

## **Accreditation Report**

### **National University of Life and Environmental Sciences of Ukraine Ukraine**

#### **Master programme in Administrative Management (M.Sc.)**

#### **I Procedure**

**Date of contract:** 19 January 2022

**Date of the submission of self-assessment report:** 2 August 2022

**Date of site visit:** 21 September 2022

**Attendance by ACQUIN office:** Dr. Jasmine Rudolph

**Accreditation decision:** 9 Mai 2023

#### **Peer review experts:**

- **Prof. Dr. Elena Kashtanova**, Anhalt University of Applied Sciences, Professor of International Trade in Agribusiness
- **FH-Prof. MMag. Dr. Michael Schmidthaler**, Upper Austria University of Applied Sciences, Professor and Head of study programme Agricultural Management and Innovations
- **Prof. Dr. Thore Toews**, Technical University Bingen, Professor for applied agricultural business management, agricultural accounting and taxation, taxation theory, agricultural business planning and controlling
- **Farhod Ahrorov**, PhD, Vice-Rector Samarkand branch of Tashkent State University of Economics (Uzbekistan)
- **Dr. Alen Mujcinovic**, Associate Professor, Faculty of Agriculture and Food Sciences University of Sarajevo Sarajevo (Bosnia and Herzegovina)
- **Professor Anargul Belgibayeva**, Sh. Ualikhanov Kokshetau University, Department of Business and Services
- **Marat Onaev**, Zhangir Khan University (Uralsk, Kazakhstan), Director of the Institute of Agrotechnology

Date of the publication: 9 June 2023

- **Rinat Fazylbekov**, Deputy Head, Department of technology innovation Kazakh Research Institute of Plant, Protection and Quarantine
- **Professor Dr. Aleksandra Mandych**, State Biotechnological University, (Kharkiv, Ukraine), Economics and Management of Enterprise
- **Professor Dr. Volodymyr Pysarenko**, Poltava State Agrarian University (Poltava, Ukraine), Head of marketing department
- **Professor Valentina Yakubiv**, Vasyl Stefanyk Precarpathian National University, Vice-Rector for Research, Department of Business Administration
- **Alina Magomedova**, PhD, Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv, Associate Professor, Department of Business Economics
- **Nurgaziev Mairambek**, PhD, Associate Professor, American University of Central Asia, Bishkek, Kyrgyzstan
- **Ulrich Pingel**, CEO, Agralis GmbH
- **Sandra Koop**, University Kiel, Student of Agricultural Sciences (M.Sc.)

The **Assessment Report** of the peer-review experts is **based on** the self-assessment report of the Higher Education Institution (HEI) and extensive discussions with the HEI management, deans and/or heads of the departments, heads of study programme(s), lecturers, staff representatives, students, and alumni.

The basis of the **Assessment Criteria** is part 1 of the “Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area” (ESG) in the current official version. At the same time the national context, particularly the national regulations regarding the establishment of study programmes, are taken into account.

**Content**

<b>I</b>	<b>Procedure</b> .....	1
<b>II</b>	<b>Introduction</b> .....	6
	1 Short profile of HEI .....	6
	2 General information on the study programme .....	9
	3 Results of the previous accreditation .....	9
<b>III</b>	<b>Implementation and assessment of the criteria</b> .....	11
	1 ESG Standard 1.1: Policy for quality assurance .....	11
	1.1 Implementation .....	11
	1.2 Assessment .....	12
	1.3 Conclusion .....	13
	2 ESG Standard 1.2: Design and approval of programmes .....	13
	2.1 Implementation .....	14
	2.2 Assessment .....	19
	2.3 Conclusion .....	20
	3 ESG Standard 1.3: Student-centred learning, teaching, and assessment .....	20
	3.1 Implementation .....	20
	3.2 Assessment .....	22
	3.3 Conclusion .....	23
	4 ESG Standard 1.4: Student admission, progression, recognition, and certification .....	23
	4.1 Implementation .....	23
	4.2 Assessment .....	24
	4.3 Conclusion .....	24
	5 ESG Standard 1.5: Teaching staff .....	25
	5.1 Implementation .....	25
	5.2 Assessment .....	26
	5.3 Conclusion .....	28
	6 ESG Standard 1.6: Learning resources and student support .....	28
	6.1 Implementation .....	28
	6.2 Assessment .....	31
	6.3 Conclusion .....	32
	7 ESG Standard 1.7: Information management .....	32
	7.1 Implementation .....	32
	7.2 Assessment .....	33
	7.3 Conclusion .....	34
	8 ESG Standard 1.8: Public information .....	34
	8.1 Implementation .....	34
	8.2 Assessment .....	35
	8.3 Conclusion .....	36

9	ESG Standard 1.9: On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes .....	37
9.1	Implementation .....	37
9.2	Assessment .....	39
9.3	Conclusion .....	40
10	ESG Standard 1.10: Cyclical external quality assurance .....	41
10.1	Implementation .....	41
10.2	Assessment .....	42
10.3	Conclusion .....	43
<b>IV</b>	<b>Recommendation to the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN</b> .....	<b>44</b>
1	Assessment of compliance the Standards and Guidelines in the Higher European Area (ESG) in the actual official version .....	44
2	Accreditation Recommendation .....	46
<b>V</b>	<b>Decisions of the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN</b> .....	<b>47</b>

## **II Introduction**

The experts would like to thank the representatives of the HEI as well as students that they have taken part in the discussions and willingly shared information and their views during the site visit. The discussions are valuable not only for the assessment of the institution, but also for a better understanding of the legal and sociocultural context of the local higher education system.

Evaluation basis for the peer-review experts is the self-assessment report of the HEI as well as intensive discussions during the site visit with the HEI management, deans and/or heads of the departments, head(s) of the study programme, study programme coordinators, teachers, lecturers, administrative staff, students, and graduates.

Main objective of the accreditation procedure is to assess the quality of the study programmes and compliance with the "Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area" (ESG). The ESG standards are applied as main assessment criteria in the international accreditation procedure.

In addition, the respective country-specific criteria and standards are taken into account.

A group of experts was set up, which ensured that all areas relevant to the accreditation procedure (e.g. legal, structural, social etc. aspects) as well as the ESG and national criteria were considered. The peer-review experts include professors, representatives of the professional practice and the student representative. A certificate with the ACQUIN seal is awarded upon accreditation of the study programme.

### **1 Short profile of HEI**

The mission of the university is to create, systematize and spread current scientific knowledge in order to improve the quality of people's life and train qualified specialists taking into account their personal development.

According to the status of higher education institutions, the National University of Life and Environmental Sciences of Ukraine (NUBIP) is a research institution, which conducts educational, scientific, innovative and industrial research and consulting activities aimed at studying the contemporary science issues about life and environment, at usage, reproduction and balanced development of terrestrial and aquatic ecosystems bio-resources, introduction of new environmental agro- and biotechnologies, technologies of safety revival and soil fertility, energy-saving agricultural technologies, environmental and legal management in rural areas, monitoring and

control of standards compliance, quality and safety of agricultural products, processed products, systematize, store and spread current scientific knowledge.

Currently, the university offers 50 bachelor programs, 63 master programs (90 ECTS credits) and seven Master programs (120 ECTS credits) and PhD programs.

More than 28,000 students and 600 graduates, PhD students study at three Educational and Research Institutes and 13 Faculties of the general university institution in Kyiv and ten units of NUBIP of Ukraine – regional institutes and colleges of I-III accreditation levels.

Educational process and scientific research at the university are provided by more than 2600 scientific and educational and pedagogical staff, including about 300 professors and Doctor of Sciences, more than 1,000 assistant professors and PhDs.

The university consists of the following structural subdivisions: training and research institutions, departments, chairs and scientific and research institutes, including Ukrainian Institute of Agricultural Radiology, Ukrainian Laboratory of Quality and Safety of Agricultural Products, Scientific-Research and Design Institute of Standards and Environmentally-Safe and Organic Products Technology (in Odessa), training, educational and scientific, scientific and research, problem scientific and research, problem scientific, educational, scientific and industrial laboratories, higher educational institutions of I-III accreditation levels and educational and research farms and research stations.

The structure of the university includes subdivisions located in Crimea.

Master's degree training at NUBIP is based on a detailed study and analysis of master's degree training systems offered at the universities worldwide.

The academic program was initiated by NUBIP of Ukraine together with Weihenstephan-Triesdorf University of Applied Sciences (HSWT) in 1998 with the participation of NUBIP students in practical training programs at HSWT. In 2002, NUBIP enrolled first students in the master program "Administrative Management", which focuses on solving problems and challenges of Ukrainian agriculture using the experience of economic development of Western Europe and the latest educational technologies.

The aim of the master program "Administrative Management" is to prepare a new generation of managers who can comprehensively solve complex management and economic problems, develop successful business strategies, form a team of professionals and effectively use the latest business technologies based on theoretical, practical and analytical approaches.

After successful graduation of the study program, graduates of NUBIP of Ukraine get a diploma of the state standard with the qualification "Master of Management; manager of administrative

activity ", as well as a certificate of Weihenstephan-Triesdorf University of Applied Sciences for the Master Program recognition.

