Implementation

Resource needs are determined taking into account the "Rules of organization of the educational process for credit technology of education", general provisions developed by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan in accordance with the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education".

Every year the chair secures funds in the state procurement plan to expand the material and technical base.

The educational process is fully provided with all necessary sources of information: textbooks, teaching aids, active handouts and guide to self-study, e-textbooks and access to network educational resources.

Continuous improvement of material-technical and information resources is one of the main factors in ensuring the quality of a study program. The faculty has more than 150 computers in 10 computer labs and classrooms, interactive whiteboards, monitors, beamers and printers. Within the framework of the implementation of the international project (Sustainable Agriculture and Rural Development in Russian Federation and Kazakhstan, Project No. 561969-EPP-1-2015-1-DE-EPPKA2-CBHE-JP 15.10.2015 - 10 /14/2018, coordinated by the University of Hohenheim) modern equipment DigiTouch interactive panel, electronic flipchart, conference camera, computer were installed in a seminar room) and economic literature (171 copies) including in English were handed over to the university library. Within the framework of the program German Language Studies in CEE/CIS (DAAD project number 57565520 coordinated by the Weihenstephan-Triesdorf University of Applied Sciences) modern equipment: laptops, printers, conference camera, textbooks in German and English languages were purchased.

A special room is available to students for self-study. The room is equipped with modern computers, a multimedia beamer and a screen, as well as Internet access, which creates conditions for obtaining a wide range of up-to-date information in the learning process and in preparation for a final theses.

The library is the most important part of the information infrastructure of the University. Effective support of educational and research processes at the University, organization of access for readers to the global information flow, dissemination of traditions of world and national culture are the main goals of library development. KATU conducts systematic studies of student satisfaction with the information and library services.

In 2013, KATU Library joined the Association of University Libraries of the Republic of Kazakhstan (VUB RK) and since then participates in the annual conferences of VUB RK. The most important milestone of the modern period is a major project - work with the automated library

information system "Irbis", which was acquired by the University at the end of 2002. This information system allows to improve the methods of library work and to create maximum convenience in serving readers.

The library received annual access to Scopus and Scival databases based on an agreement with Elsevier.

Access to the E-copies of books of the libraries of Kazakhstan is open, including the National Library of the Republic of Kazakhstan in Almaty, the Science Center of the Eurasian Gumilyov National University "Otyrar kitapkhanasy", regional libraries, university libraries and personally by the authors: famous scientists, writers, etc., also to the Russian Scientific Electronic Library (licensed access), which is integrated into the Russian Science Citation Index (RSCI). Each year readers obtain more than 7 million full-text articles from the library and view more than 22 million abstracts.

The university website has an educational portal that contains useful information for students, staff, and applicants. On the portal there is a description of the credit system for education, as well as definitions of specific terminologies that help applicants and first-year students get detailed information about how their education and knowledge assessment is conducted.

The university has an educational portal, through which several surveys such as on causes of corruption in the university, the level of satisfaction with living conditions and the level of satisfaction with the quality of education of students at KATU is conducted. The surveys are conducted anonymously.

At the university, each student can get a room in a dormitory. The area of the dormitory is 28022,5 m<sup>2</sup> and it is designed for 2180 people.

The "Center for Careers and Business" has been in operation since 2015. The center acts as a central link between the university and employers, assisting students and graduates of the university with career planning and development, as well as establishing and maintaining communication with the university.

## **6.2 Assessment**

The ratio between the number of students and the teaching materials and spaces is appropriate. Libraries and classrooms are well digitised and it should be mentioned which has a positive effect on the development process of student-centred learning. Therefore, the premises and equipment are adequate to support the effective implementation of the programme objectives and learning success in all respects.

From the meeting with the student council and the self-evaluation report, it can be concluded that the information provided to the students about the service facilities of the university is very good.

The resource facilities of the study programme can be described as very good. The modern and excellent equipment, which corresponds to the subject standards, is suitable for providing students with a sound education. In the opinion of the review panel, the overall resource endowment is thus very well suited for the implementation of the degree programme. Buildings, rooms and technical equipment can be described as exemplary. The library offers students extensive support in searching for information and using the available technology. The university is also well equipped for digital teaching.

