

## **Accreditation report**

Joint accreditation procedure at

**L.N. Gumilyov Eurasian National University (ENU)**

**5B030200 – International Law (Bachelor), 6M030200 – International Law  
(Scientific and Pedagogical Master), 6M030200 – International Law (Profile  
Master), 6D030200 – International Law (Ph.D.)**

### **1. Procedure**

**Date of contract:** 7<sup>th</sup> September 2017

**Receipt of self-evaluation report:** 6<sup>th</sup> November 2017

**Date of the on-site-visit:** 12<sup>th</sup>-16<sup>th</sup> November 2017

**Decisions of the Accreditation Commission:** 26th March 2018

**Chairman of the expert group:** Vladimir Nikolayevich Kosov, Doctor of Physical and Mathematical Sciences, professor of Kazakh National University named after Abai

**ACQUIN Standing Expert Committee:** Economics, law and social sciences

**Attendance by ACQUIN:** Dr. Stefan Handke, Head of International Department, ACQUIN e.V. (Bayreuth, Germany); Nina Soroka, Deputy Head of International Department ACQUIN e.V. (Bayreuth, Germany)

**Attendance by IAAR:** Timur Yerbolatovich Kanapyanov, Manager of International Projects and Public Relations, IAAR (Astana)

### **Members of the expert group:**

- Professor Dr. Gerhard Hohloch, University of Freiburg, Institute of Foreign and International Private Law
- Assistant professor Medeu Shungenovich Kurmangali, Candidate of Legal Sciences, member of Kazakhstan Association of International Law, member of German-Russian Bar Association, Narxoz University

- Professor Larisa Arnoldovna Shkutina, Doctor of Pedagogical Sciences, Karaganda State University named after E. A. Buketov
- Liliya Amangeldievna Ispenbetova, a Ph.D. student in the second year of study programme 6D030200 – International Law, Kazakh Humanitarian and Law University (KAZGUU University)

The **evaluation report** of the expert group is based on the self-evaluation documentation of the higher education institution and extensive discussions with the heads of the study programmes, faculty members, students, and employers.

The **evaluation criteria** are based on the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG<sup>1</sup>) in the official version valid at the time the contract is concluded. At the same time the national context, particularly the national rules regulating the establishment of study programmes, has been taken into account<sup>2</sup>.

---

<sup>1</sup><http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/P1200001080>

<sup>2</sup><http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/P1200001080>

## Table of Contents

<b>Accreditation report .....</b>	<b>1</b>
ESG Part 1. Standard 1.1: Policy for quality assurance .....	7
<b>Description .....</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>Conclusion .....</b>	<b>10</b>
ESG Part 1. Standard 1.2: Design and approval of programmes .....	11
<b>General principles and objectives .....</b>	<b>11</b>
<b>Description of the study programmes International LAW (Bachelor, Master, Ph.D.).....</b>	<b>15</b>
<b>Assessment .....</b>	<b>18</b>
<b>Conclusion .....</b>	<b>20</b>
ESG Part 1. Standard 1.3: Student-centred learning, teaching and assessment.....	21
<b>Assessment .....</b>	<b>21</b>
<b>Conclusion .....</b>	<b>23</b>
ESG Part 1. Standard 1.4: Student admission, progression, recognition and certification .	24
<b>Assessment .....</b>	<b>24</b>
<b>Conclusion .....</b>	<b>25</b>
ESG Part 1. Standard 1.5: Teaching staff.....	26
<b>Description of facts .....</b>	<b>26</b>
<b>Assessment .....</b>	<b>27</b>
<b>Conclusion .....</b>	<b>28</b>
ESG Part 1. Standard 1.6: Learning resources and student support .....	29
<b>Assessment .....</b>	<b>29</b>
<b>Conclusion .....</b>	<b>30</b>
ESG Part 1. Standard 1.7: Information management.....	31
<b>Description of facts .....</b>	<b>31</b>
<b>Assessment .....</b>	<b>33</b>
<b>Conclusion .....</b>	<b>34</b>
ESG Part 1. Standard 1.8: Public information .....	35
<b>Description of facts .....</b>	<b>35</b>
<b>Assessment .....</b>	<b>36</b>
<b>Conclusion .....</b>	<b>36</b>

ESG Part 1. Standard 1.9: On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes .....	37
<b>Assessment</b> .....	<b>37</b>
<b>Conclusion</b> .....	<b>39</b>
ESG Part 1. Standard 1.10: Cyclical external quality assurance .....	40
<b>Assessment</b> .....	<b>40</b>
<b>Conclusion</b> .....	<b>40</b>
<b>Decision</b> .....	<b>42</b>

## 2. Initial Situation

The experts thank the organizers and the participating teachers and students whom they have met during the on-site visit in Astana for being available for discussions and providing information on programmes and higher education institution. This kind of participation is perceived as very valuable not only for evaluation of the programmes but also for a better understanding of the legal, social, and cultural background of the higher education system of the Republic of Kazakhstan, particularly of L.N. Gumilyov Eurasian National University. The **evaluation of the expert group** is based on the self-evaluation report of the university and extensive discussions with the heads of the study programmes, faculty members, students, and employers as well as the depiction of university management during the on-site visit. The process of accreditation in Kazakhstan has a common goal of checking the quality of study programmes and their compliance with European standards. In the context of international accreditations in European Higher Education Area, the **key evaluation criteria** are the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) that are revised on a regular basis. In addition, the accreditation procedure must take into account the relevant legislative requirements of the state concerned. To this end, an expert group has been appointed to ensure that all issues related to the evaluation procedure are taken into account (for instance, technical considerations, structural and formal aspects as well as social factors). The certificate with the seal of ACQUIN is awarded based on accreditation of study programmes in Kazakhstan. The standing expert group consists of several academic field representatives as well as representatives of professional practice and students.

### **3. Outcomes of the first accreditation**

Study programmes 5B030200 International Law (Bachelor), 6M030200 International Law (Scientific and Pedagogical Master), 6M030200 International Law (Profile Master) were assessed and accredited for the first time by ACQUIN in 2012.

The conditions were fulfilled and the decision was made to accredit the study programmes 5B030200 International Law (Bachelor), 6M030200 International Law (Scientific and Pedagogical Master), 6M030200 International Law (Profile Master) until 30<sup>th</sup> September 2017.

For the proper implementation of the ACQUIN re-accreditation procedure, the term of accreditation of study programmes 5B030200 International Law (Bachelor), 6M030200 International Law (Scientific and Pedagogical Master), 6M030200 International Law (Profile Master) was tentatively extended until 30<sup>th</sup> September 2018.