Students enrolled in the study program of NUBIP or Weihenstephan-Triesdorf University of Applied Sciences get master degrees from both universities, provided that they have met the relevant requirements for the educational process and exams, the second or third semesters held at a partner university, and received a general assessment not lower than "satisfactory".

Distinctive features of the International Master Program "Administrative Management" are its focus on the state of Ukrainian agribusiness, combining theoretical training and development of practical skills, involvement in the educational process of highly qualified Ukrainian and German-speaking academic staff and conducting professional seminars for students and teachers.

The study program offers places for 50 students. Students can get a financial assistance from a state, there were 15 students from 2015 to 2019. All quotas for master programs from 2020 due to the difficult economic situation in the country have been revised and reduced. In 2021 there was just 1 placement, financed by the state budget.

The curriculum of the master's study program at NUBIP consists of the following blocks: compulsory subjects and elective subjects (within the educational program and at the student's choice).

The list of elective courses in the master's program "Administrative Management" NUBIP of Ukraine differs from the list of these disciplines at Weihenstephan-Triesdorf University of Applied Sciences.

NUBIP of Ukraine also offers a part-time master's program "Administrative Management", which is accredited in accordance with Ukrainian legislation (until 2024, the licensed number of places - 50 students).



## 2 General information on the study programme

Location	National University of Life and Environmental Sciences of Ukraine (NUBiP of Ukraine): Master programme in Administrative Management (M.Sc.)
Date of introduction	01.09.2022
Faculty/ department	Faculty of Agricultural Management
Standard period of study (semesters)	3 semesters, 1,5 years
Number of ECTS credits	90
Number of study places	50
Number of students currently enrolled	16 per semester, 32 per year
Average number of graduates per year	19
Form of study	Full-Time
Tuition fee	18 185 UAH per semester, 36 370 UAH per year

## 3 Results of the previous accreditation

The study programme(s) “**Master programme in Administrative Management**” (M.Sc.) was examined and accredited by ACQUIN for the first time in 2016 resulting in the following conditions:

- In order to ensure the standard of theses at Master's level, the university must draw up a handbook for students in which minimum requirements and standards for Master's theses are defined.

The conditions were fulfilled. The accreditation was issued by the 30 September 2021.

For further development of the study programme, the following recommendations were formulated:

- Training with regard to methods of scientific research should be intensified).
- Students should be guided more intensely towards independent scientific work. For this purpose, lecture notes should be supplemented with more up-to-date literature and students should be encouraged to conduct their own literature research).

- The module descriptions should be revised. The topicality of the literature references should be checked and competencies should be examined to determine whether they correspond to a master level.
- The university should explore the possibility of offering forms of examination (e.g., portfolio examinations) that assess course-related performance.

A temporary accreditation was issued for the proper implementation of the ACQUIN reaccreditation procedure. The application was approved and the temporary accreditation of the Study programme was issued until 31. September 2023.

### **III Implementation and assessment of the criteria**

*The peer-review experts assess the quality of the study programme and compliance with the ESG standards as well as with the national standards. The report must document the assessment of each study programme in the cluster, taking into account each criterion.*

#### **1 ESG Standard 1.1: Policy for quality assurance**

**Institutions should have a policy for quality assurance that is made public and forms part of their strategic management. Internal stakeholders should develop and implement this policy through appropriate structures and processes, while involving external stakeholders.**

##### **1.1 Implementation**

Regulations on ensuring the quality of educational activities and the quality of higher education at the National University of Life and Environmental Sciences of Ukraine (hereinafter - the Regulations) were developed according to the Law of Ukraine "On Higher Education" from 01.07.2014 (Article 16. Quality assurance system of higher education).

The main goal of the development of education in NUBIP for 2021-2025 is to improve the quality of the educational process, as well as the current training programs.

Internal quality assurance of study programs is carried out in accordance with the Statute of NUBIP of Ukraine and the Regulations on quality assurance of educational activities and quality of higher education in NUBIP of Ukraine (item 5 of the Regulation).

The system of internal quality assurance of education at NUBIP provides: control over staffing (personnel department, personnel commission and academic councils of faculties and universities), educational and methodological support (guarantor of the educational program, project groups of the educational program, departments, academic councils of faculties and universities, educational - methodical department), material and technical support (departments and dean's office of the Faculty of Agricultural Management, supply department), quality of classes, quality of knowledge (guarantor of master program, departments, dean's office, educational and methodical department), ensuring academic mobility (faculty, educational department, educational and scientific center of international activity), ensuring the availability of information systems for effective management of the educational process (center of distance learning technologies), monitoring and updating of the study program (guarantor, dean's office, members of the project group of the educational program, departments, academic council of the faculty and university, representatives of the Council of Employers, applicants), ensuring publicity of

information about the study program (guarantor, department, dean's office, educational department) and prevention of academic dishonesty (guarantor, academic and research staff, faculty, educational department, scientific library of NUBIP of Ukraine).

The external quality assurance system includes higher education standards, licensing of higher education levels, accreditation of higher educational levels, quality management system, compliance of curricula and training programs with the requirements of the European and international education standards, cooperation with employers on quality control of training, state attestation of graduates in the state attestation commission and overall image of the university and rating of its activity.

According to the Law of Ukraine "On Higher Education", the Charter of NUBIP of Ukraine, to the Regulation "On Student Self-Government of NUBIP of Ukraine", student self-government bodies participate in the discussion and resolution of issues concerning improving the educational process, research work, in measures (processes) to ensure the quality of academic programs.

The Faculty of Agricultural Management has an Employers' Council, which periodically discusses the quality of training at all levels of education.

Members of the academic community are involved in internal quality assurance procedures by conducting regular surveys on current issues of higher education, familiarizing members of the academic community with new trends in higher education, as well as discussing and approving internal quality assurance procedures in education.

Considerable attention in the university is paid to the rules and principles of academic integrity of educational and scientific process.

NUBIP conducts training seminars for heads of departments and heads and members of scientific organizations on current trends in educational activities.

## **1.2 Assessment**

Based on the university goals and strategic management, the quality assurance policy has been implemented appropriately in the field of research, teaching and learning. Hence, the quality assurance policy of the University meets the requirements of the Ministry of Education and Science of the country. In addition, the successful results of previous years and promising goals for the future shows the satisfaction of internal and external stakeholders in terms of cooperation.

The analysis of the internal quality assurance of the programme has shown that the procedures for the development, approval, periodic review and monitoring of the Master's program are

carried out in accordance with the study regulations, which indicates that the initiation, development, approval, monitoring, revision and termination of the Master's programme at the University are carried out transparently and in accordance with the approved procedures, in line with the general objectives of the University's development strategy, as well as the students of education participate in the design and improvement of the Master's programme, the evaluation of its components and the quality of teaching.

The quality assurance system for the educational process consists of an internal quality assurance system (administration, department for quality assurance of education, pedagogical and methodological centre for the organisation of the educational process) and external quality assurance.

During the meeting with the representatives of the University it was noted and confirmed that the University has a clear quality culture that ensures systematic development of the educational programme. The University has an Education Quality Assurance Department, whose main purpose is to monitor educational activities and evaluate the data of academic activities in order to effectively manage the quality of the educational process.

During the accreditation process, it was noted that the results of external quality assurance of higher education are presented in detail on the University's website, especially the comments and suggestions made during previous accreditations on the official website of the University.

In the accreditation process, it is clear that employers are constantly involved in the process of periodic revision of the educational programme. The university has consultation and advisory bodies, as well as an expert council of employers and graduates.

### 1.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

## 2 ESG Standard 1.2: Design and approval of programmes

**Institutions should have processes for the design and approval of their programmes. The programmes should be designed so that they meet the objectives set for them, including the intended learning outcomes. The qualification resulting from a programme should be clearly specified and communicated, and refer to the correct level of the national qualifications framework for higher education and, consequently, to the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.**

## 2.1 Implementation

Regular updating of the content of the study program is conducted with the participation of academic and research staff, students, and representatives of the Council of Employers of the faculty.

The updated content of the study program is considered at the department and at the educational and methodical council of the faculty. The basis for updating the content of specific disciplines are the results of research work, surveys of employers, student surveys, training and internships of teachers. For example, the internship of academic and research staff of the department in Germany and in Latvia on improvement of traditional teaching methods through digitalization of educational and scientific process was one of the factors to update certain disciplines.

The faculty has an educational and methodical council, which holds monthly meetings. The council discusses aspects related to the content of the study program and educational and methodological approaches in the study program. If necessary, proposals for changes in the study program are formulated, which are then approved at the meeting of the academic council of the faculty. In order to ensure the quality of education, the guarantor of master's program "Administrative Management" monitors and periodically reviews the program to ensure compliance with the objectives, as well as the needs of stakeholders and society. As a result of this review, the program is improved based on recommendations, feedback, and suggestions.

The purpose of the study program "Administrative Management" is to provide training of highly qualified specialists in administrative management, capable of administrative management and professional activities based on mastering basic management concepts and principles, comprehensively solve complex economic problems, develop successful business strategies, form a team of professionals and effectively use the latest business technologies, perform research and analysis of the formation and effective functioning of the administrative management system and the processes that provide it, to make effective management decisions, the formation of the future specialist's ability to combine dynamically knowledge, skills, communication skills and abilities activities and responsibilities in solving tasks and problems in management.