The needs of a heterogeneous student body are also adequately addressed. Internal quality assurance takes material resources into account in its evaluation culture and regularly solicits feedback from students. The evaluation team assesses all material, financial and human resources as fully sufficient to achieve the qualification goals of the study programme. The needs of a heterogeneous student body are taken into account in every respect.

For the administrative staff, there is the possibility of individual further development. The scope and qualifications of the non-academic administrative staff can be described as very good. Sufficient opportunities for further training are available.

It can be stated that the degree programme has a high degree of studyability. Yet, the University of Applied Science Weihenstephan-Triesdorf should establish a good administrative infrastructure for all partner universities and create even more support services in general and during student mobility phases with a view to even better studyability.

In order to guarantee the implementation of the study programme, the staff should also grow with the increasing number of students.

### **6.3 Conclusion**

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

## **7 ESG Standard 1.7: Information management**

<b>Institutions should ensure that they collect, analyse and use relevant information for the effective management of their programmes and other activities.</b>
--

## 7.1 Implementation

The university has several information systems which include a website, automated information system for the management of the educational process "Platonus", "1C: PROF University", AIS "Electronic Selection Committee", AIS "Electronic Library", Electronic document management system "ARTASynergy, Documentologist. All of the above-mentioned information systems use electronic databases DBMS MySQL. Responsible for their functioning and reliability of information are Department of Student Affairs, Registrar, Education and Methods Council, Scientific Library, Department of Information Technology, Department of Technology Management and Document Management.

KATU ensures the functioning of the system for collecting, analysing and managing information based on the use of modern information and communication technologies and software tools, the introduction of the automated information system Platonus in the educational process.

AIS "Platonus" provides each student and staff with a personal profile that allows university staff to automate their tasks and for students to view the required information. Distance learners can get instant access to electronic educational and methodological material and communicate with lecturers in real time via the global Internet or the internal network of the university.

Documentary approval of the procedures for processing information on personal data of students, staff and faculty is regulated in the Statute of KATU.

Personal information about students is created in "Personal card of the student" when enrolling in the Platonus program. The card contains the following personal data: Data from the identity card, on education, contact details, orders on free movement of the student, employment details.

The Quality Manual describes internal quality assurance system and the process of using the gathered data. The Quality Service conducts control on all processes implemented in the structural areas of the University on the basis of the documented procedure "Internal Audit".

A system of regular reporting is implemented within the study program which includes the effectiveness and efficiency of the department and its evaluation at the university level. The department produces semi-annual and annual reports covering all areas of departmental work, as well as reports from faculty, trustees, and consultants. The structure of the reports is determined by the forms approved by the appropriate documented procedures.

To determine consumer satisfaction (both external and internal), an annual survey is conducted of the main groups: students, faculty and staff. The information collected and analysed

on the study program includes data on the student contingent, student progress and performance, student satisfaction with the implementation of the study program, availability of educational resources and support systems for students, employment and career growth of graduates.

The university, in accordance with the regulations "On Information Security Policy at S.Sejfullin KATU", defines the procedure for ensuring the protection of information and responsible persons for the reliability and timeliness of information analysis and data provision.

The university has various mechanisms of communication with students, faculty, staff, and employers through the educational process, advising events, information booths, the Platonus system, the university website, the university's educational portal, the Facebook social network, media, "My University" newspaper, etc. All information on students' learning progress is reflected in the students' Individual Study Plan, which they complete at the beginning of the academic year. Students can track their progress and achievements at any time on their personal profiles and find information related to the educational process. The Regulation "On the Procedure for Conducting Sociological Research in JSC S. Sejfullin KATU" and the Regulation "On the Procedure for Managing the Feedback Process in JSC S. Sejfullin KATU" have been developed.

In order to analyse opinion of the external stakeholders, the university surveys employers of the graduates of KATU. When studying the internal environment, employees and students are asked about study and working conditions, job security, quality of services, etc. Surveys are conducted on corruption at the university and religious extremism. The survey is conducted anonymously twice a year. The results of the survey are processed by the Sociological Laboratory of the university, the weaknesses and strengths and recommendations are identified, the results are brought to the attention of the management, which takes measures to eliminate deficiencies and improve processes.