***The study programme of doctoral studies 6D030200 International Law (Ph.D.) is being accredited for the first time by NAAR and ACQUIN.***

#### **4. Description of the facts and assessment (in accordance with ESG)**

The expert group assesses the quality of study programmes and their compliance with European standards (Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area - ESG). General statements contain information applicable to all programmes. Specific matters relevant to individual programmes are mentioned only in the case of deviations from general conclusions.

##### **Part 1. Standards and guidelines for internal quality assurance**

##### **ESG Part 1. Standard 1.1: Policy for quality assurance**

[Institutions should have a policy for quality assurance that is made public and forms part of their strategic management. Internal stakeholders should develop and implement this policy through appropriate structures and processes, while involving external stakeholders.]

##### **Description**

The policy in the field of quality assurance of ENU is based on its mission, vision, and values; it is a part of the university strategic management and is implemented at all levels of the higher education institution. The policy on quality assurance is made available in the public domain and is accessible via ENU website and information stands of university departments as well as the electronic document management system. The heads of all university departments make the policy known to all stakeholders (by using various kinds of information spreading tools, for instance, clarifications are available at all levels). They are also responsible for planning, implementation, and improvement of quality within scope of their functional duties. All stakeholders are involved in quality assurance processes.

The university has its own Quality Assurance Department. It ensures the implementation of its quality policy and maintains and improves its Quality Management System. The university has successfully undergone the procedure of the QMS re-certification. The certificate of compliance of QMS with ISO 9001:2008 Standards has been obtained. It is valid until September 2018.

In accordance with the requirements of the regulatory documents of the Republic of Kazakhstan, ISO 9001:2008 and university management processes, ENU has drafted internal regulatory documents that establish the mechanisms of the functioning of all educational processes.

The main provisions of the policy are detailed in the following documents: Academic Policy of the University, ENU Code of Business Ethics, Internal Quality Standards, Operational Plans for Chairs and Departments, Plans for the Development of Study Programmes, and Quality Assurance Procedures.

The Quality Policy (2017) emphasises the importance of a number of focus areas: internationalisation of education; principle of student-centredness; involvement of students in quality assurance processes; academic mobility of students, faculty members, and university staff; cooperation with employers.

Quality assurance of modular study programmes is carried out based on internal and external evaluations. The internal quality assessment of study programmes is provided by representatives with substantive expertise, procedure for reviewing and approval of modular study programmes over the course of meetings of the department, Teaching and Methodological Commission of the faculty, Council of the faculty, Scientific and Methodological Council of the university as well as Academic Council of the university.

External assessment of the quality of study programmes is carried out through the final state examination of students, procedures of state attestation and institutional accreditation of the university as well as participation in national and international ratings of study programmes. Accreditation and rating results are made available to all interested parties, published in the media and posted on the website of external organisations. There are expert opinions on accredited study programmes. The objectives and competencies of study programmes are also available and published on the official website of the university.

The analysis of the self-assessment report as well as the results of meetings, held with undergraduate and graduate students and faculty members, confirmed that the priorities for the development of study programmes currently undergoing the accreditation process are in line with the national policy in the field of education and are defined by the requirements of the external environment (competition and demographic issues), resources (information and material resources) and labour market requirements.

To increase the motivation and responsibility of employees, to ensure the quality of performance and to determine the contribution of each employee to the strategic and operational goals of the university in 2016, the KPI pilot project was implemented at ENU. It is based on the principles of objectivity, transparency, attainability, and measurability of indicators. This project received a positive assessment of the university. KPI results are available on the official website of ENU. In 2017, corrections and amendments were made to the automated KPI system that took into account proposals from faculty members, heads of departments, and deans.

One of the strategic directions of the ENU is "the formation of the university as a research centre in the Eurasian space". The Quality Policy reflects the link between research and training, which involves research and implementation of its results in the context of education. Teachers take an active part in competitions for scientific research grants announced by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan; thus, conducting initiative research. Young scientists, undergraduate and graduate students are involved in the implementation of scientific projects. Subjects of theses of Master and Doctoral students are determined by taking into account the subject of fundamental scientific research conducted by the teaching staff.

The policy supports values such as maintenance of academic honesty and freedom, and promotes prevention of protectionism, corruption, and discrimination. These values are reflected in the following documents: ENU Business Ethics Code, ENU Student Honour and Conduct Code, Rules of the Study Procedures, Procedure for Checking the Students' Theses against Plagiarism. If disputes arise when students take interim and final examinations, a special Appeals committee is created to address these issues; such committees are governed by the Regulations on Appeal.

Feedback from stakeholders is received through sociological surveys and questionnaires, for these procedures independent experts are involved.

The quality assurance policy also applies to the activities performed by contractors (outsourcing) on the following types of work at ENU: sociological studies conducted by outside organisations, external audits, maintenance work and renovation of premises. The requirements for contractors are stated in the technical specification of the services in question.

Thus, Quality Management System allows ENU to comprehensively monitor the effectiveness of its activities in the field of education; it ensures continuous monitoring of the quality of training and management by both the senior staff of the university and users of its services.

Implementation of the Policy in the Field of Quality Assurance, functioning of the quality management system, internal and external assessment of the quality of educational programmes, upgrading the qualification and rating of the teaching staff, monitoring the quality of the services provided, analysing the educational resources and support systems for students with the aim of improving the material and technical base, and information resources contribute to the successful development and competitiveness of the university as well as its continuous improvement of the quality of the educational services provided. Chairs that implement study programmes subject to this accreditation procedure carry out activities in accordance with the Policy in the Field of Quality Assurance. The goals of study programmes fully correspond to the mission, aims, and objectives of Eurasian National University and are available in the public domain.

All stakeholders participate in quality assurance processes and are responsible, within their competence, for the quality of the educational services provided.

## **Conclusion**

**The group of experts concludes that Standard 1.1 of the Standards and Recommendations for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) has been fulfilled.**

## **ESG Part 1. Standard 1.2: Design and approval of programmes**

[Institutions should have processes for the design and approval of their programmes. The programmes should be designed so that they meet the objectives set for them, including the intended learning outcomes. The qualification resulting from a programme should be clearly specified and communicated and refer to the correct level of the national qualifications framework for higher education and, consequently, to the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.]

### **General principles and objectives**

Development of modular study programmes is carried out on the basis of normative documents of the Republic of Kazakhstan, requirements of international standards within the Bologna process. The structure and content of syllabi correspond to standard curriculums and a catalogue of elective disciplines.

Master study programme (Scientific and Pedagogical Master course) International Law includes objectives, level of qualification, degree awarded, recognition of previous training, ways and methods of implementing the study programme, evaluation criteria for learning outcomes, key learning outcomes, main modules of the study programmes.

The objectives of study programmes are formulated in accordance with the programmes of the institutional strategy and are consistent with the mission of the university and the needs of society; they correspond to the 7 level of the National Qualifications Framework. The Scientific and Pedagogical Master course contains theoretical training, pedagogical and research practice, research work of Master students and final state certification. The results of the training reflect the qualification levels and key competencies of the graduates.