The feature of master's degree program is the combination of university's orientation in the direction of interconnected management of agricultural production, in training for the labour market professionals with professional skills in management with an emphasis on the specifics of the agricultural sector and in a focus on cooperation with agribusiness and related sectors of the economy.

The mission of NUBIP is to create, systematize, preserve and disseminate modern scientific knowledge in order to improve the quality of life, train specialists of European and international level.

The working curriculum of the study program "Agricultural Management" consists of educational information from the list of compulsory academic disciplines, and elective and practical training and provides the acquisition of the system of knowledge and skills necessary for the formation of the master's degree in the speciality.

Disciplines of specialization and the elective part of the master's degree in management in NUBIP of Ukraine consist of disciplines of independent choice of university and choice of students, the list of these disciplines is determined depending on the speciality and specialization.

Students enrolling in the master's program must have a previous bachelor's or equivalent higher education including agricultural production practices during the undergraduate studies.

The first theoretical semester is similar to the compulsory subjects offered by Weihenstephan-Triesdorf University of Applied Sciences and has a variable part, according to the national requirements of the labour market.

The second theoretical semester has the same compulsory part as Weihenstephan-Triesdorf University of Applied Sciences and elective subjects.

After the second semester, students undergo a 12-week internship, which takes place on agricultural enterprises.

The third theoretical semester has both compulsory subjects and elective courses at the Weihenstephan-Triesdorf University of Applied Sciences.

The final stage of training is the presentation and public defense of the master's thesis. For students studying in parallel at Weihenstephan-Triesdorf University of Applied Sciences, it is possible to organize defense through Zoom, Skype, Cisco WEB Conference, etc. in the simultaneous presence of defense commissions from Ukraine and Germany.

Master's degree program "Administrative Management" focuses on the introduction of modern teaching methods and modern scientific and practical knowledge in the field, ensuring the acquisition of practical skills in agricultural management, developing students' readiness for self-development and self-education, and the possibility of training and internships for mobility programs.

NUBIP Strategy of Ukraine was set out in the Development Program "Holosiivska Initiative - 2025", which is designed to implement qualitative and quantitative changes for higher education institutions in order to fulfil characteristics of the status of a research university of Ukraine.

The mission of NUBIP of Ukraine and the purpose of the study program meet four main goals: Council of Europe: preparation for the labour market; preparation for life as active citizens in democratic societies; personal development; development of a broad and advanced knowledge base.

Accordingly, master's program "Master programme in Administrative Management" (M.Sc.) focuses not only on equipping students with knowledge and skills in the profession, but also on developing skills to accomplish their tasks using innovative approaches, analytical, managerial and organizational skills in the agricultural sector in compliance with the principles of environmental management.

Regulations on the organization of the educational process in NUBIP of Ukraine and Regulations on educational programs in NUBIP of Ukraine determine the workload of applicants throughout the study period.

The studying process is based on the credit-module system. Each discipline has its own certain number of credits ECTS (one ECTS point is equal to 30 hours). Master's program includes 90 credits, at least 25% of which is allocated to elective components. Courses are assessed by the combination of written examinations and coursework as specified in the module teaching programs.

Courses are usually conducted as lectures and as a seminar-style discussion. Regular class attendance is expected and required. A part of the final grade is based on attendance and participation in the discussions. The final score for the students' coursework is estimated as an average of all modules points. The final grade is therefore comprised of continuous evaluation and the final examination results.

Students who fail courses normally are required to retake the complete course, when it is offered next time. However, a student who fails a final course examination, but who has completed all the coursework for that course, may be allowed to carry their coursework marks and retake the final test at the next sitting of that examination.

If all examinations and tests are passed successfully, and the thesis is defended, then a scientific degree "Master of Management" is awarded to a student.

Students have an opportunity to submit their suggestions and comments on the study program by taking part in a survey, which is held annually online, posted on the website of the department, as well as during conversations with group curators, which are carried out systematically.

In terms of personal development, many students have achieved significant success during their studies. Many students in the practical semester for the first time can apply their



knowledge and face real-life situations and problems in the enterprise. Students write research papers, prepare presentations, solve case studies and write master's theses. Frequent group work promotes communication and teamwork skills. These aspects contribute to the personal development of a student.

Students of master's program annually participate in the international scientific-practical conference of students and young scientists "New challenges for the agricultural sector of Ukraine in the context of globalization", International scientific-practical conference of students, graduate students and young scientists "Modern Management: Challenges and Opportunities" and others.

During the study program students acquire research skills in combination with a theoretical knowledge.

First-year students write term papers. Teachers acquaint them with research methods, teach them to make a plan, systematize and process literary sources, and introduce them to the rules of academic integrity. Practical training i.e. training and industrial practice in the study program is envisaged at the end of the second semester. During the acquisition of practical skills, students use various research methods that are necessary to perform practical tasks, conduct analytical research, and generate analytical reports.

Different scientific clubs at the university encourage students to conduct research. The department has the scientific club: "Fundamentals of scientific research in agribusiness". Members of the club take part in national and international competitions for students. In addition, the university annually hosts the "Student Science Festival", where the best scientific clubs of the university can compete. Involvement in thematic research on the topics proposed by the department is another possibility to involve applicants in research activities. Students actively participate in conferences and co-author articles and conference materials with teachers. Acquisition of "soft skills" and development of students' personality is provided by the following disciplines: "Personal effectiveness and communicative efficiency", "Team building and personnel management", "Organizational behaviour and leadership", "Practical training".

The study programs aims at developing "soft skills" for example through group work, presenting at conferences and workshops, project defense and discussions at seminars. The master program is aimed at developing students' communication, leadership and teamwork skills, time management, ability to take responsibility and work in critical conditions, the ability to resolve conflicts, understanding the importance of deadlines, the ability to think logically and systematically, creativity and more. In addition, an elective discipline "Organizational Behaviour and Leadership" was added in 2021.

The university has a council of employers. The council's tasks are providing suggestions for improving professional requirements of the graduates, assessment of the quality of curricula and programs, joint implementation and resource support of educational programs, industrial and undergraduate practices, involvement of students in production and research activities at enterprises, development of partnership infrastructure, creation of joint subdivisions, involvement of employees in the educational process, holding joint conferences, schools-seminars for students, graduate students and young scientists, participation in examination commissions, promotion of employment of university graduates, constant monitoring of the quality of training among graduates and leading employers; organization on the basis of enterprises-employers of advanced training and internships of scientific and pedagogical workers and employees of the university.

Employers' council holds regular meetings both at the university level and at the faculty level.

The faculty has an educational and methodical council, which holds monthly meetings. At the meetings, issues related to the quality of educational and methodological support of the curriculum are discussed, as well as the content of educational components, proposals for changes in the study program are formed, which are approved at the meeting of the academic council of the faculty. Decisions on changes in the study program are discussed at the department.

The master's program envisages an internship which amounts to 5 ECTS credits. Applicants undergo training and internships after the second semester of study, which is regulated by the Regulations on practical training of students of the National University of Life and Environmental Sciences of Ukraine and provides detailed requirements in guidelines developed by the project team

The main purpose of practice is to master students' modern methods and forms of organization of labour and production in the field of agro-industrial production, the formation of their professional skills and abilities to make independent decisions, educate the need to systematically develop and update their knowledge and creatively apply it in practice. The objects of practice can be enterprises of various forms of ownership, types of economic activity, and organizational and legal status, which are legal entities and operate in the market and carry out production, trade, brokerage, wholesale, and other activities. Enterprises must meet modern requirements, such as advanced forms and methods of management and organization of production, planning, logistics, marketing activities, accounting and advanced technologies of production, labour organization and management must be applied. In addition, the staff of the enterprise should be highly qualified specialists who can create appropriate conditions for students in the acquisition of professional skills.

## 2.2 Assessment

According to the national standard, the curriculum of the Master's program "Master programme in Administrative Management" (M.Sc.) has been successfully adapted to the national standard since 2009 and approved by the Ministry of Education and Science. Hence, in the specialization component, all 18 subjects of the curriculum are approved by HSWT. Currently, all components of the curriculum have been successfully implemented in the practice in terms of education, research and employment. In addition, the current local and global agricultural production system shows the relevance and necessity of this curriculum, as well as the fact that it corresponds to the goals of the Kyrgyz government and national strategies.

The study programme is in line with the University's mission and vision, as well as with the goals of the 2020-2024 strategic plan, particularly with the first three objectives of education, research and management.

The content of the educational program has a clear structure; the educational components included in the educational program make up a logical interconnected system and collectively allow the achievement of stated goals and program learning outcomes.

The content of the educational programme corresponds to the subject area of the subject area "Management" of the Master's level of the university. In particular, the ability to solve complex tasks, which fully corresponds to the standard of higher education in the field of knowledge "Management and Administration", is the integral feature of the educational programme. The structure of the educational program provides an opportunity for the formation of an individual educational trajectory, in particular through the individual choice of academic disciplines by students of higher education to the extent provided by legislation.