Monitoring of labor employment of graduates is the basis for analysing the demand for graduates and identifying trends in the structure of distribution of graduates by employment. Monitoring of employment is carried out in the form of a questionnaire after graduation from the university, and the information is compiled by the coordinators of the Department and the Center for the Development of Entrepreneurship, Career and Business.

The university has developed the regulation "On Privacy Policy in JSC" S. Sejfullin KATU. Confidential information about each study program participant is located in the Platonus database, to which only the user has access. Students, employees and teachers write an application to the Rector stating their consent to the processing of personal data.

## 7.2 Assessment

The university has a well-functioning information management system. The administration has thorough data collection systems. The current and complete data structure is used very well for the internal quality management system. The evaluation of the data is accompanied by quality assurance measures and planning of follow-up activities.

The programme uses the existing infrastructure of the university to collect student feedback on individual courses and lectures as well as on the environment at the university in general. Students report that they feel encouraged to give feedback to lecturers and that their feedback is well received by lecturers. A survey of student satisfaction with the quality and conditions of the study programme is conducted annually to investigate student opinion on the quality of the University's educational and administrative services.

For the programme that is in the process of being accredited, there is sufficient information to attract applicants.

The university has the necessary procedures for collecting and analysing information about the programme, including key performance indicators, information about the student body, the level of academic achievement, student performance and examinations. Students are provided with educational resources and student support services.

The expert group therefore notes that the university regularly collects and analyses information on the study programme, students, graduates and other activities as part of the quality management system and makes it available to the internal quality assurance system.

Both students and teachers are involved in the processes through a procedure and existing structures at the university. In addition, graduates and employers are also involved in the process.

Thus, as part of the university's quality management, data on students is collected and their assessment is carried out. Also based on the self-evaluation report of the university and the discussions during the online evaluation, the expert group was able to confirm that the institution implements the necessary measures to assess the quality of teaching.

Information management includes the use of various methods to provide information. Confidentiality of information is also guaranteed.

## 7.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

## 8 ESG Standard 1.8: Public information

**Institutions should publish information about their activities, including programmes, which is clear, accurate, objective, up-to date and readily accessible.**

### 8.1 Implementation

The university organizes an annual graduate fair, to which potential employers from various organizations are invited to get up-to-date information about the requirements for specialists on the market.

On the website of the university interested persons can find comprehensive information on admission and individual study programs. The website contains information about the Chair of Management, curriculum of study program, study conditions and forms, a brief description of the scope of application of knowledge, career prospects, description of skills, content of study program, modular educational program, study program development plan, research work of the Department under the programs of the Ministry of Education and Science of the RK and the Ministry of Agriculture of the RK, the place of study program in the national rating of the Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating.

KATU's website features "Graduates are Our Pride" and "Alumnis" sections that provide information on graduates' achievements.

The main sources of information about the university's activities and implementation of educational programs are the website, newspapers "Kazakhstanskaya Pravda", "Aksham", intra-university newspaper "Menin Universitym" and television channels: Kazakhstan, Astana etc.

The university has official pages on popular social networks such as Facebook, Twitter, V Kontakte and Youtube.

Stakeholders' satisfaction with the quality of information received and its completeness is monitored through comments on social networks, through the Complaints Book and Rector's blog

Scientific publications of lecturers are discussed on the information platforms ResearchGate and G-Global.

Every year the Rector of the university prepares a report on the work accomplished during the year, the electronic version of which is available on the website.

On the university's website, the Press Center publishes up-to-date information on upcoming events, conferences and other events of Kazakh Agrotechnical Saken Seifullin University.

The most interesting events are published in the Menin Universitim newspaper. At the Press Center, a student television studio runs weekly newscasts that are aired on the university's internal radio and social networking sites.

The university Press Center systematically informs the public about cooperation and interaction with external partners, including research institutes and centers, consulting organizations, business partners, social partners, public organizations, and partner universities.

The Center for International Cooperation and Multilingual Education, whose main tasks are to support and develop international activities and cooperation, publishes information such as invited foreign lecturers and scientists, internships abroad and foreign partners on the website.

The university website publishes current information on research projects, meetings, conferences, seminars and events.