In determining the objectives of the study programmes, the results of training and competences, the needs of stakeholders, the results of questioning of students and employers, the recommendations of foreign experts and accreditation agencies are taken into account (the results of the questionnaires are published on the ENU website).

The disciplines included in the curriculum of the Master programme (Scientific and Pedagogical Master course) have been developed in accordance with the European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System (ECTS). The content of the modules is well balanced, logically linked and focused on obtaining the expected learning outcomes.

When forming elective disciplines for purposes and content, labour market requirements, their correspondence with global development trends and science achievements, employers' requests and programme profile are taken into account. The Master programme focuses on the scientific-analytical and research aspects of education, students have academic freedom in conducting scientific activities and research in the chosen direction. Assessment of educational achievements and the level of preparation of graduates is provided with the use of a score and rating system.

The organisation and completion of all types of practices are carried out in accordance with the state compulsory educational standards of the Republic of Kazakhstan (please see Quality Management System. Procedure. Professional practice. PRO ENU 705-12). The programmes for gaining work experience have been developed for each type of internships. Over the course of the past two years, there has been a trend towards an increase in the conclusion of tripartite agreements for internships.

The university created conditions for the effective promotion of students on an individual educational trajectory, including consultations provided by a number of advisers, curators, and mentors. These conditions ensure the availability and effective functioning of the system of individual assistance and counselling of students on the issues of the educational process. The academic policy is available on ENU website and via the Platonus system; students have access to all educational and methodological information.

Thus, development and approval of the study programmes are carried out in accordance with the approved procedure outlined in the Instruction for the development and approval of study programmes at ENU (22-16). The availability of normative documentation and methodological guidance ensures transparency and effectiveness of the development, approval and implementation of study programmes. The study programmes correspond to the objectives and the expected learning outcomes. The qualification obtained as a result of the programme completion is clearly defined and explained; it also corresponds to a certain level of the National Qualification Framework and, therefore, the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.

Positive changes in the content of study programmes undergoing the accreditation process over the past five years are as follows:

- a significant increase in the volume of elective subjects (up to 75% of the total theoretical education) which contributes to the expansion of academic freedom of Master students;
- active assistance of employers in the improvement of vocational education through the recommendations of the most relevant disciplines;
- expert assessment of implemented programmes is carried out by Kazakhstani and foreign partners;
- growth of the number of internships allows increasing the level of adaptation of graduates in the chosen field of professional activity.

L.N. Gumilyov Eurasian National University in Astana / Kazakhstan (ENU) was founded more than 20 years ago. The university considers itself one of the best universities in the higher education system of the Republic of Kazakhstan; this self assessment is factually true. The university enjoys special support in the system of higher education of the country and within the framework of the presidential political system. High level of study programmes is supported with the university buildings in the capital, equipment, facilities, and faculty members. Such a high assessment extends to the Faculty of Law. Enrolment of students is limited numerically; it depends on the funding availability through scholarships. Prospects for employment after graduation are also determined by this structure. This applies both to the programmes of the faculty in the field of common law, and the programmes of International Law, which are offered as Bachelor, Master and Ph.D. programmes.

The Law Faculty at ENU is organized in accordance with the traditions of the higher education system of Russia and Kazakhstan, therefore, teaching and research studies are conducted in separate units called "institutes" ("faculties") or "departments", each such subdivision manages a separate area of jurisprudence (for example, criminal law and forensics, civil law with its relevant subsections, constitutional law and administrative law, international law). These units are hierarchically organized under the supervision of the head of the institute or department, in particular in the field of jurisprudence, and include professors, teachers and part-time employees. Junior employees are also part of the unit, the age structure is similar, and the proportion of female employees is somewhat inferior in numbers.

The academic management of the faculty with the above mentioned structure is the responsibility of the dean and the corresponding dean's office. As for the administrative and university organization, the rector/president of the university is its head. Legal basis is based on the state legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Significant interdependence between the state bodies of the Republic and the region (state and municipal administration, ministerial administration, judicial bodies of the Republic and the region) and enterprises that act as partners, especially in the field of providing additional disciplines offered by lecturers working part-time, is significant for ENU and the Faculty of Law. They also play an especially important role as partners for providing places for internships and writing Master and Bachelor theses.

Study programmes in International Law are offered by the Law Faculty of the Institute of International Law. As a training and research unit, the faculty includes more professors, teachers, other faculty members, and staff. Not all of them are full-time employees of the university and faculty. Background for the activities of the faculty in its current form was created by the former director of the institute, who is now retired but still has international recognition. The Bachelor study programme (eight semesters, including exam periods) is offered as training course. It is also the basis for the admission to a Master programme of two types of courses (a two-semester Profile Master course and a four-semester Scientific and Pedagogical Master course for further research at the university level). Doctoral study programme Ph.D. is aimed at promoting young researchers in the field of "International Law" and their participation in research and teaching at ENU and other universities in Kazakhstan. The study programmes International Law are organized separately from the programmes of common law. They are aimed at training the junior staff both for the diplomatic services of the Republic of Kazakhstan and for professional positions in international organizations which are represented in the Republic of Kazakhstan in proportion. Employment of graduates of these programmes, especially graduates of the Master course, is also possible in ministries and business; in the latter, there is a growing need for legally qualified specialists in the field of international jurisprudence.

As part of the current accreditation, it is necessary to check whether changes have been made to the accredited programmes in accordance with the recommendations made during the previous accreditation for the 2012/2013 academic year. The fundamental out-

come of the audit was that the Institute of International Law which offers study programmes leading to the award of the degree had to cope with the need of better distinguishing the undergraduate and graduate programmes in terms of their content and structure. The Master study programmes in the version proposed at this stage now clearly differ from the Bachelor programmes that offer a basic level of higher education. There is also a clear distinction in comparison with the doctoral programme and the considerable freedom of choice; students can customize the programme according to their preferences; it is also characterized by a small number of students. As a rule, they are also involved in teaching activities within the Institute of International Law.

The recommendations of the previous accreditation procedure have been fulfilled.

### **Description of the study programmes International LAW (Bachelor, Master, Ph.D.)**

The **Bachelor** programme in International Law is designed to be completed in four academic years (8 semesters) and has a modular structure. With regard to this structure, the first accreditation by ACQUIN in the 2012/2013 school year should be taken into consideration. The curriculum still covers general educational disciplines devoted to history, foreign languages and basic subjects as well as supporting sciences (psychology and political science). A more important part of the training is, of course, actual subjects in the field of jurisprudence. The International Law programme differs from the general jurisprudence in the field of elective subjects that are already offered at the faculty and which, in turn, lead to a general qualification as a lawyer/attorney (Bachelor of law). The main subjects are civil law, public law and criminal law; each is a type of procedural law and is generally binding for subject training. The overall number of these disciplines has been reduced for the Bachelor programme International Law. It is currently taught in correspondence with the framework of individual disciplines of International Law, International Private Law and European Law in more detail and is extensively studied. Nevertheless, International law still constitutes a larger percentage than International Private Law and European Law. The fact that the latter is not the main direction should be emphasized. Kazakhstan is the "third state" in relation to the EU and the legislation of the European Union as well as the laws of the Council of Europe refer to the Republic of Kazakhstan only as a third country.