The educational program and curriculum provide for the practical training of higher education students, which allows them to acquire the competencies necessary for further professional activity.

The scope of the educational program and individual educational components (in credits of the European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System) realistically reflects the actual workload of applicants, is appropriate for achieving the goals and programmatic results of education.

The right to freely choose educational components and form an individual trajectory is provided for by the educational program and regulated by relevant regulatory acts. Students studying in the educational program can individually choose the bases of practice and the topic of the master's thesis. The educational program provides practical training and allows you to acquire the competencies necessary for further professional activity.

Students' English language skills should be improved. Higher entrance requirements should be created with regard to English skills or students should be offered compulsory language courses to improve their English language skills.

Within the framework of the further development of the curriculum, current topics such as big data and digitalisation should be given greater consideration.

### 2.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

## 3 ESG Standard 1.3: Student-centred learning, teaching, and assessment

**Institutions should ensure that the programmes are delivered in a way that encourages students to take an active role in creating the learning process, and that the assessment of students reflects this approach**

### 3.1 Implementation

. Student-centered training in the program is provided by:

- Encouraging students to be autonomous and responsible subjects of the educational process which is ensured through the involvement of applicants in the review of master's program and the content of academic disciplines,
- creating educational environment focused on meeting the needs and interests of students, in particular providing opportunities for the formation of individual educational trajectory is ensured and is in line with NUBIP regulation,
- constructing educational process on the basis of mutual respect and partnership between the participants of the educational process ensures the participation of students in self-governing structures and collegial governing bodies in NUBIP of Ukraine (FAM Student Organization),
- providing consultations on academic disciplines, internships, coursework on individual requests of students
- providing program disciplines are provided with electronic training courses which allow students to build their individual schedule of independent work with the course,
- offering combined classroom and online learning (using platforms Cisco WebEx, Zoom, Google Meet) due to the Covid-19 pandemic.

Each student group is assigned a mentor among the academic and research staff of the graduating department who helps students in easy adaptation to the learning environment, development of communication skills, and provides support if necessary.

The diploma supervisor is responsible for the scientific development of students during the master's qualification work. Together with the student he forms an individual work plan and directs the student's work during the whole period of study, including participation in scientific projects and scientific-practical conferences. On-the-job mentoring is provided as part of the students' internship program. Such mentoring allows students to enter professional activities easily and to adapt to the workplace.

The level of satisfaction of students with teaching and learning methods is discussed both during conversations of mentors of academic groups with students, and during written and online surveys.

Academic and research staff of the program regularly improve their teaching skills and qualifications in the relevant courses.

The procedure for conducting control measures in master's program is regulated by the following documents: Regulations on the organization of the educational process in NUBIP of Ukraine, Regulations on exams and tests in NUBIP of Ukraine, Regulations on examination commissions in NUBIP of Ukraine, Regulations on ensuring the quality of educational activities and the quality of higher education in NUBIP of Ukraine, Regulations on the electronic educational environment of NUBIP of Ukraine and Regulations on academic integrity.

Assessment of students takes place in accordance with the Regulations for electronic assessment of residual knowledge of students of NUBIP of Ukraine and its results are published annually on the website.

The assessment of current and final work of students is based on the rating-module system which is reflected in the regulation "On exams and tests in NUBIP of Ukraine".

The rating system allows the most objective approach to the assessment of student knowledge, with an individual approach to each student and taking into account all components of the assessment: 70% - academic and additional work, 30% - exam.

Criteria and methods of intermediate and final assessment are described in detail in the working program and syllabus of each discipline and posted on the page of the department. During the examination session, an appeal commission is set up by the faculty to consider the appeals of students concerning the results of examinations.

Students can report of any forms of pressure from teachers and other officials and colleagues anonymously by calling the hotline or leaving a written request in the trust boxes.

### 3.2 Assessment

Overall, it can be stated that the teaching methods used promote student-centred learning and are sufficiently diverse. The teaching and learning forms are therefore rated as very good by the evaluators. The students provide information about a very good supervision relationship with the teaching staff. The students are very satisfied with the supervision and emphasised the excellent support and accessibility of the teaching staff. The study advisors advise students on the choice of study programme and the creation of an individual study plan.

Students are continuously supported by the teaching staff in preparing for exams. The examination regulations are also transparent.

All documents relevant to the study programme are available in the university information system.

All information on the study programme is complete and transparent. Interactive teaching methods encourage students to take an active role in the learning process.

Students receive questionnaires to evaluate their courses and the overall learning experience. Discussing the feedback from these surveys with students can be an additional valuable tool in the student-centred quality process. Students can use office hours and the various electronic communication tools to submit complaints or suggestions for improvement.

Students also have various options available for complaints about assessment.

Students are assessed through various methods, e.g. written and oral examinations, presentations and written assignments. The assessment corresponds to the intended learning outcomes. The assessment procedure and regulations are clear to students and are published at the beginning of each course.

Quality control of study preparation takes place throughout the study period and consists of sufficient different control measures:

The University provides equal opportunities for students in all fields of study, regardless of gender, nationality, religion and social status, language and mode of instruction, as well as taking into account special educational needs and individual opportunities to design an individual educational programme aimed at developing the student's professional competence and cognitive activity.

Thus, the documents and materials provided by the university indicate that the university has developed an effective system of knowledge control. It can be concluded that the university applies the principle of student-centred learning, which aims at the personal development of students and ensures equal opportunities for all groups of students.

### 3.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

## 4 ESG Standard 1.4: Student admission, progression, recognition, and certification

**Institutions should consistently apply pre-defined and published regulations covering all phases of the student “life cycle”, e.g. student admission, progression, recognition and certification.**

### 4.1 Implementation

Applicants who have obtained a bachelor's or master's degree in agriculture are admitted to study for a master's degree. Admission to the training of specialists with a master's degree is carried out at the expense of individuals (legal entities).

For a competitive selection of applicants entrance examinations are conducted, which up until 2020 included a foreign language exam and an exam in professionally-oriented disciplines. In 2021 the Ministry of Education and Science introduced new rules: applicants had to pass the Common entrance exam (EVI), which was conducted in specially accredited places and evaluated by the Ministry of Education and Science and the exam in professionally oriented disciplines was based in NUBIP.

Examination commission is established in NUBIP of Ukraine to conduct entrance examinations. Professional attestation commissions are created to conduct professional tests upon admission to study on the basis of a previously obtained educational degree.

Retaking of entrance examinations is not allowed. Appeals of the results of entrance examinations conducted in NUBIP of Ukraine are considered by the Appeals Commission, the composition and procedure of which are approved by the order of the Rector of NUBIP of Ukraine. The applicant's appeal on the examination grade received at the entrance examination in NUBIP of Ukraine must be submitted personally no later than the next day after the announcement of the grade. The appeal is considered at the meeting of the appeal commission no later than the next working day after its submission, usually in the presence of the applicant.

The ranking lists are formed by the admissions committee from the Unified database and are published in full on the website of the higher education institution.

Lists of applicants recommended for enrolment are formed by the admissions committee from the Unified database and the lists are published on the stands of the admissions committee and the website of the university.



Upon the completion of the study program both full and part-time graduates receive Master of Science degree and a diploma of the national standard.

Students of the full-time program obtain a Certificate about the conformity of the International Master Program in Kyiv and its partner university in Germany. Those students, who studied at the German university receive a double degree.

## **4.2 Assessment**

The study requirements are clearly defined and can also be viewed by applicants across parents on the university's website. The website in question is easy to find and very clearly laid out. The university has a suitable procedure for recording relevant information on the course of studies and taking action if necessary. The review panel assesses the admission procedure as transparently described and well thought-out. At the beginning of their studies, students are sufficiently informed about the course of their studies and all opportunities to participate in university life. Upon completion of their studies, graduates therefore receive meaningful and transparent documents showing the qualifications and learning outcomes acquired. In addition, the university has sufficient procedures in place to collect information on students' progress.

Admission requirements are clearly defined. Admission in relation to the need for teachers ensures that there is no oversupply of trained teachers. In addition to the regular admission procedure, the university supports disabled students and students from national minorities.

The university monitors the development of students during their studies. An important element of student success is the sharing of information about the structure of the study programme, prerequisites for course selection, course objectives, course assignments, examinations, workload, etc. In the department, a compulsory introductory course is offered to all students, which introduces them to all the above-mentioned areas. In addition, students receive information from various counselling services throughout their stay at the university.

The degree certificates issued by the university enable students to either continue their education at institutions outside the country or to pursue a professional career abroad.

Overall, it can be said that the university has transparent enrolment procedures, records and monitors the development of students and issues sufficiently meaningful graduation certificates that demonstrate the qualifications acquired in the program.

## **4.3 Conclusion**

The criterion is **fulfilled**.



## 5 ESG Standard 1.5: Teaching staff

**Institutions should assure themselves of the competence of their teachers. They should apply fair and transparent processes for the recruitment and development of the staff**

### 5.1 Implementation

The university and the Faculty of Agricultural Management are well-equipped to provide the study program ““Master programme in Administrative Management” (M.Sc.):

The procedure for holding a competition to fill the positions with the NUBIP of Ukraine regulates the procedure for competitive selection when filling vacant positions of the NUBIP and concluding employment agreements with them.