## **8.2 Assessment**

The main source of public information about the study program "Agricultural Management" (Master of Economics) is the official website of the university, the website of the Faculty of Agricultural Economics, the website of the Faculty of Agrobusiness and Management, and website of the Master's Center which is the graduation department for this study program.

All persons interested in receiving information about events at the university and, in particular, information updates on program have informational support through close communication using various social networks: Facebook, Instagram. The Master's Preparing Center additionally highlights all information related to the program on its official Facebook page. Considerable attention is paid to the coverage of all events related to the organization of the educational process, the life of students and graduates. The university has its own YouTube channel, where all scientific and educational events of the university are covered and students upload videos. Students can find here the information about the history of successful partnership, advantages of studying the master's program etc.

The university offers detailed information on studying and teaching as well as on the university's main research areas. Organisational documents and relevant regulations are made available on the website. Contact persons and contact points for the degree programme and student life are clearly and transparently named.

The information provided to the public about the degree programme is satisfactory overall. There are many opportunities for prospective students to find out about the university and student life.

Information about study programmes is publicly available (admission criteria, learning outcomes, qualifications awarded, information about employment of graduates, etc.). Information

about the study programme that is in line with the university's mission is secured. High school graduates, students, graduates and other interested groups can find out about the university's activities and offers on its homepage. In addition, contact persons are named for further information and questions. Yet there should be better strategic communication activities developed to publicise the study offer in order to arouse the interest of potential applicants in the long term.

The university provides information about its activities, such as the degree programme and the selection criteria for admission, the intended learning outcomes of the degree programmes, the teaching, learning and examination methods, the student success rates and the qualifications of the teaching staff.

In addition, the university provides information on its homepage about its academic achievements, such as publications, external and internal conferences and events, as well as non-academic achievements, such as cultural and social projects and activities.

The study-related documents and information are to be accessible to both students and prospective students. In addition, contact persons are named for further information and questions.

The university provides information about its activities. The University conducts its activities based on the principles of transparency, openness, involvement and awareness-raising of all stakeholders in educational activities: One of the main means of providing information is through the use of information technology and media. In addition to the information on the university's website, the public and applicants are provided with information on the specifics of the study program "Agricultural Management" (Master of Economics) under accreditation through events such as the Open Day.

### 8.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

## 9 ESG Standard 1.9: On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes

**Institutions should monitor and periodically review their programmes to ensure that they achieve the objectives set for them and respond to the needs of students and society. These reviews should lead to continuous improvement of the programme. Any action planned or taken as a result should be communicated to all those concerned.**

### 9.1 Implementation

The university regularly monitors and evaluates the study program to achieve set goals and meet the needs of students and society.

Changes to the educational programs are made in accordance with the requirements of the legislative and regulatory documents of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the field of higher education and requirements of the society and labor market. The results of these processes are aimed at continuous improvement of the study program. In addition, new elective courses reflecting the current state of the economy are periodically included. Meeting the needs of the labor market is ensured through the participation of farm, industry, and service sector representatives in the development of catalogue of electives.

Study program quality monitoring includes:

- internal evaluation of the study program (assessment of the chair, assessment of the persons responsible for study program implementation at the university, assessment of the teaching staff, self-assessment of the study program in the context of accreditation, assessment of teaching quality, review of activities related to study program implementation)
- internal assessment of the university's activities: Self-assessment and compliance with regulatory documents (standards, guidelines for self-assessment) of accrediting independent agencies; external assessment: specialized (program) accreditation, study program rating, state final certification of students; external evaluation of the university's educational activities: examination for legal compliance, institutional accreditation, rating.

At least once a year educational and methodological complexes of the subjects are reviewed by members of the Educational and Methodological Council of the Faculty.

Monitoring of planned activities within the framework of study program implementation and evaluation is carried out in meetings of the Chair, Faculty Council and Department of Student Affairs. At the meetings, the implementation of the plans is reviewed; conformity of the results of the processes with the planned indicators; appropriate evaluation is carried out; if necessary, corrective actions are developed to eliminate deficiencies and omissions in the work.