The offered subjects are divided into compulsory subjects and, to a limited extent for the undergraduate, into elective disciplines. The distribution of separate disciplines into two thematic catalogues is such that it is impossible to specialize only in the field of international law and the law of international organizations with the complete exception of international private law and European law. Teaching is conducted in the form of lectures in small group sessions, including training on the basis of cases; the completion of internships is compulsory and is conducted in public institutions and enterprises working in cooperation with the university. At the end of the course, students have to prepare a thesis; in principle, its subject can be chosen relatively freely, but, as a rule, the choice of topics comes from the list offered by the teachers. In part, examinations are conducted in the form of state testing with multiple-choice questions, but they also take the form of an oral and written examination (also in the form of case studies). Bachelor thesis is considered in accordance with the principle of "four eyes". If the exam is failed, students in question have a possibility of filing an appeal.

The **Master** study programme is offered in two versions: Scientific and Pedagogical course with a duration of two years of study required for further academic work at the university level and Profile course that is necessary for mastering the profession. Both courses consist of modules; the main focus corresponds with their concepts, so they have already been accredited in the 2012/13 academic year. The concept is to offer a study programme that should allow its graduates to immediately take positions of the entrance level in the international public service of the Republic of Kazakhstan, which still needs properly trained lawyers. Equally, the situation is similar in areas of business that have external relations of an international nature. The Scientific and Pedagogical Master course is aimed at preparing a new generation of teaching staff for ENU and other universities of the country. For this purpose, a clear selection process has been established; only a small part of the graduates of the Bachelor programme - about 10-15% - are admitted into the Master programme, and about half of them receive state scholarships. After the successful completion of the Master programme there is an actual guarantee of employment in accordance with the training.

The subjects are offered to a lesser extent in the form of lectures, largely in the form of small group sessions for assignments and group work as well as seminars. The connection with the practice of international law is ensured by the presentation and examination of

the present cases; this concerns the teaching of international law as well as international private law and, to a certain extent, European law. The choice is more pronounced than in the Bachelor programme, so a purposeful specialization - International Law or International Private Law (including an integrated right) is possible. This specialization continues in the framework of compulsory internships: work placements are offered in the ministerial office as well as in the economy and the choice is made by students themselves. These placements are often very successful and sometimes lead to the employment of students by the company or institution that provided the internship position immediately after their graduation.

The order of the examination system corresponds to the main state regulations mentioned above for the undergraduate program. Passing the exams leads to the successful completion of training, and then to work placement in the specialty on the basis of the choice made at the beginning of the training and the concept of training. This applies to both 1 and 2-year Master courses.

**Doctorate programme Ph.D.** is regulated only in the field of individual elements. The purpose and concept is scientific activity at the faculty and at the Institute of International Law or in other fields of science in Kazakhstan. This requires the successful defense of a doctoral dissertation and the passing of postgraduate examinations. This qualification is required only for the highest level of academic positions in the university system of Kazakhstan, so the number of students enrolled in the doctoral programme is quite small. The compulsory curriculum is a flexible framework programme; doctoral students focus on scientific activity and preparation of a dissertation which must meet the high level of requirements. In addition, it is necessary to have the experience of teaching, which can be started after the Master programme in the framework of the programmes offered by the institute, and in accordance with the appointment of the institute's management and the dean of the faculty. Financing of doctoral studies is carried out through a scholarship or through work as a teacher of the institute. As a rule, research outside of Kazakhstan is possible and financed. The number of studies amount to a fairly modest level; the reasons are limited resources and a conscious limitation of doctoral candidates. These measures are necessary for the avoidance of an excessive number of graduates of doctoral studies since number of places for employment is limited and will not accommodate more Ph.D. graduates.

## Assessment

The current concept of studying International Law at ENU can be characterized as successful and implemented at an appropriate level. The fundamental concept of the proposal and the conduct of a special training course that falls outside the bounds of general jurisprudence and is different in structure and teaching of material is quite convincing. The model is also offered in a similar form outside of Kazakhstan, for example, there is a programme in Dresden / Germany. This study programme in the field of International Relations is similar in structure of the International Law provided that students use the proposed options for elective subjects. The disciplines at ENU obviously correspond to the demand of practice in the Republic of Kazakhstan for its public service (foreign policy service, ministerial department, other foreign agencies) as well as for the import and export sectors. This areas generate a constant need for specialists who have completed training in the field of International Law and in its separate areas. For the reasons mentioned above, graduates, at least, of Master programmes do not face any challenges in finding employment in accordance with the qualifications. The abovementioned description applies to both the undergraduate programme and to both courses of the Master program. In addition, it should be noted that the number of graduates is limited due to the limited intake of first year students that is based on the high average score necessary for enrollment into the Bachelor programme and on a rigorous selection process for admission to the Master programme.

The university should revise the doctoral programme. The number of students is extremely small because the Ph.D. programme requires special scientific qualifications and is necessary only to teach at the highest level.

In the context of the comments made above, it should be emphasized that the recommendations made in the context of the first-time accreditation have been taken into account and implemented. Such conclusion is made on the basis of the presented documentation and conversations with teachers and students over the course of the on-site visit. Thus, currently there is a clear distinction - both in terms of content and technical aspect - between the Bachelor study programme which offers a limited list of elective subjects and two courses of the Master programme that include a large number of elective disciplines with the relevant content. The doctoral programme is determined by the nature of the Ph.D. programmes: here the main focus is placed on developing students' own

academic achievement. This is, in fact, a fundamental prerequisite for the autonomous scientific studying of International Law.

The way the institute implements the described concept in the process of teaching students can be assumed. This is especially true of teaching in the field of International Law. Although the curriculum in the field of International Law focuses on international law and the legislation of international organizations, private international law and uniform law and the corresponding international procedural law is currently taken into account, since Kazakhstan itself forms the curriculum, but international criminal law is also becoming more important, although it is not the subject of the curriculum, which cannot be said about other countries offering similar programmes for undergraduate and graduate students. Also, the inclusion of teaching materials (detailed handouts with lists of literature as well as case law) should be emphasized. A relatively small number of students in the Bachelor programme is favorable, especially if we take into account the presence of two branches (Kazakh and Russian), which greatly facilitates the task of the faculty members. These benefits become even more pronounced within the framework of the Master programme.