Persons with full higher education have the right to participate in the competition, who meet the requirements for academic and research staff, defined by the Law of Ukraine "On Higher Education" and the Procedure and conditions of the announced competition. During the replacement of academic and research staff positions, the conclusion of an employment contract is preceded by the competitive selection, secret ballot of members of the Academic Council, consideration of the candidate's achievements at a meeting of the department, open lecture of the candidate and interview with rector.

Applicants in the competition must have an individual rating coefficient (for the last 5 years) within the limits set by the Academic Council of the university. Competitive selection procedures for academic and research staff are transparent and provide an opportunity to ensure the required level of professionalism for the successful implementation of the master's program. The selection procedure complies with the provision of educational components (subjects) according to paragraph 38 of the License conditions for educational activities, approved by the Cabinet of Ministers of 30.12.2015 (as amended by the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine of March 24, 2021).

According to the Regulations on the professional development of scientific and pedagogical workers of NUBIP of Ukraine, academic and research staff must take part in advanced training at least once per five years. Academic and research staff are free to choose the subjects of advanced training and can improve their skills and qualifications in various forms. The National Research Institute of Continuing Education and Tourism of NUBIP of Ukraine offers advanced training programs.

The professional development of teachers is facilitated by international cooperation programs, which enable teachers to take internships or undertake practical training. Academic and research staff improve their skills by participating in conferences, seminars, training, etc..

In addition, teaching staff can take part mobility program at Weihenstephan-Triesdorf University of Applied Sciences.

The management of NUBIP of Ukraine developed Regulations on providing annual monetary remuneration to teachers of NUBIP of Ukraine, Regulations on bonuses for employees of NUBIP of Ukraine, Regulations on the remuneration of university staff; Regulations on the rating system for assessing the activities of academic and research staff and structural units of NUBIP of Ukraine for exemplary performance of official duties. The documents regulate financial incentives for the teachers.

Every year at the beginning of the academic year, the academic council of the university publishes the names of the best teachers based on the results of a survey of students, announces gratitude, and awards diplomas.

Every year NUBIP organizes courses for young teachers and seminars to improve the psychological and pedagogical skills of academic and research staff.

Each semester a schedule of open classes is formed, the practice of mutual attendance of classes is introduced, the results of which are discussed at the meetings of the department.

The study program “Agricultural Management” is offered by the Department of Administrative Management and Foreign Economic Activity. The department is headed by the Doctor of Sciences, Professor. Total scientific and pedagogical staff is 19 including: three doctors of sciences, professors, 13- Candidates of Sciences, Associate Professors, one candidate of sciences, senior teacher and two assistants, senior teachers without a scientific degree.

## **5.2 Assessment**

In general, according to the university's self-assessment report, the positive trends in education, research and training shows the effectiveness of the University's human resources policy. Also, bilateral and multilateral active cooperation with internal and external partners indicates that the University has been achieving good results in the field of education, research and professional training of teaching staff.

The academic and professional qualifications of the teachers involved in the implementation of the educational program ensure the achievement of the goals and program learning outcomes defined by the respective program.

Procedures for the competitive selection of teachers are transparent and allow to ensure the necessary level of their professionalism for the successful implementation of the educational programme.

The procedure of competitive selection for the positions of scientific and pedagogical workers at the University is regulated by the relevant Regulations and determines the main requirements and procedures of competitive selection.

The announcement of the competition is posted on the university's website in accordance with the legislation. When evaluating candidates during the competitive selection of teachers, academic and professional qualifications are taken into account in accordance with the goals of the educational program and professional activity. The level of proficiency in the state language, foreign languages, the presence of an academic title, a scientific degree in the specialty of teaching disciplines is taken into account; availability of scientific publications, including in Scopus, WoS, textbooks, manuals, methodological developments, participation in international projects, internships, experience of teaching and practical work, participation in grant projects and research topics, etc.

The institution of higher education promotes the professional development of teachers through its own programs or in cooperation with other organizations.

The university, together with its partners, provides various forms of professional development of teachers.

Teachers improve their professional qualifications and teaching skills mostly through participation in projects, internships, trainings, etc.

The institution of higher education attracts practicing professionals, industry experts, and representatives of employers to classroom classes.

All teachers of the program improve their professional qualifications on an ongoing basis in the areas of the disciplines they teach. Teachers undergo internships, courses to improve pedagogical skills. The best practices are the academic mobility of teachers, both international and national, to participate in conferences, forums, and seminars. Active academic and professional activity contributes to the internationalization of the educational program and the University. The competitive selection procedure is transparent, takes into account teachers' professionalism, experience, and pedagogical skills.

Professional teaching is assured. Applicant selection and staff development are clearly regulated and meet all standards. There is no doubt about the academic qualifications of the teaching staff. The numerical ratio of teachers to students is very good, which is also appreciated by the students. In the discussions with lecturers and students, the impression was confirmed that the staff is very good, both quantitatively and qualitatively. The students

confirmed very good supervision by the lecturers. All lecturers are very well qualified. They describe the situation in class and the contact with the lecturers as extremely pleasant and motivating. Yet, the English language skills of teaching and administrative staff should be improved and corresponding further training courses implemented.

The same standards and uniform application procedures for teaching staff should be prevailed at all partner universities.

Professional practice representatives should be consulted in an institutionalised way in curriculum development.

However, despite the above-mentioned positive trends, the University's human resources policy should continue to increase the transparency of recruitment of the teaching staff and develop new training methods, technologies and their implementation.

### 5.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

## 6 ESG Standard 1.6: Learning resources and student support

**Institutions should have appropriate funding for learning and teaching activities and ensure that adequate and readily accessible learning resources and student support are provided.**

### 6.1 Implementation

The educational and laboratory base of structural subdivisions of the Faculty of Agricultural Management allows organizing and conducting classes in all academic disciplines at a sufficient level. Material and technical resources fully meet the needs of students. Specialized classrooms, multimedia projectors, computer classrooms, interactive whiteboards, other modern information and communication equipment, information systems and software products are available. NUBIP of Ukraine has 17 educational buildings and 14 dormitories.

The university has a canteen, an equestrian sports complex, a scientific library, an information center, computer centers and agricultural machinery labs.

For applicants for the Master program "Administrative Management" all the necessary conditions for distance learning are created. For this purpose, classrooms with multimedia equipment, reading rooms in the different university buildings, computer classes, educational and scientific laboratories, training, research and production laboratory "Business Analytics" of the Department of Administrative Management and Foreign Economic Activity are used.

The sanitary and technical conditions of all NUBIP premises meet the requirements of current norms and rules of operation, where the necessary thermal, sanitary and fire-protection regime is provided. Capital and on-going repairs are carried out to improve working conditions and prevent occupational injuries.

Safety instructions are provided to all students and staff to prevent accidents. In connection with the need to monitor the health of students and academic and research staff on the basis of the decision of the Academic Council of NUBIP from 26.08.2016, the Health Center of NUBIP of Ukraine was established, which operates in accordance with the Regulations on the health center.

Due to the difficult epidemiological situation, distance learning is used for students of master's program "Management".

In the context of the COVID-19 pandemic, the system of appropriate measures for the safety of staff and students has been implemented since March 12, 2020, the distance learning training has been introduced, relevant orders on distance practice, tests and examinations and state certification online were issued.

Measures are being taken for sanitation of premises, temperature screening, sanitizers are available and face masks regime was introduced. The official website of NUBIP of Ukraine contains information about educational programs, scientific and educational activities, structural units, admission rules and contacts. All users registered at the university have unlimited access to the Internet.

The library fund is multi-branch and has more than one million copies of domestic and foreign literature, including rare publications, special types of scientific and technical literature, abstracts of dissertations (since 1950), dissertations (since 1946), more than 500 titles of journals and more than 50 titles of newspapers.

The fund includes material on agriculture and forestry, economics, technology, related sciences and management. Library service is provided on 8 subscriptions, in 7 reading rooms for 527 seats, among which there are: 4 branches, one universal and one specialized reading room for teachers, graduate students and masters (Reference Room); catalogs, including electronic (over 206292 units of records); bibliographic files (since 1954); fund of reference and bibliographic publications. Every year, the library serves more than 40000 users, including 14000 students.

Every year, the fund for educational literature receives more than 35,000 copies of books and periodicals. Reading rooms are equipped with wireless Internet access. An important electronic resource is an electronic library (from the local network of the university), where there are more than 6409 full-text documents (textbooks, manuals, monographs, guidelines).

The Digital Library of NUBIP was established in November 2019 and contains 790 full-text documents, including 150 textbooks and manuals, 117 monographs, 420 abstracts of dissertations, 98 digitized rare and valuable editions from the library funds (1795-1932). All library resources are available through the university website. Since January 2017, NUBIP of Ukraine has access to one of the largest Scientometrics databases Web of Science. Since November 2017, NUBIP of Ukraine has access to the SCOPUS published by Elsevier. Access is available from the local network of the university.