Monitoring and periodic evaluation of the study program takes into account the content of programs in the light of the latest scientific achievements in a particular discipline to ensure the relevance of the discipline taught, changes in the needs of society and the professional environment, student load, academic performance and graduation, the effectiveness of student assessment procedures and student expectations, needs and satisfaction with education. In addition, the study program are updated annually, taking into account the interests of the labor market. As the survey of the department shows, more than 90% of students and employers are satisfied with the quality of education at KATU.

Educational programs are reviewed at a meeting of the Chair of Management with the participation of employers, the Council of the Faculty and approved by the Academic Council of the university. Monitoring of the quality of educational programs is carried out by the Academic Council of the university through internal audits. The external audit of the study program is conducted by the Ministry of Education and Science of the RK. After passing the external audit, the study program is registered in the Register of Educational Programs of Higher Education.

## 9.2 Assessment

The Examination of the regulatory documents in the Academic Policy section of the University's website, the self-evaluation report, the results of the faculty and student survey, and the results of the online survey confirmed that monitoring and regular evaluation of the study program "Agricultural Management" (Master of Economics) is carried out at the University.

The schedule of activities for monitoring the quality of education was approved, according to which the University monitors and regularly evaluates the study programmes in order to achieve the objectives and meet the needs of students and society. In order to determine the level of satisfaction of internal needs, the University organises and conducts a survey among students, faculty and University staff every academic session.

The survey is conducted to determine the level of satisfaction with the students' educational needs, their attitude towards the educational process, the socio-cultural environment, etc.

The results of the survey are statistically analysed, discussed in the administrative meetings and taken into account in the further planning of educational activities. According to the monitoring statistics, the programme management analyses and compiles the survey results in order to initiate the necessary measures to achieve the desired results.

The existing quality management seems to function according to a hierarchical principle. However, the goal is a functioning control circle between the participants in order to improve the quality of research and teaching (Circle of Quality). This Circle of Quality functions according to the bottom up - top down principle.

The university regularly reviews the strategy and policy in the area of quality and monitors its implementation.

Overall, it should be noted that responsibilities are clearly and comprehensibly regulated, not least because the core processes of quality assurance are documented in the university's regulations.

Feedback between students and teachers is a prerequisite for improving teaching and should be introduced. The evaluation results of the anonymous course evaluations will be presented

to the students after the surveys and discussed with them in order to derive concrete measures for improving teaching.

It became clear in the discussions that there is definitely close contact with the graduates and that they are surveyed very soon after graduation.

The course evaluations thus serve the continuous development and improvement of quality and studyability. The student workload is continuously surveyed in the course evaluations; corresponding questions are included in the questionnaires. An evaluation of the workload through a module should take place at regular intervals.

Students are made aware of the student workload and examination requirements by the lecturers at the beginning of the course. In the degree programme, the measure of how many hours one ECTS point corresponds to the student workload is anchored in the regulatory documents.

With regard to the quality of teaching, it should be noted that measures to ensure it begin with the recruitment of teaching staff. In addition, the university offers teaching staff various further training opportunities, both on technical and didactic topics.

It can be stated that there is a combination of internal and external quality management in order to offer its own study program in a generally ESG-compliant manner.

The study programme “Agricultural Management” (Master of Economics) is regularly evaluated to ensure quality and to check compliance with the high quality standards. Ongoing monitoring of the study programme is carried out in accordance with the quality assurance policy. The programme is reviewed regularly and if changes are required, they are made. This process is exemplary. The study program thus have suitable and different procedures for internal quality assurance.

The University has a systematic procedure of analysis, development, monitoring and periodic revision of the educational program. Employers who confirmed this process as transparent, understandable and accessible are involved in the improvement of the educational program. A culture of quality has been formed in the academic community of the University, which contributes to the continuous development of the educational program and educational activities under this program.

The process of collecting proposals from various groups of stakeholders is insufficiently organized. It is recommended to strengthen work on the organization of the process of collecting proposals from various groups of stakeholders.

Standardised evaluation procedures should be introduced, in order to advance the quality assurance of the study programme and, if necessary, to be able to derive recommendations for action.