As for the study process, both teachers and students expressed their satisfaction with the current state of affairs. The faculty members stressed the favourable ratio of the number of teachers and students; it is no less true for students who were somewhat inactive in expressing their opinions on ENU. There was little critique offered on the implemented examination system. Most of it takes form of testing with multiple-choice questions, followed by oral examinations with a limited number of students taking it on the same date and a written exam which includes cases from practice. It should also be emphasized that students have an opportunity to appeal the decision if they do not pass the examination. As for the taking of exams, it is also necessary to mention the presence of several examiners.

Thus, the current and expected status of programmes in the near future in the specialty International Law can be assessed positively in terms of goals and concepts and their implementation. The current situation is in line with the guidelines for accreditation. The 2012 recommendations were taken into account and implemented. As suggestions for further improvement, the group of experts can offer the following points expressed over the course of the visit to the university:

- expansion of library collections of foreign literature; the existing electronic access to such collections (books and periodicals) should not mean there is no need for the increase in hard copies;
- strengthening academic relations with foreign and overseas institutions of teaching and research in the field of International Law as well as the possibility of expanding exchange for Master students;
- increase in the number of guest lecturers from abroad;
- continuation of revising of the training materials and curricula, taking into account ongoing changes in international conventions and other international law (e.g. European law, legal association in private international law). More examples of the law of foreign countries should be used, preferably taught by relevant foreign teachers in Russian or English.

## **Conclusion**

**The group of experts makes a few minor recommendations and concludes that Standard 1.2 of the Standards and Recommendations for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) has been fulfilled.**

### **ESG Part 1. Standard 1.3: Student-centred learning, teaching and assessment**

[Institutions should ensure that the programmes are delivered in a way that encourages students to take an active role in creating the learning process, and that the assessment of students reflects this approach.]

#### **Assessment**

According to the stipulated standard, the university should ensure the implementation of the programmes in such a way as to stimulate students to participate in the joint development of study programmes. Participation of students allows ensuring the quality of study programmes due to their valuable stakeholder evaluation.

As part of the issue of ensuring respect and attention to different groups of students and providing flexible learning paths at the university, a position of an adviser has been stipulated. By the nature of the activity, the adviser is called upon to provide counselling to students on all issues of the educational process, including the drafting of individual students' curriculum by the means of choosing and registering for elective disciplines. The whole concept of an advisory unit requires the availability of sufficient staff in regards to the annual intake of students for each profession as well as a sufficient and even distribution of consulting hours.

The group of experts recommends expanding the staff of the advisors when the body of students increases to ensure effective interaction and counselling.

The use of various forms of teaching at the university implies the availability of lecture and seminar rooms without any teacher restrictions in the format of the conduct. An important goal of this direction is to ensure the effectiveness of the learning process and to achieve the results of mastering of the necessary competencies by the students.

The group of experts recommends considering a possibility of changing the form of teaching from a classical seminar and lecture to the format of a contact hour which provides a constant interaction of students and teachers and allows using pedagogical methods of brainstorming and raising problematic issues. In addition, the transition to the contact hour format provides for the students' constant readiness to discuss the issues within the session.

Flexible use of a variety of pedagogical methods at the University includes the application of the methods of discussion, case work, work in small groups, mootings, preparing essays and projects.

Regular feedback on the techniques and methods used to evaluate and adjust pedagogical methods is provided in the form of a procedure for assessing the teacher and the course by students through the automated information system Platonus which involves entering the students' login and password which may call into question the anonymity of the student questioning or indirectly affect the objectivity of students in the assessment process. The feedback of the university and the student is manifested in involving the student in the process of developing the study programmes of all levels.

The group of experts notes the need to involve the student in the process of developing the study programmes of all levels on the basis of transparent competition / online voting of all students for the candidacy of a given person which develops the autonomy of students in decision-making and provides for the elimination of subjective factors in the selection of the student's candidacy.

The availability of appropriate procedures for responding to student complaints at the university is confirmed by the ability to communicate with the management of any level and competence in the online mode. In addition, an appeal procedure is provided based on the application of students.

The group of experts recommends creating an independent body to deal with student complaints, in addition to the existence of the Appeals Commission, because the competence of the Appeals Commission does not provide for the consideration of conflict issues between students and the teacher. The composition of this body, in turn, should include teachers and students to ensure transparency.

Taking into account the importance of assessing the progress of students, advance publication of criteria and methods of evaluation in the automated information system Platonus is implemented. This information is an integral part of the syllabus of the teacher. The University provides written and oral forms of passing exams. The most controversial and complex for the exclusion of teaching subjectivism is oral form of examination. In connection with which participation in the evaluation of two teachers is envisaged: the main teacher in discipline and the independent from the department.

As for previously made recommendations, changes were implemented, namely, the final control policy was revised. In general, emphasis is placed on solving practical problems (cases); the texts of assignments for legal analysis are supplemented with examples of examining specific legal cases. The number of multiple-choice tests has been reduced. As the final control of knowledge, an oral examination is applied, and it includes theoretical questions as well as the analysis of a specific case, the solution of problems under International Law.

The university supports the development of the scientific activity of students.

### **Conclusion**

**The group of experts makes a few minor recommendations and concludes that Standard 1.3 of the Standards and Recommendations for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) has been fulfilled.**

### **ESG Part 1. Standard 1.4: Student admission, progression, recognition and certification**

[Institutions should consistently apply pre-defined and published regulations covering all phases of the student "life cycle", e.g. student admission, progression, recognition and certification.]

#### **Assessment**

The university has pre-defined, published and consistently applied rules that regulate all periods of the student's "life cycle".

Providing the conditions and support that students need to develop their academic careers is guaranteed by the university through the provision of annual grants, both for training and for the implementation of start-up projects.

Internal regulatory documents, such as the Statute, the University Development Strategy, the Policy and Objectives in the Field of Quality of Education are published on the official website of the university.

The procedure for admission of students is carried out strictly within the framework of existing internal acts and is also published on the official website. During the admission period of students, a special Admissions Committee is appointed. It carries out consulting and promotional activities.

The admission of students also includes a certain state order and quotas for foreign students. Grants on a competitive basis are awarded based on those achieving the highest scores. Priority in awarding is given to persons who have the Altyn belgi badge.

The access requirements are properly defined in the selection procedure reflected in the training documents. The publication of lists of students and grant holders is conducted.

There are places for foreign students. For the present period, students from the Republic of Belarus, China, Azerbaijan, Afghanistan and Russia have been accepted for training.

Academic mobility of students is provided by Erasmus +, MEVLANA, grants from Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, and bilateral agreements with universities.

Access policy, processes and criteria for admission of students are carried out in a consistent and transparent manner. The university attracts private independent organizations for implementing the procedure and tools for collecting and monitoring. In addition, the university provides monitoring within the Platonus system itself.