Students can further develop their research skills through free participation in classes of the scientific clubs. They can study foreign languages at the Center for the Study of Foreign Languages of the Faculty of Humanities and Education of NUBIP of Ukraine. Students can take part in sports sections (basketball, volleyball, football, boxing, weightlifting, athletics and others) and develop their creative abilities in creative studios and clubs of the Department of Cultural Studies. Every year the university holds sports competitions among students and teachers.

Educational and methodical information and material on the study program is available on the educational information platform of NUBIP of Ukraine and on the websites of the structural subdivisions involved in the implementation of the master's program. According to the curriculum and the workload of the academic and research staff, communication with students takes place during classroom lessons and through the E-learning platform.

The dean's office and the department are in constant contact with the students' self-government organization.

The NUBIP of Ukraine has a mechanism for surveying students.

The university has a department for employment and issuance of documents on higher education. Students are provided with participation in educational, scientific, research, sports, artistic, public activities held in Ukraine and abroad. Applicants for higher education are provided with social protection in accordance with the requirements of current legislation. Orphans and students deprived of parental care, who are on full state support, are provided with all statutory benefits.

The university provides students with social and academic scholarships in accordance with current legislation and the Rules for the appointment of academic scholarships in NUBIP of

Ukraine. The university has created the necessary conditions for the realization of the need for education of applicants with special needs. In particular, the organization of inclusive education at the university is carried out in accordance with the resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine dated 10.08.2019 "On approval of the Procedure for inclusive education of persons with special educational problems in higher education."

The territory of the educational complex of NUBIP of Ukraine is adapted to the requirements of students with special needs: at the entrance to the educational buildings and dormitories there are ramps that meet the requirements of state building codes of Ukraine; appropriate training of pedagogical staff is carried out; there are appropriate classes of physical therapy in specially created academic groups; the Center of social and psychological service operates as well. The purpose of the Center for Social and Psychological Service is to provide psychological and pedagogical conditions for the full realization of personal and intellectual potential of students and provide psychological support.

Students have access not only to the NUBIP resources, but also to the resources of the supporting international universities and guest professors lectures. These resources include fully set computer laboratories, management libraries and modern teaching facilities. The university campus is located in a quiet, green surrounding in the southern part of Kyiv, which adds to the quality of studying as well.

There is a possibility to use study materials on-line through the access to the MOODLE System. Similar information is offered for the NUBIP students at the website of our partner Weihenstephan-Triesdorf University of Applied Sciences with the resources, available on MOOC on HSWT website.

## **6.2 Assessment**

The ratio between the number of students and the teaching materials and spaces is appropriate. Libraries and classrooms are well digitised and it should be mentioned which has a positive effect on the development process of student-centred learning. Therefore, the premises and equipment are adequate to support the effective implementation of the programme objectives and learning success in all respects.

From the meeting with the student council and the self-evaluation report, it can be concluded that the information provided to the students about the service facilities of the university is very good.

The resource facilities of the study programme can be described as very good. The modern and excellent equipment, which corresponds to the subject standards, is suitable for providing

students with a sound education. In the opinion of the review panel, the overall resource endowment is thus very well suited for the implementation of the degree programme. Buildings, rooms and technical equipment can be described as exemplary. The library offers students extensive support in searching for information and using the available technology. The university is also well equipped for digital teaching.

The needs of a heterogeneous student body are also adequately addressed. Internal quality assurance takes material resources into account in its evaluation culture and regularly solicits feedback from students. The evaluation team assesses all material, financial and human resources as fully sufficient to achieve the qualification goals of the study programme. The needs of a heterogeneous student body are taken into account in every respect.

For the administrative staff, there is the possibility of individual further development. The scope and qualifications of the non-academic administrative staff can be described as very good. Sufficient opportunities for further training are available.

It can be stated that the degree programme has a high degree of studyability. Yet, the University of Applied Science Weihe-Stephan-Triesdorf should establish a good administrative infrastructure for all partner universities and create even more support services in general and during student mobility phases with a view to even better studyability.

In order to guarantee the implementation of the study program “Master programme in Administrative Management” (M.Sc.), the staff should also grow with the increasing number of students.

### 6.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

## 7 ESG Standard 1.7: Information management

<b>Institutions should ensure that they collect, analyse and use relevant information for the effective management of their programmes and other activities.</b>
--

### 7.1 Implementation

Information on the contingent of students in particular, data on place of residence, registration, data of parents, previous place of study, success, achievements, expectations from training, information sources through which students learned about the program is collected at the level



of faculty management. To monitor student's performance ongoing control, intermediate certification and final certification is used. Performance data is monitored on an ongoing basis by the dean's office of the faculty, group curators and program coordinators.

According to the results of the intermediate certification, a set of preventive measures is implemented to improve the performance of each student. The availability of forms of control and their frequency are contained in the schedule of the educational process and the schedule of the examination session.

The university publishes regular surveys on the level of student satisfaction with the quality of education. Similar surveys are conducted by the coordinator of the program, in particular, data are collected by anonymous surveys of students on the quality of teaching of each discipline of the educational program, the quality of the educational process, collect suggestions and complaints about the quality of the educational process.

The university platform has online support for students, which is implemented by both platform administrators and course teachers. The quality of e-learning courses is monitored twice a year, and the course certification procedure takes place. Student surveys on the level of satisfaction with the use of the educational platform are conducted annually. Regulations on the training and information platform regulate the uniform requirements, the procedure for developing the electronic training courses, the method of current control, intermediate and final certification.

Monitoring of student employment is carried out by the department of employment of graduates and issuance of documents on higher education of NUBIP of Ukraine and the administration of the faculty. Information on key performance indicators of the university is collected by the Department of Quality of Education, Marketing and Career Guidance, which reports to the Vice-Rector for Research and Teaching. The whole process of collecting information is transparent, regular and public, which allows all participants in the learning process to obtain reliable data and make strategic decisions based on them. The procedure of collection, processing, responsible for conducting the questionnaire and key indicators of quality control of the educational process are published in Regulation for quality assurance.

## **7.2 Assessment**

The university has a well-functioning information management system. The administration has thorough data collection systems. The current and complete data structure is used very well for the internal quality management system. The evaluation of the data is accompanied by quality assurance measures and planning of follow-up activities.

The programme uses the existing infrastructure of the university to collect student feedback on individual courses and lectures as well as on the environment at the university in general. Students report that they feel encouraged to give feedback to lecturers and that their feedback is well received by lecturers. A survey of student satisfaction with the quality and conditions of the study programme is conducted annually to investigate student opinion on the quality of the University's educational and administrative services.

For the programme that is in the process of being accredited, there is sufficient information to attract applicants.

The university has the necessary procedures for collecting and analysing information about the programme, including key performance indicators, information about the student body, the level of academic achievement, student performance and examinations. Students are provided with educational resources and student support services.

The expert group therefore notes that the university regularly collects and analyses information on the study programme, students, graduates and other activities as part of the quality management system and makes it available to the internal quality assurance system.

Both students and teachers are involved in the processes through a procedure and existing structures at the university. In addition, graduates and employers are also involved in the process.

Thus, as part of the university's quality management, data on students is collected and their assessment is carried out. Also based on the self-evaluation report of the university and the discussions during the online evaluation, the expert group was able to confirm that the institution implements the necessary measures to assess the quality of teaching.

Information management includes the use of various methods to provide information. Confidentiality of information is also guaranteed.

### **7.3 Conclusion**

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

## **8 ESG Standard 1.8: Public information**

<b>Institutions should publish information about their activities, including programmes, which is clear, accurate, objective, up-to date and readily accessible.</b>
--

### **8.1 Implementation**

Information about the master's program (title, type of diploma, scope of educational program, admission requirements, purpose and features of the program) "Administrative Management"

(international version of IMA) is presented on the official website of Faculty of Agricultural management (FAM) of NUBIP of Ukraine.

Open days are held regularly, both in online and offline formats, announcements of which are posted on the official website of the university and on social networks. Detailed conditions for admission can be found and on the website of the faculty in the document "Rules of admission to the National University of Life and Environmental Sciences of Ukraine", approved by the Academic Council.

The master's program is made transparent through publication in various media nationally and internationally. Information on further employment opportunities for students and entrants can be found on the official website of the FAM Employers' Council.

If students or applicants have questions about the content of the program, a consultant is available at the department, whose contacts are listed in the information about the program on the official website of the university. The consultation can be arranged individually by phone, e-mail or through social networks.

The department has developed an advertising brochure. The management of the faculty regularly publishes annual report. The list of companies in which students can undergo internships during their studies and get further employment can be found on the university website.

## **8.2 Assessment**

The main source of public information about the "Master programme in Administrative Management" (M.Sc.) is the official website of the university, the website of the Faculty of Agricultural Economics, the website of the Faculty of Agrobusiness and Management, and website of the Master's Center which is the graduation department for this study program.

All persons interested in receiving information about events at the university and, in particular, information updates on program have informational support through close communication using various social networks: Facebook, Instagram. The Master's Preparing Center additionally highlights all information related to the program on its official Facebook page. Considerable attention is paid to the coverage of all events related to the organization of the educational process, the life of students and graduates. The university has its own YouTube channel, where all scientific and educational events of the university are covered and students upload videos. Students can find here the information about the history of successful partnership, advantages of studying the master's program etc.