### 9.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

## 10 ESG Standard 1.10: Cyclical external quality assurance

<b>Institutions should undergo external quality assurance in line with the ESG on a cyclical basis</b>
--

### 10.1 Implementation

Quality assurance of education has become the basis of the state educational policy of the Republic of Kazakhstan, aimed at improving the quality of education, defining criteria, norms and quality standards, increasing the level of knowledge and practical skills of students, scientific and pedagogical and methodological support of the learning process, improving the material, technical, social and information infrastructure of the university, mechanisms and tools for managing a higher education institution.

Since 2005, KATU has been using international standards and has implemented and certified a quality management system to correspond to MS ISO 9001-2015. The maintenance of the functioning quality management system is carried out through the improvement of the internal set of rules, which consists of more than 300 documents, through the systematic implementation of internal audits, as well as through the inspection control by the certification body.

In addition to internal evaluation, the educational program is evaluated as part of the planned state certification and national accreditation process. The state certification format includes an independent external review and survey of students.

In 2016, the master's program "Agricultural Management" was accredited by ACQUIN until September 2021 as part of the international cooperation with Weihenstephan-Triesdorf University of Applied Sciences (Germany).

The university participates in international and Kazakh rankings, such as QS World University Rankings, Times Higher Education World University Rankings, Webometrics Ranking of World Universities, Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating (IAAR) and the Independent Kazakh Agency for Education Quality Assurance (IQAA).

The results of the external evaluation are published on the university's website in the form of a certificate obtained during the external evaluation.

## 10.2 Assessment

As far as the legal framework of quality assurance is concerned, the study programme is conducted in accordance with the regulations and guidelines. For this purpose, the university has a combination of internal and external quality management to offer the study programme in accordance with the ESG. The university has undergone institutional accreditation. The accreditation results are incorporated into the structuring of the university's business processes. Of particular importance is the cooperation with external stakeholders such as partner universities, graduates, industry and employers in order to gain impetus for continuous internal quality development.

Quality management ensures very well that the general quality assurance measures and instruments are constantly up-to-date and transparent. The university fulfils all obligatory aspects of external quality assurance: the different organisational units and levels are adequately in place and were explained in detail in the interviews with the HEI. Both internal and external quality assurance of the university's measures take into account all legal requirements and benefit from each other to advance the quality development of the study programme. External quality assurance extends to all necessary organisational levels such as financial operations and educational provision. The internal and external quality assurance mechanisms for the continuous development of the programme is well developed and the cyclical functioning of the programme's quality assessment is effective. The quality of the surveys and the processing of the results can be rated as very good. No specific problems in the cyclical external quality assurance were reported for the study programme.

The follow-up activities of the university's external quality assurance in preparing the next procedure are generally well thought out. The results of the external assessment and recognition of the quality of the study program (reports, expert opinions, etc.) are published on the university's website.

In conclusion, the coherence between external and internal quality assurances is well structured.

## 10.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

#### IV Recommendation to the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN

##### 1 **Assessment of compliance the Standards and Guidelines in the Higher European Area (ESG) in the actual official version**

The study programme “**Agricultural Management**” (**Master of Economics**) was assessed on the basis of the "Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area" (ESG) and the national or other relevant regulations.

The expert group concludes that the **ESG standards** 1.1 (Policy for quality assurance), 1.2 (Design and approval of programmes), 1.3 (Student-centred learning, teaching and assessment), 1.4 (Student admission, progression, recognition and certification), 1.5 (Teaching staff), 1.6 (Learning resources and student support), 1.7 (Information management), 1.8 (Public information), 1.9 (On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes) and 1.10 (Cyclical external quality assurance) are fulfilled.

The assessment criteria are as follows:

**Standard 1.1 Policy for quality assurance:** Universities have a publicly accessible quality assurance strategy, which is part of their strategic management. This strategy is developed and implemented by internal stakeholder representatives through appropriate structures and processes, involving external stakeholders.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.2 Design and approval of programmes:** Universities have procedures for the design and approval of their courses. The courses are designed in such a way that their objectives, including the desired learning outcomes, can be achieved. The qualification obtained during a degree program is clearly defined and communicated; it refers to the corresponding level of the national qualifications framework for higher education and, consequently, the qualifications framework for the European Higher Education Area.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.3 Student-centred learning, teaching and assessment:** Universities ensure that the courses offered are carried out in such a way as to encourage students to play an active role in the design of the learning process and that this approach is also taken into account when assessing students / examinations.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.4 Student admission, progression, recognition and certification:** Universities ensure that the courses offered are carried out in such a way as to encourage students to play an active role in the design of the learning process and that this approach is also taken into account when assessing students / examinations.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.5 Teaching staff:** Universities ensure the competence of their teachers. They use fair and transparent procedures for the recruitment and further training of their employees.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.6 Learning resources and student support:** The university has adequate funding to finance study and teaching and ensure that there is always a sufficient and readily available range of learning and support available for their studies.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.7 Information management:** Universities ensure that they collect, analyze and use the relevant data relevant to the successful conduct of studies and other activities.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.8 Public information:** Universities publish easily understandable, correct, objective, up-to-date and well-accessible information about their activities and courses of study.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.9 On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes:** Universities are constantly monitoring their courses and regularly reviewing them to ensure that they achieve the goals set and meet the needs of students and society. The tests lead to a continuous improvement of the courses. All affected parties will be informed about any measures planned or resulting from this.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.10 Cyclical external quality assurance:** Universities regularly undergo external quality assurance procedures in accordance with the ESG.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

The peer-review experts note that the recommendations from the previous accreditation procedure have been adequately taken into account.

## 2 Accreditation Recommendation

The peer-review experts recommend an unconditional accreditation of the study programme **“Agricultural Management (Master of Economics)”** with the following **recommendations**:

1. Students' English language skills should be improved. Higher entrance requirements should be created with regard to English skills or students should be offered compulsory language courses to improve their English language skills.
2. Within the framework of the further development of the curriculum, current topics such as big data and digitalisation should be given greater consideration.
3. The same standards and uniform application procedures for teaching staff should prevail at all partner universities.
4. The English language skills of teaching and administrative staff should be improved and corresponding further training courses implemented.
5. Professional practice representatives should be consulted in an institutionalised way in curriculum development.
6. The HSWT should establish a good administrative infrastructure for all partner universities and create even more support services in general and during student mobility phases with a view to even better studyability.
7. In order to guarantee the implementation of the study programmes, the staff should also grow with the increasing number of students.
8. Better strategic communication activities should be developed to publicise the study offer in order to arouse the interest of potential applicants in the long term.
9. Standardised evaluation procedures should be introduced, in order to advance the quality assurance of the study programme and, if necessary, to be able to derive recommendations for action.

## **V Decisions of the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN**

Based on the evaluation report of the expert group and the statements of the Higher Education Institutions the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN makes on the 09 May 2023 the following decisions unanimously:

**The study programme “Agricultural Management” (Master of Economics) at the S. Seifullin Kazakh Agro Technical University is accredited without any conditions.**

**The accreditation is valid until 30. September 2031.**

The following recommendations are given for the further development of the study programme:

- Students' English language skills should be improved. Higher entrance requirements should be created with regard to English skills or students should be offered compulsory language courses to improve their English language skills.
- Within the framework of the further development of the curriculum, current topics such as big data and digitalisation should be given greater consideration.
- The same standards and uniform application procedures for teaching staff should be prevailed at all partner universities.
- The English language skills of teaching and administrative staff should be improved and corresponding further training courses implemented.
- Professional practice representatives should be consulted in an institutionalised way in curriculum development.
- The HSWT should establish a good administrative infrastructure for all partner universities and create even more support services in general and during student mobility phases with a view to even better studyability.
- In order to guarantee the implementation of the study programmes, the staff should also grow with the increasing number of students.
- Better strategic communication activities should be developed to publicise the study offer in order to arouse the interest of potential applicants in the long term.
- Standardised evaluation procedures should be introduced, in order to advance the quality assurance of the study programme and, if necessary, to be able to derive recommendations for action.
- It is recommended to carry out further development of the internal quality assurance system by timely response to legislative changes, and by improving the coordination of measures to monitor the quality of the educational programme and educational activities at the University level.
- The expert group recommends involving students more in the work of the department in order to take their wishes and suggestions more into account when planning and implementing the educational process, selecting, reviewing and updating the educational programme.
- It is recommended to ensure the teaching of professional disciplines by a specialist with appropriate qualifications.