As part of the training process, there is a registration for the disciplines before the start of the educational process. The registration of students is supervised by the adviser and the Register Office. For information purposes, publication of guides for students is provided. Information about the content of the discipline, the teacher, the schedule is available to all students via the automated information system Platonus.

The graduation at the end of the students' studies is accompanied by the support from the university Organization for Employment and Career in addition to providing the necessary documentation.

### **Conclusion**

**The group of experts makes a few minor recommendations and concludes that Standard 1.4 of the Standards and Recommendations for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) has been fulfilled.**

### **ESG Part 1. Standard 1.5: Teaching staff**

[Institutions should assure themselves of the competence of their teachers. They should apply fair and transparent processes for the recruitment and development of the staff.]

#### **Description of facts**

In the self evaluation report of the university information was presented on the staffing of the Department of International Law. The department employs 30 teachers, including 3 Doctors of Science, 6 Candidates of Sciences, 4 Ph.D. holders, 17 teachers with Master of Law degrees. Twenty-one teachers work full-time. More than half of the teachers of the Department of International Law are represented by the holders of Master of Law. The number of teachers of the department having a scientific degree for the last 3 years has not changed significantly, apparently, this is due to the turnover of staff. Six teachers specialize in the profile of International Law.

The heads of the study programmes presented information on how the university plans to solve personnel issues for the specialty International Law (Bachelor, Master, and Ph.D.) arising from the diversification and growth of the student body and in accordance with the requirements of national and European standards. This will be done mainly by encouraging teaching staff holding Master of Law to enter the Ph.D. programme.

There is an incentive policy aimed at improving the skills of teachers using the KPI system, developing foreign (English) language skills and teaching methods. The representative of the administration of the university informed the group of experts of the financing of the study trip to Omsk (Russia) for 40 ENU teachers, including several (2-3) teachers from the Department of International Law. The course was titled Innovative Teaching Methods, and classes at the University of Omsk were offered by teachers from the University of Dresden (Germany).

Preliminary information on the provision of the university faculty members with the possibility of further development with the exemption from teaching for 1 year with the preservation of wages has not been confirmed.

Teachers showed the necessary level of professional qualification. They understand the current trends in the development of education in the field of International Law, use effective methods of teaching, in particular the case method and the solution of practical problems. Teachers are also informed of the previous recommendations of ACQUIN in

2012. Some of the interviewed teachers participated in the implementation of the agency's recommendations in the teaching of their academic disciplines.

## **Assessment**

The analysis showed that there is an aspiration of the university administration to implement the ESG recommendations related to the provision of favourable conditions for effective work of teachers and ensuring their professional qualification level.

Most of the teachers at the department work full-time with just a few teachers work part-time. The latter combine teaching with practical work in state authorities. Well-known Kazakhstani practitioners of law as well as academic lawyers in the field of International Law from Russia and abroad are regularly invited by the university. The university is taking measures, including those described above for the further development of teachers.

Based the analysis of the submitted documents, meetings with the management and teachers, the group of experts was able to confirm the availability of sufficient coverage of teachers working full-time. The level of teaching workload is sufficient. Teachers participate in conducting examinations. As a rule, there are 2 teachers in the audience where the exam takes place. Examination workload is generally balanced.

According to the information provided for the assessment, 341 students are enrolled in the International Law programmes at ENU: 277 Bachelor students, 56 Master students, and 8 Ph.D. students. The level of professional training of teachers as a whole is in line with the academic and scientific requirements of students.

Human resources for the implementation of the higher education programmes in the specialty International Law at all levels (Bachelor, Master, and Ph.D. studies) are currently minimally sufficient.

However, in the future, due to the growth in the number of undergraduate, postgraduate and doctorate students, it will be necessary to recruit teachers specializing in the following fields: diplomatic and consular law, international criminal law, international private law, international economic law, including WTO law, EU law and others. The recruitment of teachers specializing in these and other important branches of international law can provide guarantees to ensure the necessary development of profile of the study programme in International Law.

## **Conclusion**

**The group of experts makes a few minor recommendations and concludes that Standard 1.5 of the Standards and Recommendations for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) has been fulfilled.**

### **ESG Part 1. Standard 1.6: Learning resources and student support**

[Institutions should have appropriate funding for learning and teaching activities and ensure that adequate and readily accessible learning resources and student support are provided.]

#### **Assessment**

The university is called upon to ensure the availability of sufficient, accessible, and appropriate goals for the educational resources and support services for students in the framework of educational programmes.

Over the course of the training, students are provided with educational resources, both material (libraries or computers) and human (mentors, curators, and other consultants). The role of support services is particularly important for encouraging student mobility both within the education system and between different higher education systems. The University has renewed computer equipment, furniture, etc. Spatial infrastructure is sufficient to achieve the objectives of the training courses as, among other things, it allows for lecture classes for large groups.

The university will include in the structure a specialized body for the support of students - the Service Centre for Students.

The university ensures the proper regulation and planning of individual support and counselling for students. Meetings with the management, consulting hours, support of training aids are provided, through the publication of the faculty members of the chair of the relevant teaching materials.

The university develops cooperation with various organizations and state bodies for the organisation of internships for students. Feedback from these organizations allows the group of experts to conclude the effectiveness of cooperation and the subsequent employment of students on the basis of the work placements.

The training facilities are properly equipped for the purpose of the training course, in particular, the rooms are equipped with interactive whiteboards, projectors and computers for the successful implementation of interactive teaching methods.

Library equipment is sufficient, but the collection of textbooks needs to be updated due to the lack of a sufficient number of foreign books on International Law. It is also important to establish a close relationship between the subject librarian and the Department.

It is necessary to create special offices within the library for Ph.D. and Master students for writing dissertations as well as to strengthen cooperation with foreign electronic databases.

## **Conclusion**

**The group of experts makes a few minor recommendations and concludes that Standard 1.6 of the Standards and Recommendations for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) has been fulfilled.**

### **ESG Part 1. Standard 1.7: Information management**

[Institutions should ensure that they collect, analyse and use relevant information for the effective management of their programmes and other activities.]