The university offers detailed information on studying and teaching as well as on the university's main research areas. Organisational documents and relevant regulations are made available on the website. Contact persons and contact points for the degree programme and student life are clearly and transparently named.

The information provided to the public about the degree programme is satisfactory overall. There are many opportunities for prospective students to find out about the university and student life.

Information about study programmes is publicly available (admission criteria, learning outcomes, qualifications awarded, information about employment of graduates, etc.). Information about the study programme that is in line with the university's mission is secured. High school graduates, students, graduates and other interested groups can find out about the university's activities and offers on its homepage. In addition, contact persons are named for further information and questions. Yet there should be better strategic communication activities developed to publicise the study offer in order to arouse the interest of potential applicants in the long term.

The university provides information about its activities, such as the degree programme and the selection criteria for admission, the intended learning outcomes of the degree programmes, the teaching, learning and examination methods, the student success rates and the qualifications of the teaching staff.

In addition, the university provides information on its homepage about its academic achievements, such as publications, external and internal conferences and events, as well as non-academic achievements, such as cultural and social projects and activities.

The study-related documents and information are to be accessible to both students and prospective students. In addition, contact persons are named for further information and questions.

The university provides information about its activities. The University conducts its activities based on the principles of transparency, openness, involvement and awareness-raising of all stakeholders in educational activities: One of the main means of providing information is through the use of information technology and media. In addition to the information on the University's website, the public and applicants are provided with information on the specifics of the study programme under accreditation through events such as the Open Day.

### **8.3 Conclusion**

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

## 9 ESG Standard 1.9: On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes

**Institutions should monitor and periodically review their programmes to ensure that they achieve the objectives set for them and respond to the needs of students and society. These reviews should lead to continuous improvement of the programme. Any action planned or taken as a result should be communicated to all those concerned.**

### 9.1 Implementation

Regulations on the organization of the educational process at NUBIP of Ukraine stipulate that the continuous improvement of the training system of higher education is provided in accordance with generally accepted European and international standards of the formation of a culture of quality at the university. Updating academic disciplines is carried out in compliance with the principles of openness and accessibility, unity and continuity of the educational process. Continuity is realized through the concept of "lifelong learning" through the organization of independent learning and self-education of students in order to ensure a high quality of life, scientific character through the integration of education with science and practice, professional orientation of the educational process, flexibility and predictability provided by variability, self-regulation and continuity of updating the content of training. Academic curricula are developed by leading academic and research staff of the department before the beginning of the academic year. Curricula are considered at the meeting of the department, approved by the academic council of the faculty and by the dean of the faculty. Curricula are updated annually.

The material and technical base of the university and the Faculty of Agricultural Management is constantly updated and expanded, and it gives teachers an opportunity to expand and update the content of programs using new or updated laboratories. The updated content of the study program is considered at the department and the educational and methodical council of the faculty. The basis for updating the content of specific components are the results of scientific research, employers' surveys, student questionnaires, teacher training and internships. An example is the internship of academic and research staff of the department on improvement of traditional teaching methods through digitalization of educational and scientific process in Germany and on innovative approaches in education and science in Latvia.

Electronic academic courses that comply with the "Regulations on the electronic educational environment of NUBIP of Ukraine" and "Regulations on educational and information NUBIP of Ukraine portal" have been created for all disciplines. Electronic academic course content is updated before the beginning of the academic year and undergoes re-certification - at least once per 5 years.

Students can submit their suggestions and comments on the master's program by taking part in the survey, which is held annually in online format, posted on the website of the department.

Students can also submit their comments during discussions with the curators of the groups, which are carried out systematically before the update of the master's program and before its approval.

Students can express their opinions on the quality of teaching, format and content of the master's program during the defense of reports, qualification work, at meetings with curators and using the website.

The opinion of employers on the program objectives, competencies and program learning outcomes was taken into account by involving them in the discussion and in review of the master's program.

A Council of Employers at the Faculty of Agricultural Management is an advisory body created to develop strategies and directions for educational and research activities. The main task of the FAM Employers' Council, as a strong and effective platform for cooperation in the format of "business and university", is to improve the quality of education and strengthen the reputation of the faculty, which will put cooperation between industry, science and education on a more systematic basis in Ukraine. At its meetings, the Council of Employers considers the organization of the educational process, maintaining the content of the program, compliance with the planned schedules of practice and quality preparation of master's thesis.

As a result of provided recommendations, the structure and content of educational components of the master's program was improved. Changes were made regarding the importance and special role of the mentor in the practical training and preparation of a master's thesis. The positive experience of the mentors from the top management of companies who took an active part in the practical training of students and in the preparation of master's thesis and in the examination commission during the public defense was considered. Employers also join the classes and make constructive suggestions.

The wishes of other stakeholders in formulating the goals and program results of the training are implemented in cooperation with research and other institutions and organizations, in particular with the Association "Ukrainian Club of Agrarian Business", All-Ukrainian NGO "National Association of Agricultural Advisory Services of Ukraine", Project German-Ukrainian Agropolitical Dialogue " (APD), the International Finance Corporation (IFC) in Ukraine, whose proposals help to update the content of academic disciplines in accordance with current trends in economic development.

In addition, various stakeholders provide their feedback on master's program through direct communication with project team members, guarantor and dean at scientific and practical conferences, seminars, round tables, etc.

## 9.2 Assessment

The Examination of the regulatory documents in the Academic Policy section of the University's website, the self-evaluation report, the results of the faculty and student survey, and the results of the online survey confirmed that monitoring and regular evaluation of the study program "Master programme in Administrative Management" (M.Sc.) is carried out at the University.

The schedule of activities for monitoring the quality of education was approved, according to which the University monitors and regularly evaluates the study program in order to achieve the objectives and meet the needs of students and society. In order to determine the level of satisfaction of internal needs, the university organises and conducts a survey among students, faculty and University staff every academic session.

The survey is conducted to determine the level of satisfaction with the students' educational needs, their attitude towards the educational process, the socio-cultural environment, etc.

The results of the survey are statistically analysed, discussed in the administrative meetings and taken into account in the further planning of educational activities. According to the monitoring statistics, the programme management analyses and compiles the survey results in order to initiate the necessary measures to achieve the desired results.

The existing quality management seems to function according to a hierarchical principle. However, the goal is a functioning control circle between the participants in order to improve the quality of research and teaching (Circle of Quality). This Circle of Quality functions according to the bottom up - top down principle.

The university regularly reviews the strategy and policy in the area of quality and monitors its implementation.

Overall, it should be noted that responsibilities are clearly and comprehensibly regulated, not least because the core processes of quality assurance are documented in the university's regulations.

Feedback between students and teachers is a prerequisite for improving teaching and should be introduced. The evaluation results of the anonymous course evaluations will be presented to the students after the surveys and discussed with them in order to derive concrete measures for improving teaching.

It became clear in the discussions that there is definitely close contact with the graduates and that they are surveyed very soon after graduation.

The course evaluations thus serve the continuous development and improvement of quality and studyability. The student workload is continuously surveyed in the course evaluations;



corresponding questions are included in the questionnaires. An evaluation of the workload through a module should take place at regular intervals.

Students are made aware of the student workload and examination requirements by the lecturers at the beginning of the course. In the degree programme, the measure of how many hours one ECTS point corresponds to the student workload is anchored in the regulatory documents.

With regard to the quality of teaching, it should be noted that measures to ensure it begin with the recruitment of teaching staff. In addition, the university offers teaching staff various further training opportunities, both on technical and didactic topics.

It can be stated that there is a combination of internal and external quality management in order to offer its own study programmes in a generally ESG-compliant manner.

The “Master programme in Administrative Management” (M.Sc.) is regularly evaluated to ensure quality and to check compliance with the high quality standards. Ongoing monitoring of the study program is carried out in accordance with the quality assurance policy. The programme is reviewed regularly and if changes are required, they are made. This process is exemplary. The study programmes thus have suitable and different procedures for internal quality assurance.

The university has a systematic procedure of analysis, development, monitoring and periodic revision of the educational program. Employers who confirmed this process as transparent, understandable and accessible are involved in the improvement of the educational program. A culture of quality has been formed in the academic community of the University, which contributes to the continuous development of the educational program and educational activities under this program.

The process of collecting proposals from various groups of stakeholders is insufficiently organized. It is recommended to strengthen work on the organization of the process of collecting proposals from various groups of stakeholders.

Standardised evaluation procedures should be introduced, in order to advance the quality assurance of the study program and, if necessary, to be able to derive recommendations for action.

### **9.3 Conclusion**

The criterion is **fulfilled**.



## 10 ESG Standard 1.10: Cyclical external quality assurance

**Institutions should undergo external quality assurance in line with the ESG on a cyclical basis**

### 10.1 Implementation

Cyclical external quality assurance of higher education takes place, in particular, through communication with the accreditation bodies of the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine and the National Agency for Quality Assurance in Higher Education. Also, the review of the content of the program and disciplines is carried out in accordance with the recommendations and annual seminars for coordinators of cooperation between NUBIP of Ukraine and HSWT and teachers involved in teaching at master's program "Administrative Management".