#### **Description of facts**

The university has information systems for collecting and analyzing full-fledged information about quantitative (information about the student population) and qualitative characteristics of students studying in the programmes in International Law at all levels: Bachelor, Master, and Ph.D. The university uses the automated information system Platonus and other information systems, including internal document management systems. The registration office performs functions of analyzing and managing the academic progress of students. There is a special service called the Student Service Center. Here students can receive counseling and services related to the receipt of documents, questions of enrollment, transfer, expulsion, provision of academic leave, accommodation in the dormitory. The dean's office of Faculty of Law also works with a database of information and documents that analyze the results of academic achievements and completion of internships, student GPA progress and all other necessary information. The availability of educational resources and student support services is provided by the ability to log in to the Platonus information system through computer networks or telephone (with login and password) and to learn about the necessary and required academic information. Students can also use information kiosks (terminals) installed in the building of the faculty as well as personally contact the office of registration, the department and the dean's office. Students can view and upload their individual curriculum, view and unload the educational-methodical complex of disciplines of disciplines, monitor current, rating and final evaluations in your electronic journal, view and unload the transcript, view traffic orders. In the self-assessment report of the university, a description was given of the availability of internal information support resources (in section 7 of the provide report), but feedback from students was not clearly shown. Therefore, over the on-site visit, it was necessary to find out the presence or absence of channels of communication with students of the study programmes International law, full information about their opinions, wishes for what they wanted to change and improve in the learning process in the university.

Information on the availability of feedback for the purpose of obtaining objective information that allows ENU to adjust the quality policy and improving the educational process is provided in Appendix 10 to the self assessment report of the university. In the online survey of undergraduate students to determine the degree of satisfaction with the quality of teaching disciplines (2016-2017 academic year) (Appendix 10) for question 7: "I am satisfied with the quality of teaching in lectures, practical / seminar, laboratory classes (the instructor understands the material, there is the practical orientation of the material the accessibility and clarity of the presentation)", 12 of 18 students gave an affirmative answer. For question 14: "I recommended that the students of subsequent courses study this discipline", 9 of 18 students gave an explicit affirmative answer. Similar (to this online survey) feedback channels with students are able to present an objective picture of the situation in the university. Therefore, they are recommended to be used more often for information management purposes. Over the course of the interview with students overall satisfaction with the quality of teaching and the organization of the educational process at the university was expressed.

Among the interviewed, there was one active student, participating, in his words, in the development of study programmes in International Law. In the opinion of the expert group, there is no evidence of wide and systematic participation of the student community in the development, adjustment, revision and implementation of educational programmes at ENU.

Employment of graduates is also part of the recommendations for criterion 1.7 of ESG. Appendix 11 of the provided report includes a certificate of employment issued by the Department of International Law to the head of the career and business partnership department of the university. According to this information, 73 of 89 graduates of the Bachelor programme of 2016-2017 academic year were employed (which amounted to 82 percent); 39 of 43 of Master students were employed (which amounted to 91 percent). However, this information is not supported by specific evidence.

It was important for the university to show a high percentage of graduates employed. Based on this, ENU is invited to use reliable data and describe the situation using factual evidence. The employed graduates are taxed for social and pension purposes and provide the money flow into the account of the tax authorities and into their own pension funds.

Therefore, the university has the opportunity to check the actual number of working graduates. However, due to the fact that such figures were not presented, it was impossible to assess the real state of affairs in the context of employment of graduates.

## **Assessment**

The university has the necessary procedures for collecting and analyzing information on the study programmes of International Law at all levels (Bachelor, Master, and Ph.D.) which includes the following criteria: key performance indicators, information about the body of students, level of academic achievement, students' achievements and screenings. Students are provided with educational resources and student support services. For most of the above criteria, the university has special activities and uses the information received. However, ENU has somewhat neglected the criterion of students' satisfaction with the implementation of the undergraduate programme in International Law, the criterion of the participation of students in the development and adjustment of educational Bachelor, Master, and Ph.D., and the use of feedback on these issues in the internal quality assurance system of the university. Also, due attention is not paid to the actual employment of graduates of the Bachelor programme.

Therefore, the university is recommended to pay attention to the fact that objective information on the employment of graduates will make it possible to make adequate decisions that are likely to contribute to quality assurance in education. A real, permanent, transparent, and systematic work is needed to assist in choosing a career and employing graduates.

It is recommended that the university also intensifies the motivation of students at all levels (Bachelor, Master and Ph.D.) to systematically participate in the creation, adjustment, revision, and implementation of educational programmes in International law.

Staff members of the dean's office and the registrar's office are mainly responsible for organization of quality management tasks in the context of issues within the criterion 1.7 of ESG. Collection of data on students and their assessment in the framework of quality management of the university is carried out. Also based on the self assessment report of the university and the on-site visit, the group of experts could confirm that the institution carries out the necessary measures to assess the quality of teaching. Comprehensive information on the evaluation of the current training courses was not provided. Having said

that, the group of experts has received sufficient information on the complete implementation of the previous accreditation recommendations made by ACQUIN in 2012 on the quality and content of certain disciplines taught within the International Law curriculum at all levels (Bachelor, Master and Ph.D.). The students' workload, consisting of attending lectures, seminars, performing independent work is strictly regulated. Mechanisms for checking and developing the higher education programmes at the university are available. ENU should continue improving the quality and effectiveness of their use in the future.

### **Conclusion**

**The group of experts makes a few minor recommendations and concludes that Standard 1.7 of the Standards and Recommendations for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) has been fulfilled.**

### **ESG Part 1. Standard 1.8: Public information**

[Institutions should publish information about their activities, including programmes, which is clear, accurate, objective, up-to date and readily accessible.]

#### **Description of facts**

General information on the activities of the university is available to the general public on the university website. Information on the activities of the Department of International Law is available on the website of the university on the page of the Faculty of Law. Information on the conditions of admission is available on the website of the Department of International Law.

There is information about the requirements for admission of school graduates, minimum grade, and necessary documents are indicated. The information for incoming foreign citizens, cost of training, living conditions, possibility of receiving an educational loan or an internal (rector) grant, discounts, etc. is stated for undergraduate students of International Law.

For newly enrolled students of the first year, information is provided on the methods and criteria for marking criteria, rules for conducting various types of examinations, and other necessary information. Information for students is also available on ENU website.

The abovementioned information is also available in paper form (booklets, collections, etc.). Information on the activities of the university, study programmes (including International Law) is available in electronic and paper form. There is information about the expected results of studies and the qualifications awarded for the completion of the study programme in International Law covering all levels (undergraduate, graduate and doctoral studies Ph.D.).

Information is provided on the opportunities for internships of students in state bodies and commercial organizations in accordance with the concluded agreements. There is information about the partner universities and concluded memoranda of cooperation in academic and scientific matters. This information is available for both internal and external stakeholders.

## Assessment

The information on the activity of the university is mainly directed to the target group of school graduates and students, that is, mainly to one group of stakeholders. The university could provide clear, accurate, and objective information to all external stakeholders (for example, employers) as well as publicly maintain links with the community of graduates in International Law.

It is known, one of major ESG values is openness, transparency of educational processes. In this regard, the university could provide Internet access to information related to the activities of the Department of International Law (for example, the reports of the department in the past, its strategy for the future, plans for the current academic year).

The ESG standards and recommendations on the availability of information published by educational organization on its activities for the study programmes in International Law (Bachelor, Master, and Ph.D.) are being implemented. The same information provided in the public domain also meets the criteria of clarity and relevance.

According to the criteria of accuracy and objectivity of the information published (for example, on the employment opportunities for Bachelor programme graduates), there was no possibility of a full evaluation. At the same time, to the extent possible, the university could avoid using the "promotional nature" of describing its achievements (for example, the places occupied by the university in various national and international rankings) and information about its programmes, in particular, study programme International Law.

## Conclusion

**The group of experts makes a few minor recommendations and concludes that Standard 1.7 of the Standards and Recommendations for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) has been fulfilled.**

### **ESG Part 1. Standard 1.9: On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes**

*[Institutions should monitor and periodically review their programmes to ensure that they achieve the objectives set for them and respond to the needs of students and society. These reviews should lead to continuous improvement of the programme. Any action planned or taken as a result should be communicated to all those concerned.]*

#### **Assessment**

To ensure effective implementation of study programmes and create an enabling learning environment at ENU the following tools are applied: questioning of all persons interested in the quality of training; active cooperation with employers on quality assurance issues; internal university quality monitoring system and the activities of the faculty, department and university structures for quality control and assurance.

The university regularly reviews the Strategy and Policy in the field of quality, monitors their implementation. To ensure quality assurance, the university complies with the requirements of the normative regulations of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, implements international requirements and procedures for improving the quality of education, analyses the effectiveness of planning and reporting, conducts sociological monitoring of the implementation of the mission and strategy, attracts stakeholders - social partners, employers, teaching staff, observes the principle of openness of university management for proposals.

The development of strategic documents is also carried out based on the results of the analysis of the external and internal environment, identified risks, compliance of resources, labour market needs and specifics of the market of educational services. The discussion annually takes place at the meetings of the departments, Councils of the Faculties and the Academic Council of the university. In this context, opinions and proposals of employers and students are taken into account.

The departments annually monitor, assess and revise the study programmes, taking into account the views of the representatives of the students, employers who are members of the Study Programmes Development Committee.

The Quality Assessment Department carries out ongoing monitoring and regular evaluation in the form of online questionnaires. The questionnaires are conducted with the purpose of finding out the quality of educational services, revealing the degree of satisfaction

of students with the quality of the subjects taught (the quality of teaching lectures, seminars and laboratory classes, the quality of assignments and the time for their implementation, teaching and methodological support) and receiving suggestions from students related to this issue. The survey is conducted twice a year and is available here: [https://my.enu.kz/page\\_anketa](https://my.enu.kz/page_anketa) in Kazakh and Russian languages. The results are analysed by the departments and taken into account.

The analysis of the questionnaires showed that, in general, students of study programmes undergoing the accreditation process are satisfied with the quality of the educational services provided.

Chairs analyse the progress of students, the conformity of the forms of evaluation of students learning and the results of the discipline, the assessment of the adequacy of the labour intensity of disciplines is conducted, the results of which, if necessary, introduce changes in the workload of the respective disciplines.

The interests of employers are taken into account by monitoring the analysis of their satisfaction with study programmes based on the results of internships, employment of graduates, scientific and practical forums held at the university with the participation of representatives of professional sectors, and the involvement of employers in the development of modular Master programmes. Employers are satisfied with the competencies of graduates.

All suggestions of students and other stakeholders are reflected in the minutes of the expanded meeting of the departments, the changes introduced are reflected in the study programmes, catalogue of elective subjects and the learning and methodical materials for the subject. Proposals concerning the work of support services are sent to the relevant structural units of the university.

The analysis of the self assessment report, the results of the meetings with Bachelor and Master students, and teaching staff showed that the departments monitor, regularly assess and revise the study programme strategy with regards to the requirements and recommendations of the ministry of Science and Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan, accreditation agency ACQUIN, and other stakeholders.

Thus, the monitoring, regular evaluation and revision of the study programmes allows the staff of ENU to adjust study programmes in a timely manner, taking into account the

achievements of modern science and the trends of change in the labour market as well as ensure the training of competitive professionals.

It is recommended to introduce and implement permanent feedback documentation used on a regular basis for acquisition of students' opinions based on the results of surveys and out of these ongoing activities.

## **Conclusion**

**The group of experts makes a few minor recommendations and concludes that Standard 1.9 of the Standards and Recommendations for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) has been fulfilled.**

### **ESG Part 1. Standard 1.10: Cyclical external quality assurance**

[Institutions should undergo external quality assurance in line with the ESG on a cyclical basis.]

#### **Assessment**

ENU conducts external quality assurance procedures in accordance with the State General Education Standard and European Standards and Recommendations (ESG) on a regular basis.

The university carries out procedures for the accreditation of study programmes through national and foreign accreditation agencies and publishes information on accredited study programmes on its webpage. Also, the university regularly conducts procedures for institutional accreditation.

Quality Management System of ENU is subjected to constant examination regarding its compliance with all the requirements of ISO 9001:2008.

#### **Conclusion**

**The group of experts makes a few minor recommendations and concludes that Standard 1.10 of the Standards and Recommendations for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) has been fulfilled.**

## 5. Recommendation on accreditation

The study programmes 5B030200 International Law (Bachelor), 6M030200 International Law (Scientific and Pedagogical Master), 6M030200 International Law (Profile Master) and 6D030200 International Law (Ph.D.) have been evaluated on compliance with the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG).

The group of experts makes a conclusion that Standard 1.1 (Policy for quality assurance), Standard 1.2 (Design and approval of programmes), Standard 1.3 (Student-centred learning, teaching and assessment), Standard 1.4: Student admission, progression, recognition and certification), Standard 1.5 (Teaching staff), Standard 1.6 (Learning resources and student support), Standard 1.7 (Information management), Standard 1.8 (Public information), Standard 1.9 (On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes), Standard 1.10 (Cyclical external quality assurance) have been fulfilled.

The group of experts points out that the recommendations from the first-time accreditation procedure are properly taken into account.

The group of experts recommends accrediting the study 5B030200 International Law (Bachelor), 6M030200 International Law (Scientific and Pedagogical Master), 6M030200 International Law (Profile Master) and 6D030200 International Law (Ph.D.) **without any conditions.**

## 6. Decision of the ACQUIN Accreditation Commission

### Decision

On the basis of the report of the expert group, the statement of the HEI and the statement of the standing expert committee, on 26th March 2018 the Accreditation Commission takes the following decisions:

**The study programmes 5B030200 International Law (Bachelor), 6M030200 International Law (Scientific and Pedagogical Master) and 6M030200 International Law (Profile Master) are accredited without any conditions. The accreditation is valid until 30th September 2024.**

**The study programme 6D030200 International Law (Ph.D.) is accredited without any conditions for the first time. The accreditation is valid until 30th September 2023.**