The master's program was accredited through the Ukrainian regulatory system by the Ministry of Education and Sciences of Ukraine. The accreditation of the master's programme for 50 full time and 50 part-time placements is valid till the 1st of July 2024.

In addition, in 2004 representatives from the Weihenstephan University of Applied Sciences (Germany), Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine and Germany held a meeting and discussed the possibility to educate students at two partner universities with further acquirement of double degree. In 2016 the full-time program was accredited by ACQUIN and in 2018 it was approved till 2023.

The university undergoes external quality assurance procedures in accordance with the cyclical basis, licensing procedures for specialties of various educational degrees, accreditation of educational programs in accordance with state requirements defined in the Resolutions of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine and Orders of the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine.

External quality assurance of educational activities and the quality of education includes participation in national rankings, which aims to determine the positioning of the university on the national educational market, vectors of development of the best higher education institutions, calculating them to adjust strategic and current tasks, higher education and scientific personnel, strengthening the scientific basis of educational activities, internationalization of the educational process, taking into account the views of academic experts and employers.

NUBIP of Ukraine entered the ranking of the best universities in the world - QS World University Rankings 2023. In the latest issue of the QS World university ranking 2023 published on TopUniversities.com, the university ranks 1201-1400.

Our university is in the TOP 85% of the universities indexed in the QS world university ranking 2023. The ranking includes 11 Ukrainian universities.

Also, the review of the master's program takes into account the results of external quality assurance of higher education (in particular, comments and suggestions made during the accreditation of other master programs).

The academic community is a constant participant in the system of internal quality assurance of educational activities at the graduate level. Teachers of departments participate in methodical seminars and meetings of the department, whose purpose is to optimize the structure and content of academic disciplines, exchange experience in methods of teaching disciplines of the department, discuss the use of modern technologies in teaching, development of educational and methodological and logistical support, as well as the search for ways to improve pedagogical skills.

Also, research and teaching staff, as permanent members of the Academic Council of the faculty, discusses the quality of the master's program and makes decisions on specific actions to ensure the quality of the study program. In addition, representatives of the department participate, as permanent members, in the work of the Academic Council of the Faculty and the Academic Council of NUBIP of Ukraine, where decisions on quality assurance of the educational program are also considered and adopted.

## **10.2 Assessment**

As far as the legal framework of quality assurance is concerned, the study program is conducted in accordance with the regulations and guidelines. For this purpose, the university has a combination of internal and external quality management to offer the study programme in accordance with the ESG. The University has undergone institutional accreditation. The accreditation results are incorporated into the structuring of the University's business processes. Of particular importance is the cooperation with external stakeholders such as partner universities, graduates, industry and employers in order to gain impetus for continuous internal quality development.

Quality management ensures very well that the general quality assurance measures and instruments are constantly up-to-date and transparent. The University fulfils all obligatory aspects of external quality assurance: the different organisational units and levels are adequately in place and were explained in detail in the interviews with the HEI. Both internal and external quality assurance of the University's measures take into account all legal requirements and benefit from each other to advance the quality development of the study programme. External quality assurance extends to all necessary organisational levels such as financial operations and educational provision. The internal and external quality assurance mechanisms for the continuous development of the programme is well developed and the cyclical functioning of the

programme's quality assessment is effective. The quality of the surveys and the processing of the results can be rated as very good. No specific problems in the cyclical external quality assurance were reported for the study program.

The follow-up activities of the university's external quality assurance in preparing the next procedure are generally well thought out. The results of the external assessment and recognition of the quality of the study program (reports, expert opinions, etc.) are published on the university's website.

In conclusion, the coherence between external and internal quality assurances is well structured.

### **10.3 Conclusion**

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

#### IV Recommendation to the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN

##### 1 **Assessment of compliance the Standards and Guidelines in the Higher European Area (ESG) in the actual official version**

The study programme “**Master programme in Administrative Management**” (M.Sc.) was assessed on the basis of the "Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area" (ESG) and the national or other relevant regulations.

The expert group concludes that the **ESG standards** 1.1 (Policy for quality assurance), 1.2 (Design and approval of programmes), 1.3 (Student-centred learning, teaching and assessment), 1.4 (Student admission, progression, recognition and certification), 1.5 (Teaching staff), 1.6 (Learning resources and student support), 1.7 (Information management), 1.8 (Public information), 1.9 (On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes) and 1.10 (Cyclical external quality assurance) are fulfilled.

The assessment criteria are as follows:

**Standard 1.1 Policy for quality assurance:** Universities have a publicly accessible quality assurance strategy, which is part of their strategic management. This strategy is developed and implemented by internal stakeholder representatives through appropriate structures and processes, involving external stakeholders.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.2 Design and approval of programmes:** Universities have procedures for the design and approval of their courses. The courses are designed in such a way that their objectives, including the desired learning outcomes, can be achieved. The qualification obtained during a degree program is clearly defined and communicated; it refers to the corresponding level of the national qualifications framework for higher education and, consequently, the qualifications framework for the European Higher Education Area.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.3 Student-centred learning, teaching and assessment:** Universities ensure that the courses offered are carried out in such a way as to encourage students to play an active role in the design of the learning process and that this approach is also taken into account when assessing students / examinations.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.4 Student admission, progression, recognition and certification:** Universities ensure that the courses offered are carried out in such a way as to encourage students to play an active role in the design of the learning process and that this approach is also taken into account when assessing students / examinations.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.5 Teaching staff:** Universities ensure the competence of their teachers. They use fair and transparent procedures for the recruitment and further training of their employees.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.6 Learning resources and student support:** The university has adequate funding to finance study and teaching and ensure that there is always a sufficient and readily available range of learning and support available for their studies.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.7 Information management:** Universities ensure that they collect, analyze and use the relevant data relevant to the successful conduct of studies and other activities.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.8 Public information:** Universities publish easily understandable, correct, objective, up-to-date and well-accessible information about their activities and courses of study.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.9 On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes:** Universities are constantly monitoring their courses and regularly reviewing them to ensure that they achieve the goals set and meet the needs of students and society. The tests lead to a continuous improvement of the courses. All affected parties will be informed about any measures planned or resulting from this.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.10 Cyclical external quality assurance:** Universities regularly undergo external quality assurance procedures in accordance with the ESG.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

The peer-review experts note that the recommendations from the previous accreditation procedure have been adequately taken into account.

## 2 Accreditation Recommendation

The peer-review experts recommend an unconditional accreditation of the study programme **“Master programme in Administrative Management” (M.Sc.)** with the following **recommendations**:

1. Students' English language skills should be improved. Higher entrance requirements should be created with regard to English skills or students should be offered compulsory language courses to improve their English language skills.
2. Within the framework of the further development of the curriculum, current topics such as big data and digitalisation should be given greater consideration.
3. The same standards and uniform application procedures for teaching staff should prevail at all partner universities.
4. The English language skills of teaching and administrative staff should be improved and corresponding further training courses implemented.
5. Professional practice representatives should be consulted in an institutionalised way in curriculum development.
6. The HSWT should establish a good administrative infrastructure for all partner universities and create even more support services in general and during student mobility phases with a view to even better studyability.
7. In order to guarantee the implementation of the study programmes, the staff should also grow with the increasing number of students.
8. Better strategic communication activities should be developed to publicise the study offer in order to arouse the interest of potential applicants in the long term.
9. Standardised evaluation procedures should be introduced, in order to advance the quality assurance of the study programme and, if necessary, to be able to derive recommendations for action.

## **V Decisions of the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN**

Based on the evaluation report of the expert group and the statements of the Higher Education Institutions the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN makes on the 09 May 2023 the following decisions unanimously:

**The study programme “Master programme in Administrative Management” (M.Sc.) at the National University of Life and Environmental Sciences of Ukraine is accredited without any conditions.**

**The accreditation is valid until 30. September 2029.**

The following recommendations are given for the further development of the study programme:

- Students' English language skills should be improved. Higher entrance requirements should be created with regard to English skills or students should be offered compulsory language courses to improve their English language skills.
- Within the framework of the further development of the curriculum, current topics such as big data and digitalisation should be given greater consideration.
- The same standards and uniform application procedures for teaching staff should be prevailed at all partner universities.
- The English language skills of teaching and administrative staff should be improved and corresponding further training courses implemented.
- Professional practice representatives should be consulted in an institutionalised way in curriculum development.
- The HSWT should establish a good administrative infrastructure for all partner universities and create even more support services in general and during student mobility phases with a view to even better studyability.
- In order to guarantee the implementation of the study programmes, the staff should also grow with the increasing number of students.
- Better strategic communication activities should be developed to publicise the study offer in order to arouse the interest of potential applicants in the long term.
- Standardised evaluation procedures should be introduced, in order to advance the quality assurance of the study programme and, if necessary, to be able to derive recommendations for action.
- It is recommended to carry out further development of the internal quality assurance system by timely response to legislative changes, and by improving the coordination of measures to monitor the quality of the educational programme and educational activities at the University level.
- The expert group recommends involving students more in the work of the department in order to take their wishes and suggestions more into account when planning and implementing the educational process, selecting, reviewing and updating the educational programme.

- It is recommended to ensure the teaching of professional disciplines by a specialist with appropriate qualifications.